Athens Journal of Humanities & Arts

Quarterly Academic Periodical,
Volume 10, Issue 2, April 2023
URL: https://www.athensjournals.gr/ajha
Email: journals@atiner.gr
e-ISSN: 2241-7915 DOI: 10.30958/ajha

Front Pages

Athens Journal of Humanities & Arts

Published by the Athens Institute for Education and Research (ATINER)

****

ATINER is an Athens-based World Association of Academics and Researchers based in Athens. ATINER is an independent and non-profit Association with a Mission to become a forum where Academics and Researchers from all over the world can meet in Athens, exchange ideas on their research and discuss future developments in their disciplines, as well as engage with professionals from other fields. Athens was chosen because of its long history of academic gatherings, which go back thousands of years to Plato's Academy and Aristotle's Lyceum. Both these historic places are within walking distance from ATINER's downtown offices. Since antiquity, Athens was an open city. In the words of Pericles, Athens"…is open to the world, we never expel a foreigner from learning or seeing". ("Pericles' Funeral Oration", in Thucydides, The History of the Peloponnesian War). It is ATINER's mission to revive the glory of Ancient Athens by inviting the World Academic Community to the city, to learn from each other in an environment of freedom and respect for other people's opinions and beliefs. After all, the free expression of one's opinion formed the basis for the development of democracy, and Athens was its cradle. As it turned out, the Golden Age of Athens was in fact, the Golden Age of the Western Civilization. Education and (Re)searching for the 'truth' are the pillars of any free (democratic) society. This is the reason why Education and Research are the two core words in ATINER's name.

****

The ***Athens Journal of Humanities & Arts (AJHA)*** is an Open Access quarterly double-blind peer reviewed journal and considers papers all areas of arts and humanities, including papers on history, philosophy, linguistics, language, literature, visual and performing arts. Many of the in this journal have been presented at the various conferences sponsored by the Arts, Humanities and Education Division of the Athens Institute for Education and Research (ATINER). All papers are subject to ATINER's Publication Ethical Policy and Statement.

The Athens Journal of Humanities & Arts
ISSN NUMBER: 2241-7702 - DOI: 10.30958/ajha
Volume 10, Issue 2, April 2023
Download the entire issue (PDF)

Athens Journal of Humanities & Arts
Editorial and Reviewers' Board

of World Languages and Literature, Western Connecticut State University, USA.
- Dr. Rodrigo Gouvea, Professor of Philosophy, Federal University of São João del-Rei, Brazil.
- Dr. Hank Hehmsoth, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor, Texas State University-School of Music, USA.
- Dr. Christine James, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor, Valdosta State University, USA.
- Ms. Jill Journeaux, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor of Fine Arts Education, Coventry University, UK.
- Dr. Bogdan Ataullah Kopanski, Professor, International Islamic University, Malaysia.
- Dr. Irena Kossowska, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor of Art History, Polish Academy of Sciences, Copernicus University in Torun, Poland.
- Dr. James L. Lawton, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor, Michigan State University, USA.
- Dr. Jennifer Logan, Professor, Occidental College, Music Department, USA.
- Dr. Margarita Lianou, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor, University of York, UK.
- Dr. Henrique Marins de Carvalho, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor, Federal Institute of Science, Education and Technology of Sao Paulo, Brazil.
- Dr. Nicholas Meihuizen, Professor, School of Languages, English Department, North-West University, South Africa.
- Dr. Angela M. Michelis, Philosophy and History Teacher in High School in Italy, PhD (University of Turin), National Italian Title of Professor in Moral Philosophy of II level (associated), Italy.
- Dr. Christopher Mitchell, Professor of Theatre Arts, Eastern Illinois University, USA.
- Dr. Anabela Moura, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor, Instituto Politécnico de Viana do Castelo, Portugal.
- Dr. Mechthild Nagel, Professor, SUNY Cortland, USA.
- Dr. William O'Meara, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor, Department of Philosophy and Religion, James Madison University, USA.
- Dr. Eloise Philpot, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor of Art, Radford University, USA.
- Dr. Alexandria Pierce, Professor, Art History, Savannah College of Art and Design, USA.
- Dr. Laura Virginia Radetich, Professor of History, Faculty of Philosophy and Literature, University of Buenos Aires, Argentina.
- Dr. Giovanna Daverio Rocchi, Full Professor of Greek History, Department of Historical Studies, Faculty of Humanities, University of Milan, Italy.
- Dr. Luiz Paulo Rouanet, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor, Department of Philosophy and Methods, Federal University of Sao Joao del-Rei, Brazil.
- Dr. Nancy Lee Ryuter, Dance Historian, Teacher, and Choreographer, & Retired Professor of Dance, Claire Trevor School of the Arts, University of California, Irvine, USA.
- Dr. Elia Saneleuterio, Professor, University of Valencia, Spain.
- Dr. Gleisson R. Schmidt, Professor of Philosophy, Universidade Tecnológica Federal do Paraná, Brazil.
- Dr. Nicholas D. Smith, James F. Miller Professor of Humanities, Lewis and Clark College in Portland, USA.
- Mr. Marco Aurelio da Cruz Souza, Professor & Choreographer, Regional University of Blumenau (FURB), Brasil, and PhD Candidate, Faculty of Human Kinetics (FMH), Technical University of Lisbon, Portugal.
- Dr. Maria Urma, Professor, University of Art "George Enescu", Romania.
- Dr. Bart Vandenabeele, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor of Philosophy (Aesthetics & Philosophy of Art), Ghent University, Belgium.
- Maja Vukadinović, Professor, Higher School of Professional Business Studies, Serbia.
- Dr. Suoqiang Yang, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor, Chinese Calligraphy

Department, Director, Institute for Interdisciplinary Research of Calligraphy Art and Information Technology, Xi'anJiaotong University, China.

- Dr. Panayotis Zamaros, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor, Academic Counsellor, University IFM, Switzerland.
- Dr. John Doerksen, Vice-Provost (Academic Programs & Students), Western University, Canada.
- Dr. Blaine Garfolo, Chair, Academic Advisory Committee for the DBA Program, Northwestern Polytechnic University, USA.
- Dr. Catie Mihalopoulos, Visiting Professor, Department of Enviroment, California State Polytechnic University, Pomona, USA.
- Dr. Marius-Mircea Crisan, Associate Professor, West University of Timisoara, Romania.
- Dr. Emanuela Ilie, Associate Professor, Faculty of Letters, Alexandru Ioan Cuza University of Iaşi, Romania.
- Dr. Eglė Jaškūnienė, Associate Professor & Vice-Dean for Science, Faculty of Creative Industries, Vilnius Gediminas Technical University, Lithuania.
- Dr. Nicoleta Calina, Associate Professor, University of Craiova, Romania.
- Dr. Aldo Dinucci, Associate Professor, Federal University of Sergipe, Brazil.
- Dr. Fatma Çelik Kayapinar, Associate Professor, School of Physical Education and Sport, Mehmet Akif Ersoy University, Turkey.
- Dr. Soubhik Chakraborty, Associate Professor, Department of Applied Mathematics, Birla Institute of Technology, India.
- Dr. Caterina Pizanias, Academic Member, ATINER & Instructor, University of Calgary, Canada.
- Dr. Mariana Cojoc, Academic Member, ATINER & Associate Professor, Faculty of History & Political Sciences, Ovidius University, Romania.
- Dr. Sarah L. Cole, Academic Member, ATINER & Associate Professor, Framingham State University, USA.
- Ms. Jenefer Davies, Associate Professor of Dance, Director of the Dance Program, Washington and Lee University, USA.
- Dr. Christopher Dreisbach, Associate Professor, Johns Hopkins University, USA.
- Dr. Michael Eisman, Academic Member, ATINER & Associate Professor, Temple University, USA.
- Dr. John Freeman, Academic Member, ATINER, Associate Professor & Head of Theatre, Falmouth University, UK.
- Dr. Rebecca Gillan, Associate Professor, (RT) Baton Rouge Community College, USA.
- Dr. Ensiye Baqeri, Academic Member, ATINER & Faculty Member and Assistant Professor, Encyclopedia Islamica Foundation, Iran.
- Dr. Ahmed Ghanem Hafez, Associate Professor, University of Alexandria, Egypt.
- Dr. Sophia Gilmson, Associate Professor of Piano Pedagogy, The University of Texas at Austin, USA.
- Dr.Christian Göbel, Associate Professor of Philosophy, Assumption College, Worcester, USA &Research Associate, The Von Hügel Institute, St. Edmund's College, University of Cambridge, UK.
- Dr. Ebru Gokdag, Academic Member, ATINER & Associate Professor, Performing Arts Dept., Anadolu University, Turkey.
- Dr. Samar Mostafa Kamal, Associate Professor, Tourist Guidance Department, Faculty of Tourism & Hotels, Minia University, Egypt.
- Dr. Yuemin Hou, Academic MEmber, ATINER & Associate Professor, Institute of Design Engineering, Department of Mechanical Engineering, Tsinghua University, China.
- Dr. Michele Kahn, Associate Professor of Multicultural Education, Studies in Language and Culture, University of Houston-Clear Lake, USA.
- Dr. Douglas J. King, Associate Professor, Gannon University, Department of English, USA.

- Dr. Simonetta Milli Konewko, Academic Member, ATINER & Associate Professor, Department of French, Italian, and Comparative Literature, University of Wisconsin Milwaukee, USA.
- Dr. Ana Ktona, Academic Member, ATINER & Associate Professor, Tirana University, Albania.
- Dr. James Latten, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor of Music & Director of Instrumental Music, Juniata College, USA.
- Dr. Gina Marie Lewis, Associate Professor, Art Coordinator, Studio Art, Department of Fine and Performing Arts, Bowie State University USA.
- Dr. Maureen O'Brien, Academic Member, ATINER & Associate Professor, St. Cloud State University, USA.
- Dr. Margo Apostolos, Academic Member, ATINER, Associate Professor, USC Kaufman School of Dance, & Co-Director, Cedars-Sinai, USC Glorya Kaufman Dance Medicine Center, University of Southern California, USA.
- Dr. Laura Osterweis, Academic Member, ATINER & Associate Professor, Communication Arts Department, Framingham State University, USA.
- Dr. Sayyed Rahim Moosavinia, Associate Professor, Shahid Chamran University of Ahvaz, Iran.
- Dr. Georgeta Rata, Associate Professor, B.U.A.S.V.M. Timisoara, Romania.
- Dr. Barbara Sicherl Kafol, Associate Professor of Music Didactis & Chair of Music, Faculty of Education, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia.
- Dr. Emily Shu-Hui Tsai, Academic Member, ATINER & Associate Professor, National Chung Hsing University, Taiwan.
- Dr. Nisha Bala Tyagi, Associate Professor, Delhi University, India.
- Dr. Laura Wayth, Associate Professor of Theatre, School of Theatre and Dance, San Francisco State University, USA.
- Dr. Sander Wilkens, Academic Member, ATINER & Associate Profesor, Berlin University of Technology, Germany.
- Dr. Baruch Whitehead, Academic Member, ATINER & Associate Professor, Ithaca College School of Music, USA.
- Dr. RajyaShree Yadav, Associate Professor, Goverment R.D. Girls College, India.
- Dr. Barbara Botter, Academic Member, ATINER & Adjunct Professor, Federal University of Espírito Santo (UFES) – Vitória, Brazil.
- Dr. Fatima Susana Mota Roboredo Amante, Invited Adjunct- Professor, Higher School of Education of Viseu, Portugal.
- Dr. Damian Islas, Invited Profesor, University of Toronto, Canada.
- Dr. Athena Rebecca Axiomakaros, Assistant Professor, Art History, State University of New York - Nassau Community College, USA.
- Dr. Ewa Bobrowska, Academic Member, ATINER & Assistant Professor of Philosophy and Arts, Academy of Fine Arts in Warsaw, Poland.
- Dr. Tugba Celik, Academic Member, ATINER & Assistant Professor, Nigde University, Turkey
- Dr. Kathleen Downs, Academic Member, ATINER & Assistant Professor of Theatre & Drama, American University of Kuwait, Kuwait.
- Dr. Chrysoula Gitsoulis, Academic Member, ATINER & Adjunct Assistant Professor, City College, City University of New York, USA.
- Dr. Sinem Elkatip Hatipoğlu, Assistant Professor, Department of Philosophy, Istanbul Sehir University, Turkey.
- Ms. Alma Hoffmann, Academic Member, ATINER & Assistant Professor, University of South Alabama, USA.
- Dr. Michael James Matthis, Professor & Director of Philosophy Dept. of English & Modern Languages, Lamar University, USA.

