Front Pages

Athens Journal of History

The ***Athens Journal of History (AJHIS)*** is an Open Access quarterly double-blind peer reviewed journal and considers papers from all areas of history. Many of the papers published in this journal have been presented at the various conferences sponsored by the History Unit of the Athens Institute for Education and Research (ATINER). All papers are subject to ATINER's Publication Ethical Policy and Statement.

Athens Journal of History
Editorial and Reviewers' Board

President's Message

All ATINER's publications including its e-journals are open access without any costs (submission, processing, publishing, open access paid by authors, open access paid by readers etc.) and is independent of presentations at any of the many small events (conferences, symposiums, forums, colloquiums, courses, roundtable discussions) organized by ATINER throughout the year and entail significant costs of participating. The intellectual property rights of the submitting papers remain with the author. Before you submit, please make sure your paper meets the basic academic standards, which includes proper English. Some articles will be selected from the numerous papers that have been presented at the various annual international academic conferences organized by the different divisions and units of the Athens Institute for Education and Research. The plethora of papers presented every year will enable the editorial board of each journal to select the best, and in so doing produce a top-quality academic journal. In addition to papers presented, ATINER will encourage the independent submission of papers to be evaluated for publication.

The current issue is the third of the ninth volume of the *Athens Journal of History (AJHIS), published by the History Unit of ATINER*.

Gregory T. Papanikos
President
ATINER

Athens Institute for Education and Research
A World Association of Academics and Researchers

22nd Annual International Conference on History & Archaeology:
From Ancient to Modern, 3-6 June 2024, Athens, Greece

The History Unit of ATINER, will hold its **22nd Annual International Conference on History & Archaeology: From Ancient to Modern 3-6 June 2024, Athens, Greece** sponsored by the Athens Journal of History. The aim of the conference is to bring together scholars and students of all areas of history, archaeology and other related disciplines. You may participate as a stream leader, presenter of one paper, chair of a session or observer. Please submit a proposal using the form available (https://www. atiner.gr/2024/FORM-HIS.doc).

Important Dates

- Abstract Submission: **23 October 2023**
- Acceptance of Abstract: 4 Weeks after Submission
- Submission of Paper: **6 May 2024**

Academic Members Responsible for the Conference

- Dr. Steven Oberhelman, Professor of Classics, Holder of the George Sumey Jr Endowed Professorship of Liberal Arts, and Associate Dean, Texas A&M University, USA, USA, Vice President of International Programs, ATINER and Editor of the Athens Journal of History.
- Dr. Nicholas Pappas, Vice President of Academic Membership, ATINER & Professor of History, Sam Houston University, USA.
- Dr. David Philip Wick, Director, Arts and Humanities Division & Professor of History, Gordon College, USA.
- Dr. Jayoung Che, Head, History Unit, ATINER & Deputy Director of Research, Korean Academy of Greek Studies, South Korea.
- Dr. Tatiana Tsakiropoulou-Summers, Director, Athens Center for Classical & Byzantine Studies (ACCBS) & Associate Professor, The University of Alabama, USA.

Social and Educational Program

The Social Program Emphasizes the Educational Aspect of the Academic Meetings of Atiner.

- Greek Night Entertainment (This is the official dinner of the conference)
- Athens Sightseeing: Old and New-An Educational Urban Walk
- Social Dinner
- Mycenae Visit
- Exploration of the Aegean Islands
- Delphi Visit
- Ancient Corinth and Cape Sounion

Conference Fees

Conference fees vary from 400€ to 2000€
Details can be found at: https://www.atiner.gr/fees

Athens Institute for Education and Research

A World Association of Academics and Researchers

17th Annual International Conference on Literature
3-6 June 2024

The Literature Unit of ATINER is organizing its **16th Annual International Conference on Literature, 3-6 June 2024, Athens, Greece** sponsored by the Athens Journal of Philology. The aim of the conference is to bring together academics and researchers from all areas of literature and other related disciplines. You may participate as stream leader, presenter of one paper, chair of a session or observer. Please submit a proposal using the form available (https://www.atiner.gr/2024/FORM-LIT.doc).

Important Dates
- Abstract Submission: **23 October 2023**
- Acceptance of Abstract: 4 Weeks after Submission
- Submission of Paper: **6 May 2024**

Academic Member Responsible for the Conference

- **Dr. Stamos Metzidakis**, Head, Literature Research Unit, ATINER & Emeritus Professor of French and Comparative Literature, Washington University in Saint Louis, USA.

Social and Educational Program
The Social Program Emphasizes the Educational Aspect of the Academic Meetings of Atiner.
- Greek Night Entertainment (This is the official dinner of the conference)
- Athens Sightseeing: Old and New-An Educational Urban Walk
- Social Dinner
- Mycenae Visit
- Exploration of the Aegean Islands
- Delphi Visit
- Ancient Corinth and Cape Sounion
    More information can be found here: https://www.atiner.gr/social-program

---

Conference Fees
Conference fees vary from 400€ to 2000€
Details can be found at: https://www.atiner.gr/fees

Large Scale Slave Revolts in Ancient Greece: An Issue of Absence or an Absence of Issue?

By Nemanja Vujčić*

In the modern perception of the Ancient World the massive slave revolts loom largely. To the modern mind, infused, through education and mass media, with notions of sanctity of personal freedom and shamefulness of servitude, there is natural and immediate connection between the institution of slavery and armed, violent resistance to it. Ancient slaves were kept in obviously shameful and degrading state of bondage, therefore they revolted – they must have. In fact, however, large scale slave revolts are actually quite rare in world history and, in the case of Ancient Greece, all examples that one could point to are late and (at least superficially) marginal. If we limit our scope to Classical Greece (5th and 4th centuries BC), the slave revolt is virtually non-existent, unless we choose to widen the definition of slaves to include the helots of Sparta and the penests of Thessaly. This paper assumes that Messenian (helot) revolts are a separate (though perhaps related) phenomenon to slave revolts, and focus only on the latter. There are only three known cases of anything resembling a slave revolt (four, if we add the problematic case of the slave uprising of Drimacus, in the 3nd century BC Chios), and they seem rather minute in their scope and achievement, especially when compared to the contemporary massive slave wars of Roman Sicily and Italy. The paper argues that this absence is not an illusion, created, as one might argue, through a lack of interest or organized silence on the part of ancient authors, but the actual reflection of historical reality. Prospects of success for such endeavor were minimal, while the dangers involved were overwhelming. Specific conditions required for large scale slave uprisings were rarely met in Ancient Greece and consequently the phenomenon itself was rare.

Introduction

Anyone who teaches the history of slavery in ancient Greece is probably familiar with questions such as "Were there any slave revolts in ancient Greece?", and the usual follow-up: "Why there were no slave revolts?", or, depending on the initial answer: "Why slaves did not revolt more often?" To a modern mind slavery is both morally abhorrent and socially unacceptable. Slaves are (rightly) seen as exploited by their masters, humiliated and dehumanized. Thus, the connection between the objectionable state of slavery and violent resistance to it seems direct and obvious to modern audience.[1] Enslaved persons (must have)

---

*Associate Professor, Department of History, Faculty of Philosophy, University of Belgrade, Serbia.

1. Cf. Eugene D. Genovese, *From Rebellion to Revolution: Afro-American Slave Revolts in the Making of the Modern World* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1979), xiii: "Enslavement in any form has figured as the antithesis of that individual autonomy

desired freedom more than anything, so they initiated one armed revolt after another. It is that simple.

However, the issue might not be as simple and obvious to ancient peoples. The plain fact is that there are barely any examples of large scale slave revolts in Ancient Greece, and all of them are of a comparatively late date. This work will examine what we know about these revolts in order to understand why they came about and, by implication, why there were not more of them. To attain better understanding, some comparisons with slave insurrections in other times and places will be made. Such comparisons instantly reveal that in this respect the ancient Greeks were actually not unique. Slavery was very common throughout world history, but large slave revolts were not.[2]

Before we continue, three obstacles need to be moved out of the way. The first one is possibility that there actually were massive slave uprisings in Greece, during the half a millennium between ca. 800 and 300 BC, but that we are simply unaware of them, due to loss or silence of Greek authors. This silence is usually explained either as lack of interest on the part of said authors, or as deliberate concealment, perhaps due to the embarrassing nature of the subject.[3] Neither explanation is very convincing. In spite of numerous caveats that could be made about limitations of our knowledge, it is highly unlikely that we overlooked a large-scale slave insurrection during the Classical age, especially considering that such an event could only take place where slaves were particularly numerous: in rich and developed societies such as Athens, Corinth, Megara, Syracuse or Chios – exactly the places we are best informed about.[4] A conspiracy of silence is even less likely, most of the Classical authors report freely on the flight of slaves and slave participation in wars. Thucydides, for example, shows no hesitation in speaking about the brutal civil war on Corcyra and the slave involvement in it,[5] about a massive flight of Athenian slaves during the Decelean war,[6] nor about Chian slaves joining with the Athenians and pillaging the countryside.[7] As we

considered the essence of freedom in modern societies. The revolt against slavery thus emerged as the basic assertion of human dignity and of humanity itself."

2. E. D. Genovese, *op. cit.*, xxii; Orlando Patterson, *Slavery and Social Death* (Cambridge MA/London: Harvard University Press: 1982), vii. Though massive slave revolts are not quite as rare in the world history as claimed by Moses I. Finley, *Ancient Slavery and Modern Ideology* (New York: Viking Press, 1980), 114-115.

3. Barry Strauss, "Slave Wars of Greece and Rome," in V. D. Hanson (ed.) *Makers of Ancient Strategy. From the Persian Wars to the Fall of Rome* (Princeton/Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2010), 187; Niall McKeown, "Resistance Among Chattel Slaves in the Classical Greek World," in Keith Bradley, Paul Cartledge (eds.) *The Cambridge World History of Slavery I: The Ancient Mediterranean World* (Cambridge: CUP, 2011), 154.

4. This, of course, leaves plenty of room for some (perhaps many) instances of smaller-scale violent resistance that are lost to us or were never recorded at all.

5. Thuc. 3.70-85; slave participation is mentioned in 3.73.

6. Thuc. 7.27.

7. Thuc. 8.40.

shall presently see, Theopompus, Posidonius, Diodorus, Strabo, Athenaeus and others show no hesitation in this regard as well.

The second potential obstacle rises from the problem of categorization of subjugated groups such as the *helots* of Laconia and Messenia, or the *penests* of Thessaly. If these should be (re)classified as slaves, as it was recently suggested,[8] the issue would seemingly dissolve: there were many historically attested massive revolts by these groups, some expanding into full-scale wars that went on for years. However, this solution is more apparent than real, as it still would not explain the absence of slave revolts in, for example, Classical Attica. Furthermore, the prevailing consensus among classicists and historians remains that helots and similar groups are clearly distinct from slaves, and that they should be understood as a kind of "serfs" i.e. semi-free servile agricultural population.[9] As things stand at the moment, the helots and helot uprisings should be seen as a separate historical and social phenomenon from slaves and their revolts.[10]

Finally, we should be wary not to interpret other forms of slave resistance or their military participation as armed revolts. Slaves equipped and mobilized to fight in war or civil strafe, or to otherwise aid the war effort, are a familiar occurrence in ancient Greek history.[11] But this activity is not directed against

---

8. David M. Lewis, *Greek Slave Systems in their Eastern Mediterranean Context, c. 800-146 BC* (Oxford: OUP, 2018), 125-146. Lewis drew much inspiration from earlier works on helots by Jean Ducat, *Les Hilotes* (Athènes/Paris: École française d'Athènes, 1990) and Nino Luraghi, "Helotic Slavery Reconsidered," in Anton Powell, Stephen Hodkinson (eds.) *Sparta: Beyond the Mirage* (London: Duckworth / Classic Press of Wales, 2002), 227-248. See also Kostas Vlassopulos, *Historicising Ancient Slavery* (Edinburgh: University Press, 2021), 169-170.

9. Cf. Peter Hunt, "Slaves of Serfs?: Patterson on the Thetes and Helots of Ancient Greece," in John Bodel and Walter Scheidel (eds.) *On Human Bondage. After Slavery and Social Death* (Malden / Oxford: Wiley Blackwell, 2017), 61-80 (also: id., "Ancient Greece as a 'Slave Society'," in Noel Lenski and Catherine M. Cameron (eds.) *What is a Slave Society? The Practice of Slavery in Global Perspective* (Cambridge: CUP, 2018), 75-84).

10. It should be noted that distinction between helots and slaves was recognized within the Spartan society as well. Free population of Laconia owned imported slaves who were not helots and could be manumitted by their masters (Pl. *Alc.* 122d; Ath. 6.271f; cf. Rachel Zelnick-Abramovitz, *Not Wholly Free. The Concept of Manumission and the Status of Manumitted Slaves in the Ancient Greek World* (Leiden/Boston: Brill 2005), 63). There is epigraphic evidence (late 5th / early 4th century BC) for Laconian owners manumitting slaves: *IG* V 1, 1228-1232; a 5th century BC inscription from Gythium (a town of perioeci) prohibits quarrying of stone to both free and enslaved (*IG* V 1, 1155). Unlike the Athenian slaves, helots had property rights (cf. Thuc. 4.26.7) etc. I do not find very helpful the suggestion of Sara Forsdyke, *Slaves and Slavery in Ancient Greece* (Cambridge: CUP, 2021), 42-43, that distinctions between slaves and helots were simply unclear in ancient Greece.

11. Karl-Wilhelm Welwei, *Unfreie im antiken Kriegsdienst* I: *Athen und Sparta*; II: *die kleiner und mittleren griechische Staaten und die hellenistischen Reiche* (Wiesbaden: Franz

masters, but rather agreed upon and sanctioned by them, or their state. Although flight of slaves is sometimes marked by violence, this is either of accidental nature, or with the purpose of facilitating the escape. For a movement to be considered a proper slave uprising three things are necessary: to be massive (participation should at least be in the hundreds), to be composed exclusively or mainly of enslaved people, to be focused on fighting the established order and government, rather than mere flight. The last point should not suggest that rebels aimed at abolition of the slavery as such – in fact, this would be untrue for any of the ancient slave revolts. They were fighting to render *themselves* free, though others would remain in bondage.

Slave Revolts in Attica and Delos

There are only three reasonably certain examples of slave revolts in the ancient Greek world. There is also a fourth case to consider, actually the most interesting one, but its historicity is disputed, and it will be examined separately.

Two earliest incidents that can be reliably dated are mentioned by Diodorus of Sicily, his source probably being Posidonius of Apamea.[12] Diodorus tells us that, in 135 or 134 BC, reacting to news of the initially successful slave revolt in

---

Steiner Verlag, 1974-1977); Yvon Garlan, *Slavery in Ancient Greece* (Ithaca / London: Cornell University Press, 1988), 163-176; Peter Hunt, "Arming Slaves and Helots in Classical Greece," in Christopher Leslie Brown, Philip D. Morgan (eds.) *Arming Slaves: from Classical Times to Modern Age* (New Haven / London: Yale University Press, 2006), 14-21, 25-34; Jean Andreau, Raymond Descat, *The Slave in Greece and Rome* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2011), 120-124, 126-128. Peter Hunt, *Slaves, Warfare, and Ideology in the Greek Historians* (Cambridge: CUP, 1998) made a case for Classical Greek historians deliberately concealing the role of slaves in warfare and civil strife. This he achieved, however, by throwing off the shackles of methodology: numerous examples of actual slave participation he speaks of, are found in the works of the very same historians. When Herodotus, Thucydides, Xenophon and others write of slaves under arms, no omission is assumed and they are treated as reliable witnesses. When they do not mention slave participation, this is taken as a proof of concealment. Credibility of the sources is decided according to whether they support the desired conclusion or not.

12. These events are often seen as a single revolt; however Diodorus and Orosius (or their sources) must have had a reason to single out the uprising in Delos from smaller unrests in "many other places". I suggest that this is due to the comparatively high number of persons involved. Diodorus mentions two other revolts in the same breath (D.S. 34.2.19): the Attican (more than thousand slaves) and the one in Rome (150 slaves); Orosius speaks of two contemporary uprisings in Latium with even greater numbers of participants (450 and four thousand). The Delian revolt must have been within the same orders of magnitude. Late Hellenistic Delos was a major center of Mediterranean slave trade and there were centrally many recently enslaved individuals, who would riot given the right circumstances.

Sicily,[13] slaves in Attica and those in Delos, and also "in many other places" (κατ᾽ ἄλλους πολλοὺς τόπους), rose against their masters. Apart from that, we are given only two bits of information: the numbers of slaves involved were large, "more than a thousand" (ὑπὲρ χιλίων) in Attica alone, but, in spite of that, the revolts were short lived. Authorities reacted with the greatest speed and crushed the insurrections before they could develop into something more substantial.[14] This information is corroborated by a much later source, Orosius, who adds that rebel slaves in Attica were miners, defeated by a magistrate called Heraclitus. Similarly, the rebels in Delos were eliminated by citizen-soldiers, who anticipated the unrest. Orosius, too, emphasizes the connection between uprising in the West and those in the Aegean.[15]

This was not the end, however. A generation later, about the time of the Second Sicilian slave war (104-100 BC),[16] the Athenian slaves took arms again. We are slightly better informed about this episode. According to Posidonius (this time *via* Athenaeus), slaves employed in the Laurium mines of Attica managed to break free, kill their guards and take the Acropolis of Sunium. From this stronghold they made destructive forays into the Attican countryside. These slaves resisted "for a long time", ἐπὶ πολὺν χρόνον (months? years?), before they were overpowered.[17]

Once again, it is important to emphasize the fact that the Athenian slave revolt occurred concurrently with the much larger uprising in Sicily. The mention of Laurium is equally significant. It is one spot in mainland Greece where we would expect armed slave resistance to happen: slaves were numerous and concentrated within a limited locality, they were mainly adult males, most of

---

13. D.S. 34.2.2-48. On Sicilian slave wars see Keith R. Bradley, *Slavery and Rebellion in the Roman World, 140 B.C. - 70 B.C.* (Bloomington / London: Indiana University Press / B. T. Batsford, 1989), 46-82. A more thematic approach to these (and other) slave uprisings is given by Theresa Urbainczyk, *Slave Revolts in Antiquity* (London / New York: Routledge, 2008).

14. D.S. 34.2.19: Οὗ διαβοηθέντος κατά τε Ῥώμην δούλων ἀπόστασις ἑκατὸν πεντήκοντα συνομοσάντων ἀνήπτετο, καὶ κατὰ τὴν Ἀττικὴν ὑπὲρ χιλίων, ἔν τε Δήλῳ καὶ κατ᾽ ἄλλους πολλοὺς τόπους. Οὓς τάχει τε τῆς βοηθείας καὶ τῇ σφοδρᾷ κολάσει τῆς τιμωρίας οἱ καθ᾽ ἕκαστον ἐπιμεληταὶ τῶν κοινῶν θᾶττον ἠφάνισαν, σωφρονίσαντες καὶ τὸ ἄλλο ὅσον ἦν ἐπὶ ἀποστάσει μετέωρον.

15. Oros. 5.9.5: "...in metallis quoque Atheniensium idem tumultus seruilis ab Heraclito praetore discussus est; apud Delon etiam serui nouo motu intumescentes oppidanis praeuenientibus pressi sunt, absque illo primo Siciliensis mali fomite, a quo istae uelut scintillae emicantes, diuersa haec incendia seminarunt."

16. D.S. 36.3-11.

17. Ath. VI 272e-f: Ποσειδώνιος γοῦν, οὗ συνεχῶς μέμνησαι, ὁ φιλόσοφος καὶ ἀποστάντας φησὶν αὐτοὺς καταφονεῦσαι μὲν τοὺς ἐπὶ τῶν μετάλλων φύλακας, καταλαβέσθαι δὲ τὴν ἐπὶ Σουνίῳ ἀκρόπολιν καὶ ἐπὶ πολὺν χρόνον πορθῆσαι τὴν Ἀττικήν. Οὗτος δ᾽ ἦν ὁ καιρὸς ὅτε καὶ ἐν Σικελίᾳ ἡ δευτέρα τῶν δούλων ἐπανάστασις ἐγένετο.

whom would be recently captured and purchased, and they were employed in one of the hardest and most dangerous forms of labor. While Diodorus omits this information, Orosius confirms that the revolt of ca. 135 BC also began in the Laurium mines. The importance of this will be expanded upon in the discussion of the circumstances that lead to slave revolts.

The other (roughly) contemporary examples of slave involvement in armed conflicts in the Hellenistic East fall into the categories of unfree summoned to fight for their masters, or joining a side in a civil war. This was the case with slaves mobilized by Andriscus (Pseudo-Philip) in 149-148 BC,[18] with those who fought for Aristonicus in 133-129 BC,[19] as well as with those who took part in the wars of Mithridates VI, from 89 BC onward.[20]

The Slave State of Drimacus

Nymphodorus of Syracuse, a Hellenistic writer of (probably) late 3rd century BC, whose account is preserved (again) only through Athenaeus of Naucratis, speaks of a slave revolt on the island of Chios, led by a man named Drimacus (Δρίμακος). In his account, the Chian society is described as in possession of multitude of foreign, imported slaves.[21] As time went by, increasing numbers of

---

18. Eutr. 4.15: "Iterum in Macedonia Pseudoperses, qui se Persei filium esse dicebat, *collectis servitiis rebellavit* et, cum sedecim milia armatorum haberet, a Tremellio quaestore superatus est." (my italics). Cf. K-W. Welwei, *Unfreie im antiken Kriegsdienst* II, 64-65.

19. D.S. 34.2.26; Strab. 14.1.38; cf. K-W. Welwei, *op. cit.*, 68-78. Romans themselves sought to attract slaves to join them in this war. It seems that a group of slaves, who fought for Aristonicus in the territory of Colophon, switched sides and was even recognized by the Senate, however briefly, as an allied community: Louis & Jeanne Robert, *Claros* I, 1, col. II, ll. 36-47 (= *SEG* 39.1243); see Kent J. Rigsby, "Agathopolis and Doulopolis," *Epigraphica Anatolica* 38 (2005): 112-115. Diodorus (*loc. cit.*) sees a direct link between the revolts in the West and slave participation in war of Aristonicus.

20. Mithridates enticed the slaves of Romans and Italians settled in Asia to kill their masters by promising them freedom and material rewards (App. *Mith.* 22). Among other late-war measures, Mithridates freed all slaves who would join him in the fight (App. *Mith.* 48; cf. 61-62). However, his enemies used slaves as well. Two Athenian slaves kept Sulla's forces informed on the events in the besieged city (App. *Mith.* 31, 34). After they turned on the Pontic king, the Ephesians manumitted their public slaves to boost the numbers of recruits (*Syll.*3 742, ll. 47-48), but also to preempt a similar measure by the king. K-W. Welwei, *op. cit.*, 80-86; Brian McGing, *The Foreign Policy of Mithridates VI Eupator King of Pontus* (Leiden: Brill, 1986), 114-116, 128-129, 131.