- Dr. Vassiliki Kotini, Academic Member, ATINER & Assistant Professor, Zayed University, UAE.
- Dr. Jamshid Malekpour, Academic Member, ATINER & Assistant Professor, College of Arts and Sciences, Department of Mass Communications, Gulf University for Science and Technology, Kuwait.
- Dr. Lejla Music, Academic Member, ATINER & Assistant Professor, Faculty of Political Sciences, University of Sarajevo, Bosnia and Herzegovina.
- Dr. Esra Cagri Mutlu, Academic Member, ATINER & Assistant Professor, Yuzuncu Yil University. Turkey.
- Dr. Sri Ram Pandeya, Assistant Professor, Ramjas College, University of Delhi, India.
- Dr. Anne Peterson, Assistant Professor, University of Utah, USA.
- Dr. Hany Sallam, Academic Member, ATINER & Assistant Professor, Theater Department, Faculty of Arts, Alexandria University, & General Director, National Center for Theater, Ministry of Culture, Cairo, Egypt.
- Dr. Mahdi Shafieyan, Assistant Professor of English Literature & Islamic Hermeneutics, Imam Sadiq University, Tehran, Iran.
- Dr. Abbasuddin Tapadar, Academic Member, ATINER & Assistant Professor, Department of English, University of Delhi, India.
- Dr. Mostafa Younesie, Assistant Professor, Tarbiat Modares University, Iran.
- Dr. Deborah S. Nash, Full-Time Philosophy Teacher, Marquette University, USA.
- Mr. Nick Higgett, Principal Lecturer, Digital Design & Programme Leader, MA Digital Design, De Montfort University, Leicester, UK.
- Dr. Bianca Predoi, Academic Member, ATINER and Architect & Associate Lecturer, Ion Mincu University of Architecture & Urbanism, Romania.
- Dr. Eric Francis Eshun, Senior Lecturer, Department of Communication Design, Faculty of Art, College of Art & Built Environment, Kwame Nkrumah Unversity of Science & Tech., Kumasi, Ghana.
- Dr. Mike Fox, Senior Lecturer, Limerick School of Art and Design, Ireland.
- Dr. Vasileios Adamidis, Lecturer, Nottingham Trent University, UK.
- Ms. Georgina Gregory, Academic Member, ATINER & Lecturer, University of Central Lancashire, UK.
- Dr. Siu-lun Lee, 李兆麟, Head of Academic Activities Division & Senior Lecturer, Yale-China Chinese Language Center, Chinese University of Hong Kong, China.
- Ms. Lillian Nave Goudas, Academic Member, ATINER & Senior Lecturer, University College, Appalachian State University, USA.
- Dr. Angela McCarthy, Senior Lecturer in Theology, University of Notre Dame Australia, Australia.
- Dr. Joseph Naimo, Senior Lecturer, School of Philosophy and Theology, University of Notre Dame Australia, Australia.
- Dr. Ebunoluwa Olufemi Oduwole, Academic Member, ATINER & Senior Lecturer, Department of Philosophy, Olabisi Onabanjo University, Nigeria.
- Dr. Daphne Vidanec, Senior Lecturer, Baltazar University of Applied Sciences, Croatia.
- Dr. Doaa Sayed Abdel Azim, Lecturer of English Literature, Faculty of Languages, October University for Modern Sciences and Arts (MSA), Cairo, Egypt.
- Dr. Tsarina Doyle, Academic Member, ATINER & Lecturer, National University of Ireland-Galway, Ireland.
- Dr. Michail Mersinis, Lecturer of Fine Art Photography, the Glasgow School of Art, UK.
- Dr. Orel Beilinson, Academic Member, ATINER & Lecturer, Harari College Worldwide, USA.
- Dr. Jonas Ciurlionis, Lecturer, Vilniaus University, Lithuania.
- Dr. Nursilah, Lecturer, Department of Dance, Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia
- Dr. Oseni Taiwo Afisi, Academic Member, ATINER & Lecturer, Department of Philosophy,

Faculty of Arts, Lagos State University, Nigeria.

- Dr. Edeh Peter Daniel, Lecturer 1, Department of Philosophy, University of Abuja, Nigeria.
- Dr. Ogunbiyi Olatunde Oyewole, Lecturer, Department of Religions, University of Ilorin, Nigeria.
- Dr. Declan Patrick, Lecturer, Liverpool Hope University, UK.
- Dr. Nur Silah, Lecturer, Dance Department, Negeri Jakarta University, Indonesia.Dr. Stephen Steinberg, Lecturer, University of Pensylavia, USA.
- Dr. Ensa Touray, Academic Member, ATINER & Lecturer, University of the Gambia, Gambia.
- Dr. Margherita Dore, Adjunct Lecturer in English (Translation Studies), Department of European, American and Intercultural Studies, University of Rome "La Sapienza", Italy.
- Dr. Eleni Tracada, Academic Member, ATINER & University Principal Tutor in Built Environment, Faculty of Art, Design & Technology, College of Engineering & Technology, University of Derby, U.K.
- Dr. Yakup Mohd Rafee, Coordinator, Fine Arts Program, Faculty of Applied and Creative Arts, University Malaysia Sarawak (UNIMAS), Malaysia.
- Dr. Tanja Tolar, Senior Teaching Fellow, School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS), London, UK.
- Dr. Susana Furphy, Honorary Research Fellow, The University of Queensland, Australia.
- Dr. Alessandra Melas, Postdoctoral Research Fellow, Department of History, Human Sciences and Education, University of Sassari, Italy.
- Dr. Douglas Lucas Kivoi, Researcher/Policy Analyst, the Kenya Institute for Public Policy and Research Analysis (KIPPRA), Kenya.
- Dr. Margot Neger, Academic Member, ATINER & Postdoctoral Researcher, University of Salzburg, Austria.
- Dr. Sabitha.S.R.Najeeb, M.Phil, Ph.D., University of Dammam, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia.
- Dr. Nasrin Daftarchi, Ph.D. of French Literature, Iran.
- Mr. Sanjit Chakraborty, Research Scholar, Department of Philosophy, Jadavpur University, Kolkata, India.
- Dr. Pritika Nehra, Academic Member, ATINER & Ph.D Research Scholar, Department of Humanities& Social Sciences, Indian Institute of Technology, India.
- Mr. Richard Finn, Academic Member, ATINER & Program Director, Stage and Screen Arts, Whitireia NZ, New Zealand.Dr. Arunima Roychoudhuri, Research Scholar, University of Kalyani, India.
- Dr. Christina Papagiannouli, Academic Member, ATINER & Research Assistant, Faculty of Creative Industries, University of South Wales, UK.
- Dr. Rossana Raviola, Department of Humanities, Philosophy Section, University of Pavia, Italy.
- Mr. Hugh O'Gorman, Director, Athens Center for Theatre Studies (ACTS) & Professor and Head of Performance, California State University, Long Beach, USA.
- Ms. Viviana Soler, Academic Member, ATINER & Research Professional, National Research Council (CONICET) & Sur National University (UNS), Argentina.
- Ms. Subha Marimuthu, Academic Member, ATINER & Research Scholar, Bharathi Women's College, India
- Ms. Arunima Roychoudhuri, Academic Member, ATINER & Full Time Research Scholar, University of Kalyani, India.
- Dr. Inma Garín, University of Valencia, Spain.
- Dr. Manoranjan Mallick, Academic Member, ATINER & Lecturer, Post-Graduate Department of Philosophy, Utkal University, India.
- Dr. Christina Banalopoulou, PhD Student, University of Maryland, USA.
- Dr. Julijana Zhabeva-Papazova, Academic Member, ATINER & Musicologist/Independent Scholar, FYROM.

President's Message

All ATINER's publications including its e-journals are open access without any costs (submission, processing, publishing, open access paid by authors, open access paid by readers etc.) and is independent of presentations at any of the many small events (conferences, symposiums, forums, colloquiums, courses, roundtable discussions) organized by ATINER throughout the year and entail significant costs of participating. The intellectual property rights of the submitting papers remain with the author. Before you submit, please make sure your paper meets the basic academic standards, which includes proper English. Some articles will be selected from the numerous papers that have been presented at the various annual international academic conferences organized by the different divisions and units of the Athens Institute for Education and Research. The plethora of papers presented every year will enable the editorial board of each journal to select the best, and in so doing produce a top-quality academic journal. In addition to papers presented, ATINER will encourage the independent submission of papers to be evaluated for publication.

The current issue is the second of the tenth volume of the *Athens Journal of Humanities & Arts (AJHA), published by the Arts, Humanities and Education Division of ATINER*.

Gregory T. Papanikos
President
ATINER

Athens Institute for Education and Research

A World Association of Academics and Researchers

14th Annual International Conference on Visual and Performing Arts
5-8 June 2023, Athens, Greece

The Arts & Culture Unit of ATINER is organizing its **14th Annual International Conference on Visual and Performing Arts, 5-8 June 2023, Athens, Greece** sponsored by the Athens Journal of Humanities & Arts. The aim of the conference is to bring together academics and researchers of visual and performing arts, and other related disciplines. You may participate as stream leader, presenter of one paper, chair of a session or observer. Please submit a proposal using the form available (https://www.atiner.gr/2023/FORM-ART.doc).

Academic Members Responsible for the Conference

- **Dr. Stephen Andrew Arbury,** Head, Arts & Culture Unit, ATINER and Professor of Art History, Radford University, USA.
-

Important Dates

- Abstract Submission: **7 March 2023**
- Acceptance of Abstract: 4 Weeks after Submission
- Submission of Paper: **8 May 2023**

Social and Educational Program

The Social Program Emphasizes the Educational Aspect of the Academic Meetings of Atiner.

- Greek Night Entertainment (This is the official dinner of the conference)
- Athens Sightseeing: Old and New-An Educational Urban Walk
- Social Dinner
- Mycenae Visit
- Exploration of the Aegean Islands
- Delphi Visit
- Ancient Corinth and Cape Sounion

Conference Fees

Conference fees vary from 400€ to 2000€
Details can be found at: https://www.atiner.gr/fees

8th Annual International Symposium on Religion & Theology
22-25 May 2023, Athens, Greece

The Humanities & Education Division of ATINER is organizing its **8th Annual International Symposium on Religion & Theology, 22-25 May 2023, Athens, Greece**. The aim of the conference is to bring together academics and researchers of Religion, Theology and other related disciplines. You may participate as stream leader, presenter of one paper, chair of a session or observer. Please submit a proposal using the form available (https://www.atiner.gr/2023/FORM-REL.doc).