21. The claim is corroborated by Thucydides (8.40) and Theopompus (Ath. VI 265b). Athenaeus emphasizes greed of the Chians, who sought to acquire ever more slaves, and the element of divine justice in misfortunes that befell on them (Ath. VI 265c: ἐγὼ δὲ τοῖς Χίοις ἡγοῦμαι διὰ τοῦτο νεμεσῆσαι τὸ δαιμόνιον· χρόνοις γὰρ ὕστερον ἐξεπολεμήθησαν διὰ δούλους).

these slaves fled their masters' estates and households, to congregate in an isolated, mountainous part of the island. Initially this was a rather chaotic affair, slaves were leaving their mountain refuge to plunder the countryside, until Drimacus, also a runaway slave, assumed leadership of the movement, "as king would take command of the army" (ὡς ἂν βασιλέα στρατεύματος). Under his leadership, they became more organized and more threatening to the slaveholders of Chios. The Chians made several attempts to crush the revolt by force, each one ending in defeat.[22]

At this point, Drimacus offered a compromise to the citizens of Chios, which was accepted. The slave community in the mountains would refrain from further violence against the citizens, in return they were to be allowed to take agreed upon amounts of food and goods, essentially being paid to keep the peace. Drimacus would cease to shelter runaway slaves indiscriminately. In the future he would accept only those who had genuine grievances; others would be returned to their masters. For many years this compromise held, with Drimacus ruling his mountain kingdom with the utmost discipline, punishing severely those who were out of the line. Then we have a gap in narration: Drimacus is now an old man and the Chians are offering a high bounty on his head. Seeing the end approaching, he urged his young lover to kill him and claim the bounty for himself, which the young man did, following some hesitation. After taking the prize and burying Drimacus, the unnamed youth left the island forever.[23]

---

22. Ath. VI 265d: μικρὸν δὲ πρὸ ἡμῶν οἰκέτην τινὰ μυθολογοῦσιν αὐτοὶ οἱ Χῖοι ἀποδράντα ἐν τοῖς ὄρεσι τὰς διατριβὰς ποιεῖσθαι, ἀνδρεῖον δέ τινα ὄντα καὶ τὰ πολέμια ἐπιτυχῆ τῶν δραπετῶν ἀφηγεῖσθαι ὡς ἂν βασιλέα στρατεύματος. Καὶ πολλάκις τῶν Χίων ἐπιστρατευσάντων ἐπ᾽ αὐτὸν καὶ οὐδὲν ἀνύσαι δυναμένων...

23. Ath. VI 265d-266d: ἐπεὶ αὐτοὺς ἑώρα μάτην ἀπολλυμένους ὁ Δρίμακος (τοῦτο γὰρ ἦν ὄνομα τῷ δραπέτῃ) λέγει πρὸς αὐτοὺς τάδε· "ὑμῖν, ὦ Χῖοί τε καὶ κύριοι, τὸ μὲν γινόμενον πρᾶγμα παρὰ τῶν οἰκετῶν οὐδέποτε μὴ παύσεται· πῶς γάρ, ὁπότε κατὰ χρησμὸν γίνεται θεοῦ δόντος; ἀλλ᾽ ἐὰν ἐμοὶ σπείσησθε καὶ ἐᾶτε ἡμᾶς ἡσυχίαν ἄγειν, ἐγὼ ὑμῖν ἔσομαι πολλῶν ἀγαθῶν ἀρχηγός." σπεισαμένων οὖν τῶν Χίων πρὸς αὐτὸν καὶ ἀνοχὰς ποιησαμένων χρόνον τινὰ κατασκευάζεται μέτρα καὶ σταθμὰ καὶ σφραγῖδα ἰδίαν· καὶ δείξας τοῖς Χίοις εἶπε διότι· "λήψομαι ὅ τι ἂν παρά τινος ὑμῶν λαμβάνω τούτοις τοῖς μέτροις καὶ σταθμοῖς, καὶ λαβὼν τὰ ἱκανὰ ταύτῃ τῇ σφραγῖδι τὰ ταμιεῖα σφραγισάμενος καταλείψω. τοὺς δ᾽ ἀποδιδράσκοντας ὑμῶν δούλους ἀνακρίνας τὴν αἰτίαν, ἐὰν μέν μοι δοκῶσιν ἀνήκεστόν τι παθόντες ἀποδεδρακέναι, ἕξω μετ᾽ ἐμαυτοῦ, ἐὰν δὲ μηδὲν λέγωσι ‖ δίκαιον, ἀποπέμψω πρὸς τοὺς δεσπότας." ὁρῶντες οὖν οἱ λοιποὶ οἰκέται τοὺς Χίους ἡδέως τὸ πρᾶγμα προσδεξαμένους πολλῷ ἔλαττον ἀπεδίδρασκον φοβούμενοι τὴν ἐκείνου κρίσιν· καὶ οἱ ὄντες δὲ μετ᾽ αὐτοῦ δραπέται πολὺ μᾶλλον ἐφοβοῦντο ἐκεῖνον ἢ τοὺς ἰδίους αὐτῶν δεσπότας καὶ πάντ᾽ αὐτῷ τὰ δέοντ᾽ ἐποίουν, πειθαρχοῦντες ὡς ἂν στρατηγῷ· ἐτιμωρεῖτό τε γὰρ τοὺς ἀτακτοῦντας καὶ οὐθενὶ ἐπέτρεπε συλᾶν ἀγρὸν οὐδ᾽ ἄλλο ἀδικεῖν οὐδὲ ἓν ἄνευ τῆς αὐτοῦ γνώμης. ἐλάμβανε δὲ ταῖς ἑορταῖς 266b ἐπιπορευόμενος ἐκ τῶν ἀγρῶν οἶνον καὶ ἱερεῖα τὰ καλῶς ἔχοντα, ὅσα δ᾽ ἂν αὐτοῖς δοίησαν οἱ κύριοι· καὶ εἴ τινα αἴσθοιτο ἐπιβουλεύοντα αὐτῷ ἢ ἐνέδρας κατασκευάζοντα, ἐτιμωρεῖτο. εἶτ᾽ (ἐκήρυξε γὰρ ἡ

After his death, Drimacus left an interesting legacy of respect by slaves and masters. Around his grave a ἡρῷον was built (of Ἥρωος Εὐμενοῦς, The Kind Hero), where both runaway slaves and their masters left offerings. Drimacus is even credited with appearing in dreams of some free Chians, to warn them about plots of their slaves. Athenaeus finishes by remarking that slave leader is nameless in some copies of Nymphodorus' text.[24]

What should we make of this story? The only chronological bit of data is phrase that revolt of Drimacus took place "little before our time" (μικρὸν δὲ πρὸ ἡμῶν),[25] which, if the accepted dating of Nymphodorus is correct, ought to mean sometime during the 3rd century BC.[26] On the face of it, there is nothing impossible in the story and little that seems improbable. That fleeing slaves would congregate in remote and inaccessible locations is well known practice, attested in many times and places. With an area of almost 850 km² Chios is large enough for such activity to be plausible. The refuge of these slaves must have been located somewhere within the mountainous region in the island's northeast. An inaccessible highland stronghold, combined with a large number of armed slaves, would account for inability of the Chians to end the revolt by force.[27]

πόλις χρήματα δώσειν πολλὰ τῷ αὐτὸν λαβόντι ἢ τὴν κεφαλὴν κομίσαντι) οὗτος ὁ Δρίμακος πρεσβύτερος γενόμενος, καλέσας τὸν ἐρώμενον τὸν ἑαυτοῦ εἴς τινα τόπον λέγει αὐτῷ ὅτι· "ἐγώ σε πάντων ἀνθρώπων ἠγάπησα μάλιστα καὶ σύ μοι εἶ καὶ παῖς καὶ υἱὸς καὶ τὰ ἄλλα πάντα. ἐμοὶ μὲν οὖν χρόνος ἱκανὸς βεβίωται, σὺ δὲ νέος εἶ καὶ ἀκμὴν ἔχεις τοῦ ζῆν. τί οὖν ἐστιν; ἄνδρα σε δεῖ γενέσθαι καλὸν κἀγαθόν· ἐπεὶ γὰρ ἡ πόλις τῶν Χίων δίδωσι τῷ ἐμὲ ἀποκτείναντι χρήματα πολλὰ καὶ ἐλευθερίαν ὑπισχνεῖται, δεῖ σε ἀφελόντα μου τὴν κεφαλὴν εἰς Χίον ἀπενεγκεῖν καὶ λαβόντα παρὰ τῆς πόλεως τὰ χρήματα εὐδαιμονεῖν." ἀντιλέγοντος δὲ τοῦ νεανίσκου πείθει αὐτὸν τοῦτο ποιῆσαι· καὶ ὃς ἀφελόμενος αὐτοῦ τὴν κεφαλὴν λαμβάνει παρὰ τῶν Χίων τὰ ἐπικηρυχθέντα χρήματα καὶ θάψας τὸ σῶμα τοῦ δραπέτου εἰς τὴν ἰδίαν ἐχώρησε.

24. Ath. VI 266d-e: καὶ οἱ Χῖοι πάλιν ὑπὸ τῶν οἰκετῶν ἀδικούμενοι καὶ διαρπαζόμενοι μνησθέντες τῆς τοῦ τετελευτηκότος ἐπιεικείας ἡρῷον ἱδρύσαντο κατὰ τὴν χώραν καὶ ἐπωνόμασαν Ἥρωος Εὐμενοῦς· καὶ αὐτῷ ἔτι καὶ νῦν οἱ δραπέται ἀποφέρουσιν ἀπαρχὰς πάντων ὧν ⟨ἂν⟩ ὑφέλωνται. φασὶ δὲ καὶ καθ᾽ ὕπνους ἐπιφαινόμενον πολλοῖς τῶν Χίων προσημαίνειν οἰκετῶν ἐπιβουλάς· καὶ οἷς ἂν ἐπιφανῇ, οὗτοι θύουσιν αὐτῷ ἐλθόντες ἐπὶ τὸν τόπον οὗ τὸ ἡρῷόν ἐστιν αὐτοῦ. ὁ μὲν οὖν Νυμφόδωρος ταῦτα ἱστόρησεν· ἐν πολλοῖς δὲ ἀντιγράφοις ἐξ ὀνόματος αὐτὸν καλούμενον οὐχ εὗρον.

25. Ath. VI 265d.

26. Though Felix Jacoby, *FGrH* III B, F4 n. 10 saw this as a mistake and corrected it as οὐ μικρὸν δὲ πρὸ ἡμῶν (my italics).

27. I disagree with the interpretation of J. Adreau, R. Descat, *op. cit.*, 143 that we are not dealing so much with a slave revolt here as with an interesting case of cooperation between runaway slaves and their former masters. This seems to run contrary to the facts as we have them: some cooperation was eventually achieved, but only after compelling display of strength on the part of the former slaves.

But there are some problems as well. A story is not historical merely because it sounds, in a very broad sense, "realistic". We know next to nothing about Nymphodorus of Syracuse, merely that he lived during the Hellenistic Age, perhaps in the late 3ʳᵈ century BC (but even this is inferred),[28] and wrote a volume on paradoxography (*On Strange Things in Sicily*, Περὶ τῶν ἐν Σικελίᾳ θαυμαζομένων).[29] The tale of Drimacus is taken from his other work, titled *Voyage along the coasts of Asia* (Τῆς Ἀσίας περίπλους).[30] It is puzzling that such a long story (Athenaeus gives us only a condensed version) should find its place in a work like this. But it is likely that Nymphodorus' composition was less a travelogue and more a collection of entertaining tales, less geographical and more paradoxographical in nature.[31] Not only that we have no corroborating account but, to judge from his comment on various versions of Nymphodorus' text, Athenaeus had none himself. Furthermore, the story as we have it is broken in three uneven parts that do not connect well. How did we got from peace between young Drimacus and the Chians, to old Drimacus with Chian bounty on his head? Once dead, why did the Chians choose to worship as a hero the one whose death they solicited? This, together with Athenaeus' comment that Drimacus' name does not appear in all versions of the text, has led Laquer and Jacoby to assume that we are in fact dealing with two or more distinct stories, perhaps taken from different sources, that were artificially cobbled together. In which of these stories was the protagonist actually called Drimacus?[32]

Even if we choose to separate conflicting tales, some difficulties remain. The conclusion of the story is obviously written from the perspective of slaveholders. It asks of the reader to accept that there are "good masters" (who treat the slaves justly, and deserve their obedience) and "bad slaves" (who disobey without proper cause, and deserve punishment), and it frames Drimacus as a divine protector of some idealized master-slave relation.[33] This begins to look like an etiological tale, invented to explain the existence of the shrine of the Kind Hero, and its connection with slaves on the run.

Consequently, the opinions of scholars as to the veracity of this story vary significantly. Already in the 19ᵗʰ century one could read diverse judgments: Fustel de Coulanges saw the account as an imaginary tale, one that resembles "un roman moral", while John P. Mahaffy believed it to be essentially true and

---

28. F. Jacoby, *FGrH* III b 572, 602-605 provides solid arguments for Nymphodorus as a Hellenistic writer, and more specifically writer of the late 3rd century BC, though the latter is less certain.

29. F. Jacoby, *op. cit.*, 602-603.

30. Ath. VI 265c.

31. F. Jacoby, *op. cit.*, 603.

32. Richard Laquer, *RE* XVII, *Nymphodoros* (6): 1625-1627.

33. Ath. VI 266e.

representative of a widespread phenomenon in antiquity.[34] Laquer (*op. cit.*) questioned its historicity, as did Westermann, while Jacoby dismissed it as a pure romance.[35] Soviet scholar Irina A. Šišova (Ирина А. Шишова) believed it to be fictional: Nymphodorus of Syracuse was actually a contemporary – perhaps even an eyewitness – of the Sicilian slave wars, which he used as a model for his imaginary Chian revolt.[36] Sara Forsdyke's dictum that "This wonderful tale cannot be accepted as an accurate account of historical events on Chios" is symptomatic of much of the recent scholarship.[37] On the other hand, there were and are many scholars that are less skeptical. Gustave Glotz took Nymphodorus' account at face value.[38] Moses I. Finley believed that numerous historical parallels are enough to give sound credibility to the story.[39] Alexander Fuks assumed the general outline of the story to be essentially historical, even if some details are not.[40] Joseph Vogt was of similar opinion.[41] Yvon Garlan said of the story that "it contains many details that are perfectly convincing historically."[42] Keith Bradley noted that it "has many features characteristic of maroon life", and that "there is every reason to accept the account as evidence..."[43]

---

34. Fustel de Coulanges, "Mémoire sur l'île de Chio," *Archives des missions scientifiques et littéraires* 5 (1856): 526; John P. Mahaffy, "The Slave Wars Against Rome," *Hermathena* 7, no. 16 (1890): 178-180.

35. William L. Westermann, *The Slave Systems of Greek and Roman Antiquity* (Philadelphia: The American Philosophical Society, 1955), 41-42; F. Jacoby, *op. cit.*, 604.

36. Irina A. Sisova, "Anticnaya tradiciya o Drimake," in *Anticnoe obsestvo. Trudi konferencii po izucaniyu anitcnosti* (Moskva: Nauka, 1967), 85-91. Similar arguments are given in ead., "Rabstvo na Hiose," in Dimitriy P. Kalistov et al. (eds.) *Rabstvo na periferii anticnogo mira* (Leningrad: Nauka, 1968), 182-192.

37. Sara Forsdyke, *Slaves Tell Tales and Other Episodes in the Politics of Popular Culture in Ancient Greece* (Princeton / Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2012). Lydia Langerwerf, "Drimakos and Aristomenes. Two stories of slave rebels in the Second Sophistic," in Stephen Hodkinson (ed.) *Sparta: Comparative Approaches* (Swansea: Classical Press of Wales, 2009), 331-359 treats the story of Drimacus as an example of the Greek literary fiction of the 2nd century AD. Cf. Peter Hunt, *Ancient Greek and Roman Slavery* (Malden: Wiley Blackwell, 2018), 157, who describes the account as "more like a good story than the truth."

38. Gustave Glotz, "Têtes mises à prix dans les cités grecques," *Revue des Études Anciennes* 9 (1907): 4.

39. M. I. Finley, *op. cit.*, 113-114.

40. Alexander Fuks, "Slave war and slave troubles in Chios in the third century BC," *Athenaeum* 46 (1968): 102-111 (reprinted in: Alexander Fuks, *Social Conflict in Ancient Greece*, (Jerusalem: The Magnes Press, 1984), 260-269).

41. Joseph Vogt, "Zum Experiment des Drimakos: Sklavenhaltung und Räuberstand," *Saeculum* 24, no. 3 (1973): 213-219.

42. Y. Garlan, *op. cit.*, 182.

43. K. Bradley, *op. cit.*, 38-40. Cf. id., "Resisting Slavery at Rome," in id., Paul Cartledge (eds.) *The Cambridge World History of Slavery I: The Ancient Mediterranean World* (Cambridge: CUP, 2011), 372. The Drimacus' story is accepted as historical by N. McKeown, *op. cit.*, pp.

Fortunately, the choice is not merely one between "an accurate account of historical events" and pure fiction. Real events can be (and often are) reflected in otherwise literary compositions. One should ask why was the slave-owning island of Chios chosen as the setting for the story? Why do slaves and, especially, a slave mountain refuge loom so largely in it? A romantic tale of a noble bandit-king would work well enough without these elements. When all the suspicious segments are removed, what remains may well be a reflection of actual events that took place on the Hellenistic Chios. The Attican revolt of 104 BC offers something of a parallel. Here too, the slaves escaped to the most inaccessible stronghold they could find, where they were able to hold out for a long time, and from where they made inroads into the countryside. More recent history of slavery provides many similar examples. Continuing forward, the romantic tale(s) of life and afterlife of Drimacus will be discarded, but I will also assume that three core elements of the account – Chian slaves fleeing in large numbers, the existence of slave stronghold in the mountains, and armed slave resistance than went on for some years – are true.

Conditions that Could Lead to Slave Revolts

So far, there is not much to go on, but comparisons with other slave uprisings in antiquity and beyond offer same useful parallels and opportunity for more solid conclusions. Some of historians of ancient slavery, of course, tackled the issue and offered explanations. Many scholars of older generation simply took opinions of certain ancient Athenian writers at face value and assumed that slaves did not revolt because they were, all things considered, well treated and satisfied with their position.[44] In doing so, they ignored statements to the contrary by other sources,[45] as well as the simple observation that many slaves fled whenever the opportunity presented itself.

Attempts to explain the lack of slave revolts prior to later Hellenistic period had been made, many of them focused on discovering a single determining factor. Michael Rostovtzeff believed that there was general impoverishment and marginalization of "lower classes" in the 2nd century BC; the slaves took arms

---

153. From vague language used by T. Urbainczyk, *op. cit.*, 29-31, I could not decide whether she considers the story fictional or not.

44. W. L. Westermann, *op. cit.*, 18, 22 (cf. 41-42); Alfred Zimmern, *The Greek Commonwealth: Politics and Economics in Fifth-Century Athens* (New York: Oxford University Press 1961), 381-382, 384-396 (cf. 179, 264, 266, 275, 348); Joseph Vogt, *Sklaverei und Humanität: Studien zur antiken Sklaverei und ihrer Erforschung* (Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1965), 3-4. Cf. Siegfried Lauffer, *Die Bergwerkssklaven von Laureion II: Gesellschaftliche Verhältnisse, Aufstände* (Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1957), 1012-1015.

45. For example Lys. 7.35; Pl. *Resp.* 578d-9a. Cf. Xen. *Hier*. 10.4: ἤδη δὲ πολλοὶ καὶ δεσπόται βίᾳ ὑπὸ τῶν δούλων ἀπέθανον!

because their position was worst of all and kept deteriorating.[46] In his extensive study on the slave workers of the Laurium, Siegfried Lauffer sought to explain the Attican uprisings as mirroring of the larger movements in Sicily.[47] Geoffrey E. M. de Ste. Croix decided that there was a "simple and obvious" solution. Different slave backgrounds (divergent cultures, languages, ethnicities etc.) meant that it was nearly impossible to organize and coordinate a revolt. Instead, they were forced to choose between fleeing or coming to terms with their fate.[48]

Others opted for a more complex explanation. In his much quoted work on armed resistance of African slaves in the 18th and 19th centuries, Eugene Genovese brings up a list of general conditions needed for the initiation of a large scale slave revolt. According to him, there is "a higher probability of slave revolt where: (1) the master-slave relationship had developed in the context of absenteeism and depersonalization as well as greater cultural estrangement of whites and blacks; (2) economic distress and famine occurred; (3) slaveholding units approached the average size of one hundred to two hundred slaves, as in the sugar colonies, rather than twenty or so, as in the Old South; (4) the ruling class frequently split either in warfare between slave holding countries or in bitter struggles within a particular slaveholding country; (5) blacks heavily outnumbered whites; (6) African-born slaves outnumbered those born into American slavery (creoles); (7) the social structure of the slaveholding regime permitted the emergence of an autonomous black leadership; and (8) the geographical, social, and political environment provided terrain and opportunity for the formation of colonies of runaway slaves strong enough to threaten the plantation regime."[49] Not all conditions are absolutely necessary, rather some combination of majority of them will suffice in most cases.

Several historians of antiquity suggested that this list, perhaps with some modifications, could be applied to the ancient world, maybe even offering explanations as to comparative scarcity of massive slave revolts. Paul Cartledge went further than most and made a valiant attempt to use this theoretical framework to explain the absence of slave revolts and recurrence of helot uprisings.[50] In spite of the obvious effort and great knowledge and diligence on display, there are problems with the solution proposed. Above all, modern concepts of race, racism and nationalism are applied to the ancient world with surprising ease. White masters / black slaves divide of the Atlantic colonial

---

[46]. Michael I. Rostovtzeff, *The Social and Economic History of the Hellenistic World* II (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1941), 756-757.

[47]. S. Lauffer, *op. cit.*, 991-1015.

48. Geoffrey E. M. de Ste. Croix, *The Class Struggle in the Ancient Greek World: From Archaic Age to the Arab Conquest* (Ithaca / New York: Cornell University Press, 1981), 146.

49. E. D. Genovese, *op. cit.*, 11-12.

50. Paul Cartledge, "Rebels and *Sambos* in Classical Greece: A Comparative View," in id., *Spartan Reflections* (London: Duckworth, 2001), 127-152.

societies, is equated with the ancient distinction between Greeks and barbarians with a very little caveat or qualification.[51]

If we accept these conditions or some modification of them as the explanation for the absence of the slave revolts prior to the Hellenistic age, we then must ask how they address the revolts that did happen in 3rd and 2nd centuries BC. That there was a significant social gap between masters and slaves can be taken for granted, but absenteeism, depersonalization and "greater cultural estrangement" (1) are harder to establish. Even if Sicily, where sources give a bleak picture of masters abusing and exploiting their slaves, we predominantly see native Greek masters in possession of Greek-speaking slaves from the Hellenistic east.[52] What sort of total cultural estrangement are we looking for here? There is very little that can be said concerning this aspect in Attica, Delos or Chios. Diodorus provides solid evidence for "absenteeism" in Sicily, but nothing of the kind for other places. Economic distress and famine (2) did not occur prior or during any of these revolts. The size of slaveholding units (3) seems to be very large in Sicily, though no statistics exist, but much smaller in Attica. This is of less importance, however, considering that uprisings began in Laurium. There is hardly any information on this aspect for Delos or Chios. The split in the ruling class (4) played no part in these events, nor were Athens or Chios in a state of war with any foreign enemy. Rome was, of course, always engaged in some or other foreign conflict but all of these were fought far away from Sicily. Roman difficulties in the north of Italy played some role in the Second slave war but not in the First.[53] Slaves did not outnumber the free population (5) in Attica or Delos, nor in Sicily for that matter.[54] Cartledge suggested that slaves were a majority of the population in Chios but the claim is dubious.[55] That newly purchased slaves outnumbered those born in slavery (6) is surely true of Sicily and Chios, probably of Delos as well, while for the 2nd century BC Attica there is just not enough evidence. However, if we consider only the slaves in the Laurium, then this condition is almost certainly fulfilled. The Chian slave refuge and the Sicilian slave revolts certainly had strong leadership, and we can at least infer the same for Attican and

---

51. Ibid, 142-143.

52. Cf. Gerald P. Verbrugghe, "Sicily 210-70 B.C.: Livy, Cicero and Diodorus," *Transactions and Proceedings of the American Philological Association* 103 (1972): 542-543.

53. Numerous examples from Classical and Hellenistic age show that Greek slaves did use civil strife and war as opportunity to free themselves. However, this never took the form of an autonomous revolt. Rather, slaves would join one of the sides (as in Corcyran civil war or the Athenian campaign against Chios) or simply took advantage of irregular circumstances to flee (as did more than 20,000 Athenian slaves from 413 BC onward). See n. 5-7 and 18-20.

54. Ibid, 557-558.

55. Thuc. 8.40.2 (οἱ γὰρ οἰκέται τοῖς Χίοις πολλοὶ ὄντες καὶ μιᾷ γε πόλει πλὴν Λακεδαιμονίων) is no proof; Thucydides could not have known how many slaves there were in Athens, let alone in Chios.

Delian revolts, but was this in any way connected with the social structure of "slaveholding regime" in those places (7)? And if so, how to confirm this, given the state of our evidence? This criterion is both broad and vague. The final condition, one concerning "the geographical, social and political environment" (8) that would allow the formation of runaway slave colonies is again very broad and general. If there was a slave refuge in Chios in the 3rd century BC (again, the date is anything but certain) but not before or later, we should ask what changed regarding these conditions. But there is simply no basis to pursue this line of inquiry.

In short, Genovese's theoretical framework is less useful for explaining the slave revolts of ancient Greece than it would seem at first glance. Some conditions are specifically tailored for the 16th to 19th century Atlantic slavery, and not really applicable to antiquity, or just hopelessly difficult to confirm and examine, given the state of ancient evidence (1, 3, 7, 8). Others are simply not present (2, 4, 5). What remains is 6, the great numbers of individuals recently enslaved and sold, but this surely cannot be enough on its own. However, the slave uprisings in Attica and Delos did happen, probably the one in Chios as well, while slave revolts in the West went on for several years. A solution for this ought to be offered, and preferably one that would explain the absence of similar events prior to the 3rd/2nd centuries BC.

Conditions that Did Cause Slave Revolts

The four conditions that follow are based on observation of commonalities between four Greek cases, and the slave uprisings in Sicily and Italy. The examples from later history are called upon when needed. These factors were clearly present in all the cases and played significant (if not always pivotal) role. I do not suggest that there are no other important factors at play in these events, factors that we are simply unable to see with the sources we have, nor that the mere presence of four main factors would automatically lead to slave unrest.

Numbers. An absolute majority of slaves in any given population is evidently not a requirement for slave revolts to start, least of all overwhelming majority; the cases we have at hand prove as much. However, they also show that significant numbers are essential even for an uprising to begin, and especially to have some success and expand. Revolts in Sicily and Italy began with thousands of slaves that grew into the tens of thousands (hundreds of thousands, if Diodorus is to be believed).[56] The numbers for the Aegean uprisings are not as high, which is to be expected (the total numbers of slaves were lower) but they are still significant. Over a thousand participated in failed uprising in the Laurium mines in ca. 135 BC, and probably even more in the more successful one of 104 BC. Something

---

56. D.S. 34.2.18 (cf. 34.2.27).

about the numbers of slaves involved in the Chian revolt can be gleaned from the fact that they repeatedly beaten off subjugation attempts.

When slaves resort to violence, the high numbers give them greater strength and confidence, but also limit their options. Five or fifteen dissatisfied slaves can chose to flee and/or hide instead of revolting openly, but this is more difficult if they are fifty or five hundred. Where would hundreds or thousands slaves go, how would they survive, unless they take what they need, weapons in hand? Slave revolt in Chios began as a mass of unconnected flights of individual slaves. But, once their number grow beyond a certain point, both sides were pushed in the direction of massive confrontation. It is hard to imagine that the Chians would suffer the continuous existence of a stronghold of armed former slaves, and indeed they did their best to subdue them. On the slave side, a multitude of fugitives hiding in the mountains had little prospect of obtaining food and other necessities except through plunder. Thus, the armed conflict was fought until slaves were successful enough to impose terms on their enemies.

Concentration. High total numbers are not enough on their own, there has to be enough willing and/or desperate slaves at hand, in a limited geographic area, for a revolt to start. This is a more extensive and applicable version of the "size of the slaveholding units" criteria on the Genovese's list. It is potentially one of the stronger points in explaining the absence of slave revolts. Slaves were found everywhere but were rarely concentrated in a single locality in large numbers. Where this existed, the "locality" was usually a large urban area such as Athens, Corinth or Syracuse. But here the slaves were divided between many households and workshops, and also between very different regimes of life and work. They were intermingled with more numerous free population who, if emergency should rise, could quickly arm themselves, unlike slaves. Furthermore, the worst conditions for the enslaved were usually not found inside city walls but in agriculture and undertakings such as mining and stone quarrying.

What, then, of slaves outside cities? The single largest concentration of slaves in the Aegean were the Laurium mines of Attica. In the Classical age there were at the very least around ten thousand slaves (low estimate, perhaps three times as much) working in the silver mines.[57] They were also predominantly adult males and foreigners, purchased specifically for the purpose of hard physical labor. The production of the mines declined during the Hellenistic age, but slave workforce was still in the thousands in the second half of the 2nd century BC. [58] Here we have both numbers and concentration and it is a small wonder that of four known Greek slave revolts, two took place here. The more important question is: why

---

57. S. Lauffer, *op. cit.*, 140-148.

58. Strab. 9.1.23 testifies that silver mines were all but exhausted, a century after the slave uprisings. In the second half of the 2nd century AD Paus. 1.1.1 described the mines as long abandoned.

there were no such revolts in the centuries prior, when the numbers were even larger and conditions hardly any better?

Nothing comparable in size to the Laurium existed elsewhere in the Aegean. Slaves were used in agriculture in significant numbers by the Athenians and others, but they were usually not concentrated in large groups. The largest estates of Attica were of moderate size,[59] not in any way comparable to the vast landholdings of the Hellenistic rulers and grandees, or to the Roman *latifundia*. More typical were small farms with at best several slaves. Outside Attica, it is difficult to speak with great certainty on this topic, but it does not seem that there were many large, compact landholdings, at least not before the Roman times.[60] Where larger estates are found, they are usually not worked by slaves, but by the helots, the penests and similar groups. The island of Chios seems like a good candidate for a place where larger agricultural domains existed and were tiled primarily by slaves. But if this was the case, it did not lead to an uprising of agricultural slaves but to their frequent flights – to the mountains.

Between themselves, Greek communities varied considerably in numbers of slaves in their possession. There were those where enslaved population was moderate and some where it was minimal. Unlike early modern examples, the richer and more developed the ancient state was, the higher the chances that it would possess an abundance of slaves. Thus, numbers and overall conditions that slaves lived in, could be significantly different between two neighboring states. Any coordinated action that would join slaves from different city-states would be exceedingly difficult to organize, and indeed we have no such example. When Greek slaves did rebel, this happened within the confines of a single community. This was a problem in another sense, revolts in Attica and Chios began in close proximity to a large urban center, one that slaves could not hope to take possession of. Their only chance was to take a well-fortified position and fight until they could reach some terms, which they managed to do in Chios. It was fortunate for the slaves in the First Sicilian revolt that they were able to take the

---

59. Alison Burford, *Land and Labor in the Greek World* (Baltimore/London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1993), 70-71. The largest known Attican landholding is supposedly one belonging to a certain Phaenippus, [Dem.] 42.5. Attempts were made to judge the size on the basis of its productivity ([Dem.] 42.20) but the conclusions vary between 40 and 120ha. See Geoffrey E. M. de Ste Croix, "The Estate of Phaenippus (Ps.-Dem. xlii)," in Ernst Badian (ed.) *Ancient Society and Institutions: Studies Presented to Victor Ehrenberg* (New York: Barnes & Noble, 1967), 109-114 for the minimal assessment; Alain Bresson, *The Making of the Ancient Greek Economy: Institutions, Markets and Growth in the City-States* (Princeton/Oxford, Princeton University Press, 2016), 146-148 for the maximal. Smaller, but still "large" by Athenian standards, were the estate of Alcibiades (Pl. *Alc.* I 123c; 28.3 ha), and the one of Aristophanes, mentioned by Lys. 19.29.

60. A. Bresson, *op. cit.*, 149-152.

town of Enna at the very beginning of the conflict, and use it as their base.[61] But Enna was a small and isolated settlement in the hills. Capturing Athens or even Chios by storm was never a realistic option. The problem is most clearly visible at Delos, where the miniature size of the island forced rebels into a hopeless fight; there was practically nowhere to go, no inaccessible hill or stronghold to take and hold. The fragmentation of the Greek world, still very much a fact in the late 2nd century BC, worked against large scale slave revolts.

Desperation. While we can safely assume that all slaves longed for freedom, they above all else desired to survive. But some slaves were objectively in a much better position than others. Those who are reasonably content with their lot or convinced that non-violent options for improving it exist (whether this is actually true or not), will likely not revolt. Among the means of control utilized by slave owners, there are prizes as well as punishments. By encouraging some slaves to work harder and be loyal through privileges and material rewards, masters were also splitting and diminishing groups of potential rebels. For this and other reasons, household servants and slaves trained and employed in specialized crafts rarely riot. Especially difficult, indeed desperate, conditions are required to force someone to consider joining an incredibly dangerous and, in most cases, hopeless venture such as slave insurrection.

In the two Attican cases the rebels were overworked miners. We are reasonably well informed about the dire conditions prevailing in the mines of Laurium. It is true that most of the information comes from the 5th and 4th centuries, but there is little reason to think that there was any improvement by the 2nd century BC.[62] The fleeing Chian slaves were probably employed in agriculture. The situation in Sicily, where slaves lived and worked in detestable conditions, offers interesting parallels: the first revolt began on the estate where Damophilus and his wife habitually abused their slaves. There is no information on the Delian revolt, but since there were no mines or much opportunity for agriculture on the little island, the majority of rebels were most likely the people brought for sale on the infamous Delian slave market.

The criterion of desperation is in part subjective. It is well established that people who spent years in servitude or were born in it are less likely to flee or revolt. Here the importance of recently enslaved persons comes into play. They are much less tolerant of their new position and much more inclined to flee or fight, even when there is not much hope. There is enough evidence to assume that in each of the four Greek cases under consideration, the newly enslaved made up the majority of the rebels.

---

61. D. S. 34.24b. Similarly the Sicilian uprising of 104 BC began with 120 slaves seizing a defensible position: D.S. 36.3.4-5.

62. For the possibility that conditions in the mines were actually worse, that more inhumane and cruel Roman mining practices were introduced in Attica in the 2nd century BC, see S. Lauffer, *op. cit.*, 1005-1006.

Impulse. Finally, it takes something well out of the ordinary to set the violence in motion. Once the slaves shed the blood of the free, they are committed and have no other option but to fight until the (usually bitter) end, but this point of no return is difficult to reach. The impulse can come from the outside of the community in question, or it can be internal, originating from the interactions between masters and slaves. The latter can be unusual demands or brutality on the part of masters or slave handlers, or endless, everyday accumulation of small acts of humiliation and cruelty that are tolerated until a breaking point is reached. The former is any encouragement, inspiration or incentive that comes from the outside. The First Sicilian slave war is an example of the latter: slaves of Damophilus choose to fight to end unusual cruelties they were subjected to; the lack of oversight was a strong contributing factor.[63] The Second war was brought on by an outside impulse: the slaves were incited by the possibility of freedom that was supposedly offered but then immediately denied to them.[64]

Once there is at least a partially successful slave uprising, it becomes an impulse on its own; it can act as a model and a constant encouragement for other similar attempts. We have seen that in the case of the Attican and the Delian revolts the impulse clearly came from outside. Sources we have explain these as reactions to the news of the great uprisings in Sicily.[65] The eagerness with which the slaves initiated a forlorn struggle, once they received the smallest stimulation from the outside, shows that other conditions, and especially that of desperation, must have been well and truly present beforehand.

There is a clear historical parallel between these events and the Haitian (Saint-Domingue) slave revolution of 1791. This uprising, by far the largest in the history of Atlantic slavery, was itself brought on by an outside cause – the grant of freedom and citizenship for the enslaved of Saint-Domingue by the French parliament, and the stark refusal of the white planter class to accept this outcome. But, once successful, the Haitian example began to exert influence of its own on other enslaved groups in the Western hemisphere. Several Brazilian slave revolts were directly inspired by it, as well as the German Coast Uprising in Louisiana in 1811, the largest slave rebellion in the history of the United States, the Great African revolt in Cuba in 1825, and the Jamaica Rebellion of 1831-32 ("the Christmas Rebellion"). Though none of these movements had much success, the abolition of slavery and the complete freedom were now seen as realistic goals. In the earlier, 17th and 18th century revolts, the rebels mostly aimed at creating "maroons", "quilombos" and similar refugee communities.[66]

---

63. D. S. 34.2.10, 26, 34-37.

64. D. S. 36.3.1-3.

65. D.S. 34.2.19; Oros. 5.9.5.

66. E. D. Genovese, *op. cit.*, 82-120; Herbert S. Klein and Francisco V. Lunda, *Slavery in Brazil* (Cambridge: CUP, 2010), 208-211; Manuel Barcia, *African Slave Revolt of 1825: Cuba and the Fight for Freedom in Matanzas* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2012), 51, 97-119.

As a side note, free individuals sometimes incite slaves to revolt, out of their own personal interests. Polyaenus speaks of such an attempt by a free man named Sosistratus, during the Athenian siege of 414-413 BC. The attempt was thwarted before it took off.[67] According to Diodorus, a Roman knight named Titus Minucius Vettius actually lead an unsuccessful slave revolt in Campania ca. 105 BC. His motives were distinctly personal and selfish, but thousands of slaves that followed him willingly had reasons of their own.[68]

The Chian example is somewhat different; the impulse was internal, and not a direct product of master/slave interaction. Here the situation itself and worsening conditions provided enough incentive for armed action. The inability to leave the island, to obtain supplies, as well as the increasing numbers of slaves within the refuge directly led to pillaging and other violent actions.

Conclusion

After taking everything into account the initial questions began to seem pointless. Given the prevailing conditions there was never much opportunity for the enslaved in ancient Greece to rise in rebellion, let alone be successful in such an attempt. The first Attican and the Delian revolt were brief though bloody affairs. The Chian and Second Attican uprisings went on for longer time, but only because the slaves utilized the local geography to their advantage. The ultimate failure of these movements must have had a discouraging effect on any similar endeavors. Nothing comparable to revolutions in Sicily and Haiti was ever likely to happen in ancient Greece. It is indeed remarkable that any slave revolts took place at all.

Faced with a situation as hopeless as this, some slaves took advantage of other options, including individual or group flight, cooperation with participants in civil conflicts or foreign enemies appearing on the borders of their particular slave state. Such actions were highly dangerous and precarious on their own, of course, but much less so than an autonomous slave revolt. Athenian slaves fled in great numbers to the Spartans and Boeotians during the Decelean war,[69] while at the same time the Chian slaves threw in their lot with the Athenians and ravaged their masters' estates.[70] A similar choice was made by many Greek and Anatolian slaves during the wars of Aristonicus and Mithridates, in the 2nd and 1st centuries BC.

---

67. Polyaen. *Strat*. 1.43.2. Thucydides makes no mention of this episode.

68. D. S. 36.2.

69. Thuc. 7.27.5. They did not flee to freedom, though, as testified by *Hell. Oxy*. XVII (XII) 4.

70. Thuc. 8.40.2.

However, even those slaves that fled rarely seem to congregate in large and permanent groups. The kingdom of Drimacus on Chios is often compared with "maroons", the settlements of runaway slaves in the Western Hemisphere. And, indeed, there are many similarities, which came about through broadly similar goals. However, while the Chian slave state, if historical, is the only clear ancient Greek example,[71] "maroons" are among the widespread and ubiquitous phenomena in the history of Western colonialism. There were hundreds of these in Brazil, Suriname, Guyana, Colombia, Jamaica, Cuba and elsewhere, even some in the southern parts of USA. Some of the more long lasting "maroons" survived for several generations, fighting, trading and sometimes even cooperating with the colonies they fled from, as well as with the other "maroons".[72] However, this was made possible by the existence of vast areas of swamps, hills and forests, with little or no human settlement, for slaves to escape to. Similar communities would be much harder to establish in the Classical and Hellenistic Aegean which had a greater population than 18th century colonies of Brazil, Suriname and Guyana combined, but with the territory that was several orders of magnitude smaller.

Why, then, were there some slave revolts in the 3rd and 2nd century BC, but none before? In short, the absence of an initial catalyst. Where the slaves were concentrated in greater numbers, as in the Laurium, they were subjected to tight control that made organizing and resisting extremely unlikely, at least without the strong incentive from the outside. Since in antiquity there was no antislavery and abolitionist movement or ideology to provide that role, the only alternative was a successful uprising elsewhere. And then, for a brief moment in the 2nd century BC, there actually was a glimmer of hope, brought on by the massive revolts in the West, and some of the Aegean slaves made valiant if futile attempts to regain their freedom. In Classical Greece the slaves were numerous and there certainly was desperation and suffering aplenty. But the proper impulse was nowhere to be found.

Note

A short version of this paper was presented at the *21st ATINER Annual International Conference on History & Archaeology: From Ancient to Modern*, held in Athens, Greece between 29th May and 1st June 2023.

---

71. The "slave city" (Δούλων πόλις) near Claros in the late 2nd century BC, mentioned in L. & J. Robert, *Claros* I, 1, col. II, ll. 36-47, may be another example, if K. Rigsby's interpretation (*op. cit.*) is correct.
72. E. D. Genovese, *op. cit.*, 51-81; H. S. Klein, F. V. Lunda, *op. cit.*, 193-199.

Bibliography

Andreau, Jean and Descat, Raymond. *The Slave in Greece and Rome*. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2011.

Barcia, Manuel. *African Slave Revolt of 1825: Cuba and the Fight for Freedom in Matanzas.* Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2012.

Bradley, Keith R. *Slavery and Rebellion in the Roman World, 140 B.C. - 70 B.C.* Bloomington/ London: Indiana University Press / B. T. Batsford, 1989.

Bradley, Keith and Paul Cartledge, Paul (Eds.) *The Cambridge World History of Slavery I: The Ancient Mediterranean World*. Cambridge: CUP, 2011.

Bresson, Alain. *The Making of the Ancient Greek Economy: Institutions, Markets and Growth in the City-States.* Princeton / Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2016.

Brian McGing. *The Foreign Policy of Mithridates VI Eupator King of Pontus.* Leiden: Brill, 1986.

Burford, Alison. *Land and Labor in the Greek World*. Baltimore/London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1993.

Cartledge, Paul. "Rebels and *Sambos* in Classical Greece: A Comparative View." In id., *Spartan Reflections*. London: Duckworth, 2001, 127-152.

De Coulanges, Fustel. "Mémoire sur l'île de Chio." (Memory on the Island of Chio.) *Archives des missions scientifiques et littéraires* 5 (1856): 481-642.

De Ste Croix, Geoffrey E. M. "The Estate of Phaenippus (Ps.-Dem. xlii)." In *Ancient Society and Institutions: Studies Presented to Victor Ehrenberg,* edited by Ernst Badian. New York: Barnes & Noble, 1967, 109-114.

De Ste Croix, Geoffrey E. M. *The Class Struggle in the Ancient Greek World: From Archaic Age to the Arab Conquest.* Ithaca/New York: Cornell University Press, 1981.

Ducat, Jean. *Les Hilotes.* Athènes/Paris : École française d'Athènes, 1990.

Finley, Moses I. *Ancient Slavery and Modern Ideology.* New York: Viking Press, 1980.

Forsdyke, Sara. *Slaves Tell Tales and Other Episodes in the Politics of Popular Culture in Ancient Greece.* Princeton / Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2012.

Forsdyke, Sara. *Slaves and Slavery in Ancient Greece.* Cambridge: CUP, 2021.

Fuks, Alexander. "Slave war and slave troubles in Chios in the third century BC." *Athenaeum* 46 (1968): 102-111.

Fuks, Alexander. *Social Conflict in Ancient Greece.* Jerusalem: The Magnes Press, 1984.

Garlan, Yvon. *Slavery in Ancient Greece*. Ithaca/London: Cornell University Press, 1988.

Genovese, Eugene D. *From Rebellion to Revolution: Afro-American Slave Revolts in the Making of the Modern World.* Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 1979.

Glotz, Gustave. "Têtes mises à prix dans les cités grecques." (Bounty on Heads in Greek Cities.) *Revue des Études Anciennes* 9 (1907): 1-5.

Hunt, Peter. *Slaves, Warfare, and Ideology in the Greek Historians.* Cambridge: CUP, 1998.

Hunt, Peter. "Arming Slaves and Helots in Classical Greece." In *Arming Slaves: from Classical Times to Modern Age,* edited by Christopher Leslie Brown, Philip D. Morgan. New Haven/London: Yale University Press, 2006, 14-39.

Hunt, Peter. "Slaves of Serfs?: Patterson on the Thetes and Helots of Ancient Greece." In *On Human Bondage. After Slavery and Social Death*, edited by John Bodel and Walter Scheidel. Malden/Oxford: Wiley Blackwell, 2017, 61-80.

Hunt, Peter. "Ancient Greece as a 'Slave Society'." In *What is a Slave Society? The Practice of Slavery in Global Perspective*, edited by Noel Lenski, Catherine M. Cameron. Cambridge: CUP, 2018, 61-85.

Hunt, Peter. *Ancient Greek and Roman Slavery.* Malden: Wiley Blackwell, 2018.

Jacoby, Felix. *Die Fragmente der Griechischen Historiker* III B: *Autoren ueber einzelne Staedte (Laender) Nr. 297-607.* (The Fragments of the Greek Historians III B: Authors on Individual Cities (Countries) Nos. 297-607.) Leiden: Brill, 1950.

Jacoby, Felix. *Die Fragmente der Griechischen Historiker* III b: *Kommentar zu Nr. 297-607.* (The Fragments of the Greek Historians III b: Commentary on Nos. 297-607.) Leiden: Brill, 1955.

Klein, Herbert S. and Francisco V. Lunda. *Slavery in Brazil.* Cambridge: CUP, 2010.

Langerwerf, Lydia. "Drimakos and Aristomenes. Two stories of slave rebels in the Second Sophistic." In *Sparta: Comparative Approaches,* edited by Stephen Hodkinson. Swansea: Classical Press of Wales, 2009, 331-359.