Important Dates

- Abstract Submission: **11 April 2023**
- Acceptance of Abstract: 4 Weeks after Submission
- Submission of Paper: **24 April 2023**

Academic Member Responsible for the Conference

- **Dr. William O'Meara**, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor, Department of Philosophy and Religion, James Madison University, USA.

Social and Educational Program

The Social Program Emphasizes the Educational Aspect of the Academic Meetings of Atiner.

- Greek Night Entertainment (This is the official dinner of the conference)
- Athens Sightseeing: Old and New-An Educational Urban Walk
- Social Dinner
- Mycenae Visit
- Exploration of the Aegean Islands
- Delphi Visit
- Ancient Corinth and Cape Sounion

More information can be found here: https://www.atiner.gr/social-program

Conference Fees

Conference fees vary from 400€ to 2000€
Details can be found at: https://www.atiner.gr/fees

Athens Journal of Humanities & Arts - Volume 10, Issue 2, April 2023 – Pages 91-104

Oedipus's Responsibility: The Problem of Moral Luck According to Bernard Williams and Thomas Nagel

By Rui Rego[*]

In mythology, Oedipus is impelled, by destiny or fate, to perform a set of actions. Given that he is not responsible for his fate or luck, is he responsible for his crimes? Can moral judgments be independent of luck, chance or fortune? Nagel suggests an example: two agents (with the same intentions, desires, beliefs, etc.) shoot someone. The first agent hits the target, the second agent does not hit it because, luckily, a bird crossed the path of the bullet fired. Both agents wanted to hit their targets, but by the interference of chance or luck only one of them hits it: do we judge both agents in the same way, morally speaking? It seems that the moral responsibility of an agent for his actions is inseparable from a principle of control of the agent over his actions. However, when we analyse the object of moral judgment (agents, actions), our assessment varies according to elements of luck (constitutive, circumstantial, resulting, causal). Does luck introduce a paradox into the core of moral judgments (Nagel's thesis), limiting the very concept of morality (as Williams argues)? In this paper, I argue for the need to evaluate agents and actions morally regardless of whether they are subjected to luck.

Introduction

Can moral judgments be independent of luck? It seems that the moral responsibility of an agent for his actions is inseparable from a *principle of control* of the agent over those actions. However, when we analyse the object of moral judgment (agents, actions), our assessment varies according to elements of luck.

Let us clarify the problem of moral luck with an example suggested by Thomas Nagel. Two agents[1] aim to shoot another person with the intention to kill. In the case of the first agent, the bullet hits a bird, failing the target and preventing him to kill the person. The second agent has the same intention, the same motivation, and performs an action similar to that of the first agent. However, unlike the previous agent, when he shoots, nothing stands between the bullet and his victim, and he manages to hit his target and kill him.

Our *moral judgment* of these two agents is distinct: we do not consider attempted murder and homicide to be morally wrong at the same level. But, if

*PhD Student, Centre of Philosophy of the University of Lisbon, Portugal. This paper is funded by national funds through FCT — Fundação para a Ciência e a Tecnologia, I.P., under project SFRH/BD/119664/2016 and UIDB/00310/2020.

1. For *agent*, cf. Sofia Miguens and Susana Cadilha, *Ação e Ética: Conversas sobre a Racionalidade Prática* (Lisbon: Edições Colibri, 2011), 83-84; Donald Davidson, *Essays on Actions and Events* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001), 12-24.

this is so, we are admitting that moral judgments differ according to *luck*, i.e., to something that is not controlled by the agent. The *intentions* and *actions* of the first and the second agents do not vary (both have the intention to kill and act accordingly). What does vary from one case to the other is a *circumstance* and, because of that, the *consequences*. But, if we make a different appraisal of both actions, it appears that we don't judge only what is under the control of the agent. For nothing that is directly dependent on both agents' control is different: both have the same intentions, beliefs, and motivations to kill a person. The fact that one of them is effective and the other isn't does not depend on something that was under any of the two agents' control, but on the fact that in one of the cases, the trajectory of the bullet was intercepted, by chance or luck, by a bird passing through.[2]

Consider a second example. Two people want to help feeding the poor and they can do a bank transfer to that effect by pressing a button. The first person pushes the button and the money is indeed sent. The second person presses the button, but the money isn't transferred, perhaps due to technical reasons, and therefore no poor person is fed. Should both be praised for their generosity?[3] This is the fundamental point of the discussion: if the consequences of an action are important for the moral evaluation of that action, then, when the consequences depend on luck and not on what the agent can control, moral evaluation must be dependent on luck.

What can *luck* have to do with *moral* thought? Bernard Williams felt that, in associating these two terms — *moral* and *luck* —, he was creating an oxymoron,[4] because their combination expresses a dilemma or a confrontation. On the one hand, based on the principle of control, an agent has moral responsibility only for what he can control in his actions. But luck is something that escapes human control. Thus, *prima facie*, morality has nothing to do with luck: morality has to do with judgments about responsibility, about whether an agent is or isn't justified in acting as he did, and therefore whether he is worthy of praise or blame; luck, on the other hand, consists of elements that are beyond the realm of human freedom. However, we don't usually eliminate from our moral judgments elements that escape the agent's will. So, can agents and their actions be subjected to moral judgments when they are substantively subjected to fate or luck? It should be

2. Thomas Nagel, *Mortal Questions* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979), 29.

3. I owe this example to the anonymous reviewers of this paper.

4. "When I introduced the expression *moral luck*, I expected it to suggest an oxymoron. There is something in our conception of morality, as Thomas Nagel agreed, that arouses opposition to the idea that moral responsibility, or moral merit, or moral blame, should be subject to luck. This is so, I still think, because the point of this conception of morality is, in part, to provide a shelter against luck, one realm of value (indeed, of supreme value) that is defended against contingency. However, there are some misunderstandings that I now think my formulations in *Moral Luck* may have encouraged." Bernard Williams, *Making Sense of Humanity and Other Philosophical Papers 1982-1993* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 241.

noted that fate can be distinguished from luck. Fate is usually associated with a predetermination concerning the whole of life, a predetermination that can be blind or produced by someone, whereas luck (or bad luck) is usually referred to an isolated, chance event. As I will eventually conclude, in the case of fate, the person (Oedipus) cannot resort to it to clear himself of an action he was led to commit, while in the case of luck (the bird), our judgment of the agent's moral fault is nuanced by the fact that he was prevented from completing his action. That is, in the case of Oedipus, the fate that impels him to action does not diminish his responsibility, whereas in the case of the killer, the luck that prevented him from completing the action diminishes his blame.

Let's consider the myth of Oedipus. Oedipus is impelled by fate to perform a set of actions; not being responsible for his fate, is he responsible for his crimes? I shall argue that, although fate or luck interferes with our moral judgments, it is necessary to evaluate agents and actions morally regardless of whether they were impelled to action by fate or luck. I shall begin by defining moral luck and categorizing it in different types (*resultant, circumstantial, constitutive*, and *causal*); I then proceed analyse the interference of luck on the judgments we make about others (considering Nagel's proposal) and the interference of luck on the agent's self-evaluation of his own actions (in Williams' philosophy). I shall conclude by arguing that, even if we accept the interference of chance in life projects, we cannot admit that bad luck alters our moral judgments (at the risk of bad luck completely eliminating the object of moral judgment): Oedipus cannot escape moral judgment by claiming that his actions were due to the force of circumstances that transcended him — his fate or his bad luck.

Field of Analysis

Luck, *fate* or *fortune* — the things that escape the control of the human agent as contingencies, good or bad, advantageous or harmful — is a recurrent theme of moral consideration both in ancient philosophy and in tragic poetry. Hellenistic culture uses the *fate* in 25 different ways (has 25 different words for *destiny*). In recent times, the echoes of the problem of luck circumscribed to morals are essentially due to Bernard Williams and Thomas Nagel. "Moral Luck" by Thomas Nagel is a response to Bernard Williams' paper of the same title. In 1975, both philosophers entered a Symposium on Aristotelian thought with a meditation on moral luck. These articles are the mainspring of contemporary discussion.[5]

Martha Nussbaum analyses the influence of luck or fortune on ethical life (particularly in *The Fragility of Goodness: Luck and Ethics in Greek Tragedy and Philosophy*, 1986), evoking not only the philosophers (mainly Plato and Aristotle), but also the

5. Sergi Rosell, *La Suerte Moral* (Oviedo: KRK Ediciones, 2013), 23-26; Judith Andre, "Nagel, Williams, and Moral Luck," *Analysis* 43 (1983): 202-207.

(tragic) poets, given how compelling the theme is for both poets and philosophers. Recalling how tragic poets were considered "important sources of ethical insight"[6] with whom philosophers directly competed, Nussbaum follows Bernard Williams' philosophical exercise of returning to Greek thought and tragedy.

In this reengagement with Greek philosophy and tragedy, we can find, among other references, the important case of Oedipus.[7] The myth of Oedipus has multiple facets in contemporary culture.[8] In this paper, I want to focus on the fact that Oedipus internalizes the guilt of parricide although he was destined by fate to perform it, thus becoming a central example of the paradox I'd like to analyse: the paradox introduced by moral fate.[9]

Methods and Categories

In the present section, I will focus on both the definition and the characterization of the types of moral luck proposed by Thomas Nagel, trying to systematize them. At the end of this section, I will make a brief commentary on the cases of luck analysed by Bernard Williams. Let's start by considering Nagel's definition of moral luck:

> Where a significant aspect of what someone does depends on factors beyond his control, yet we continue to treat him in that respect as an object of moral judgment, it can be called moral luck.[10]

According to this definition of moral luck, the object of moral judgment integrates factors external to the will of the agent. That is, character and action are evaluated also according to good or bad luck.

The elements of luck which interfere with moral judgment can be distinguished and typified into different categories: *resultant luck*, *circumstantial luck*, *constitutive luck*, and *causal luck* (note that although Thomas Nagel has listed these forms of moral luck, the designations are not explicitly of his making). These different types of moral luck help clarify what is at issue.

Resultant luck.[11] The case of murder *versus* attempted murder presented above is an example of *resultant moral luck*. Both members of the pair (the murderer and the

6. Martha Nussbaum, *The Fragility of Goodness: Luck and Ethics in Greek Tragedy and Philosophy* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), XV.

7. Ibid, XXXII; 25; 129; 282-283; 334; 380; 383; 385; 387; 489*n*; 510*n*; Williams, *Moral Luck* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981), 30.

8. Carlos João Correia, *Mitos e Narrativas: Ensaios sobre a Experiência do Mal* (Lisboa: Centro de Filosofia da Universidade de Lisboa, 2003), 147-160.

9. For a broader literature review about *moral luck*, see Dana K. Nelkin, "Moral Luck," in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (ed.) Edward N. Zalta (Summer 2021 Edition).

10. Thomas Nagel, *Mortal Questions,* 1979, 26.

murderer in the attempted form) had the same intentions, plans, motives and actions. Yet, the outcomes differed. The different outcomes (murder and attempted murder) trigger different moral judgments.

Another example formulated by Nagel is the case of the Russian revolutionaries known as the Decembrists. The Decembrists were a revolutionary group in Russia that contested Tsar Nicholas I. Like all revolutionaries, they took a risk when they launched their uprising: if their actions were successful, they would be justified; if not, they faced a grim future. The outcome was tragic: the coup failed, and the consequences were severe for the soldiers who had been persuaded to follow them.

As we will see later, it should be noted that *retroactive justification* based on future success does not eliminate present evils. Thus, for example, Serguei Volkonski, one of the few Decembrists who survived the Siberian punishment, was Tolstoy's distant cousin and the inspiration for the character of Prince Andrei Bolkonski in *War and Peace*; but his alleged literary and artistic success does not supersede the evil of having been imprisoned. We will return to this topic when discussing *Gauguin's problem* as presented by Bernard Williams.[12]

Circumstantial luck. It refers to the environment in which one acts, or the time and place in which one finds oneself, and how this fact determines how one is appraised. Consider the case of two German men, one of whom travels to Argentina before the rise of the Nazi party in Germany, while the other remains in Germany. Both identify with the ideology of the rising Nazi party, but the agent who remains in Germany will eventually become an officer in a concentration camp, while the other does not affect his support for the Nazi party because he is not, at that time, on German territory. According to Nagel, it is not possible to pass the same judgement on both agents' ideological stance.

In Oedipus' case, the circumstances in which he found himself were relevant. We can assume that Oedipus would not kill his father if he knew he was his father (he would not commit parricide), because Oedipus ran away from home so as not to risk killing his father (or the man he thought was his father).

Constitutive luck. One considers "one's luck to be who one is [...] one's inclinations, talents, and temperament."[13] An agent's response to the requirements of morality is not indifferent to the kind of agent that he is. Thomas Nagel points to character's traits (sympathy, cowardice, coldness, envy, etc.) that are the background from which one responds morally (although one can counteract those same character traits). As to Williams, he begins "Moral Luck" by presenting the sage in classical antiquity as someone immune to luck, independent from whatever might disturb his tranquillity and happiness (think of the Stoic sage); however, he

11. Sergi Rosell, "Nagel y Williams Acerca de la Suerte Moral," *Revista de Filosofia* 31, no. 1 (2006): 158. Cf. Bernard Williams, *Moral Luck*, 1981, 28.

12. Orlando Figes, *Uma História Cultural da Rússia* (Rio de Janeiro: Record, 2017), 150.

13. Thomas Nagel, *Mortal Questions*, 1979, 28.

adds that this would already be an example of *constitutive luck*, since not all agents are willing to be wise in this way, able to accept the corresponding demands, inclined to take this path, that is not accessible to all.

Causal luck. "The luck in how one is determined by antecedent circumstances."[14] The debate about determinism *versus* free will falls under this category of moral luck. On the one hand, if our actions are a consequence of things that we do not control, they are not free actions, and since freedom is, as we would admit, a requirement for moral action, they are not proper moral actions. On the other hand, if we admit that agents are free, it is as if they inserted into the causal world, which they can't control, a certain spontaneity non determined by biological, physical, psychological luck, etc.[15]

For the purposes of the categorization of cases of luck, Thomas Nagel's work seems more adequate, since it is more detailed. Nagel uses Bernard Williams' *constitutive luck*, but Williams makes a broader category of it, encompassing not only *constitutive luck* in the sense given above, but also *circumstantial luck* and *causal luck*. Williams distinguishes *constitutive luck* from *incident luck*, understanding the latter as the *resultant luck* of the types here presented.[16]

Results: Limits, Justifications, and Regret

First. The boundaries of moral luck are dependent on the concept of morality that one has. If you think Kantian, then moral responsibility excludes the idea of luck. If you agree with Kant, then *good will* (*guter Wille*), the will whose goodness is intrinsic (since it expresses duty or has the moral law as its motive), must dominate over talents and temperament (referred to earlier as *constitutive luck*) and over luck in general (*circumstantial*, etc.) as a condition for being moral. According to Kant, luck does not interfere with morality and moral judgments nor should it.[17] Kantism is the paradigm theory for the denial of moral luck, since moral duty — to act according to one's good will — excludes from its horizon elements such as luck, fate or fortune, which bypass the determination of the will by duty. Contrary to the sage referred to by Williams (mentioned earlier), who is inclined to his sagacity by his *constitutive luck*, Kant believes that the possibility of an agent morally determining his will is universal, regardless of inclinations.[18] Bernard Williams recognizes in this thesis — of morality conceived as independent

14. Ibid.

15. Thomas Nagel will return to this problem in *The View from Nowhere*, cf.: Nagel, *The View from Nowhere* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986), 110-137.

16. Sergi Rosell, "Nagel y Williams Acerca de la Suerte Moral," 2006, 158.

17. Immanuel Kant. *Fundamentação da Metafísica dos Costumes* (Lisboa: Porto Editora, 2003), 32.

18. Ibid, 31.

of luck — an enticing aspect: it is, in a certain sense, a consolation for the injustices of the world;[19] in Kant's view, morality restores equality among people, because morally relevant actions can't have anything to do with luck (*constitutive*, *circumstantial*, or other).[20]

Second. Luck imposes limitations on morality. According to Bernard Williams, morality (contemporary and otherwise) aims at "delivering good news,"[21] by advancing harmonious conclusions to practical dilemmas. The circumstantial contingencies of human life betray, at every step, the ambition to find harmony for practical dilemmas. Williams is interested in Greek tragedy because it presents man (even the hero) as irreconcilable with the world. There is, in fact, a distance and confrontation between individual desires and the force of reality, regardless of whether we call it fate, the gods, or social reality.[22] In this sense, the agent could act well and still feel regret. Rationality and morality do not guarantee harmony of judgement, nor a safe conduct inhibiting luck and circumstantial (or other) chance. Williams is sceptical as to the ability of morality to solve practical dilemmas.

Third. Let us consider, in the context of luck, *retrospective justifications* for action, starting with a case presented by Bernard Williams, the so-called *Gauguin problem*:[23] imagine that Gauguin has to decide whether to live according to certain social expectations (and thus continuing to live with his family) or travel to the South Pacific, where he can evolve as an artist and become a great painter.[24] If he chose the latter (as he has), the justification for his actions based on his success would be retrospective, that is *a posteriori*; but retrospective justifications depend on the consequences, and therefore, on luck in the process.[25] Williams goes even further, claiming that Gauguin's decision reveals that morality does not prevail in all cases: to take a risk as an artist in progress would be more structuring for Gauguin's identity than certain moral obligations. And that is Williams' dilemma — either moral value is not supreme or it incorporates elements of luck.[26] Thomas Nagel rejects Gauguin's case as a moral case.

---

19. Bernard Williams, *Moral Luck*, 1981, 21.

20. John Rawls, writing in the Kantian tradition, proposes a choice of *principles of justice* whose aim it is to blindfold the contingencies of chance. John Rawls, *Uma Teoria da Justiça* (Lisboa: Editorial Presença, 2013), 76; Rawls, *A Theory of Justice* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1971), 62-63.

21. Eduardo Pohlmann, *O Problema da Sorte Moral* (Porto Alegre: Universidade de Rio Grande do Sul, 2012), 74

22. Bernard Williams, *Shame and Necessity* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993), 164-165.

23. Simon Blackburn, *The Oxford Dictionary of Philosophy* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005): "Gauguin problem".

24. Bernard Williams, *Moral Luck*, 1981, 22.

25. Sergi Rosell, "Nagel y Williams Acerca de la Suerte Moral," 2006, 152.

26. Ibid, 153.

Furthermore, we don't always act according to our own moral standards, but in order to have a justification when we don't, we need to present a different standard for our actions. We have to present a justification for our choice of standards, and this can ultimately also be moral: it means deciding how we should live.

Fourth. One might think that if the agent has no control over a particular action, then he is not truly an agent, but a spectator of an event. However, this does not seem to be the case. For example, if a careful truck driver runs over a child who jumped into the road, the driver, although careful, had no control over the outcome, and yet he is not a mere spectator of an event.[27] The driver can be expected to *regret* the event, even if he is exempt from moral responsibility.[28] Thus, the agent's participation in a misfortune is not indifferent, even when he is not responsible for the result.[29]

Williams proposes a concept that helps clarify what is at issue: *agent-regret*. That is, to the general idea of regret, according to which "it would have been better if things had been otherwise," if we had deliberated differently, there is added the agent's participation in an action (not restricted to deliberative agency) and the evaluation that the agent makes about himself.[30] This regret presupposes that the agent participates in the act, even if he is exempt from moral responsibility for it: if the truck driver was not sorry for what happened, even though he had no responsibility in it, that would be, we would admit, morally wrong. Although the running over was not intentional and the driver was not negligent, the example reveals it is not only consequences that matter for moral judgment; reactions to misfortune also play a relevant role in morality.

Thus, even if one tries to focus moral evaluation on the agent's motives and intentions, first, there is no escape from moral fate, and second, these are not the only elements to consider in morality: it is important to consider (moral) reactions in the wake of unintentional acts.

---

27. Bernard Williams, *Moral Luck*, 1981, 28.

28. It should be noted that *regret* has both a subjective and an objective meaning. It is one thing to say, "It would have been better if I had done things differently" and another thing to say, "It would have been better if things had happened otherwise"; the former is repentance for what one has done/not done and the driver does not feel, the latter grief for what happened.

29. For the debate around the egalitarianism of luck, as to whether, in the name of justice, a more egalitarian distribution of goods should correct certain inequalities arising from *constitutive luck* (natural talents), on the grounds that it is unjust for people to have advantages for which they are not responsible, cf. Dana K. Nelkin, "Moral Luck," 2021.

30. Bernard Williams, *Moral Luck*, 1981, 27.

Discussion: The Paradox of Moral Luck or a Hybrid Position

Thomas Nagel objects to Gauguin's case by arguing that it does not constitute a moral situation. For Nagel, the problem of moral luck is a paradox arising at the core of morality or our moral judgments. Let us analyse two corollaries of Nagelian philosophy applied to this problem.

First, Thomas Nagel will not give up on the principle of control as a structuring element of morality. However, he views various philosophical problems from a perspective that applies also to moral luck, namely that individuals are capable of a double viewpoint:[31] on one hand, the internal (or first-person) viewpoint, from which they conceive themselves as agents acting in the world; and, on the other hand, the external (or third-person) viewpoint, from which they conceive themselves as events in a given causal nexus, from which they are absent.[32] Nagel argues that we would be unable to always look at ourselves from an external point of view, as mere events in a causal nexus. A permanently external point of view would eliminate the possibility of seeing ourselves as agents.

Second. Luck threatens intuitive and habitual moral judgements: when everything is blamed on luck, the attribution of responsibility is reduced to a point without extension. However, at the same time, the paradox clarifies relevant aspects of the agent's conception of himself:

> I believe that in a sense the problem has no solution, because something in the idea of agency is incompatible with actions being events, or people being things. But as the

31. Cf.: Thomas Nagel "Subjective and Objective," In *Mortal Questions* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979), 196-213. "The power of the impulse to transcend oneself and one's species is so great, and its rewards so substantial, that it is not likely to be seriously baffled by the admission that objectivity has its limits. While I am arguing for a form of romanticism, I am not an extremist. The task of accepting the polarity without allowing either of its terms to swallow the other should be a creative one. It is the aim of eventual unification that I think is misplaced, both in our thoughts about how to live and in our conception of what there is. The coexistence of conflicting points of view, varying in detachment from the contingent self, is not just a practically necessary illusion but an irreducible fact of life." Nagel, *The View from Nowhere* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986), 213.