Laquer, Richard. Nymphodoros (6).` *RE* XVII: 1625-1627.

Lauffer, Siegfried. *Die Bergwerkssklaven von Laureion II: Gesellschaftliche Verhältnisse, Aufstände.* (The Mine Slaves of Laureion II: Social Conditions, Uprisings.) Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1957.

Lewis, David M. *Greek Slave Systems in their Eastern Mediterranean Context, c. 800-146 BC.* Oxford: OUP, 2018.

Luraghi, Nino. "Helotic Slavery Reconsidered." In *Sparta: Beyond the Mirage*, edited by Anton Powell and Stephen Hodkinson. London: Duckworth/Classic Press of Wales, 2002, 227-248.

Mahaffy, John P. "The Slave Wars against Rome." *Hermathena* 7, no. 16 (1890): 167-182.

McGing, Brian. *The Foreign Policy of Mithridates VI Eupator King of Pontus.* Leiden: Brill, 1986.

McKeown, Niall. "Resistance among Chattel Slaves in the Classical Greek World." In *The Cambridge World History of Slavery I: The Ancient Mediterranean World,* edited by Keith Bradley, Paul Cartledge. Cambridge: CUP, 2011, 153-175.

Patterson, Orlando. *Slavery and Social Death.* Cambridge MA / London: Harvard University Press: 1982.

Rigsby, Kent J. "Agathopolis and Doulopolis."*Epigraphica Anatolica* 38 (2005): 109-115.

Rostovtzeff, Michael I. *The Social and Economic History of the Hellenistic World* II. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1941.

Sisova, Irina A. "Anticnaya tradiciya o Drimake." (Ancient Tradition on Drimacus). In *Anticnoe obsestvo. Trudi konferencii po izucaniyu anitcnosti.* Moskva: Nauka, 1967, 85-91.

Sisova, Irina A. "Rabstvo na Hiose." (Slavery in Chios.) In *Rabstvo na periferii anticnogo mira,* edited by Dimitriy P. Kalistov et al. Leningrad: Nauka, 1968, 149-191.

Strauss, Barry. "Slave Wars of Greece and Rome." In *Makers of Ancient Strategy. From the Persian Wars to the Fall of Rome*, edited by V. D. Hanson. Princeton/Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2010, 185-205.

Urbainczyk, Theresa. *Slave Revolts in Antiquity.* London/New York: Routledge, 2008.

Verbrugghe, Gerald P. "Sicily 210-70 B.C.: Livy, Cicero and Diodorus." *Transactions and Proceedings of the American Philological Association* 103 (1972): 535-559.

Vlassopulos, Kostas. *Historicising Ancient Slavery.* Edinburgh: University Press, 2021.

Vogt, Joseph. *Sklaverei und Humanität: Studien zur antiken Sklaverei und ihrer Erforschung.* (Slavery and Humanity: Studies in Ancient Slavery and its Exploration.) Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag: 1965.

Vogt, Joseph. "Zum Experiment des Drimakos: Sklavenhaltung und Räuberstand." (On the Drimakos Experiment: Slavery and Robbery.) *Saeculum* 24, no. 3 (1973): 213-219.

Welwei, Karl-Wilhelm. *Unfreie im antiken Kriegsdienst* I: *Athen und Sparta.* (Bonded in Ancient Military Service I: Athens and Sparta.) Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1974.

Welwei, Karl-Wilhelm. *Unfreie im antiken Kriegsdienst* II: *die kleiner und mittleren griechische Staaten und die hellenistischen Reiche.* (Bonded in Ancient Military Service II: The Small and Medium-Sized Greek States and the Hellenistic Empires.) Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1977.

Westermann, William L. *The Slave Systems of Greek and Roman Antiquity.* Philadelphia: The American Philosophical Society, 1955.

Zelnick-Abramovitz, Rachel. *Not Wholly Free. The Concept of Manumission and the Status of Manumitted Slaves in the Ancient Greek World.* Leiden/Boston: Brill, 2005.

Zimmern, Alfred. *The Greek Commonwealth: Politics and Economics in Fifth-Century Athens.* New York: Oxford University Press, 1961.

Plato's Academy and the "Roman Market": A Case Study in "Humanities Education" During Times of Crisis or Recession

By David Philip Wick*

The innovative (and sometimes painful) story of Athens' self-transformation from a self-defined and self-confident independent city-state to a culture-market and service economy that discovered it could thrive best by selling its heritage to others is one I have written on in the past from a number of angles. To the elite of Athens, both community leaders and leaders in the city's culture, the most poignant stories may have been those of the city's schools, in particular the school that defined (for traditionalists who were not themselves philosophers) what "Athenian philosophy" meant: the Academy, the school of Plato. I should like in this short study to follow the leaders, the 'scholarchs' of that school – all of them 'working philosophers' as well as what we would call administrators – who successfully adapted it to survive through, and draw on the clientele of, the last three generations or so of the Roman Republic. I should like to see if these behaviors and characters – and they, while they do not always fit what we expect from a classical philosopher, make more sense if understood by the school's 'driving clientele,' and finally what sort of story this adds up to.

The "Academy" to which Romans flocked, as students or intellectual tourists in the last generations of the Republic, was a place pictured in the mind and heart as much as an institution. They expected as they landed in the Piraeus and took the roads that skirted the rubble of the old Long Walls toward urban Athens a grove from the dialogues, full of immemorial *auctoritas* because Plato and even Socrates had once spoken there. It came as a melancholy shock to Cicero to find in 79 that he and his friends would have to make do with visiting the old site one afternoon–a special hike out toward the little hill of Colonus by themselves.[1] The place was deserted. The very ground was bare. All the lovely, shady, stream-watered trees one could almost *feel* in Plato's later dialogues had been ripped out by Sulla to make artillery for the siege of Athens.[2] Later in the *de Finibus* Cicero recalled the almost heartbreaking quietness of the scene, and how afterward in Athens he and his friends spoke of what really mattered to them in the city: Quintus Cicero of the little town of Colonus haunted by the ghosts of Sophocles and the *Oedipus* set there; Lucius Cicero of the beach where Demosthenes worked

---

*Professor (Retired), Gordon College, USA.

1. Cicero, *De Finibus* v, 1 and 2. Cf. Rawson, *Intellectual Life in the Late Republic* (London, 2002), 11.
2. Plutarch, *Sulla*, xii; Pausanias I, xxix, 2. In Levi's edtn., (Harmondsworth, 1981), vol. 1, p. 83 and esp. Levi's note 172.

at his oratory, and of the tomb of Pericles.[3]

"Plato's Academy" – The definitive school of schools in Athens, was by the generation or two before Julius Caesar a foreigners' school. As the eastern Mediterranean fractured and the Roman Republic spread toward it in the generations leading up to Julius Caesar's, the arrival of young, toga'd Romans looking among the groves and colonnaded porches of the legendary town for both learning they could use in political and legal careers, and as they grew older, take refuge from the world of power politics, became the norm in Athens. By Cicero's student years, outsiders looking for and dominating the educational subculture of Athens (and one of its most important economic sectors) were no longer 'aliens.' Not only the bulk of students there, but most of the prominent teachers as well had been, even since the Hellenistic changes of the Fourth Century, outsiders. The men who *made* Athens a university town in the first generation after the classical world fell – Plato, Isocrates, perhaps Polycrates – had been natives. The following generation – Aristotle, Theophrastus, Zeno, Cleanthes, Chrysippus – were all new in the town.[4] Epicurus had indeed been an Athenian, though of colonial birth, and that (coupled with his un-Athenian gentleness, his extremely easy health, and his remarkable age) must have set him apart.[5]

But as the age of Epicurus passed, the close alignment we are used to between famous teacher and a distinct choice among the Athenians schools (whether for that teacher's career, for as an expectation in students coming to Athens to learn) began to blur. Principal philosophers rotated through the various schools, including the Academy, in an almost casual fashion, almost as though the governing of knowledge in each was to be done by serial democracy, in the old manner of the Athenian council. *Scholarch* (the school administrator of the era) passed wisdom and a library on to *scholarch* like civic Athenians passing through the chair of the *archon basileius*, the difference being that non - Athenians almost monopolized the academic chair.[6]

---

3. Cicero, *De Finibus* v, 1 and 2. Cf. Rawson, "Cicero and the Areopagus," *Athenaeum* 63 (1985): 26 f.

4. This philosophical "second generation" was a thorough, fundamental shock to the intellectual self- sufficiency of the archetypal Greek polis just as the fourth century series of brushfire wars was a shock to its political self-sufficiency. For a very sensitive discussion of this unsettlingly wide new world to which Athens lay exposed, its spiritual walls in shambles, see Dodds, "The Fear of Freedom," in his *Greeks and the Irrational*, (Berkeley, 1951), esp. 237-243.

5. Lucretius V, 8 has a genuinely religious (and Hellenistic) fervor to it, however sophisticated its exact meaning, and so also Cicero, *Tusculans*, I, 48. Both were (Hellenized) Romans.

6. It is the very *fact* that cultured outsiders make up by scholastic rotation the intellectual culture of Athens that commends the place to Cicero (*de Orat*. III, 43); it is responsible for the unusually elegant, cosmopolitan Greek spoken there. It should not be too quickly dismissed, either, that something like the evolution of the 'career college

Outsiders now occupied a great many student seats as well: that constellation of Hellenistic cities which now ran all-round the rim of the eastern Mediterranean sent the youth of its elite families to study – or at least to be initiated into the old heritage and flavor of Greek culture – in the university towns round the Aegean. Athens was the favorite, if one's family could afford it.[7] A proper initiation included registration in the city's ephebic corps (the course of political and religious training by which Athens had in the classical era made fully committed *Athenians* of her male children). It was open by the first century B.C. to outsiders who could pay, allowing them to carry a sort of spiritual diploma in "authentic" Greekness back to the scattered and wistfully Hellenic cities of the east. An outsider could even, if he wished, use graduation from the *ephebeia* as a door to Athenian citizenship.[8] Future kings like Antiochus Epiphanes jostled side by side with the children of Attica who themselves begin to appear in the ephebic lists bearing names like Ptolemy, Seleucus, Ariarathes, Parmenio, and Pyrrhus. The *Index Stoicorum Herculanensis*, with its lists of principal students attached to the great teachers of the Stoa, reads like an international sampler.[9] An extreme example might perhaps be a young Carthaginian named Hasdrubal who so hellenized and distinguished himself in the Academy under Carneades that he eventually (under the Greek name Cleitomachus) opened his own school in the Palladion.[10]

Actually, it is with the Carneades just mentioned that we can mostly easily pick up a thread to follow this story. Newcomers had to deal with discovering that many of the most admired old schools in the city were rather dilapidated, improvising philosophically to make ends meet. Before Carneades, Romans came to Athens with a more old-fashioned set of tastes and a simpler idea of "Greekness" than anyone in the real Greek world had admitted to for generations.[11] Romans thus resembled the classicists of the Middle Ages rather as the Hellenistic scholars resembled those of the Renaissance. Carneades' moment of fame in Italy

---

administrator' with a point of view increasingly unconnected with the teaching ethos of the institution may also be emerging here.

7. H. I. Marrou, *A History of Education in Antiquity* (London, 1956), 284 ff; Mossé, *Athens in Decline* (London, 1973), 146-147; W. S. Ferguson, *Hellenistic Athens: an Historical Essay* (London, 1911), 316; J. P. V. D. Balsdon, *Life and Leisure* (London, 1969), 233-234.

8. John K. Davies, "Athenian Citizenship: the Descent Group and the Alternatives," *Classical Journal* 73 (1975): 119. Cf. M. J. Osborne, *Naturalization in Athens* (Brussels, 1982), 205.

9. Rawson, *Intellectual Life* (London, 1985, 2002), 55; Jean-Louie Ferrary, *Philhellénisme et Impérialisme: Aspects Idéologiques de la Conquête Romaine du Monde Hellénistique, de la Seconde Guerre de Macédoine à la Guerre Contre Mithridate* (Rome, 1988), 453.

10. Diogenes Laertius, iv, 67; Ferguson, 337 f; Balsdon, *Romans and Aliens* (Chapel Hill, 1979), 120 f.

11. Though one can be forgiven for ignoring the urban legends that grew about Romans asking if Plato (or even Socrates) were still actively teaching somewhere in town; those are just the usual in-town stories told to celebrate the gullibility of tourists.

went far to change this.

The stage setting was a court case that carried Greeks to Rome. A few years before 157 B.C., an Athenian expedition seized a stretch of land including the small port town Oropus just north of the mountains and eastern coast of Attica, where the Attic coast met Boeotia and bent northward to enter the Euripus straits. Oropus and areas near it were "granted" or "recognized" to have Athenian citizenship and had the full portfolio of Attic road tolls levied.[12] When a raid from Athens attempted to collect these by force, Oropus (which stood no chance in an Athenian court) appealed a lawsuit directly to the Roman Senate – which also had a lawsuit filed by Delos against the Athenians hanging fire. The Senate's instinctive first reaction initially (before the contending parties showed up in Italy to contest the case) went wrong for the city – damages were levied at a shocking 500 talents. Athens (while refusing to pay) responded by playing to its strength as an educational and cultural, rather than a political power; in fact an argument could be made that Athens had strategized this. A mission of Athens' most authoritative experts in philosophy and oratory left for Rome to press their case.[13] Carneades (a brilliant orator in the classic style of sophistic expertise, especially in 'live social media,' and head of Academy as well) led this historic embassy in 155; his colleagues Diogenes and Critolaus were heads of the Stoa and the Lyceum. They intended to mix courtroom skill with a little cultural advertising. The result was first coup and then commotion – Carneades attracted initially a cadre of interested students and then a crowd to demonstrations that applied oratorical and dialect skill not to a pursuit of inner or higher truth, but of votes, and managed to sway the same crowd toward opposite sides of the same issue on successive days before the public tumbled to the way they were being played, and the horrified elder Cato had them voted out of the city.[14]

Carneades was as aware as anyone that in the Italy of this era there was a growing sense of cultural "inferiority" in portions of the Roman upper class, a feeling that grew more conscious (however it was denied) as Rome's empire began to become truly international. But a sense of inferiority does not by itself answer very much. Romans were beginning to hire Greek *grammatici* to teach their children (or, surreptitiously, the adults) a few fine points of Hellenic culture. These could be contracted easily for a little money in Rome.[15] Historians should not underestimate the tendency of such feelings to produce antagonism at least as often as they spur curiosity. The Elder Cato who expelled Carneades had himself

---

12. Polybius XXXII, ii, 5. Cf. F. W. Walbank, *A Historical Commentary on Polybius* (Oxford, 1957-79), 531-536.

13. Polybius XXXII, ii.

14. Plutarch, *Life of Marcus Cato.* See also C. Habicht, *Athens from Alexander to Antony* (London, 1997), 266f, though the passage misses most of the cultural relevance.

15. On *grammatici* see Rawson, *Intellectual Life*, 117-131. Balsdon, *Romans and Aliens*, 43-58. For Varro's definition of the discipline, frags. 234, 236, and perhaps 237 (doubtfully genuine).

learned the language of the Greeks, and was not above adapting and taking credit for the more homespun of their aphorisms,[16] but he rounded back upon the culture and its works with ferocity when advising his son.

> "I shall speak in the proper place of those damned Greeks; I shall say what I saw in Athens, and how it may be good to glance at their literature, but not to go into it deeply. I shall prove how detestable and worthless is their race. Believe me, Marcus my son, this is an oracular saying: 'if ever that race comes to pass its literature to us, all is lost.'"[17]

If so, of course, the cause was already lost. "Greek literature is read in nearly every country under heaven," Cicero confessed before a Roman court, "while the vogue of Latin is confined to its own boundaries, and they are, we must admit, narrow."[18] The coup Carneades managed was built upon it; Cato could only add flavor to his success.

Students flocked from Italy toward Athens; skills of such wizardry as the Greek professors had shown – and literally on the steps of the Senate – were at a premium in an over-stressed electoral culture like Rome's. Carneades returned to Athens, waited for the Academy, under his leadership, to reap the benefits. Yet, despite the excitement Carneades caused in Rome when he demonstrated what a really trained (and morally unfettered) use of oral persuasion might do, Romans found it difficult to imagine him as head of the Academy. Was the Academy not *Plato's* school? Was Plato not a master in Greek thought, source of all the Academy's intellectual *auctoritas*? Carneades' skepticism about beliefs and universals was perhaps very interesting (if a little dangerous to a typically Roman parental mind) and the skepticism being balanced by a disturbingly powerful skill that could be used to sway voters and jurors worried the more thoughtful.

Who in Athens, on the other hand, taught *Plato's* wisdom? The idea of a "New" Academy did not go down well, nor did the fact that Carneades' prodigy Cleitomachus of Carthage, despairing of a prominent place under his master's shadow, seemed to have casually gone off across the Ilyssos and opened his own "Platonist" school in the Palladion.[19] One Academy that taught practical politics instead of Plato was difficult enough, but two Academies?

The arrival of Carneades' successor Philo of Larissa in Rome during the years of the Mithridatic crisis brought this issue to a head. Philo was also something of a skeptic: he wished to discover far more about the world by means of

---

16. Albert Grenier, *The Roman Spirit* (New York, 1926), 148 f. Cf. Chester Starr, *The Emergence of Rome* (Cornell, 1960), 49.

17. Frag. transl. by M. R. Dobie, in Grenier, ibid, 149.

18. Cicero, *Pro Archia* x, 23.

19. *Acad. Ind. Herc.* xxiv, 32-37; xxv, 8-11. Cicero, *Academica*, ii, 98. Cf. Ferrary, 448. Ferguson, 337 f.

investigative sense perception than Plato would have cared for.[20] Philo seems to have complained in Rome that he was struggling for headship of the Academy with Antiochus of Ascalon, *not* because Antiochus claimed to be more Platonist than he, but because Antiochus wished to carry the Academy in yet another direction (toward Stoicism). The resulting unease helped spur Philo (who by now had begun to tutor the young Cicero) toward an *apologia*. We do not know the title of this work, but it argued – apparently rather desperately – that nothing had ever fundamentally changed in Academic teaching, that Plato was a skeptic in the vein of Carneades and Philo, that political 'wisdom' and altruism had *never* been a part of the Academy, and good riddance to them.[21] Antiochus replied bitterly, and an academic brushfire war developed, in which Antiochus probably accused Philo of being a Peripatetic (an 'empirical-only' political thinker)[22], and Philo probably accused Antiochus of being a Stoic (with a sense of 'useless mystic' to the accusation).

Neither Roman intellect nor patience was ready for this; Q. Lutatius Catulus the elder accused Philo of lying – amoral political skills were not what Romans should be sending their children to master.[23] And then, there were those disastrous rumors that the terrorists who had taken over the Acropolis for Mithridates were graduates of the Academy.[24] All that Carneadic moral skepticism had a sting in it.

That Philo was anxious to retain his position of scholarch after the war was over mattered not at all to the Romans, of course. Everyone from Rome wanted to attend the "actual" Academy, and at the actual site of which they had heard so much. They often arrived with highly romantic or outdated ideas about who might still be in residence there.[25] The name of Carneades had worked a sort of advertising magic for a very long time even after the old sophist retired due to blindness and old age, in the early 130's. After sliding into decay under a series of his cronies, the Academy passed to Cleitomachus around 129,[26] and finally into the hands of Philo around 110.[27] Philo himself, almost before the echoes of his

---

20. J. Glucker, *Antiochus and the Late Academy* (Göttingen, 1978), cap. 1. Rawson, *Intellectual Life*, 289. Cf. J. Dillon, *The Middle Platonists* (London, 1977), 105.

21. Cicero, *Academica* ii: 5, 11, 102, 135.

22. For the developing connotation of this around the 'Aristotelian' school see D. P. Wick, "The Lyceum in Twilight: Athens' 'Second School' and its Struggle to Re-Invent Itself and Survive in the Last Years of the Roman Republic," *Athens Journal of History* 8, no. 2 (2022): 99-108.

23. Cicero, *Academica* ii, 11. Cf. Rawson, *Intellectual Life*, 57-58.

24. For the story (and alleged, but unlikely, *Akademe* connection) see D. P. Wick, "Students in the (Ancient) Streets, or Agent(s) Provocateur? The Liberal Arts Schools of Athens and the Hostage Crisis of 88," *Athens Journal of History* 6, no. 4 (2020): 299-312.

25. D. Sedley, "The End of the Academy," *Phronesis* (1981), 67. Cf. Cicero, *de Finibus*, v, 6.

26. Ferguson, 337-338.

27. Ferrary, 447.

controversy with Antiochus had finished thundering, died in 84/83. If he had returned to Athens at all, it was likely only to the official position of Academic representative in the Ptolemaeum.[28] Antiochus of Ascalon was thus in control of the Academy soon after the Mithridatic War, and began its slow turn toward Stoicism. It was returning, he said, to the original principles of Plato and was christened the "Old Academy," while followers of Carneades' and Philo's skeptical turn of mind were derisively called the "New" Academy. In fact it began the journey (as Dodds pointed out) that would reach culmination with Plotinus.[29]

And finally, if all the rest were not confusing or fragmented enough, the old splinter academy begun by Cleitomachus also continued, now under Charmadas.[30] Here Charmadas seems to have fostered for a while the only Attic "school" in which one can really find an anti-Roman tendency, perhaps a last echo of Carneadic disdain for the western barbarians who fell so easily to verbal expertise, but who seemed likely to conquer the world anyway. Like Philo, and following an example plainly set by the talents if not the practice of Carneades, he taught both philosophy and rhetoric (that is, the practice of verbal politics) in his classes.[31]   His students – most notably Diodorus of Adramyttium, who functioned for Mithridates in Caria very much as Athenion (the leader of the pro-Mithridatic hostage crisis on the Acropolis in the 80's) had in Athens – seem to have formed a sort of "Bythinian" or at least anti-Roman column in Asia during times of crisis.[32]

So we come back to Cicero's sad visit, to the picnic in the ruined Academy grounds, on a tour made in the first place to by an idealistic group of foreign students to find some feeling of intellectual home in the Athens they had come to for skill and wisdom, but producing instead in the scrub-brush of that hillside west of Athens what must have been another layer to that feeling of exile students so often experience. Cicero returned to the city, plunged into his studies and chose as his 'master' Antiochus. Antiochus now **was** *scholarch* of what the

---

28. Glucker, *Antiochus*, 98-120. Ferrary, 448. The Ptolemaeum had by this point begun to house and formalize the Athenian *ephebeia*, which had evolved from a kind of 'civic prep' for Athenian boys in the Classical era to something much more like a citizenship-prepping civic high school, and which recruited students from the non-Athenian immigrant families (esp. those of the business class) who were now settling in Athens from Italy, the Mediterranean west, and some Hellenistic eastern cultures. See D. P. Wick, *Lyceum in Twilight* (op cit.), and on the Stoic angle, Wick, "*Stoics and Epicureans for the 'Modern Market': How Athenian Educators Re-Tooled the Old City's 'Modernist Schools' for Republican Rome,*" *The Athens Journal of History* 3, no. 4 (2017): 265-274. See also, for academics and this citizenship – even when they traveled Habicht, *Athens Alexander to Antony*, 108-109.