32. "The problem arises, I believe, because the self which acts and is the object of moral judgment is threatened with dissolution by the absorption of its acts and impulses into the class of events. Moral judgment of a person is judgment not of what happens to him, but of him. It does not say merely that a certain event or state of affairs is fortunate or unfortunate or even terrible. It is not an evaluation of a state of the world, or of an individual as part of the world. We are not thinking just that it would be better if he were different, or did not exist, or had not done some of the things he has done. We are judging *him*, rather than his existence or characteristics. The effect of concentrating on the influence of what is not under his control is to make this responsible self-seem to disappear, swallowed up by the order of mere events." Thomas Nagel, *Mortal*, 1979, 36.

> external determinants of what someone has done are gradually exposed, in their effect on consequences, character, and choice itself, it becomes gradually clear that actions are events and people things. Eventually nothing remains which can be ascribed to the responsible self, and we are left with nothing but a portion of the larger sequence of events, which can be deplored or celebrated, but not blamed or praised.[33]

The analysis of the agent from an external, scientific-natural point of view, eliminates entirely the free and responsible subject, submerging him or her in a causal chain, which can be happy or unhappy, but with no room for moral praise or blame of the agent. For, in a blind causal nexus, who is the subject that responds or is responsible? In a flow of events, which actions may be subjected to moral judgment? Unlike Bernard Williams – who is sc*eptic* regarding the capacity of moral values and practical rationality to definitively influence autonomous practical decisions vis-à-vis other inputs and other values –, Thomas Nagel does not believe that morality has such limitations.

Nagel's and Williams' analysis have different focuses: (a) Nagel is interested in the interference of luck in the judgments we make about others, while Williams wants to understand the interference of luck in the agent's evaluation of his own actions (*agent-regret*; *Gauguin's problem*), i.e., the problem of *retrospective justification* for oneself and others. (b) Nagel discusses moral responsibility from an external or third-person point of view (the agent is judged from an objective point of view), while Williams reflects on the agent from an internal or first-person point of view (he is interested in the agent's self-evaluation). (c) Nagel is primarily concerned with non-circumstantial justification, while Williams highlights the agent in his surrounding circumstances, with irresolvable or morally undecidable practical conflicts. (d) For Nagel, the problem of moral luck connects to our conception of action, on the one hand, or the internal moral (actions) point of view, and, on the other hand, to the external factual viewpoint (events); while for Williams, it is not just a problem of the nature of action, but of the limits of the voluntary, the field of what can be blameworthy or praiseworthy: one can censure the driver who runs someone over without regret, even if he has no responsibility for the running over. That is, Williams believes that the agent is not limited to the strictures of morality in a legalistic sense: moral reactions and feelings also play a relevant role.

Conclusions: Oedipus' Responsibility

First. Where does the debate leave us? We have two extreme positions: either we deny the principle of control, admitting the contamination by luck of every subject of moral judgment, namely agents and actions, or we deny luck, believing

33. Thomas Nagel, *Mortal Questions,* 1979, 37.

in the immunity that morality would allow (following Kant). One of the determining aspects introduced by the philosophical problem of moral luck is the requirement to define more clearly the field of actions and agents, accounting for the possible interference of luck and chance. Does thinking that I act count as acting? And does thinking that I act mean that I'm acting? Or can one imagine an evil genius, like Descartes', or an evil neuroscientist who makes me believe that it is I who act, when in fact everything I do is controlled by him?[34]

Second. Returning to the notion of human life originating in classical tragedy, which inspires Bernard Williams' reasoning as we have argued, what part of Oedipus' actions is entirely his responsibility, in view of the fact that his actions are conditioned by his fate or luck?[35] Or, in another example from tragedy, could Ajax (the one that entered the Trojan War), after being defeated and killing false enemies, return to his home? Or does his integrity leave him no other way out but suicide? It is as if something in the way the agent sees himself overcomes moral or other values. The case of Ajax reveals the (tragic) connection between a life project (of the warrior hero), luck, and the identity of the agent (self-respect), which is not exclusively moral.

Third. The definition of moral luck and the discussion of different moral judgments of actions that differ only due to luck, presupposes certain apparently intuitive moral feelings and reactions (repudiation of the assassination attempt, etc.). If these reactions are not presupposed, it is difficult or unfeasible to recognise moral luck. Furthermore, if we admit that the agent who missed the target (murder in the attempted form) and the agent who hit it deserve equal moral judgement (treatment), then we are not in fact validating the interference of luck in moral judgements; in that case, both (the murderers in the attempted and actual forms) are guilty, regardless of the result, and therefore of the interference of luck.

However, even if we are not strictly consequentialist, the resulting luck seems to have to be weighed in, otherwise we would be forced into other absurd conclusions, or inferences that are hardly defensible *prime facie*, namely: if we don't need the results to evaluate a driver, but judge equally one that runs someone over and one that does not, we will have to condemn (or absolve) both drivers in the same way, regardless of the outcome of their driving. I admit that this conclusion is counterfactual, since, in fact, they are not both subjected to the same moral judgment. Or imagine a man full of good intentions who, by luck, never manages to put his good intentions to practice: would we, nevertheless, attribute merit to him? Would we consider someone a virtuous agent even if he has no actions to show for himself, but only morally correct intentions and motivations? Symmetrically, would a vicious agent who, by luck, never acts morally wrongly

34. Sofia Miguens and Susana Cadilha, *Ação e Ética: Conversas sobre a Racionalidade Prática*, 2011, 70.

35. Cf.: Bernard Williams, *Moral Luck* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981), 30.

(an agent hypothetically continually thwarted in his murderous intentions) be morally judged only by his malicious intentions or motivations? If we admit to not negatively evaluating (censuring) the murderer regardless of whether he was successful or not (murder in the attempted form *versus* murder in fact), it does not seem symmetrically permissible to positively evaluate (praise) both a well-meaning agent who carries out his virtuous intentions and a well-meaning agent who does not (or, *in extremis*, a malicious agent whose actions have benign consequences).

Fourth. Going back to the Greek context, even Zeus, despite being sympathetic to Hector, had to accept the death of the Trojan prince after weighing down both his and Achilles' fate.[36] It may be that even the gods are subjected to fate. Yet, as far as morality is concerned, we should not resign ourselves to benevolently accept Oedipus' statement – "I did not err"[37] – after the prophesied crimes have been committed. In conclusion: we cannot accept, *prima facie*, that luck should alter decisively our moral judgment.

There is here present a paradoxical dynamic to which I have pointed before: in the case of the gunman whose shot was intercepted by a bird, the luck that prevented him from committing the crime affects our moral judgement of his action: we don't say that he is a murderer. But in the case of Oedipus, the fate (the misfortune) that forced him to commit the crime does not affect our moral judgement of this actions: we say that he is a parricide.

Finally, the rereading of the Oedipus tragedy marks Western culture since Freud and psychoanalysis; or, if Oedipus is the scapegoat who, by being sacrificed, allows for the re-establishment of justice in Thebes and the end of the plague of which he was, after all, the only culprit (René Girard), as argued by Carlos João Correia, the myth accounts for the hiatus between life and thought,[38] namely the gap between the chaos of chance, fate and the circumstances of life, that escape the will of the agent, and moral thought and judgement. If, on the one hand, we call destiny the vital circumstances that introduce uncontrollable elements, on the other hand, moral thought cannot abandon its critical, evaluative and guiding purpose for right action. It is this responsibility for moral errors mixed with his fate that Oedipus bears, although his knowledge of the determinants of his action is limited.

Synthesizing the central argument: (1) There is a tension between luck and morality at various levels or of different kinds. (2) Kant's position is a paradigm of the exclusion of luck in moral judgment. (3) Oedipus is determined by the gods

---

36. *Ilíada* 22, 209-213, cf.: Manuel Antunes, "Sebenta de História da Cultura Clássica (1970)," in *Obra Completa do Padre Manuel Antunes, Sj.* (t. I, vol. II) (Lisboa: Fundação Calouste Gulbenkian, 2008), 262.

37. "Meus sofrimentos são inesquecíveis; / sofri-os sem saber o que fazia. / Os deuses são as minhas testemunhas / e tudo aconteceu malgrado meu." Sófocles, *A Trilogia Tebana: Édipo Rei, Édipo em Colono, Antígona* (Rio de Janeiro: Zahar, 2012), 575. "Não! Eu não pequei!" Ibid, 594.

38. Carlos João Correia, *Mitos e Narrativas: Ensaios sobre a Experiência do Mal*, 2003, 156.

to commit parricide; is he free and therefore responsible for his actions? If so, how? (4) The objective viewpoint of action (scientific-natural) eliminates or threatens the deliberative character of action. (5) There is a tensional dialectic between how we look at our actions and how actions can be observed in a causal nexus — as events. This tensional dialectic is irresolvable.

In summary: luck interferes with judgments and we continue to judge morally (this is the definition of moral luck). There are decisive factors beyond the agent's control. Oedipus is subjected to luck (he does not control what happens to him). Oedipus can still be subjected to moral judgment.

Acknowledgments

I thank Professor Adriana Veríssimo Serrão, at the Philosophy Department of the Faculty of Letters of the University of Lisbon, for challenging me to prepare this text. I would also like to thank the Praxis Group of the Philosophy Centre of the University of Lisbon (CFUL), supervised by Professor Ricardo Mendoza-Canales, for their helpful discussion of this paper. I thank Dr. Maria José Figueiredo for reviewing this article.

Bibliography

Andre, Judith. "Nagel, Williams, and Moral Luck." *Analysis* 43 (1983): 202-207.

Antunes, Manuel. "Sebenta de História da Cultura Clássica (1970)." (Notebook of History of Classical Culture (1970).) In *Obra Completa do Padre Manuel Antunes, Sj. (*t. I, vol. II). Lisboa: Fundação Calouste Gulbenkian, 2008.

Blackburn, Simon. *The Oxford Dictionary of Philosophy*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005.

Correia, Carlos João. *Mitos e Narrativas: Ensaios sobre a Experiência do Mal.* (Myths and Narratives: Essays on the Experience of Evil.) Lisboa: Centro de Filosofia da Universidade de Lisboa, 2003.

Davidson, Donald. *Essays on Actions and Events.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001.

Figes, Orlando. *Uma História Cultural da Rússia. (*A Cultural History of Russia.) Rio de Janeiro: Record, 2017.

Ilíada. Translated by Frederico Lourenço. Lisboa: Quetzal, 2019.

Kant, Immanuel. *Fundamentação da Metafísica dos Costumes. (*The Metaphysics of Morals.) Translated by Paulo Quintela. Lisboa: Porto Editora, 2003.

Miguens, Sofia, and Susana Cadilha (coord.) *Ação e Ética: Conversas sobre a Racionalidade Prática. (*Action and Ethics: Conversations on Practical Rationality.) Lisboa: Edições Colibri, 2011.

Nagel, Thomas. *Mortal Questions*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979.

____. *The View from Nowhere*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986.

Nelkin, Dana K. "Moral Luck." In *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, edited by Edward N. Zalta. Summer 2021 Edition. Available at: https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2021/entries/moral-luck/.

Nussbaum, Martha. *The Fragility of Goodness: Luck and Ethics in Greek Tragedy and Philosophy*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001.

Pohlmann, Eduardo, *O Problema da Sorte Moral*. (The Problem of Moral Luck.) Tese de Mestrado Apresentada. Porto Alegre: Universidade de Rio Grande do Sul, 2012.

Rawls, John. *A Theory of Justice*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1971.

____. *Uma Teoria da Justiça.* (A Theory of Justice.) Translated by Carlos Pinto Correia. Lisboa: Editorial Presença, 2013.

Rosell, Sergi. *La Suerte Moral.* (Moral Luck.) Oviedo: KRK Ediciones, 2013.

____. "Nagel y Williams Acerca de la Suerte Moral." (Nagel and Williams on Moral Luck.) *Revista de Filosofia* 31, no. 1 (2006): 143-165.

____. *A Trilogia Tebana: Édipo Rei, Édipo em Colono, Antígona. (*The Theban Trilogy: Oedipus King, Oedipus in Colono, Antigone.) Translated by Mário da Gama Kury. Rio de Janeiro: Zahar, 2012.

Williams, Bernard. *Moral Luck*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981.

____. *Shame and Necessity*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993.

____. *Making Sense of Humanity and Other Philosophical Papers 1982-1993*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995.

Athens Journal of Humanities & Arts - Volume 10, Issue 2, April 2023 – Pages 105-122

Baseball, Manhood, and Fathering Gay Children in Tom Perrotta's "The Smile on Happy Chang's Face"

*By Ibis Gomez-Vega**

Played out on a baseball field, Tom Perrotta's "The Smile on Happy Chang's Face" is about two men who behave badly for different reasons. Chang, a Chinese father who comes to the stadium to watch his daughter play softball, behaves badly when he rushes across a baseball field to defend his daughter who has been hit on purpose by a bean ball. He is brutalized by the police and arrested for his behavior. Jack, an upper-middle class white man, behaves badly at home when he slaps his teenage son for saying something that offends him, but the slap is followed by a punch so hard that he breaks his son's nose. This leads his wife to leave him and take the children with her, which causes Jack to feel like a victim alone in his own home without his family. The story opens after Jack has been alone for a year during which he claims to have learned a few things about himself. What the reader learns about Jack through his performance as the umpire in a Little League game is that he is in fact homophobic, probably racist, and a little too infatuated with the bodies of twelve-year-old girls. He sees himself as a victim, a man whose very existence is threatened by people like a next door neighbor who has fathered three "normal" sons, the wife who leaves him and takes "his" children with her, and the effeminate son who no longer wants to associate with his father. At the end of the story, Jack still does not know that he should blame his heteronormative way of seeing the world for all of his problems instead of his wife or his son.

Jack, the narrator in Tom Perrotta's "The Smile in Happy Chang's Face", is a man who behaves badly when he finds out that his son is gay. Because he slaps and punches his son during an argument, his wife Jeanie leaves him, takes the children with her, and "slaps" a restraining order on him that leaves him with "severely restricted" visitation rights.[1] His two daughters can visit him, but they are "not allowed to stay overnight".[2] His son Jason no longer even bothers to visit and asks him not to attend his performances in the school play. Jack, however, claims that "a year on my own had given me a lot of time to think, to come to terms with what had happened, and to accept my own responsibility for it," but he apparently also finds time "to indulge in the conviction that I was a victim too" because he cannot understand his wife's behavior. He complains that, "as far as Jeanie was concerned, I'd crossed some

*Associate Professor, Northern Illinois University, USA.

1. Tom Perrotta, "The Smile on Happy Chang's Face," in *The Best American Short Stories 2005* (ed.) Michael Chabon, 15 (New York: Houghton Mifflin, 2005).

2. Ibid.

unforgivable line".[3] Through Jack's confusion about the seriousness of his crime and the severity of his punishment, the story questions whether Jack has really learned something about himself during his year spent alone, whether he is a victim, as he claims that he is, and whether his punishment, losing his family over a slap in the face, is appropriate to his crime, his inability to accept his son. However, Jack's discomfort with his son's sexuality is not the only problem evident through his narrative. As he attempts to prove something about himself during that punitive year spent alone, Jack also reveals a propensity for ogling little girls and judging them harshly through his heteronormative way of seeing the world, part of his very narrow minded opinions on people who are the "Other," who in this case happen to be his feminine son Jason, little girls who play baseball, and Happy Chang.

As a foil to Jack, Perrotta creates Happy Chang, a Chinese American father whose daughter may or may not be gay, but a man who may be dealing with some of the same discomfort that Jack deals with. However, when the time comes for Happy Chang to choose heteronormativity over his daughter, he chooses his daughter without hesitation. With these two men, Perrotta overtly contrasts Jack's behavior toward his son and Happy Chang's behavior toward his daughter, the gender bending star pitcher of the Ravens. When an opposing pitcher hits Lori with a bean ball on the head, Happy Chang runs through the field to defend his daughter. He does not stop to ask himself if his daughter deserves to get hit by a bean ball because she is playing a game with boys and getting hit by bean balls is what happens to girls who transgress gender lines and play with boys. He does not even question the appropriateness of Lori pitching for a boy's team. Instead, he runs to the spot where his daughter is hit by the ball and attacks the coach who made the decision to hit his daughter. His behavior causes a disruption, and he is arrested, but the moment of Happy Chang's arrest rattles Jack's sense of security, his secret awareness that he is always right.

Happy Chang's arrest reminds Jack of his own arrest a year earlier, which brings back the memory of his bad behavior, but he also sees in Happy Chang's smile something that he has been searching for since the day of his arrest, the justification for having done the right thing. When Happy Chang runs across the field to stand up for his daughter, the policemen who arrest him also manhandle him. Jack notices but says nothing. He is at that particular moment more concerned with Lori, who is lying unconscious on the ground, but the behavior of the two policemen stays with him, as does the fact that Happy Chang gets up from the dirt with a smile on his face. The smile on Happy Chang's face has a direct effect on Jack, a man who has never really taken responsibility for his own actions and has in fact begun to think about himself as a victim of his wife's schemes. In this story, two men behave badly

3. Ibid.

for very different reasons, and Tom Perrotta uses this comparison, the difference in their behavior, to comment on the privilege that white men take for granted and the lessons that these same men have yet to learn about themselves in the baseball fields where their lives play out.

"The Smile on Happy Chang's Face" was originally published in *Post Road* in 2005, and it then appeared in a collection when Michael Chabon picked it for *The Best American Short Stories 2005*. In 2013, Tom Perrotta included it in *Nine Inches*, a title that, according to Matthew Gilbert in his review for *The Boston Globe,* "refers to the distance that chaperones at a middle-school soiree must enforce between kids on the dance floor" but can also refer to "the obvious penis-size joke,"[4] a point that scholars who write about Tom Perrotta's work find valuable because many of Perrotta's novels deal with the issue of masculinity in America. The story achieved local prominence when it was chosen for the One City One Story program of the Boston Book Festival in October of 2010, a selection that produced a flurry of newspaper reviews as thousands of copies were distributed free of charge in Boston. Thus, this short story has been reviewed three times, when it was first included in *The Best American Short Stories* 2005, when it was chosen for the Boston One City One Story program in 2010, and then again when it appeared in *Nine Inches* in 2013.

Jason Sanford,[5] reviewing *The Best American Short Stories 2005* for *Story South*, calls "The Smile on Happy Chang's Face" the "best sports story to be written in recent years," but he defends Jack when he claims that "the umpire (who is also the narrator of the story) is a good man and, during the course of the game, relives the mess he's made of his life in recent years." In 2010, Carlo Rotella,[6] in "Binding Boston with a Story," points out that "the story explores the inner turmoil of the home plate umpire, Jack, whose family has fallen apart," and he adds that Jack is "fumbling toward greater self-knowledge and tolerance." Rotella[7] rightly points out that "Jack's baffled, hurt, defensive, querulous, honest voice gives the story its vitality." Shannon Fischer, writing for *Boston Magazine*, states simply that the story "hits the ground on issues such as domestic abuse, homophobia, and the tendency of otherwise-mellow suburban parents to brawl at their kids' games."[8]

In 2013, Alix Ohlin,[9] reviewing *Nine Inches* for *The New York Times*, also mentions Jack's voice when he claims that it is "Dockers-casual, affable and self-

4. Matthew Gilbert, *Nine Inches by Tom Perrotta* (Boston Globe, 7 September 2013).

5. Jason Sanford, *Story of the Week: 'The Smile on Happy Chang's Face.'*

6. Carlo Rotella, *"Binding Boston with a Story." Rev. of "The Smile on Happy Chang's Face"* (Boston.com, 30 August 2010).

7. Ibid.

8. Shannon Fischer, *Person of Interest: Tom Perrotta* (Boston Magazine, October 2010).

9. Alix Ohlin, *Nine Inches, Stories by Tom Perrotta* (The New York Times, 13 September 2013).

deprecating." He points out that "a recurring element in the stories is the wrong move a character makes—blowing off college applications, committing adultery—that turns an Edenic life into a postlapsarian hell," and he claims that, for the characters in these stories, this "recurring element" works as the equivalent of losing "their place in the social order of their hometown." Ohlin[10] refers to the "carefully seeded moment of ugliness," like Jack's violence against his son, to argue that "Perrotta uses it to show how ordinary life contains both sweetness and violence," but he also notices that Jack "can't entirely grasp how everything went wrong, much less articulate it to his family." Matthew Gilbert points out in his review for *The Boston Globe* that Perrotta "has been the literary chronicler of suburban angst" and adds that "PerrottaWorld is a pretty place, but the sharp corners of despair keep breaking through the veneer of forced optimism and quaint architecture."[11] Gilbert claims that the best story in *Nine Inches* is "The Smile on Happy Chang's Face," a story "in which a Little League umpire is haunted by the moment when he struck his young gay son. He's the archetypal old-school male locked in a cycle of shame, remorse, and denial."[12] What these early newspaper reviewers note is that the story deals with the arbitrary measures that separate people, like the arbitrary nine inches that separate dancers, but the story also emphasizes, by the mere allusion to those nine inches in the book's title, the cost of measuring masculinity in America.

The main action of the story takes place on the baseball field during the Little League championship game between the Wildcats and the Ravens, a game officiated by Jack as home-plate umpire. Thus, the image of masculinity in baseball works as a backdrop for some of the statements made by Perrotta, even though this particular game features a Chinese American girl pitcher, Lori Chang, instead of a more traditional American boy, which is one of the many twists created by Perrotta in a story that examines what men like Jack value and how those values are constructed. Baseball functions as a symbol, one probably overused in literature and film, but nevertheless strangely appropriate in this story about boys and girls who break with "traditional" roles and the fathers who must then struggle with their own feelings about their children's trailblazing defiance. In "A Fit for a Fractured Society," John Thorn points out that baseball has become "the great repository of national ideals, the symbol of all that [is] good in American life: fair play (sportsmanship); the rule of law (objective arbitration of disputes); equal opportunity (each side has its innings); the brotherhood of man (bleacher harmony)".[13] In this story, all of these values will be challenged. Focusing on one man who loves baseball and

10. Ibid.

11. Gilbert, *Nine Inches by Tom Perrotta*, 2013.

12. Ibid.

13. Robert Elias, "A Fit for a Fractured Society," in *Baseball and the American Dream* (ed.) Robert Elias, 3-33 (Armonk, New York: M. E. Sharpe, 2001), 3.

functions as an umpire on the field, Perrotta uses the baseball field with its concomitant values as the canvas on which Jack's understanding of what it means to be a man is challenged because, to his surprise and even pleasure, the best pitcher on the Ravens' team is a girl whom Jack finds "adorable," but other men see as a threat.