29. Glucker, ibid. Rawson, *Intellectual Life*, 11.

30. Glucker, *Antiochus*, 109. Ferrary, 448, n. 45.

31. Cf. Ferrary, 483.

32. Strabo XIII, i, 66.

"Academy" had become. He was even by now popular enough at Rome to eclipse the reputation of Staseas of Naples. Cicero attended lectures or tutorials among what had become a crowd; even Sicilian students (who would once have belonged properly to the educational sphere of Magna Graecia) had begun to disembark at the Piraeus and ask where the Academics were.[33] Clearly, however strange the Academy had become to a Platonic purist, it had begun to answer a cultural need.

The causes of this new interest were two: Antiochus continued Philo's practice of teaching rhetoric – the Carneadic 'live social media' wizardry – right alongside philosophy, and he now 'bundled' the two by offering a new twist on "Platonism" typical of Athens' evolving role as a place of refuge. Varro (later to become the final authority and *eminence grise* of Augustan scholars), preserved much of his teaching, and much of that has been preserved by St. Augustine. Antiochus, Varro said, offered philosophy rather as the Stoics did, as a salvation from or harmonization of the stresses and dangers of the empirical world, stresses the former student might themselves have made sharper by practice of the 'live social media' skills they learned in the 'rhetoric' courses. Philosophy's principal object, for the mature student, lay no longer in any idea about the world, but in inner peace and self-forgiveness.[34]

Cicero liked Antiochus, and believed he even meant honestly to restore the old school to a shade of its former self, but somehow it wasn't the same, and Cicero found himself attending Epicurean lectures with his friend Atticus as well.[35] It will not have chafed too much. Atticus, as Rawson noticed, wore his Epicureanism very lightly; he never lectured Cicero even indirectly on the subject, though Cicero's life gave him many openings.

Then, Antiochus left Athens during the 70's to serve as political advisor to Lucullus in the East.[36] His brother Aristus continued his doctrine in the Academy, but apparently without either the creativity or the charisma (vital to those who propound doctrines of inner harmony) that Antiochus had been known for. Some Romans, especially those particularly drawn toward refuges of the mind, remained loyal to the school: Brutus studied with him in the house on the

---

33. Rawson, *Intellectual Life*, 36, n. 90.

34. The first Roman philosophical monument to this belief (or preference, perhaps) may have been the *De Virtute* of Brutus, which we know only indirectly. This was dedicated to Cicero, and is an interesting sidelight on the "stoicizing" of Antiochus. The title is very "Stoic," as is the apparent thrust of the argument (Cicero, *Tusculans* V, i, 1), but Cicero himself knew Brutus was an Academic and had studied under both Antiochus and Aristus. Cf. Rawson, *Intellectual Life*, 285 f. On the sea-change in philosophy, and the audience or market for philosophy, indicated by this mood, see Dodds, *Greeks and the Irrational*, 239 ff.

35. Plutarch, *Cicero* iv, 1. Cicero, *Brutus* 315; *De Finibus* VI, i, 3. Rawson, *Cicero*, 27.

36. Plutarch, *Lucullus* xl, 2.

acropolis during this time.[37] He would one day believe he had learned here that virtue was by itself sufficient to give life meaning.[38] The doctrine might have startled Plato – Socrates would have torn into it questioning like a dog into a bone – but it sold very well in these troubled times.

As for the rest, most of those who had studied under Philo as well as Antiochus defected to the Peripatetics, and very often left Athens.[39] Cratippus built himself a new reputation as an Aristotelian. Another, whom Caesar may have had dealings with, was named Ariston and resurfaced in Egypt as so thoroughly "empiricized" a Peripatetic that he had become an expert on the hydraulics of the Nile's flooding.[40]

Aristus, and possibly his brother Antiochus before him, maintained their large house somewhere on (or in the precinct of) the Acropolis, and taught at the Ptolemaeum, that donated gymnasium with its modest library, *inside* the walls of the city.[41] When Cicero returned from Cilicia in 50 B.C. Aristus seems still to have been there: stability of a sort, but not a very lively sort for the head of "Plato's" school. It was perhaps worst of all for Brutus, who returned to Athens (like Cassius returned to Rhodes) in search of refuge after the Ides of March. Even Aristus was at last gone; in his place remained only Theomnestus, an Academician known only for rhetoric so overblown it had become a joke.[42] Though the honor of neo-Platonism lay in the Academy's future, the immediate irony had come home to roost. Philo, Plato's "successor," had begun teaching oratory to the public. This was an art of which Plato had been very suspicious. At first Philo's improvisation could perhaps be justified; it certainly seemed to be good business sense. Now, however, there was nothing but rhetoric left, hollow (even if dangerously effective) words booming in the halls where once words had been tools by which one unlocked the world. The very feel of the place must have seemed wrong to Cicero's generation.

And the story has another curiously, bitterly, modern ring to it, as does the alternative of making the philosophical disciplines attractive as emotional refuges from such a world. The fracturing of modern academic disciplines may obscure

---

37. Cicero, *Ad Att.* V, x, 5; *Brutus* 332. Plutarch, *Brutus* 24.

38. See above, note 65.

39. Rawson, *Intellectual Life*, 82.

40. Pliny, *Natural History* xviii, 211.

41. Cicero, *ad Att.*, V, x, 5. Pausanias I, xvii, 1. It lay not far from the Agora (which was itself a kind of campus now (see discussions in the earlier installments of this study series on the Stoa and Lyceum) and featured a bust of Ptolemy, along with some stone hermae, and portraits of the scholarly foreign monarch Juba II, and the (non-Athenian) Stoic popularizer Chrysippus. That the philosophical descendant of Plato should, in the ancestral city of Platonism, be teaching in a Ptolemaeum, or cross-cultural 'high school' was itself significant. Athens crept under the shadow not only of Rome, but of Alexandria as well, to survive in the years after Sulla.

42. Plutarch, *Brutus*, 24.

the fact that these issues again trouble higher education, but what the last generations of the Roman Republic called 'philosophy' when they arrived in Athens, curious but confused by hucksters touting improvisational and 'tangible result' mutations in the intellectual marketplace, we now typically call the 'liberal arts.'

Bibliography

Classical sources, unless otherwise noted, are – or can be usefully pursued for this paper's purposes – as editions in the Loeb translated series. Useful more recent editions of some books indicated, but first versions also marked. (Ancient references may mark the most appropriate section given the topic – for precision see notes).

Balsdon, J. P. V. D. *Life and Leisure in Ancient Rome*. London, 1969 – reprint 2002.
Cicero. *Academica, ad Atticus, de Finibus, pro Archia, Tusculans.*
Davies, John K. "Athenian Citizenship: the Descent Group and the Alternatives." *Classical Journal* 73 (1975).
Dillon, J. *The Middle Platonists – 80 B.C. to A.D. 220*. London, 1977; Cornell, 1996.
Diogenes Laertius. *Lives,* iv.
Dodds, E. R. *Greeks and the Irrational*. Berkeley, 1981; Martino edtn. 2019.
Ferguson, W. S. *Hellenistic Athens: a Historical Essay*. London, 1911; Palaia Press edtn. 2016.
Ferrary, Jean-Louie. *Philhellénisme et Impérialisme: Aspects Idéologiques de la Conquête Romaine du Monde Hellénistique, de la Seconde Guerre de Macédoine à la Guerre Contre Mithridate.* (Philhellenism and Imperialism: Ideological Aspects of the Roman Conquest of the Hellenistic World, from the Second Macedonian War to the War Against Mithridates.) Rome, 1988, 2014.
Glucker, J. *Antiochus and the Late Academy*. Göttingen, 1978.
Grenier, Albert. *The Roman Spirit – in Religion, Thought and Art*. Translated by M. R. Dobie. New York, 1926; Routledge edtn. 1997.
Habicht, C. *Athens from Alexander to Antony*. London, 1997.
Marrou, H. I. *A History of Education in Antiquity*. Translated by G. Lamb. London, 1956; Wisconsin, 1982.
Mossé, C. *Athens in Decline*. London, 1973; Routledge edtn. 2013.
Osborne, M. J. *Naturalization in Athens*. 2 vols. Brussels, 1982.
Pausanias. *Description of Greece,* xvii, xix.
Pliny. *Natural History*, xviii.
Plutarch. *Lives of Brutus, Cicero, Lucullus, Marcus Cato, Sulla.*
Polybius. *Histories*, xxxii.
Rawson, Elizabeth. "Cicero and the Areopagus." *Athenaeum* 63 (1985).
____. "Intellectual Life in the Late Republic." London, 2002; Bristol, 2013.
Sedley, D. "The End of the Academy." *Phronesis* (1981).
Starr, Chester. *The Emergence of Rome*. Cornell, 1953-60; Praeger edtn. 1982.
Strabo. *Geography* i, xviii.
Walbank, F. W. *A Historical Commentary on Polybius*. Oxford, 1957-79; Clarendon reprint 1999.
Wick, D. P. "Stoics and Epicureans for the 'Modern Market': How Athenian Educators Re-Tooled the Old City's 'Modernist Schools' for Republican Rome." *Athens Journal of History* 3, no. 4 (2017): 265-274.
____. "Students in the (Ancient) Streets, or Agent(s) Provocateur? The Liberal Arts Schools

of Athens and the Hostage Crisis of 88." *Athens Journal of History* 6, no. 4 (2020): 299-312.

____. The Lyceum in Twilight: Athens' 'Second School' and its Struggle to Re-Invent Itself and Survive in the Last Years of the Roman Republic." *Athens Journal of History* 8, no. 2 (2022): 99-108.

Non-Muslim Minorities in the Modern Afghanistan's Economy

By Riccardo Bonotto[*]

The territory of what will become modern Afghanistan has for centuries been the center of a vast, economically interconnected geographical area. This area includes, besides Afghanistan, the northern regions of India, Persia and the Uzbek khanates of Central Asia. It represented a market for economic trade in which valuable products from India found buyers in the courts and bazaars of neighboring territories. Mainly, two components of the Afghan society made this system work: Pashtun nomads and non-Muslim minorities. The first ones carried out the logistical work that allowed the goods to reach the various bazaars of the region where they are sold. The second ones (non-Muslim minorities) on the other hand, had many functions: intermediaries, bankers and traders. In this paper I will present the socio-economic context of modern Afghanistan, in which non-Muslim minorities have played a key role in allowing the country to remain connected to the trans-regional trade network that was part of northern India. The aim of my paper is to present the history of non-Muslim minorities in Afghanistan through a description of their socio-economic position and to highlight their fundamental role in the economy of the Afghanistan kingdom. In particular, I will try to frame their role in the trans-national and more general context of global trade that affects not only the territories already mentioned but also the Ottoman Empire and the Mediterranean sea.

Introduction

Part of present-day Afghanistan was, for almost two centuries, a province of the Mughal Empire. All of present day Afghanistan was under the control of foreign authorities between the 16th and the 18th centuries, who shared control over it. The first of the Mughals, Babur (r.1526-1530), fell in love with the city of Kabul, of which he sang the beauty and pleasures in his autobiography, to the point of making it the summer capital of the empire. Kabul enjoyed the presence of the Mughal court for some years. Babur's successors consolidated the dynasty's hold on the Indian subcontinent and moved the capital city several times as the empire's political and economic center of gravity shifted to northern India. Afghanistan thus found itself on the periphery of the Mughal Empire in an eccentric position in relation to the heart of the Mughal possessions. Nevertheless, the country was at the center of a vast region stretching from the plains of northern India to the steppes of Central Asia and the Iranian plateau, in which a vast and developed trade network enabled the agricultural and artisanal surplus of the Punjab to reach neighboring regions and contribute to the enrichment of

[*]PhD Candidate, EHESS Paris, France.

northern India. Most of the trade between the different regions that made up this international trade network is concentrated in the hands of Indian merchants who act on behalf of large commercial enterprises originating from the Punjab, or in the hands of other non-Muslim minorities: mainly Armenians and Jews.

The Key Role of Hindu Merchants

In Afghanistan, Hindus have always been the most numerous and involved group in trade.[1] Their role as the keystone of the interregional trade system is attested from the 17th century, but their presence in the region is even older. The Hindu trade network is one of the most extensive and capillary, it's an essential tool for the development of trade in the region. By the 17th century the Mughal Empire was the center of a highly connected system that included the present-day territories of India, Pakistan, Afghanistan, China, Central Asia, Russia and the Middle East.[2] North India and the Uzbek khanates of Central Asia were highly connected territories and from the 16th century onwards the movement of goods and people suffered an acceleration that had never been recorded before and that went beyond the simple exchange of goods. The two regions influenced each other : educational, religious and political institutions circulated between them. Intellectual exchanges are constant and relationships between the two regions are fruitful.[3] In this context, merchants maintained friendly relationships with the states and the authorities that ruled them. According to Gommans, Indian merchants as intermediaries were essential to the success of the empire's economic policies. For Gommans: "[...] inter-regional roads and their trade provided the basic framework of the empire. It was only through the intermediaries along the routes that the cash nexus could be handled and the revenue could be remitted."[4] It should also be emphasized that it's thanks to the trade development policies of the empires that the trans-regional trade network was able to reach such a level of prosperity.

---

1. Vartan Gregorian, *The Emergence of Modern Afghanistan: Politics of Reform and Modernization, 1880-1946* (Stanford University Press, 1969), 62-63.

2. Jos Gommans, "Mughal India and Central Asia in the Eighteenth Century: An Introduction to a Wider Perspective," in *India and Central Asia: Commerce and Culture, 1500-1800* (ed.) Scott C. Levi (Oxford University Press, 2007), 39.

3. Muzaffar Alam, *The Crisis of Empire in Mughal North India: Awadh and the Punjab, 1707-1748* (Oxford University Press, 1986), 64.

4. Gommans, "Mughal India and Central Asia in the Eighteenth Century: An Introduction to a Wider Perspective," 2007, 40.

The Political Situation in the Region

In the early 17th century, the Mughal and Safavid empires created a stable and peaceful political environment that was an essential condition for the further development of trade in the region. This economic environment favored long-distance trade and the expansion of the Indian trading diaspora. Tapan Raychaudhuri pointed out that: "If the Mughals were ruthless in their expropriation of surplus, their rule beyond doubt brought a high level of peace and security. From the 1750s - by which time Akbar had consolidated his empire - for more than a hundred years the greater part of India enjoyed such freedom from war and anarchy as it had known for centuries. The economy of the empire benefited directly from this altered state of peace and security. Substantial increase of trade, both inland and foreign was rendered possible by this development. It would perhaps be an exaggeration to say that the Mughal age saw the emergence of an integrated national market. Still, the commercial ties which bound together different parts of the empire had no precedence."[5] The same remarks can be made about the reign of Shah 'Abbas II in Persia and, to a lesser extent, about the situation of political stability that the Central Asian khanates also experienced. The Indian merchant network, already sophisticated and active for centuries, found itself operating within a political framework that could only stimulate interactions between regions. The empires, with their strong armies, controled and secured the trails taken by caravans and merchants; the sovereigns launched campaigns for the construction of infrastructures whose objective was to increase the use of trade routes (construction of caravanserais, maintenance of roads and development of mountain passes, etc.). The Indian merchant diaspora can be considered as the counterpart in Central Asia and the Indian subcontinent of the Armenian diaspora in Persia and the Mediterranean, as Armenians enjoyed the freedom to travel and trade without any obstacle from the Ottoman ports of the Mediterranean to those of the Indonesian archipelago.[6] Indian merchants have the same freedom in their area of activity. The two groups shared the same characteristics in terms of composition and organization, both being subject to a very strong militarily central Muslim authority which could guarantee the development of their activities. Both groups were also perceived as intermediaries in the regions in which they operated and not as officials in the service of the empire. The political and economic situation at the time of Akbar's

---

5. Tapan Raychaudhuri, "The Mughal Empire," *The Cambridge Economic History of India* (eds.) Dharma Kumar and Tapan Raychaudhuri (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982), 184.

6. Edmund M. Herzig, "The Rise of the Julfa Merchants in the Late Sixteenth Century," in *Safavid Persia: The History and Politics of an Islamic Society, Pembroke Papers volume. 4* (London: I.B. Tauris, 1996), 26.

(1556-1605) and Abbas I's reign (1587-1629) was particularly favorable to trade and commerce. In the 17th century the demand for agricultural and manufactured products from India was very high in Persia and in Uzbek Turan. The imperial system of the Mughals is all the more important as it also contributed to the markets' harmonization in the different regions of the empire. It was able to integrate very different economies into a single prosperous economic system, thanks to the establishment of a single efficient administration, the alignment of the weights, measures and currencies of the empire and by providing all its territories with a uniform legislative apparatus. Mughal India's merchants who operated in Persia or in the Uzbek khanates, worked in a similar commercial and linguistic environment. Although they did not enjoy the same urban autonomy as European merchants at the same time, they could conduct their trade without restrictions, outside the limits imposed by Islamic contract law.[7] S. Dale makes a parallel between the environment in which Indian merchants operated and the mercantile environment in the Mediterranean between the 10th and 12th centuries. Quoting a passage from Shelomov Goitein,[8] Dale describes an area in which goods and culture traveled almost unlimitedly in what looked like a free trade community.[9]

Indian merchants could however enjoy a comparative advantage towards other merchant communities in the region. The factors that have benefited trade as well as agriculture and manufacturing have allowed them to access a common and integrated market where the technical barriers that could have constituted obstacles to trade had been eliminated. Thanks to this integrated market, India could play a predominant role in trade and take advantage of the quality of its products, but also of the material and human resources which greatly exceeded those of its neighbors to establish itself as the major player in the trans-regional economy. Some of the agricultural and manufactured goods produced in northern India were destined for export due to the wide availability of raw materials and workers that could be mobilized from the subcontinent. At the time, India mainly exported food products, but also luxury goods: among the most requested were the varieties of food (fruits and vegetables) which could only grow thanks to the Indian subtropical climate, and cotton, which since the times of the Roman empire represented the first product exported by India.[10] In exchange, Mughal India imported luxury goods, prized by the local aristocracy and especially horses bred in Central Asia, famous for their strength, resistance

7. Stephen Dale, *Indian Merchants and Eurasian Trade, 1600-1750* (Cambridge University Press, 1994), 10.

8. Shelomov D. Goitein, *A Mediterranean Society: The Jewish Communities of the Arab World as Portrayed in the Documents of the Cairo Geniza, volume 1: Economic Foundations* (University of California Press, 1967), 66.

9. Stephen Dale, *Indian Merchants and Eurasian Trade, 1600-1750* (Cambridge University Press, 1994), 11.

10. Ibid, 21.

and beauty and necessary for the cavalry of the Mughal army. This trade only disappeared in the 19th century, when the British authorities replaced the Mughals. The British army had its own supply network for its cavalry and the Central Asian market was definitively abandoned, radically changing the economic relationships and trade between India and Central Asia.

Trade Routes Through Afghanistan

Goods from or towards the Indian subcontinent used several trade routes to reach its destination. Among these roads, the best known is the road that reaches the territories of present-day Afghanistan through the Bolan Pass. This road was widely used by the Mughal armies committed in the campaigns for the defense or the reconquest of Kandahar city from the Safavids. It was the main guideline which linked Sindh (and in particular the city of Shikarpour) to the Iranian plateau. This path was rarely closed due to snow, but the cold between November and the end of February often discouraged caravans from using it during this period.[11] According to the British officer Henry George Raverty, the road was wide enough to allow the passage of the Mughal artillery which in 1653 was going to Kandahar in order to regain control of the city, under the orders of Prince Dara Shikoh, Emperor Shah Jahan's son.[12] The Sanghar Pass, located further north than the Bolan Pass, is the fastest land connection between the Iranian plateau and the city of Multan, capital of the Mughal province of Southern Punjab, via Kandahar. Less known than the other passes between the Indus Valley and Afghanistan, the Sanghar Pass was probably the most important in the 17th century, being the most direct route between Multan and Kandahar. Even further north is the Gumal Pass, which connects India to the Central Asian Khanates from the city of Dera Ismail Khan via Ghazni and Kabul through the Suleyman Mountains. This land route presented the most difficulties to the caravans that used it because of its length, the rising waters of the rivers that the road ran along and because of the attacks of the Pashtun tribes of the region. Babur himself, having followed the same path from Kabul to the Indian plains in 1510, was aware of the dangerousness of the route.

The position of the cities of Shikarpour and Multan is a key element for understanding the functioning of the merchant network of Northern India and its development. These two cities (and to a lesser extent Dera Ismaïl Khan and Dera Ghazi Khan) are the starting point of the trade routes towards Persia and Central Asia, as well as the native cities of most members of the Indian diaspora in the region. A large part of the Indian family businesses that composed the network linked to the diaspora originated from one of these two cities, or started their activity from one of these two cities to reach neighboring regions. The importance

11. Ibid, 51.
12. Ibid.

of Multan and Shikarpour in the organization of the Indian diaspora is such that European sources often use the words Multani or Shikarpouri in reference to the Indian merchants encountered between Kabul, Samarkand, Mashhad and Astrakhan. The role of the two cities and their leadership over trans-regional trade is still, today, a subject of debate. What is undeniable is the fact that Multan and Shikarpur were, during different periods, the cities where the great commercial companies were based which maintained highly developed commercial links with the main bazaars in the region, including that of Kabul and Kandahar in Afghanistan. Both cities are located in a geographical position of strategic importance. Shikarpour, located in Sindh, is near the Indus and on the trade route that reaches Quetta and Kandahar: a vital hub for trade by land and river. Multan is close to the roads to Kandahar and Ghazni, located on the plains of northern India; it's connected to the economic centers of Lahore and Amritsar and takes advantage of the waterways, being on the left bank of the Chenab River. From Multan and Shikarpour, Indian merchandise had to cross Afghan territories to reach the bazaars in which it was expected. To what extent has the Afghan economy been integrated into the trans-regional system? What are the benefits that the strategic position of the country brought to the provinces crossed by the caravans?

The Afghan Economy: A Transit Economy

Until the 20th century, the Afghan economy was essentially a transit economy. As seen above, Afghanistan benefits from the passage of caravans that connect the cities of northern India to the cities of Central Asia or Persia, but the role of the country is only marginal if we consider the overall amount of exchanges that are carried out by trans-regional trade actors. Indeed, Afghanistan is not the main recipient of goods crossing it. On the contrary, only a very small part of the goods that pass through Afghanistan are sold on its markets. With the exception of the Kabul bazaar, which at the time represented a relatively interesting market for Indian products, the other towns crossed had only a limited function of logistical support for the caravans. Indian goods only transited there but were very rarely sold there.

Afghan sovereigns have tried on several occasions to increase the share of benefits that cross-regional trade offers to Afghanistan. An 1887 note[13] sent by British agents in Afghanistan to the Indian government shows a request by the Emir Abdour Rahman of economic compensation calculated on the basis of the goods' value sent from Bukhara to India through Afghan territory by merchants from the city of Peshawar. The objective of the Emir's request was to be able to

---

13. National Archives of India, New Delhi. Foreign dept. 1887 – Secret F June 1887 NOS 181-185.

benefit from the income generated by the trade in goods from Central Asia which only pass through Afghanistan without bringing income for the Kingdom. It's also true for the funds that are transferred by Indian trade agencies from Moscow to Calcutta, because the emir believed that part of this money belonged to the transit country. If Abdour Rahmane's requests was not accepted by the government of British India (which on the contrary advised by a note to its embassies to change the route of the goods if necessary to prevent the Afghan sovereign from repeating his requests), it proves that the total transactions carried out by Indian agents through Afghanistan have reached such a level that every country wanted to profit from these exchanges. Moreover, the Afghan transit economy, at the time, depended to a large extent on the credit networks of the banks of Multan and Shikarpur. Representatives of Indian trading companies in Afghanistan were around 8,000 in the early modern era and they were known as Hindki. "Most of these banking houses were family businesses, with the satellite branches scattered throughout the region and run by members originally sent out from these two cities [Multan and Shikarpur]."[14] The Hindki merchants, originating from the two central cities of trans-regional trade, belong mostly to the merchant castes of the khatri. In Afghanistan they were engaged in a secondary market compared to the large Indian international network, which was more local and active in exchanges which generally covered short distances. These markets are becoming vital to the Afghan economy as trade by land is replaced by trade by sea. The activity of the Indian merchants was fundamental for the progress of trade, but it would never have succeeded in reaching such a level of efficiency without the essential contribution of the Afghan nomads, real logistical partners in the movement of goods through the region.

Merchant Networks and Afghan Nomads

The Hindki network makes it possible to resupply the Afghan provinces otherwise excluded from international trade by steamboats and to maintain links with neighboring regions. Hindu merchants were not the only ones to animate the market and guarantee credit in Afghanistan, but they shared the sector with Afghan merchants and other minorities: Armenians, Jews, Georgians and Persians. They all acted as intermediaries between the Afghan economy and the international or trans-regional economy. Their activity would never have reached the degree of importance it has had throughout its history without the collaboration of a crucial element in the region's trade: the Pashtun or Lohani nomads. While Indian merchants enabled cross-regional trade to be financed and efficiently organized, Pashtun nomads provided the logistics that for centuries allowed goods to cross Afghanistan to Central Asia, Persia and India. Caravans,

---

14. Benjamin D. Hopkins, *The Making of Modern Afghanistan* (Palgrave-Mcmillan, 2009), 116.

or kafila, were the instrument through which the boom in trade between Asia and the Indian subcontinent was possible. Alexander Burnes (1805-1841), in one of his letters on the trade between India and Afghanistan, noted that the Derajat, the territory between the cities of Dera Ghazi Khan and Dera Ismail Khan, is an essential crossing point for goods. This is where the caravans from India congregate before continuing west. The main roads intersected at Derabund (30 miles west from Dera Ismail Khan) and there began the Goolairee Pass route, through which the Lohani passed. According to Burnes' information, the Lohani gather together near Derabund in April: the families spent the winter near the Indus while the men left to buy goods in India. From Derabund they went to Khorasan where they spent the summer. The Lohani are organized into three divisions called "kirees" (which according to Burnes meant migrations) named : Nusseer, Kharoutee and Meeankhyl. Generally, Hindu merchants and foreigners traveled with the third group. The caravans reached Kabul and Kandahar around mid-June, just in time to send the goods to Bukhara and Herat where they were picked up by local Indian merchants or other nomads to continue their journey. At the end of October they headed back to India with their cargoes of fruit, horses and products from Kabul. It is the same route that Babur took in 1505, he came across a caravan of Lohani around Derajat.[15] Indian merchandise and merchants therefore followed the ancestral paths taken by the Pashtun nomads following their seasonal migration in a well established mechanism that allowed products from India to reach Afghan bazaars and caravanserais in time to be loaded into other caravans in the direction of Turan or Persia. It was this system which, together with the institution of the note of credit, allowed the goods exported by the subcontinent to flow into distant markets, passing through isolated and hostile regions through which no one else except the Pashtun nomads could have traveled without risking being robbed or killed. Each caravan, or kafila, was autonomous and depended only on a leader, called *kafilabashi*, who decided the path to take according to the random factors that presented themselves each season at the time of departure (revolt or instability in certain provinces, heavy rains or impassable roads, etc.). The agreement between the leader of the caravan and the merchants included only the price of transport and the final destination. Once these details were agreed upon, the caravan would decide autonomously which path to follow in order to reach its final destination. As already discussed above, this system allowed merchants to adapt quickly to market requirements and to change routes easily in the event of an unforeseen event. Besides, Hopkins noticed that this system stressesed the prices in the bazaars crossed all along the trip by making the market very unstable. Caravans could change destination or route at the last minute if better prices for the goods were possible elsewhere. It was up to the decision of the *kafilabashi* who represented the highest and only

---

15. Alexander Burnes, *Travels into Bokhara: Together with a Narrative of a Voyage to the Indus* (Sang-e-Meel Publications, 2003), 76-79.

authority within the caravan. "The costs involved were minimal and the potential benefits very high. The pervasiveness of the Central Asian credit network facilitated both commercial and physical flexibility."[16]

The Lohani were able to choose the best path according to the situation and have a close relationship with the Indian merchants which guaranteed them support during their stops in the bazaars. They were also very efficient when it came to guaranteeing the safety of the caravan and therefore to the merchandise. Well armed and trained to use weapons, the Pashtun nomads were the only ones able to cross without fear the gorges or mountainous areas particularly favorable to ambushes by the Pashtun tribes who inhabited them. Their characteristics allowed them to be both the best way to transport the goods and to ensure their protection during the transfer. For these same reasons, many merchants, travelers and spies have called on the services of the Lohani nomads to cross Afghanistan and reach their destinations in Central Asia or Persia totally safely. George Forster was one of the Europeans who used the kafila to cross Afghanistan in 1782. Forster traveled disguised as an Armenian merchant, having learned that the presence of an Armenian in a caravan was not unusual at all in the region. During his crossing of Afghanistan, passing through Kandahar, Ghazni, Kabul and Herat, Forster met Armenian merchants in the caravanserais of Afghan cities, four of whom told him about the attempts of forced conversion they had to undergo from the muslim merchant of Herat's city.[17] When he arrived in Kabul, Forster was welcomed by a Georgian named Bagdasir who has lived for twenty years in Kabul in a caravanserai and who wrote a reference letter for his guest who was about to join Persia. At the same time, Forster met an Armenian merchant living in Peshawar. Forster could only notice that in Kabul all the religions were represented (Muslims, Christians, Jews and Hindus).[18] In Kandahar several Hindu families originating from Multan were installed there, Forster was very impressed by their situation and he pointed out that: "a very long line of shops occupied by Hindus, who seemed happy in their look and manners, sufficiently proves that they find in Kandahar freedom and protection."[19] Forster confirmed that Armenian merchants were a constant presence in the bazaars and caravanserais of 18th century in Afghanistan. Where do these Armenian merchants came from? When did an Armenian community appear in Afghanistan in the capital Kabul?

---

16. Benjamin D. Hopkins, *The Making of Modern Afghanistan* (Palgrave-Mcmillan, 2009), 119-120.

17. George Forster, *Voyage du Bengale à Pétersbourg à travers les provinces septentrionales de l'Inde, le Kachmyr, la Perse, volume 2* (Delance, 1802), 176.

18. Ibid, 56.

19. Ibid, 122.

Armenians in India and Afghanistan

The first record of an Armenian merchant community's presence in India and Afghanistan is traced back to the 17th century. Lahore, the summer capital of the Mughal Empire and an important commercial center of Punjab, was the home to an Armenian colony from the beginning of the 17th century. A letter written on September 6th 1604, from Agra by Brother Jerome Xavier briefly described the condition of the Armenians in the city : most of them were active merchants in the wine trade. The same letter pointed out that thanks to Emperor Akbar's Firman, Christians could openly practice their faith in the lands of the Mughal Empire. Two years later, on September 25th 1606, a letter from the same brother Xavier described a change in the situation for the Armenians : Lahore was at the time experiencing a period of instability due to the revolt of Prince Khursu (1587-1622), son of Emperor Jahangir (r.1605-1627), fourth Mughal emperor. The insecurity caused by the revolt pushed Armenian merchants to hide their goods to avoid robberies. A successive letter dated in August 12th 1609, written by Brother Pinheiro, demonstrated the persecutions suffered by the Armenian community at that time. The letter spoke of 23 Armenian merchants who may have run away from the city with their families to escape the events. As pointed out by Mesrov Seth, the Armenian community was relatively large and committed to trade,[20] although among them there were a lot of landowners and public officials in the service of the Mughal administration.[21] If the community could enjoy a certain well-being due to the merchants' activity, it was not as easy regarding religious practices. The Armenians of Lahore found themselves both victims of persecution by Muslims and the object of attempts to rally to the Catholic Church on the part of Brother Pinheiro and the Jesuits. The missionary fathers considered very seriously the possibility of converting Armenians because among them there were many outstanding men and some of them had helped the Jesuits to meet the emperors Jahangir and Shah Jahan. The Armenians were considered more likely to listen to the fathers of the Catholic Church who had to report to their superiors in Europe on the regions' situation in which they were on mission's inhabitants' conversion.

Relationships between Jesuits and Armenians in India have been tense sometimes, although there have never been any reported episode of open hostility. The Jesuits considered Armenians as Christians to be protected, although they did not approve of the habit of some members of the community to hide their religious identity so that they could live among their non-Christian neighbors.[22]

---

20. Mesrov Seth, *Armenians in India: from the Earliest Time to the Present Day* (Asian Educational Service, 1992), 201.

21. Edward McLagan, *The Jesuits and the Great Mogul* (Burns Oates and Washbourne, 1932), 271.

22. Ibid, 271-273.

Armenians were opposed to the organization of a Jesuit mission in India and looked suspiciously at the brothers who came from Europe. However, it's also true that, at the beginning of the mission, the Armenians cooperated with the Jesuits as interpreters during the interviews with the Mughal court. Father Pinheiro interceded with the authorities to save poor Armenians who in 1604 risked being persecuted because of their activity as wine producers. According to another missionary, Brother Pierre de Jarric, "The Armenians in this country as a whole, are less ready than formerly to scorn and insult the Church; for it is known that the Fathers enjoy the favor and support of the Viceroy, and that the officers of justice have orders to banish from the town"[7]. Armenians who lived in the Mughal Empire or in Persia and who had a high social status wore civil or military distinctions such as Agah, Khodjah or Khan. This is also true for the Armenians of the Ottoman Empire, who bore the titles of Bey, Effendi or Pasha. Armenian merchants who arrived in India at the beginning of the 17th century were from the city of New Julfa, located in the suburbs of Isfahan and founded in 1605 during the reign of Shah Abbas I (r.1587-1629) by a colony of 12,000 Armenian families from Julfa, an Armenian city on the Araxes River.[23] In Lahore the Armenians lived in separate neighborhoods from the rest of the population. In 1757 Brother Tieffentaller wrote that Armenian and Georgian soldiers in the service of Ahmad Shah Durrani had protected the inhabitants of the Armenian neighborhood from robberies during the third Afghan invasion of Punjab. These soldiers were part of a Christian artillery group serving under former Lahore Governor Mir Mannu, brought to Kabul by Ahmad Shah a few years earlier during the second Afghan invasion of Punjab.

Relationships between Armenian Merchants and British India

In the 17th century, Armenian merchants were also active in the maritime trade between India and Persia (via the ports of Thatta in Sindh and the one of Hormuz in the Persian Gulf). In 1688 a commercial agreement was signed by the Armenian merchant community represented by Khojah Phanoos Khalantar and the East India Company for Great Britain.[24] Through this agreement the Armenian community became a commercial partner of British India. Britain recognized Armenians as "chief carriers of European goods from India to Persia."[25] This status granted Armenian merchants the same privileges as British merchants of the East India Company in terms of employment and services. The Armenians obtained the same treatment as their European peers, which represented an great advantage for the community, and acquired supremacy in the maritime trade

---

23. Seth, *Armenians in India: from the Earliest Time to the Present Day*, 1992, 148.

24. Ibid, 48-50.

25. Ibid, 230.

sector between India and Persia.[26] The British agents chose the Armenians as partners because of their linguistic knowledge in the countries in which they are settled, but also for their knowledge of the political authorities' customs and for their ability to promote their interests. The Armenians thus became agents of the British and interceded with the local authorities to the advantage of British India. In exchange for the official role that the British recognized for them, the Armenians agreed to use European ships (and mainly British ships) to transport the goods they negotiated and to further develop their commercial network. The 1688 agreement encouraged Armenian merchants to gradually abandon land trade routes and redirect trade to the sea using British ships. The same agreement granted Armenians the freedom to settle in Indian cities, to buy and sell land and houses and granted them the right to access civil charges on the same basis than British citizens. In the context of cooperation and mutual trust that existed between the British colonial authorities and the Armenian community in the region, it was not surprising to see, half a century later, Great Britain encouraging and helping the settling of an Armenian community in Kabul.

Armenians in Kabul

The exact year of the settling of an Armenian community in Kabul is not known. The Persian King Nadir Shah (r.1736-1747) encouraged the arrival of Armenian merchants in the great bazaars of Kabul, Kandahar and Herat, at that time under his control in order to stimulate trade for his empire. In 1737 he settled between 200 and 300 Armenian families in Afghanistan in order to encourage land exchanges between India and Persia.[27] Their presence became constant in Afghanistan for a century. The Armenian colony of Kabul in 1707 obtained special privileges from the Mughal authorities in Kabul.[28] The privileges received included not only freedom of worship, but also the end of dress requirements and tax reduction. Letters written by Armenian merchants in Kabul in 1799 revealed that their trade relationships were extended to Tbilisi and Istanbul. Later documents (written between 1812 and 1848) showed that the economic interests of Kabul's Armenians reached the khanates of Central Asia, as well as the city of Dera Ismail Khan. Some members of the community had developed an activity of bankers, one of the favorite activities of non-Muslims in the region and had opened trading posts in the city of Ghazni, at the south of Kabul. If the economic relationship of the Armenian community with India were flourishing, their cultural links with their original land were almost non-existent: no more priests

---

26. Alam, *The Crisis of Empire in Mughal North India: Awadh and the Punjab, 1707-1748,* 1986, 73-74.

27. Gregorian, *The Emergence of Modern Afghanistan: Politics of Reform and Modernization, 1880-1946,* 1969), 66.

28. Seth, *Armenians in India: from the Earliest Time to the Present Day,* 1992, 207.

were sent to Kabul from New Julfa or from India, leaving the small Afghan community materially and spiritually all alone. In the absence of prelates on Afghan territory, the community was deprived of religious functions during the most important moments of its members' lives, such as weddings, baptisms and funerals. There are lots of Anglican priests' testimonies who arrived in Afghanistan following British military missions and who were asked to make religious services and administer baptisms in the Armenian church in Kabul. The Rev. Joseph Wolff, who arrived on a mission in Kabul in 1832, wrote in his diary about making a religious service in Persian in front of about twenty Armenians in this same church hidden behind buildings and organized like a *saray*, not far from the Bala Hissar and Jalalabad Gate. Afghanistan's Armenians had adopted Persian names and they had embraced daily customs of the Muslim population, such as taking off their shoes before entering their church.[29]

Kabul's Armenian colony lived in such isolation that in 1896, the Emir Abdour Rahmane decided to send a letter to the Armenian community of Calcutta asking them to send a dozen families to Kabul, in order to fill the loneliness of the 21 Armenians living in the territories of the kingdom of Afghanistan.[30] Abdour Rahmane's approach was not motivated only by his pity and his sympathy for the Armenian community, but it aimed to re-establish commercial links with India without passing through the networks of Hindu merchants that he wished to compete (see above). At the end of the 19th century, the military power of the emir depended on British economic and military aid, which was a condition to the cession of the country's external sovereignty. Economic exchanges were mainly with India and the attempt to revitalize Armenian commercial channels can be seen as an attempt to free itself from the dependence of the Afghan economy on Hindu networks. The end of the Armenian presence in Afghanistan most likely came a year after Emir Abour Rahman's letter of intercession to the Armenian community in Calcutta. The emir took the decision to banish the Armenians from his kingdom in 1897. The consumption of alcohol was prohibited for all subjects (not only Muslims) and this prohibition deprived the Armenians of one of their sources of income. It's possible that the decision of the emir was taken in order to restore Islamic morality among his subjects (prohibition of the consumption of alcoholic beverages). The emir was in the process of restoring order in his country after years of turmoil which took him to the throne of Afghanistan. He decided to get rid of the Christian minority of Armenian origin (now perceived as very close to Westerners and in particular to the British) because he suspected some of them of being spies. After these events, part of the Afghan Armenians settled in Peshawar, from where they were banished in 1907 for reasons that are not known[31]. After the death of Abdour Rahmane, a war of

29. Ibid, 201.
30. Ibid, 213-214.
31. Ibid, 208-212.

succession broke out until the emergence of Sher Ali Khan as the successor to the deceased Emir. Armenians became again the object of persecution by the new king, because the marriage ties between his rival Azam Khan and an Armenian woman caused Armenians to "found themselves on the wrong side of the political divide."[32] The Armenians of Afghanistan ended the same way as the Jews of Afghanistan, who were also active in the trade of luxury goods (mainly furs from northern Afghanistan particularly prized by the elites of Central Asia) and the sale of wine and other drinks, like alcoholic beverages often of their own production.

The Jews of Afghanistan

Available sources about the Jewish community in Afghanistan are almost absent between the 11th and 16th centuries. According to Sara Koplik, this is due to the Mongol invasions which caused the loss of documents and led to the dispersal of the Israelite communities in Khorasan.[33] The Arab geographer Muhammad Al-Idrisi (1099-1166) mentioned a large community of Jews in Kabul who lived apart from Muslims, while inscriptions found not far from the minaret of Jam, in the central region of Ghor, indicated the presence of a wealthy Jewish community between the 12th and 13th centuries. As recalled by Gnoli, the dates of the inscriptions correspond to the period during which the mountainous region of Ghor came out of its isolation before finding itself cut off again from the outside world following the Mongol invasions.[34] From the middle of the 12th century, Ghor became a military and economic power. Beyond the borders of Afghanistan, Jewish communities were present in Persia as well as in Central Asia, and they shared identity features with their Afghan co-religionists. The same is true for Armenians, because in the 19th and 20th centuries Afghanistan was a land of asylum for Jews and Armenians fleeing persecution, forced conversions and political changes in neighboring countries of Afghanistan. It's therefore evident that the links between the different non-Muslim communities were able to be maintained, not only thanks to the frequent exchanges between the merchants belonging to these groups, but also thanks to the historical links that each community had with their co-religionists of the neighboring regions. Afghan Jews are part of a "cultural continuity" that stretches from Mashhad to Samarkand, via Herat, Merv and Bukhara.[35] Most often the Afghan Jews were

---

32. Jonathan L. Lee, "The Armenians of Kabul and Afghanistan," in *Cairo to Kabul, Afghan and Islamic Studies* (ed.) Ralph Pinder-Wilson (Melisende, 2002), 160.

33. Sara Koplik, *A Political and Economic History of the Jews of Afghanistan* (Brill, 2015), 16.

34. Gherardo Gnoli, *Le iscrizioni Giudeo-Persiane del Gur (Afghanistan)* (Istituto Italiano per il Medio Oriente, 1964), 9.

35. Koplik, *A Political and Economic History of the Jews of Afghanistan*, 2015, 16.

settled in the middle of the Tajik population, with whom the Jews shared the profession of merchants, the Pashtuns having abandoned this economic niche, as noted by Mr. Elphinstone (1779-1859) during his travels in Afghanistan.[36]

Afghan Jews can be divided into two social categories: the poor and the wealthy. Jews from the first category lived mainly in rural areas and ran small shops selling various products. They often acted as intermediaries between different tribes or between sedentary and nomadic populations, as they were considered neutral because they did not belong to any of these groups. Members of the wealthy category lived mainly in urban centers (small, medium or large) and were merchants, active in importing textiles, skins, furs and carpets.[37] They competed with members of the Hindu community in the drug trade and currency exchange. In contemporary times, the fierce competition between commercial agents of Indian origin pushed the Afghan Jewish merchants to leave the exchange business and reorganize their activity in the production and sale of alcoholic beverages.[38] Long-distance trade is also an activity that has affected members of the Afghan Jewish community. Often Jewish traders traveled to remote parts of the country, especially in northern Afghanistan. They were almost the only ones who could enjoy permission to travel in disputed territories and tribal zones, in order to encourage trade, because their status as a minority did not make them perceived as a threat to the inhabitants of the areas they crossed.

The base of the community was the city of Herat. The families resided there and the mother houses of the Afghan Jewish merchants were located there too. The men left Herat and their families for long periods of time up to six months. During these periods they traveled for professional reasons across the country, particularly in northern cities such as Maimana or Qala-e Naw, living in caravanserais reserved for Jewish men, sharing meals and moments of prayer with their co-religionists.[39] In cities like Bukhara, Jews carried out the same activities as the larger Hindu community. Hindus traded tea and indigo from India and exported from Central Asia products such as silk, cotton, rice and wheat.

Afghan Jews spoke in Judeo-Persian. According to the testimony of Itzhak Bezalel, quoted by Sara Koplik: "[...] the three communities of Bukharan, Afghanistani, and Mashhadi hidden Jews are all interconnected, the latter two groups are more closely linked through dialect and custom."[40] The Afghan and

---

[36]. M. Elphinstone, *An Account of the Kingdom of Caubul and its Dependencies in Persia, Tartary and India (*London: Bentley, 1842).

37. Ibid, 38.

38. Gregorian, *The Emergence of Modern Afghanistan: Politics of Reform and Modernization, 1880-1946,* 1969, 64-65.

39. Koplik, *A Political and Economic History of the Jews of Afghanistan,* 2015, 39.

40. Ibid.

Meshhed dialects are much closer to each other than the dialect spoken by the Bukharan Jews, which is more influenced by the local languages than Persian. In addition to their mother tongue, Afghan Jews knew Dari (relatively close to Judeo-Persian), Pashto, Russian, English, and Hebrew, languages essential for their business activities. The strength of Jewish merchants was their connection to markets in India and Persia. Connection possible thanks to their family ties with the two regions.

It was not uncommon for members of the same family to live separately in various cities located along the trade routes through which the products and goods they traded passed. Family ties and trade relationships between the various geographical areas were interrupted by the Soviet Revolution of 1917 and the new political balance. The isolation and rapid disappearance of Bukharan Jewish merchants in the region allowed Afghan Jews to replace their co-religionists as intermediaries in the flourishing karakul leather market. This new space for the Afghan community was short-lived: the Afghan government initiated policies of nationalization of international trade excluding members of the Jewish community during the 1930s. Since the creation of the state of Israel, more and more Afghan Jews have left the country to move to Jerusalem and its surroundings. The exodus intensified after the end of World War II and the end of the British Empire in India, bringing within a few years the end of the millennial Jewish presence in Afghanistan.

Conclusion

Before independence in 1747, the territories of present-day Afghanistan lived for more than two centuries under the control of foreign authorities: Persia, Mughal India and the Uzbek khanates of Central Asia. Although Afghanistan was banished to the margins of the empires, it has lived in the middle of a territory culturally rich but above all economically interconnected. Afghanistan was at the center of a vast trade network that reached Central Asia, Persia, the Ottoman Empire and Russia from northern India. Between the 16th and the 17th centuries, trade between these regions intensified thanks to the stability guaranteed by long periods of peace and visionary policies put in place by the Moghol and Persian rulers. Numerous roads and infrastructures have been created, the number of caravanserais available to traveling merchants increased, while the harmonization of weights and measures made it easier for negotiations. In this economically prosperous context, some communities of merchants and traders had been able to prosper: Hindus, Armenians and Jews not only controlled the exchanges between the different regions of the trade network, but they have also become an essential element for the power and the system in which they worked. Merchants, retailers and bankers have dominated the regional economy for over two centuries.