Lori Chang's presence on the field is a source of contention from the very beginning of the story. Carl DiSalvo, Jack's next door neighbor and the coach of the Wildcat Players, warns Jack before the game begins that "'the strike zone's down here. Not up here,'" and "he illustrates his point by slicing imaginary lines across his stomach and throat".[14] Carl thinks that Jack favors Lori, especially when Jack reminds him that the kids on his team have a reason to be "wound tight" (2005: 3) about the game, especially "'after what Lori did to them last time. Didn't she set some kind of league record for strikeouts?'".[15] As soon as the game begins and Lori demonstrates that she is pitching "at the top of her game",[16] Carl begins his practice of running out to scream at the umpire, what Jack considers "theatrics".[17] Later, when Lori throws "a guided missile that thudded into [the batter's] leg with a muffled whump," Carl insists that "she threw it right at him" and calls it a "bean ball",[18] which is a ball thrown to cause harm and is usually thrown at the head, not the leg. Carl immediately demands that the umpire do something about the transgressing girl pitcher, but Jack refuses to eject Lori from the game. Ray Santelli, the Ravens' manager, "cupped his hands around his mouth and called out, 'Hey, Lori, did you hit that kid on purpose?'" but "Lori seemed shocked by the question" and responds by saying, "'It slipped'".[19] After the inning is over, "on her way to the dugout she stopped and apologized to Trevor Mancini, resting her hand tenderly on his shoulder." Jack sees this as "a classy move," and he notices that "Trevor blushed and told her to forget about it".[20] Carl however does not forget. The incident causes a heated argument between the coaches, managers, and umpires on the field as Carl attempts to get Lori thrown out of the game.

Issues of race and the white man's discomfort with race lurk in the background of Perrotta's story. The most obvious theme in "The Smile on Happy Chang's Face" appears to be Jack's unease with his son's sexuality, but race lurks in the subtext as an issue because Lori is a Chinese American girl and because the smile on her Chinese father's face apparently teaches Jack something about himself. The white men in this story get to argue about

14. Perrotta, "The Smile on Happy Chang's Face," 2005, 4.
15. Ibid.
16. Ibid, 5.
17. Ibid.
18. Ibid, 11.
19. Ibid, 12.
20. Ibid, 13.

whether Lori should stay in the game or not, but Lori's father, Happy Chang, is not allowed to voice his opinion on his daughter's love of baseball. He is not only silent but he is also presented as "a grim, unfriendly man who wore the same dirty beige windbreaker no matter how hot or cold it was and always seemed to need a shave".[21] According to Jack, Happy Chang was "unlike the other Asian fathers in our town" who are "doctors, computer scientists, and businessmen who played golf and made small talk in perfect English",[22] men who have somehow blended into the culture that surrounds them. The doctors, computer scientists, and businessmen do not stand out, but Happy Chang has "a rough edge, a just-off-the-boat quality".[23] He is not only ignorant of baseball etiquette but he is also from the wrong social class, which almost labels him as an outsider in the stadium where his daughter plays the game as well as any American boy. Although he comes to the games to watch his daughter pitch, he sits on the wrong side of the field, "in the third-base bleachers, surrounded by Wildcats fans",[24] as if he does not know which side is which. Jack wonders why Happy Chang "faithfully attended [his daughter's] games but always sat scowling on the wrong side of the field, as if he were rooting for her opponents," but he also asks himself if Happy Chang's "daughter was as unfathomable to him as my own son had been to me".[25] These two men are very different, but they are also fathers of children who challenge heteronormative rules of behavior. Perrotta uses their similarities and their differences to argue that Jack is not as right as he thinks he is.

As an American male who knows everything there is to be known about baseball, Jack obviously notices that Happy Chang sits on the "wrong" side of the stadium because, to men like Jack, there is a wrong side and a right side to something as simple as watching a baseball game; he adds Happy Chang's *faux pas* to the many other things that define Happy Chang for him, like his class, his looks, and his inability to speak English. What Jack does not notice is that Happy Chang comes to the games to cheer for his daughter, albeit in silence, but the fact of the matter is that he comes. He does not socialize or emote; in fact, he does not even speak in the story until his daughter gets hit by a bean ball thrown, on purpose, by one of Carl's sons; at that point, Happy Chang climbs the fence, rushes across the field to his daughter's side, and attacks Carl just as Carl's son, Ricky, screams at his father, "'You shouldn't have made me do that!'".[26] Perrotta stresses the difference between the white males involved in this game and the tiny Chinese man who steps up to defend his daughter when he states that "Happy Chang is a small man, no bigger than some of our Little Leaguers, and

21. Ibid, 8.
22. Ibid.
23. Ibid.
24. Ibid.
25. Ibid, 9.
26. Ibid, 14.

Carl is tall and bulked up from years of religious weightlifting",[27] but Happy Chang attacks him nevertheless. The Chinese father may not speak English well enough to impress Jack, but he knows what happens on the field. He knows that the pitcher, the boy who threw the ball, hits Lori because the coach tells him to throw the ball at her, and Happy Chang attacks the man, not the boy. When Jack looks away from Lori on the ground, he sees that "Happy's straddling Carl's chest and punching him repeatedly in the face, all the while shouting what must be very angry things in Chinese".[28] Carl is so surprised that he "does not even try to defend himself, not even when Happy Chang reaches for his throat".[29] Happy Chang rushes to the field to protect his daughter, not to beat up a child. He may not know where to sit, but he does know how to take care of his own. Unlike Jack, Happy Chang knows the difference between right and wrong, between hitting an adult and hitting a child.

Happy Chang's just-off-the-boat quality sharply contrasts with Jack's sense of being just right. Jack is an American man on the baseball field, and he knows exactly where people should sit. At home, when he measured himself against his son, he could claim an empowering sense of heterosexual "normalcy." On the field, Jack serves as the home-plate umpire, a position of authority that belies the mess that his life has become in the year since he slapped and then punched his son. Perrotta uses the differences between these two men to comment on racial inequality in America. Some men are clearly more entitled to their manhood than others. Jack even notices the difference between him and Happy Chang in the way the policemen "take Happy Chang into custody with a surprising amount of force".[30] Jack sees Officer "Freylinghausen grinding" Happy Chang's "face into the dirt while Hughes slaps on the cuffs," and he adds that, a year earlier, when Jack slaps and punches his effeminate son, the exact same policemen "were oddly polite" with him.[31] Happy Chang is humiliated in public as he comes to his daughter's defense. He is arrested so quickly that he is not even allowed to approach his daughter as she lies on the ground unconscious, which suggests that the police officers have no sympathy for the father whose daughter has been hurt. For what may be the first time in his life, Jack notices the difference in the way the police officers treat him and Happy Chang, which could be a good thing, but he does not even notice that the police does not allow the Chinese father to comfort his daughter or to even find out what happens to her. Happy Chang is taken away before Lori recovers, so the poor father has no way of knowing what happens to his daughter. What Jack sees on the field leads the reader to hope for a moment of awareness about the treatment of minority people in America, but

27. Ibid.
28. Ibid.
29. Ibid.
30. Ibid, 15.
31. Ibid.

that is not to be. Although he claims that he has changed in the year that he has spent alone, he is still clueless about race relations, but the look on Happy Chang's face stays with Jack through the rest of the story, even though Jack appears to misread its meaning.

The link between Happy Chang and Jack is Lori Chang, who is introduced as a girl who "didn't even look like an athlete" because "she was petite, with a round, serious face and lustrous hair that she wore in a ponytail threaded through the back of her baseball cap".[32] The point of most of Perrotta's description, provided through Jack's narration and therefore through his prejudices, is that, "unlike Allie and Steph, both of whom were fully developed in a chunky, none-too-feminine way",[33] Lori does not look like a lesbian. He says that "Lori was one of only three girls playing in our Little League that season," and he admits that "it's politically incorrect to say so, but the other two, Allie Regan and Steph Murkowski, were tomboys—husky, tough-talking jockettes you could easily imagine playing college rugby and marching in Gay Pride parades later in their lives".[34] Unlike Allie and Steph, though, Lori "was lithe and curveless, her chest as flat as a boy's beneath the stretchy fabric of her Ravens jersey," and he adds, asking whether "it's okay for me to talk like this" about a twelve year old girl, that "there was something undeniably sexual about her presence on the baseball field".[35]

As an adult commenting on Lori's looks, on the fact that she seems to exude femininity and cannot therefore be a lesbian, Jack establishes his intolerance towards people who transgress the boundaries of what he sees as gender prescribed "normalcy." He has adopted what David L. Wallace and Jonathan Alexander refer to as the "just like us" mentality, which means that, by assuming that Lori is just the right kind of girl, a heterosexual girl, he can separate her from "the inaccurate stereotypes of LGBT people as freaks, perverts, and pedophiles" that he obviously believes to be true.[36] He admits that his wife Jeanie had tried to teach him to stop "using words like *sissy* and *wimp*" and "scolded" him "for trying to enforce supposedly outdated standards of masculinity," but he adds that, even though he "tried to get with the program," he was in fact "embarrassed to be seen in public with my own son, as if he somehow made me less of a man".[37] There is a connection between Jack's appreciation for Lori and his sense of his own masculinity, but this connection is not entirely clear to him. He is, however, a man who worries about being less of a man when he stands next to his effeminate

32. Ibid, 7.

33. Ibid.

34. Ibid, 6-7.

35. Ibid, 7.

36. David L. Wallace, and Jonathan Alexander, "Queer Rhetorical Agency: Questioning Narratives of Heteronormativity," *JAC: A Journal of Rhetoric, Culture, & Politics* 29, no. 4 (2009): 794.

37. Perrotta, "The Smile on Happy Chang's Face," 2005, 9.

son, which means that he suffers from what Tim Bergling calls "sissyphobia," "a fear and loathing of men who behave in a 'less manly than desired,' or effeminate, manner".[38] Jack's discomfort in his son's company reflects the fear of the "swish," the effeminate male who for many years was singled out for derision even by other homosexuals. In "Unacceptable Mannerisms," Craig M. Loftin traces anti-swish feelings in gay publications between 1945 and 1965, and he finds that even early gay magazines like *One* and *The Mattachine Review* portray the effeminate male or Swish as the wrong kind of gay man and refer to him as "a degrading stereotype, an irritating throwback to an outdated model of homosexual identity".[39] Writers for these early gay magazines had something in common with Jack. They also preferred masculine men who love baseball.

Having a Chinese American girl as a star pitcher leads Jack to wonder how her father, Happy, feels about her presence on the baseball field. Because Happy Chang sits "stone faced, as if he wished he were back at his restaurant"[40] during the games, Jack assumes that Happy Chang is not in fact happy about his daughter's performance in the field. He tells himself that "maybe it's a Chinese thing," this sitting "stone faced" at a baseball game and "watching his amazing daughter dominate the Wildcats in front of the whole town on a lovely summer evening",[41] but he also thinks that maybe Happy Chang "wished he had a son instead of a daughter".[42] This leads him to think of all the stories he has heard about how Chinese parents prefer sons to daughters and how the orphanages in China are "full of them".[43] With these comments on Happy Chang and what the Chinese prefer, Jack slides into yet another politically incorrect commentary on a group of people about whom he knows very little. He admits that he "had no idea" what he was thinking about in his observations about Happy Chang and the Chinese in general, but he adds that "it didn't keep me from speculating".[44] He tells himself that, "in China, girls didn't play baseball," as if he actually knew this to be true, and then asks, "what did it mean that Lori played the game as well or better than any American boy?".[45] If he were an honest man, Jack would face the possibility that Lori could have more in common with Allie and Steph, the dreaded lesbians, than he can imagine. She is after all a girl who loves baseball and who plays it better than most boys, but to think about Lori as a lesbian Jack

38. Tim Bergling, *Sissyphobia: Gay Men and Effeminate Behavior* (New York: Southern Tier Editions/Haworth Press, 2001), 3-4.