In this context, Afghanistan was no exception. Although Afghanistan is a marginal player in all trade relationships between border countries, it has benefited from its central location and cities such as Kabul, Kandahar, Ghazni and Herat have become increasingly important as transit centers for goods. In a country without a ruling class or an enterprising merchant class, as it's the case in contemporary Afghanistan, non-Muslim minorities have been the vital element to connect the country to the rest of the merchant network that was headed by Mughal India. Helped by the possibility of lending money at interest rates, by their relative freedom of movement as a minority and the support of family networks in neighboring countries, members of minorities played the role that the bourgeoisie had played in Europe in the development of trade and economy. The non-Muslims have therefore carried out the task of economic development in Afghanistan, a country where an enterprising and dynamic bourgeois class has practically never existed. The decline of merchant minorities in Afghanistan is partly caused by their special status as minority citizens. Between the 19th and 20th centuries, as trans-regional trade began to lose strength, independent Afghanistan wanted to put its hand to the economy to take advantage of the proceeds from the export of luxury goods (such as karakul skin or nuts). The creation of national export monopolies has reduced the range of action of non-Muslim merchants by forcing them to reinvent themselves as retailers or to leave the country, resulting in the end of their trans-national economic activities.

Bibliography

Alam, M. *The Crisis of Empire in Mughal North India: Awadh and the Punjab, 1707-1748.* Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1986.

Burnes, A. *Travels into Bokhara: Together with a Narrative of a Voyage to the Indus.* Lahore: Sang-e-Meel Publications, 2003.

Dale, S. F. *Indian Merchants and Eurasian Trade, 1600-1750.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994.

Elphinstone, M. *An Account of the Kingdom of Caubul and its Dependencies in Persia, Tartary and India.* London: Bentley, 1842.

Forster, G. *Voyage du Bengale à Pétersbourg à travers les provinces septentrionales de l'Inde, le Kachmyr, la Perse.* (Journey from Bengal to Petersburg through the Northern Provinces of India, Kachmyr, Persia.) Volumes 1-3. Paris: Delance, 1802.

Gnoli, G. *Le iscrizioni Giudeo-Persiane del Gur (Afghanistan).* (The Judeo-Persian Inscriptions of the Gur (Afghanistan).)Roma: Istituto Italiano per il Medio Oriente, 1964.

Goitein, S. D. *A Mediterranean Society: The Jewish Communities of the Arab World as Portrayed in the Documents of the Cairo Geniza, volume 1: Economic Foundations.* Berkeley: University of California Press, 1967.

Gommans, J. *The Rise of the Indo-Afghan Empire.* New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1999.

____. "Mughal India and Central Asia in the Eighteenth Century: An Introduction to a Wider Perspective." In *India and Central Asia: Commerce and Culture, 1500-1800*, edited by Scott C. Levi. Oxford University Press, 2007.

Gregorian, V. *The Emergence of Modern Afghanistan: Politics of Reform and Modernization, 1880-1946.* Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1969.

Herzig, E. M. "The Rise of the Julfa Merchants in the Late Sixteenth Century." *Safavid Persia: The History and Politics of an Islamic Society,* edited by C. Melville, 305-322. *Pembroke Papers volume 4.* London: I.B. Tauris, 1996.

Hopkins, B. D. *The Making of Modern Afghanistan.* New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.

Koplik, S. *A Political and Economic History of the Jews of Afghanistan.* Leiden: Brill, 2015.

Lee, J. L. "The Armenians of Kabul and Afghanistan." *Cairo to Kabul, Afghan and Islamic Studies,* edited by Ralph Pinder-Wilson. London: Melisende, 2002.

MacLagan, E. *The Jesuits and the Great Mogul.* London: Burns Oates and Washbourne, 1932.

Raychaudhuri, T. "The Mughal Empire." In *The Cambridge Economic History of India volume 1,* edited by D. Kumar and T. Raychaudhuri. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982.

Seth, M. J. *Armenians in India: from the Earliest Time to the Present Day.* New Delhi: Asian Educational Service, 1992.

Archives

National Archives of India (NAI). New Delhi: Foreign Department, Frontier Department, Political Department.

History of Community and Indigenous Language Mass Media Evolution in Turkana County from 1963-2022

By Josephat Nairutia Kemei[*], Kizito Muchanga Lusambili[±] &
Pontian Godfrey Okoth[°]

This paper examines the history of community and indigenous language mass media evolution in Turkana County from 1963-2022. It adopted a qualitative research approach. This is because, it involved collecting and analyzing non-numerical data through; texts, video, or audio. This was done in-order to understand concepts, opinions and also experiences from various respondents. It also used to gather in-depth insights into a problem or generate new ideas for this research. The paper highlighted on the pros and cons that has hit the Turkana community since 1963 on their interaction with the fourth estate in terms of social, political and economic development as compared to other communities in the country. The study was conducted in Turkana county, which is the area occupied by the Turkana people. Its focus was on the farmers, pastoralist, traders, politicians and administrators. The research illuminates on the impact of indigenous mass media empowerment to the community by use of vernacular language. That's why it discusses on its evolution and the impact it has created to the Turkana Community of Turkana County in Kenya. The research is significant in that, it informs the marginalized communities on the utilization of indigenous mass media to empower themselves in terms of socially, economically and politically by receiving regular and updated information from experts.

Introduction

Mass media can promote the climate of socio-economic development in different ways. The media have the ability to report and inform the people on a variety of matters. They can help broaden horizons and help to develop the quality of empathy (the capacity to see oneself in the other fellows' situation).[1] They can focus attention on certain topics such as political campaigns, a new agricultural practice, cultural practices, education programmes, commerce/ trading programmes or even a new health programme.[2] They can raise aspirations and also can create a desire on the part of individuals to desire a better life. The mass media can help only indirectly to change strongly held attitudes or valued

[*]Graduate Student, Masinde Muliro University of Science and Technology, Kenya.
[±]Senior Lecturer, Muliro University of Science and Technology, Kenya.
[°]Professor, Masinde Muliro University of Science and Technology, Kenya.
    1. W. Schramm, *Mass Media and National Development* (Stanford University Press, 1964), 21.
    2. Ibid, 22.

practices.[3] They can infer status and prestige upon an individual; they can provide a way to build leadership among political leaders in a given community. They can also broaden political discussion and policy making at the village level.[4]

Literature Review

According to Ram Pratap Singh, the evolution of indigenous mass media in India was started by Carey and Marshman of Serampore, who published the first vernacular newspaper in India, Samachar Darpan, on May 31, 1818.[5] It began during the reign of Lord Hastings. It was until 1878 when the father of vernacular journalism, Lord Lytton introduced the Vernacular Press Actin 1878. In India, the indigenous mass media plays a significant role in the society. For example, Community media give voice to those people whose interests and perspectives are marginalized and ignored by the mainstream media organizations.[6] In the era of globalized and urban-oriented corporate media, it is the community media which cares about local concerns. It has been observed in the past that corporate driven media organizations have very limited role in community mobilization and development but they have affected a lot to local culture. Community media have a significant role in shaping community life and its development. They may support the diversified views and provide a platform to those who are excluded and oppressed.[7] From the work Ram Pratap, he has not satisfactorily addressed the role of community media in India despite it being in operation since the early 19th Century. However, in relation to the brief knowledge he has informed the audience, his work will help the researcher in this study to address the evolution and role of indigenous mass media among the Turkana community of Turkana County since Kenyan independence. The study further used the knowledge of Ram Pratap to talk about social, economic and political development that may have been achieved, if any, by indigenous mass media in Turkana County. Furthermore, this works by Ram Pratap, was an avenue of addressing the importance of community media in general among the Turkana community of Turkana County.

According to James Orao, since the introduction of multiparty politics in 1992, Kenya has witnessed unprecedented growth in the media sector.[8] From one

---

3. W. James, *Psychology; Briefer Course* (New York: Holt, 1923), 87.

4. M. F. Milikan and D. L. M. Blackner, *The Emerging Nations (*Boston: Little Brown, 1961), 23.

5. P. S. Ram, "The Role of Community Media in Social Change and Development in India," *International Journal of Research Culture Society* 6, no. 5 (2022): 72-76.

6. Ibid, 72.

7. T. Nnaemeka et al. (1989). *Op. Cit.*, p. 34.

8. O. James, "The Kenyan indigenous languages and the mass media: Challenges and opportunities," *Stellenbosch Papers in Linguistics PLUS* 38 (2009): 77-86.

national broadcaster in radio and television and three main newspapers up until the mid-1990s, the number of radio stations, especially FM radio stations, has grown exponentially. This uncontrolled growth can be confirmed from the government's claims that they have run out of frequencies to allocate to new applicants. The floodgates opened with the licensing of the first ever FM station in Kenya, Capital FM, in 1996. Since then, the number of FM stations targeting different age groups and classes has risen. Broadcasting in the local languages[9] has also undergone the same kind of growth, with almost each of the major towns hosting FM stations broadcasting regionally or nationally.

For a very long time the local languages had to contend with limited air-time from the national government-owned broadcaster, KBC[10] approximately 4 hours daily, divided into two segments, for the approximately 18 local languages covered at the time. By 2007, there were several FM radio stations dedicated mainly to broadcasts in the various local languages. Royal Media, a private media company, led in this field with more than six FM radio stations broadcasting in various local languages: Chamge FM, Egesa FM, Mulembe FM, Muuga FM, Inooro FM, and Ramogi FM. Other indigenous language FM stations included Kameme FM and Cooro FM (Kikuyu), Lake Victoria FM (Dholuo), and Kass FM (Kalenjin). According to the BBC[11], by 2007 the market share of these local language radio stations was 27% of the radio market, compared to 33% held by mainstream radio stations. From James Orao's work, it's evident that, up to 2007, even the private media companies in Kenya, such as Royal Media services had not seen the need to establish a local radio station or any media in favor of the Turkana community of Turkana County. This segregation made the Turkana's to increasingly feel unrecognized in Kenya. This is because; they were left behind even in terms of getting the basic information that was to be provided to all Kenyans through the National news.

The aged were left behind. It is on this basis that this research interrogated the extent to which this community could have developed if the media could have served it the same way it did to other communities such as the Kalenjin, Kikuyu, Luo among others who were lucky to have media stations in their own dialect. Moreover, Orao posits that the indigenous language radio stations keep increasing not only their number of listeners, but also their reach in the country, which has expanded from being concentrated in the urban areas to covering whole regions and, in some cases, the entire country. Importantly, this boom is not a result of governmental efforts to promote the use of the local languages in

---

9. It is important to note that this is not the first time in Kenya's history that there have been indigenous language language mass media.

10. KBC's programming for the local languages is divided into Western Service (for the western regions of the country), Eastern Service (for the eastern regions) and Central Service (for the central regions).

11. BBC World Service Trust 2007.

broadcasting. These stations are in most cases private commercial ventures. As such, they are market oriented and their goal is primarily commercial. They have recognized, however, the fact that the indigenous languages are strong and play a key role in everyday communication in most of the communities in the country. While acknowledging this insight, it is also important to recognize the fact that any cultural promotion that the indigenous languages reap from the venture is purely accidental, an inevitable by-product. The current research focuses on this by-product.[12]

It's clear from Orao that the indigenous media may air some cultural practices of various communities and entertain their viewers. The question is, do these media houses get the concentrated cultures that are fully practiced by the said community? It is therefore imperative to clearly inform the audience through this work on the importance of local media in educating the society and even beyond the borders on the real cultures and traditions of that community. This is because, the local media have an opportunity to reach the epicenter of the community and draw first-hand information from the natives. Therefore, this study filled this gap by addressing the importance of local media in educating the viewers and its listeners on its culture and how important the culture is to them and to other communities at large.

From the works of Orao, indeed the aforementioned developments of the mass media, especially FM radios, in the Kenyan local languages have been received with mixed reactions from different quarters of the Kenyan society. While the ordinary Kenyans received them wholeheartedly, praising their presentation of the current affairs programs in more accessible languages, some in the ruling elite dismissed them as divisive forces that strive to highlight ethnicity and thus divide Kenya along tribal lines. The impact of the mass media generally on its target groups need not be reiterated here. To date there has been no research on whether or not the mass media in the indigenous language is capable of exerting influence on the indigenous language they employ.[13] It is on this basis that this research evaluated the concrete impact of the mass media empowerment on the socio-economic development among the Turkana community of Turkana County.

From Orao, the mass media have something to offer the target local language communities and, by extension, the indigenous languages used in these communities. Conversely, the local language communities have something to offer the producers of the mass media. This is called symbiotic constellation. In this constellation, it is argued that the media need the language communities just as much as the language communities have learnt to rely on the mass media for

---

12. O. James (2009). *Op. Cit.*, 77.
13. Ibid, 77.

services.[14] In discussing the symbiotic relationship between the mass media and the indigenous languages, a number of pertinent questions need to be asked: What is the role of the mass media in relation to the indigenous languages? Where are the possible convergent zones for the emerging mass media and the local languages? And, what could be gained, or lost, by the indigenous languages? Orao did not address these questions, and if done, it was partially that could not easily be recognized. In this study, these questions tended to address what it may refer to be the core of the symbiotic relationship. In this case, this study didn't thus look at them systematically, because they tended to overlap and pre-empt each other. Instead, it outlined the symbiotic constellation in order to give an impression of the challenges and the options that this development poses for the mass media, the indigenous languages and the language planners, as well as the government, as an important role player in language management.

Additionally, Orao, agrees that indigenous language media could play several roles within the target local language communities, of which socio-economic gain is the most obvious one. Significant for this study, however, are two specific roles namely; developing a public sphere within the given language community, thereby allowing the community to participate in creating its own news agenda, and secondly in providing an indication that the indigenous languages are sufficiently developed to cope with a fast changing world and, therefore, to effectively cater for the communicative and social needs of their speakers.

According to Gathigi and Brown, they assert that; indigenous language radio has, indeed opened up new avenues and opportunities for the development of the various local languages in Kenya. They maintain that when listening to the FM stations in Kenya, one is confronted with numerous interactive shows that are on offer.[15] The programming ranges from breakfast shows (with news and political commentaries and live call-ins) to those dealing with any number of interesting social issues of the day. That these are undertaken in the indigenous languages, which for a long time had been condemned as being unfit for public communication, exemplifies the way the mass media have created new opportunities for collective participation and have redefined the resources for self-definition. The increased role of the indigenous language mass media can be read from the reactions to and accusations leveled against their role in the early 2008 ethnic violence in Kenya. Being conscious of the deep connections between political, economic, historic and symbolic orders in Kenya, they view the mass

---

14. Important in this consideration is the fact English is not only the official language but also the language of instruction in the education system. Kiswahili, on the other hand, enjoys the status of the national language. The two languages thus command more speakers than any other indigenous language in Kenya.

15. G. W. Gathigi and D. H. Brown, The new public sphere: radio and democracy in Kenya. *Media and Technology in Emerging African Democracies* 105 (2010).

media as a significant apparatus for the development of the various indigenous language communities.

They add that the mass media have the capacity to ensure a continued cultural flow beyond language borders and are thus capable of connecting language communities beyond their ethnic boundaries. The developments sketched above show that with proper infrastructure, the indigenous languages are also in a position to develop to the point where they are usable in public interaction. The relationship between the mass media and the local Kenyan music industry presents an encouraging case. Since their inception, the FM radio stations, social media platforms and the locally owned television channels have been on the forefront of promoting local Kenyan (and East African) music.[16] It is on this basis that this study will want to assess the place of Turkana community in the media fraternity. Furthermore, Gathigi has not explained how the media industry has empowered the local communities using the indigenous language to propagate economic development through various information that they pass to the audience. This study addressed this gap by illuminating on how the local media leads to socio-economic success in the local communities especially on the Turkana of Turkana County.

Githigi and Brown further alludes that; apart from the debates regarding policy-backed stipulation of time allocation for the locally produced media content on Kenyan mass media, the FM stations themselves recognized not only the gap that existed for local music due to the KBCs concentration on western music but also the profitable venture that existed in partnerships with local musicians and producers. This marketing insight has ensured that both parties, the FM stations and the local music industry, have developed based on a symbiotic relationship.[17] The insights and infrastructure that have promoted local music could (with guidelines formulated to address the issues raised above by the linguists and language researchers) also promote the various indigenous languages employed by the mass media. Having examined the roles that mass media play in promoting and developing the indigenous languages in order to empower socio-economic developments in the society, it is evident therefore, to maintain that local media mostly aims at economically exploiting a market and making a profit. Their continued services to the indigenous languages are on condition of assured financial profit. This commercial venture leads to successful economic developments in the society.[18] In a multi-ethnic society such as Kenya, where politics of ethnicity (and therefore ethnolinguistic) rivalry abound, many local languages see the need to assert themselves. What the duo did not addressed here, is how the mass media can be used as a peace mouth piece in the society. Therefore, this study

---

16. Ibid, 106.
17. Ibid, 83.
18. Ibid, 84.

filled this gap by expounding on the place of mass media in peace development in Turkana County.

According to Omwanda, indeed in Kenya, especially in the recent past, the indigenous language mass media have become further arenas for politics and ethnic self-assertion. The mass media provide one very important avenue for this self-assertion via interplay of the mass media, politics, and ethnicity or "ethnic journalism".[19] The mass media, on the other hand, see their survival in tapping the mostly "virgin" resources of the indigenous languages. With the high number of FM stations targeting the youth, and therefore broadcasting mostly in English and Sheng,[20] the indigenous language FM radio stations target the rural folk in their own languages, therefore claiming a niche that is likely to ensure their economic survival in the competitive field. Omwanda has not clearly stipulated how the mass media in the indigenous language has impacted on the politics of the society neither has he elaborated on the extent to which it has reduced tension that arises during election period in the country. This study sought to explain how the local mass media aids in controlling the politics of hatred in the society with reference to Turkana County. It also explained on how these media stations have enriched the young generation with their indigenous language so as to avoid being swallowed by the sheng world that is not in any way official. This in turn enabled the study to elaborate on how the uses of local language in various local media stations and platforms have made the economy of the land to grow.

Methodology

This paper adopted a qualitative research approach. It involved collecting and analyzing non-numerical data through; texts, video, or audio.[21] This was done in-order to understand concepts, opinions and also experiences from various respondents. It also used to gather in-depth insights into a problem or generate new ideas for this research. The study anticipated employing historical research design. Historical research design is a plan or strategy within which a researcher collects data systematically and evaluates them by relating them to the past occurrences in order to establish the causes, effects or trends of those

---

19. L. O. Omwanda, The mass media and democracy: Understanding the problem of objectivity in multicultural settings. In M. Odero and E. Kamweru (Eds.) (2000): 203-224.

20. Originating from the slums of Eastlands in Nairobi, Sheng has developed into a sociolect very common in many Kenyan urban centres. In its many varieties, it consists mostly of modifications of combinations from English and Kiswahili. Depending on the locality of the urban centre, it is also laced with borrowings from the surrounding language communities. Thus, standard Sheng as such does not exist. In fact, even in Nairobi alone one tends to note differences depending on which part of the city the speaker comes from.

21. E. Babbie and J. Mouton, *The Practice of Social Research* (Cape Town: Oxford University Press, 2002), 71.

occurrences with the aim of using the data to understand and explain the past or present and/or future anticipated events.[22] In the historical research design, the writings are basically descriptive, they begin with a narration of events in a time sequence, and their analysis addresses the questions of explanation, relationship, and consequences of events.[23]

The study population of this study included the inhabitants of Turkana community from Turkana County. This included farmers, traders, educationists and media community from the area. This study targeted the people of Turkana south in the areas of Kainuk, Lokichar and Katilu. This study adopted convenience sampling method. This sampling procedure allowed available primary data source to be used in this research without any additional requirements. This method also involved getting participants wherever you can find them and typically wherever is convenient. The study used both the primary and secondary sources. In the primary sources, it used questionnaire, Oral and Key informant interviews, focus group discussions and finally observations. In the secondary sources, it utilized historical archives. Libraries were vastly used to gather secondary data. Journals, reports, books, theses that have been published or unpublished, and social networks (you tube videos), were also used.

Discussion

According to Naspaan, Turkana County has been one of the regions in Kenya that have faced decades of social, economic and political marginalization, with one of the highest levels of extreme poverty, illiteracy and continued vulnerability to droughts.[24] Devolution and decentralization of power as espoused in the Kenyan constitution of 2010, now provides new opportunities for economic and social transformation provided that communities are given the platform to voice their issues as well as to participate in decision making. Information is key in any society.[25]

While interrogating Moses Ekitela on the evolution of mass media in Turkana community, of Turkana County, he informed this study that, "indeed the quality of information is paramount". He supported his assertion by alluding that Turkana County for a long time has been faced by general lack of information and the proper channels to disseminate the same due to natural constraints and many challenges.[26] Recently, there is a paradigm shift due to fast

---

22. P. Leedy, *Practical Research: Planning and Design* (Englewood: Prentice Hall, 1997), 190.

23. Ibid, 190.

24. Ibid, 4.

25. T. O. Olila, *Citizens' Voices: Citizens Participation in Devolved Government* (Nairobi: EAEP, 2013), 18.

26. Moses Ekitela (32 Years), Key Informant Interview, 23/11/2022.

dissemination of information to the community. In Turkana County, public advocacy and general interest in governance is slowly growing, with an increasingly vibrant civil society and professional and student associations grounded in the community.[27] However, Ekitela posits that, despite the vibrancy that the local media has caused, there is a general reluctance and disinterest from the majority of the population to engage in governance discussions. In the past, most organizations and the government used chiefs who were mainly based in the urban or peri-urban centres as the main agents of communicating information to the local people/population.[28]

His sentiments were supported by Willy Lokiyor, who confirmed to this study that, indeed, this was a disadvantage to those based in the remote areas, who would either not receive the information or have to trek long distances to access it. Other channels of dissemination were through the village elders who were selected by the community to provide leadership and make major decisions on issues that affect the community. The downside of this approach of sharing information was that the chiefs and elders had focus on immediate issues affecting the people and in most cases made key decisions without necessarily engaging the community.[29]

Moreover, according to Wilson Lokiyor, development issues and government policies received little attention in Turkana County. According to him, the current trend with the current transition to decentralization, civil society has stepped up advocacy campaigns to enlighten indigenous Turkana people on various issues ranging from governance, development, human rights and access to justice, land and natural resources.[30] In the recent past, many environmental and human rights advocacy groups have been very active in sensitization on the impacts of oil exploration and how to allocate revenue to benefit the locals.[31] Therefore, from the two respondents, this study is convinced that Turkana County has remained mainly un-served by mainstream media since independence, with the little spotlight being informed only by disasters, especially recurrent droughts and insecurity.

The County has been experiencing communication barriers attributed to biased reporting and stereotype mentality among people and even major media houses when it comes to Turkana where dailies are read a day after others and

---

27. J. C. Glenn, T. J. Gordon and E. Florescu, "2013-14 State of the Future," in *The Millennium Project* (2014), 25.

28. Moses Ekitela (32 Years), Key Informant Interview, 23/11/2022.

29. Ibid, 23/11/2022.

30. J. A. Apiyo, *Indigenous conflict resolution mechanisms among pastoralist communities in the Karamoja cluster - A case study of the Turkana* (Nairobi, Kenya: University of Nairobi, 2014).

31. Ibid, 23/11/2022.

"unofficially sold at double price because of "remoteness."[32] As put forward by Naspaan, Joan Lemuya confirmed these allegations to this study when interrogated. She informed this study that, indeed, the image of Turkana community has been tarnished with some personalities and institutions taking advantage of recurring hunger and starvation to raise funds with no clear accountability for the assistance or aid given apart from there being no practical involvement in the setting of early warning systems to curb or mitigate against the cyrcle of tragedies.[33] Furthermore, Lemuya added that media has also become a critical platform to relay information, and various radio stations have opened in Turkana. They include: Maata FM, Sayare FM, Hosanna radio, Akicha FM and Radio Jambo. This has been a reliable source of information dissemination as most of Turkana residents like listening to radios due to the wide radio waves coverage in the County. Moreover, local newspaper publications existing in Turkana include: Turkana Mirror Newspaper, Turkana Times, and The Guardian, in addition to the national newspapers. They are bound to increase.[34]

From the oral interviews conducted by this study, it emerged that indeed Turkana community has developed positively as far as Technological mass media is concerned. The following history emerged as informed by a Key respondent to this study, Moses Ekitela with a focus group discussion from Lokichar alluding to the same sentiments put forward by him. That: Turkana community has a long history with mass media in Kenya since 1972. In this year, the then Voice of Kenya, which was later branded as Kenya Broadcasting Corporation (KBC), established a branch in the Eastern part of the country which was called KBC Eastern Service. This branch was meant to broadcast in local dialects among the communities that lived in the region.[35] These communities were majorly the Arid and semi-arid land (ASAL) based groups. They included: Rendile, Burji and Turkana. Thereafter, other groups were included, that is the Pokots, Samburu, Somali among others. In this effect, the Turkana language used to be allocated one hour per day from 1972 until 2017.[36] This was not allowing the community to access adequate information compared to other communities.

In the year 2008, with the help of Trans-world radio-Kenya, the first indigenous Turkana radio station known as Maata FM was established. It was stationed in Lodwar which by then appeared to be the urban town in the entire Turkana region. It was officially launched in 2010 and did broadcasting fully time. Up to the time of this study, Lodwar remains the urban and the only most developed town in Turkana County. Maata was established so as to advocate for

---

32. M. Naspaan, *Information and Advocacy in Turkana County: Drylands Learning and Capacity Building Initiative for Improved Policy and Practice in the Horn of Africa* (DLCI, 2014), 5.

33. Joan Lemuya, Oral Interview, 24/11/2022.

34. Naspaan, (2014). *Op. Cit*, 6.

35. Moses Ekitela (32 Years), Key Informant Interview, 23/11/2022.

36. FGD of Lokichar Community Development Association, held in Lokichar 10/11/2022.

peace in the land because there was a series of conflicts that was experienced between the Karamojong and Jie of Uganda, Topossa and Dongi'ro from Sudan who neighbored the Turkana community but shared the same dialect. Therefore, Maata was to champion for peace between them since they could receive the same message due to them understanding each other. The station used to cover a bandwidth of 80KM from Lodwar. This was very short radius to the vast Turkana County.[37]

In 2009, the Catholic Church, through the Catholic Diocese of Lodwar, established a local radio station, Akicha FM, to reach the local Turkana community. Their main aim in establishing this radio was to bring light to the people in matters to do with reaching them with the gospel. Furthermore, it based its program in matters to do with politics, social, economic and cultural matters affecting the lives of the Turkana people. Through this radio, the Catholic Church meant to civilize the community so as they can fit in the 21st century era. It covered a radius of around 80 KM from Lodwar to its surroundings.[38] Therefore, the study further records that, the Akicha radio, was used by Catholic Church to assist the people in reaching them and offering them basic assistance as the solutions to the problems encountered by the community. This is because, the radio station didn't purely broadcasted using Turkana dialect but it also infused Kiswahili and English in various programs covered. Therefore, it is the use of this radio that enlightened many Turkana's to be artists and others got to know matters of religion through regular evangelism conducted by the Catholic Church through this medium in Turkana community.

In 2010, a fully indigenous broadcasting radio known as *Ekisil* was born. It was established to assist in bringing about peace and harmony among the refugees and the host community, in the area by International Organization for Migration (IOM). It was stationed in Kakuma.[39] The main reason behind its establishment is that, the IOM observed that the area is frequently witnessing conflicts among the host community and the refugees.[40] In its programmes, the radio had set times to broadcast using Turkana dialect, and other was set differently basing on the language groups of the refugees accommodated in the refugee camp. It is still in operation to the time of this study. However it has even expanded its bandwidth to the central part of Turkana community as well as the Northern part.

In 2012, with the expansion of telecommunication technology, Ata Nayeche radio was established in Turkana West by a group of youths called Nayanae-Emeyen Youth Group who had an aim of promoting peace between the Karamojong, Jie, Topossa and Dongi'ro who bordered Turkana West Sub County

---

37. Ibid.

38. Moses Ekitela (32 Years), Key Informant Interview, 23/11/2022.

39. Ibid.

40. Ibid.

which is inhabited by Turkana community.[41] Ata Nayeche was only covering a radius of 70 KM which meant that it only covered the western part of Turkana bordering Uganda and Sudan the genesis is traced to a grandmother Ata Nayeche, who is believed to be the mother of the conflicting communities since they are perceived relatives based on the oral tradition.

The study recorded that, there was a very wide gap that arise from 2012 to 2022 when the next media station was installed. This, according to Moses Ekitela, was culminated by the challenges of telecommunication waves in the County which was by then low unlike now where there are strong telecommunication waves in the region. Also, inadequate professional in the county made the issue of establishing more stations to stall for a while. This is also followed by the general ignorance of the community stakeholders due to the high cost of living in Turkana County.[42] This is due to the fact that, all the media's established in Turkana have taken the efforts made by non-governmental organizations and the groups. No single professional has made an effort to establish it as a business enterprise.[43]

In 2022, the latest indigenous language established radio station in Turkana County is Ejok FM, 87.9. This was achieved through the efforts of SAPCON which is a non-governmental organization. It is stationed in Lodwar which is a central point of Turkana County.[44] It covers the entire Turkana County unlike the aforementioned radio stations. Its purpose is not limited compared to Ata Nayeche, Maata and Ekisil radio stations. It is wider in its broadcasting scope, in that it advertises businesses within Turkana County, educates farmers and business people, promotes culture through airing dialectical songs, promotes political education by regularly interviewing politicians from Turkana and also provides a bigger room of youth programs to take of the future generation. Therefore, this radio station is very popular as per the time of this study yet it was still very new in the community.

As by 2022, during the time of this study, Turkana County had two TV stations namely Turkana TV which was initially known as Chocha TV and Ayok TV had been established. These two televisions played almost a similar role. They empowered the Turkana community by educating them on matters to do with economic, political and social developments. Also, they addressed on matters to do with talent nurturing, air Turkana community challenges to the world, do advertisement and marketing of Turkana scenary to the world. Lastly, they also checked on emerging issues that could make the Turkana community remain updated. According to Moses Ekitela, the painful part is that, both of them were only digital televisions which had no media houses compared to Inooro TV

---

41. Ibid.
42. Ibid.
43. Ibid.
44. Ibid.

among the Agikuyu, Kass TV among the Kalenjins just to mention a few. However, despite this, it was a milestone in the Television broadcasting among the Turkana community.[45] This is because it majored on empowerment programs like business, music and art industry, leadership, farmers both in the farm and pastoralists. It is viewed globally hence selling the Turkana available opportunities to the world. This has acted as an avenue for more organization to visit the region in areas of agriculture, tourism, security and climate change.

Due to the remoteness and marginalization of this community by various sectors in the state, with mass media now being exposed as also marginalizing it, radio according to an FGD in Lokichar have played a significant role since 2008 when their establishments started.[46] Therefore, this study was interested in getting to know why the community radio such as Jambo radio, Maata FM, Radio Akicha, Ata Nayeche, Radio Ekisil and Ejok FM is so imperative. Moses Ekitela averred that; indeed, significance of community radio stations are widely recognized as the most basic, most connecting and most essential forms of community communication for the development of grassroots communities.[47] According to him, the focus of community radio on issues of utmost priority and concern to communities and are closer to community needs mainly distinguish them from the commercial and public radio stations. Moreover, the fact that community radio stations are established and sustained by non- profit entities means a media that is free and independent from commercial and state control other than the communities served.[48]

More importantly, community radio is the kind of community media that is easily able to act as a platform for social transformation.[49] This is more so because among many people, radio listenership is cheap and dominant, and has been enhanced by many radio receivers in rural homes and public transport as well as on mobile phones. Community radio is focused on being the media that is located in the endeavours of human kind to be free from want of any kind.[50] Therefore, this study found a number of indigenous mass media, operating in Turkana County. These media channels were very significant to this study as they provided out the roles they play in Turkana community and how they reach them.

It is very encouraging to record that Turkana community which was to some extent marginalized by the fourth estate has at least some print media that are

---

45. Ibid.

46. FGD of Lokichar Community Development Association, held in Lokichar 10/11/ 2022.

47. Moses Ekitela (32 Years), Key Informant Interview, 23/11/2022.

48. T. Muswede, *Sustainability challenges facing community radio: a comparative study of three community radio stations in Limpopo Province* (2009).

49. Ngugi, *Raila in push for vernacular* (Daily Nation 2 September 2015).

50. Ibid.

well informative to the people and citizens of Turkana community at large. Some of the print media which are written in Turkana language are very instrumental in the airing of the grievances and opinions of the community of Turkana County.[51] This study recorded the following print media in Turkana community of Turkana County: Turkana Guardian Newspaper-Voices of a new dawn-was founded in 2014 by Turkana County government. It is a rising local newspaper that has print as well as electronic media and the internet through its website. Its target is to become an effective voice of the Turkana people. It has commitment to Turkana community as an information sharing platform in the areas of education, peace and security, environment among other issues. It also does advertising on Turkana tours and travel agency and Centre for Advocacy Relief & Development (CARD).

Turkana Mirror Newsletter- Making all voices count-was established in 2014 by Turkana Bio Aloe Organization (TUBAE). Turkana Mirror is the Turkana county monthly newsletter. The newspaper under the auspices of TUBAE is pursuing the media agenda as a tool to bridge the communication barrier as means of giving residents an alternative source of relevant and credible information on various aspects of development more so under the devolved system of government. The Mirror enhances information and news sharing and progressively updates the county residents on the daily happenings.[52] The main focus is on the socio-economic development in the county. Apart from the monthly publication, a daily highlight of crucial and important news is accessed in electronic form through a world web social network.[53] The publication focuses on breakthrough and successes in various development spheres, challenges, human interest stories which are unique to the county, service delivery and marketing of local innovation, products & services.

Turkana Times Newspaper- the Arid Voice, was founded in 2014 by the Turkana County government. It is a weekly newspaper that aims at educating, informing and entertaining. It is the premier county newspaper that seeks to fill the gap left by decades of neglect.[54] Conceived at the dawn of devolution, the newspaper has anchored its content on issue-based journalism to tell the untold Turkana story from the local context and perspective. The content also captures relevant cross border issues that are of interest to locals and those in the Diaspora. The newspaper is divided into various sections including art & culture, sports,

51. L. B. Lihavi, *The role of radio in peace building: the case of the pokot-turkana conflict* (Nairobi, Kenya: University of Nairobi, 2020).

52. R. W. Ngugi and C. Oduor, *Review of status of public participation, and county information dissemination frameworks: a case study of Isiolo Kisumu Makueni and Turkana Counties* (2015), 22.

53. P. Palvia, N. Baqir and H. Nemati, "ICT for socio-economic development: A citizens' perspective," *Information & Management* 55, no. 2 (2018): 160-176.

54. C. S. Feibel, "A geological history of the Turkana Basin," *Evolutionary Anthropology: Issues, News, and Reviews* 20, no. 6 (2011): 206-216.

business, education, development, lifestyle, and opinion where a section on your voice where people write articles on pressing issues that needs to be addressed. The news is also available in electronic form through the website. Generally, the media has helped to ease the information barrier in the County and made the public informed of the progress and challenges faced as citizens are actively involved in their own development through the right institutions.[55] The publications have opened up for comments and contributions from various stakeholders enhancing information sharing in the county. TUBAE in partnership with Akicha Radio engage the county governments through press conference on quarterly basis where both the Governor and his executives address the county on current status of key county affairs, achievements, challenges encountered, mitigate measures deployed and plans for the next quarter.

The study also found that there is use of internet (online platforms) to obtain information in Turkana community. It emerged that the youth mainly use social media to form groups, especially Facebook group pages such as Turkana Professionals Association, Turkana County, Turkana County Legislative Assembly among others, as the main channels of information which only benefits the learned/educated and those can access internet phones or computers. Membership is a requirement to get or share information. Overtime, however, these group pages become political as the youth become manipulated by the politicians, especially as elections period nears. This limits personal freedom of expression which tends to constrain many members from contributing to status updates. Most educated people have been forced to stay in urban centres like Lokichar, Kainuk, Lodwar, Kakuma and Lokichogio because information circulates faster within these centres and also job advertisements may only be pinned at these centres making only those who are in other small centres without mobile phones and road networks get difficulties in accessing employment opportunities and vital information.

This study was further interested in assessing the place of organizations in disseminating information as a media channel to the community. This study found that, there are some active organizations that have persistently ensured that the locals receive information. One of the respondents, Achuka Kone interviewed by the researcher, postulated that; some community based organizations like the Turkana Women Advocacy and Development Organization (TWADO) through partnership with Transparency International have been able to form social audit groups in few centres to follow up initiated projects at the community level in Turkana County, as well as act as a source of information to the community.[56] She added that, for example 'Uwajibikaji Pamoja' is a platform

---

55. C. Reuter and M. A. Kaufhold, "Fifteen years of social media in emergencies: a retrospective review and future directions for crisis informatics," *Journal of Contingencies and Crisis Management* 26, no. 1 (2018): 41-57.

56. Achuka Kone (62 Years), Oral interviews, 24th/11/2022.

initiated by Transparency International that aims to improve service delivery to the residents of Turkana County and to facilitate the referral of complaints from one service provider to another. Achuka Kone further alluded that; by giving citizens a voice, key developmental issues are followed up on and information is enhanced at the grassroots level. However, the paradoxical part of it all as per her is that; despite the fact that CBOs are on the rise in Turkana County, it is difficult to pinpoint what most of them have achieved, despite claiming to be working for the community.[57] Joan Lemuya, supported Achuka Kone by informing this study that despite the existence of these organizations,

> …many of them are not sustainable and do not have the capacity to mobilize resources. Some have been formed with the aim of implementing projects on behalf of INGOs, but die immediately the projects end.[58]

Nevertheless, some CBOs are doing a great job, a case in point is the Turkana Bio Aloe Organization currently known as TUBAE African Development Trust which has promoted diversification of livelihoods in its advocacy strategies to address poverty and improve living standards of the Turkana people.[59] It has also done media advocacy and building capacities and supporting vulnerable groups on sustainable exploration and conservation of endangered environment.[60] For instance, existence of networks such as TWADO of CBOs provides legal advice to assist women facing domestic violence, rape, and divorce. It advocates against early marriages, which is common in Turkana community, and women's lack of rights in property inheritance with the aim of reducing these harmful cultural traditions and improving the visibility of women in the society.[61] From the preceding statement respondent Joan Lemuya adds that, in order to foresee socio-economic development, Centre for Advocacy, Relief and Development (CARD) was established as an oversight body aimed to improve social and economic status of Turkana people.

Furthermore, according to Joan Lemuya, there are other organizations advocating on various issues ranging from development such as Turkana Development Organization Forum (TUDOF) while others focus on promoting peace, natural resource management, among others. Generally from Joan Lemuya, Turkana County does not have clear ways of gathering and disseminating information since most of it is done through informal social sites like Facebook,

---

57. Ibid.

58. Joan Lemuya (38 Years), Oral interviews, 24th/11/2022.

59. M. Blakeney and G. M. Alemu, "Geographical indications in Africa: opportunities, experiences and challenges," *Experiences and Challenges* 38, no. 5 (2016).

60. K. Nurse, "Culture as the fourth pillar of sustainable development. Small states," *Economic Review and Basic Statistics* 11 (2006): 28-40.

61. G. Schmidt, *Violation of Women Rights Seen from a Kenyan Perspective* (Maryknoll Institute of African Studies, 2006), 54.

local newspapers and radio stations and also through area chiefs who do not reach everybody. Advocacy is also not well established. At the same time, community has reaped little social and economic benefits.

The response of Joan Lemuya is in agreement with Naspaan, who attests in her work that, "hopefully with time, advocacy will hit base as the County is at the point of interest of many developers".[62] Furthermore, Naspaan records that; according to Service Delivery Indicators (SDI) programme during data support programme workshop in July 2010 in Lodwar, it was noted that the local authorities are not always willing to provide organizations and also the community with data.[63] A case in point is the CIDP (County Integrated Development Plan) as an example of data the county government has perpetually delayed or turned down.[64] Therefore, these study nodes that, without this data, these organizations would find it difficult to carry out their advocacy mission. Moreover, all the above development issues will not be met if information does not trickle down to the communities and back to the authorities, and if advocacy cannot be the main agenda of individuals and groups in the entire county.

Conclusion

This paper concludes that indeed there is history of the evolution of mass media in Turkana County where the Turkana community are based on. It is clear that, the evolution began in 1972 when KBC Eastern service allocated few hours to broadcast in Turkana dialect. This was followed by the establishment of the indigenous media stations in 2008 when the first Turkana radio station-Maata FM was established through the help of Trans world radio-Kenya in Lodwar. In 2009, Akicha FM was started by the Catholic Church in Lodwar. In 2010, Ekisil radio was born. This was through the efforts of International Organization for Migration. Another radio station-Ata Nayeche FM- was started by Nayanae-Emeyen youth group in 2012 in Kakuma. The last radio station was established in 2022-Ejok FM. It is the only radio station that has a bandwidth that covers the entire Turkana County unlike the preceding stations that are limited to certain radius as far as coverage is concerned. Also, in 2022, the first indigenous digital-youtube televisions were established in Lodwar town. These TV stations include; Chocha/Turkana TV and Ayok TV.

Therefore the study discovered that, mass media had sporadically grown in Turkana community, where by there were about six community radio stations, three print media(newspapers) in the county, two YouTube Television channels purely in Turkana dialect among other social media platforms that were in

---

62. Mirian Naspaan, (2014). *Op. Cit*, p. 3.
63. Ibid.
64. Ibid.

operational in Turkana community of Turkana County. It was also established by the study that indeed, with the evolution of numerous radios and television, civilization had started getting to the people of this community. This is because, it emerged that people are getting teachings on politics, and socio-economic developments like other communities that have gone a big milestone in developments in Kenya such as the Agikuyu, Kalenjin, Luo and probably the Luyia community of Western Kenya. This study also concluded that through the use of mother tongue in community mass media, the cultural growth of the Turkana community will continue blossoming. The community culture will be preserved well and its continuity will be achieved. This will foresee the coming generation holding to the community's growth and maintenance of its customs, traditions and taboos at all times. More importantly to this study is the fact that, indigenous mass media restores dignity of a community as indeed the Turkana community.

Bibliography

Apiyo, J. A. *Indigenous conflict resolution mechanisms among pastoralist communities in the Karamoja cluster - A case study of the Turkana.* Doctoral Dissertation. Nairobi, Kenya: University of Nairobi, 2014.

Babbie, E. and J. Mouton. *The Practice of Social Research.* Cape Town: Oxford University Press, 2002.

Blakeney, M. and G. M. Alemu. "Geographical indications in Africa: opportunities, experiences and challenges." *Experiences and Challenges* 38, no. 5 (2016).

Feibel, C. S. "A geological history of the Turkana Basin." *Evolutionary Anthropology: Issues, News, and Reviews* 20, no. 6 (2011): 206-216.

Gathigi, G. W. and D. H. Brown. "The new public sphere: radio and democracy in Kenya." *Media and Technology in Emerging African Democracies* 105 (2010).

Glenn, J. C, T. J. Gordon and E. Florescu. "2013-14 State of the Future" (Vol. 1). In *The Millennium Project* (2014).

James, O. "The Kenyan indigenous languages and the mass media: Challenges and opportunities." *Stellenbosch Papers in Linguistics PLUS* 38 (2009): 77-86.

James, W. *Psychology; Briefer Course.* New York: Holt, 1923.

Leedy, P. *Practical Research: Planning and Design.* Englewood: Prentice Hall, 1997.

Lihavi, L. B. *The role of radio in peace building: the case of the pokot-turkana conflict.* Doctoral Dissertation. Nairobi, Kenya: University of Nairobi, 2020.

Milikan, M. F. and D. L. M. Blackner. *The Emerging Nations.* Boston: Little Brown, 1961.

Muswede, T. *Sustainability challenges facing community radio: a comparative study of three community radio stations in Limpopo Province.* Doctoral Dissertation. 2009.

Naspaan, M. *Information and Advocacy in Turkana County: Drylands Learning and Capacity Building Initiative for Improved Policy and Practice in the Horn of Africa.* DLCI, 2014.

Ngugi, R. W. and C. Oduor. *Review of status of public participation, and county information dissemination frameworks: a case study of Isiolo Kisumu Makueni and Turkana Counties.* 2015.

Ngugi. *Raila in push for vernacular.* Daily Nation, 2 September 2015.

Nnaemeka, T., E. Uvieghara and D. Uyo. *Philosophy and Dimensions of National Communication Policy*. Lagos: Centre for Black and African Arts and Civilization, 1989.

Nurse, K. "Culture as the fourth pillar of sustainable development. Small states." *Economic Review and Basic Statistics* 11 (2006): 28-40.

Olila, T. O. *Citizens' Voices: Citizens Participation in Devolved Government*. Nairobi, Kenya: 2013.

Omwanda, L. O. "The mass media and democracy: Understanding the problem of objectivity in multicultural settings." In M. Odero and E. Kamweru (Eds.) (2000), 203-224.

Palvia, P., N. Baqir and H. Nemati. "ICT for socio-economic development: A citizens' perspective." *Information & Management* 55, no. 2 (2018): 160-176.

Ram, P. S. "The Role of Community Media in Social Change and Development in India." *International Journal of Research Culture Society* 6, no. 5 (2022): 72-76.

Reuter, C. and M. A. Kaufhold. "Fifteen years of social media in emergencies: a retrospective review and future directions for crisis informatics." *Journal of Contingencies and Crisis Management* 26, no. 1 (2018): 41-57.

Schmidt, G. *Violation of Women Rights Seen from a Kenyan Perspective*. Doctoral Dissertation. Maryknoll Institute of African Studies, 2006.

Schramm, W. *Mass Media and National Development*. Stanford University Press, 1964.