39. Craig M. Loftin, "Unacceptable Mannerisms: Gender Anxieties, Homosexual Activism, and Swish in the United States, 1945-1965," *Journal of Social History* 40, no. 3 (2007): 579.

40. Perrotta, "The Smile on Happy Chang's Face," 2005, 8.

41. Ibid.

42. Ibid.

43. Ibid.

44. Ibid.

45. Ibid, 9.

would have to abandon his belief in what he considers "normal" gender prescribed behaviors.

Questioning what it means to be a man in America has been recognized as a theme in Tom Perrotta's work. In "Bad Mommies and Boy-Men", Charles Hatten not only points to the popularity of contemporary narratives that "problematize traditional male identity"[46] but also argues that, in *Little Children*, Perrotta returns to the themes "of troubled masculinity and sexual transgression"[47] that he had previously used in his earlier novel, *Election*. Hatten claims that in *Little Children*, Perrotta provides a "qualified celebration of a reassertion of masculine identity and moral clarity through violence"[48] and adds that "Todd's failure to live up to masculine ideals of self-control, including sexual self-control, is linked to what has become a stereotypical male incapacity in a postfeminist era, the difficulty of acknowledging and responding to feelings of vulnerability and pain".[49] This is part of the problem in "The Smile on Happy Chang's Face" where Jack slaps his son out of frustration that his son is not masculine enough. Jason does not like any of the things that his father associates with traditional American masculinity, like baseball and roughhousing. The challenge to American manhood provided by the effeminate son leads the more "traditional" American father to react violently. Through Jack's reaction, Perrotta examines how heterosexual men should react to finding out that their sons are gay or, in the case of Happy Chang, a character who barely speaks in this story, the possibility that their daughters could be lesbians.

Jack loses control of his emotions when his son Jason "said something that shocked" him and Jack "slapped him across the face".[50] The reader is never told what Jason says, but whatever it is offends the father. Jack admits that, "despite the evidence in front of my face, I refused to believe that you could be an American boy and not love baseball and not want to impress your father with your athletic prowess".[51] Jack claims that his son "was the one who threw the first punch, a feeble right cross that landed on the side of my head," and he even admits that "later, when I had time to think about it, I was proud of him for fighting back".[52] However, as blows are exchanged, Jack states that his son's defiance "made me crazy. I couldn't believe the little faggot had hit me." That the "little faggot" hits him is an insult to his manhood, but he adds that "the punch I

46. Charles Hatten, "Bad Mommies and Boy-Men: Postfeminism and Reactionary Masculinity in Tom Perrotta's *Little Children*," *Critique: Studies in Contemporary Fiction* 48, no. 3 (2007): 231.

47. Ibid, 232.

48. Ibid.

49. Ibid, 236.

50. Perrotta, "The Smile on Happy Chang's Face," 2005, 10.

51. Ibid.

52. Ibid.

threw in return is the one thing in my life I'll regret forever".[53] Within the same paragraph in which Jack admits to hitting his son lies a significant contradiction about what actually happened. Jack first claims that his son "said something that shocked me and I slapped him across the face," but the line that follows states that "he was the one who threw the first punch".[54] Apparently Jack does not consider a slap across the face an act of violence because he tells himself and the reader that his fifteen-year-old son "threw the first punch." The son throws a punch in self-defense after he gets slapped; then, the father punches him back hard enough to break his nose, but the slap is the first violation in this altercation.

Jack's inability to recognize that he may have been at fault suggests that he may be one of those white men whom David Savran considers masochists in the closet, "working-and-lower-middle-class men who believe themselves to be the victims of the scant economic and social progress made in the U. S. over the past thirty years by African Americans, women, and other racial, ethnic, and sexual minorities".[55] In order to see themselves as victims, as people affected by whatever benefits the "Other," these men have to see themselves "trading places, rhetorically at least, with the people they loath, [and] they imagine themselves (through a kind of psychic prestidigitation) [as] the new persecuted majority".[56] In "Becoming Rasta," Wendy Somerson explains Savran's logic of the "voluntary victimization" of the white male when she argues that, by using the "dual identification" of victim and aggressor explained by Savran through his study of Rambo movies, "the white male subject can both claim victimization and assert his aggressive masculinity through a continual battle that is ultimately waged within himself".[57] Jack makes no mention that he considers himself persecuted. He is an upper class white man who lives in a wealthy suburb, and he even gets to keep his fancy house when his wife moves out and leaves him alone, so he has not lost his possessions. However, Jack is very conscious that his ideas are being restricted, that some of his thoughts are now "politically incorrect," or simply not the right thing to say or even think. This is evident when he refers to Allie and Steph as lesbians-to-be,[58] when he speculates on whether the Chinese like girl children,[59] when he labels Mr. Chang "Happy" simply because he does not smile much, and when he relentlessly harasses his own son by using words like *sissy* and *wimp* in front of

53. Ibid.

54. Ibid.

55. David Savran, "The Sadomasochist in the Closet: White Masculinity and the Culture of Victimization," *Differences: A Journal of Feminist Cultural Studies* 8, no. 2 (1996): 128.

56. Ibid.

57. Wendy Somerson, "Becoming Rasta: Recentering White Masculinity in the Era of Transnationalism," *The Comparatist* 23 (1999): 129.

58. Perrotta, "The Smile on Happy Chang's Face," 2005, 7.

59. Ibid, 9.

him and also uses the word "faggot" to define him.[60] That he may hold resentment toward minority groups is not even mentioned in the story, but Jack does notice that he cannot think the way he thinks because other people, including his wife, consider his thoughts offensive, and he makes a point of stating very clearly that other men whom he considers less deserving than himself, like his neighbor Carl, have what he has been denied.

One of Jack's statements about himself in the story is that, "like most men, I'd wanted a son who reminded me of myself as a kid, a boy who lived for sports, collected baseball cards, and hung pennants on his bedroom walls".[61] What he gets instead is Jason, "an artistic, dreamy kid with long eyelashes and delicate features",[62] a son who, at the age of ten "wants to take tap-dancing lessons in a class full of girls," at fourteen makes "the chorus of *Guys and Dolls* and expects [his father] to be happy about this," and at the age of fifteen joins "the Gay and Lesbian Alliance at his progressive suburban high school" where the school will hold "separate" proms for "boys who want to go with boys and girls who want to go with girls".[63] Jason is not the kind of boy whom Jack values or even recognizes as a boy. Unfortunately, Jack's neighbor, Carl, "had three normal boys living right next door," and Jack could see them "in the backyard kicking a soccer ball, tossing a football, or beating the crap out of one another".[64] Carl's boys are "normal" because they do the kinds of things considered normal by men like Jack, who adds that "sometimes they included my son in their games, but it wasn't much fun for any of them".[65]

The concept of normalcy in queer studies refers to what Michael Warner calls "the taken-for-grantedness of dominant sexuality"[66] in *The Trouble with Normal*. David L. Wallace and Jonathan Alexander, in "Queer Rhetorical Agency: Questioning Narratives of Heterosexuality," explain that "heteronormativity effectively divides people into two distinct categories—homo and hetero—and clearly privileges heterosexuality".[67] Jack's world is a heteronormal world in which boys behave like the kind of boys whom he recognizes as boys and girls behave like girls whom he recognizes as girls. The problem is that, in his world, he gets to decide what is appropriate behavior for boys and girls. In the case of his son Jason, "normalcy" refers to Jack's expectation that Jason should like baseball. In Lori's case, "normalcy" refers to the fact that Lori is pretty and feminine, but Lori complicates

60. Ibid.

61. Ibid.

62. Ibid.

63. Ibid, 10.

64. Ibid, 9.

65. Ibid.

66. Michael Warner, *The Trouble with Normal: Sex, Politics, and the Ethics of Queer Life* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1999), 7.

67. Wallace, and Alexander, "Queer Rhetorical Agency: Questioning Narratives of Heteronormativity," 2009, 794.

Jack's sense of "normalcy" because, as cute as she is in a very girlie girl sort of way, she is also such a good baseball player that Jack assumes that she "actually had a strategy, a potent combination of control, misdirection, patience, and outright intimidation".[68] Lori "had not yet reached puberty" and "was lithe and curveless," like a boy, but she can still be identified by Jack as a girl because "there was something undeniably sexual about her presence on the baseball field".[69] Jack must be able to identify Lori as a girl in his heteronormative world because he likes Lori, and he does not want to consider that she could, like his son, be breaking his gender specific rules and positioning herself as "off limits" to men like him.

Jack's obsession with Lori's heteronormativity is scary. He objectifies Lori on the field, even though he is fully aware that his objectification of a twelve-year-old girl is not "okay," for he asks himself whether "it's okay for me to say this".[70] He knows that he likes her because she is "a powerhouse on the baseball diamond"[71] but he really likes her because she is a pretty girl; his problem is that, in order to like her, he must first see her as a desirable sex object, as a girl who is not like Steph and Allie and will not be marching in a gay parade, ever. Even though he assumes that Lori must be breaking Chinese cultural values (when he says that "in China, girls didn't play baseball"), he cannot allow himself to think that she is also crossing that other gender specific line that he made on the sand. He does not want to believe that just like Allie and Steph, Lori could be a lesbian. Jack's inability to consider Lori as a possible lesbian is part of his problem; he may like Lori, but he is at heart homophobic, which explains why he reacts so violently to his son's sexual orientation. Cynthia L. Conley, in "Learning about a Child's Gay or Lesbian Sexual Orientation," documents that studies "have overwhelmingly revealed that parents tend to react in a negative fashion"[72] to learning about their child's sexual orientation, and she adds that "many parents' negative reactions can be categorized as homophobic".[73] In a study from 2012, psychologists find that "the majority of parents initially respond to their children's LGB sexual orientation disclosure negatively",[74] and several mental health

68. Perrotta, "The Smile on Happy Chang's Face," 2005, 7.

69. Ibid.

70. Ibid.

71. Ibid.

72. Cynthia L. Conley, "Learning about a Child's Gay or Lesbian Sexual Orientation: Parental Concerns about Societal Rejection, Loss of Loved Ones, and Child Well Being," *Journal of Homosexuality* 58, no. 8 (2011): 1022.

73. Ibid, 1023.

74. Emily F. Rothman, Mairead Sullivan, Susan Keyes, and Ulrike Boehmer, "Parents' Supportive Reactions to Sexual Orientation Disclosure Associated with Better Health: Results from a Population-Based Survey of LGB Adults in Massachusetts," *Journal of Homosexuality* 59, no. 2 (2012): 188.

practitioners suggest that perhaps coming out to parents may not be such a good idea.

For Jason, the advice from mental health practitioners comes too late. He displays his sexual difference in front of his father, and his father behaves badly. Jack claims that he regrets his behavior toward his son, that punching his son "is the one thing in my life I'll regret forever" because he "broke [Jason's] nose, and Jeanie called the cops",[75] but Jack's statement lacks clarity; it is difficult to know whether he regrets breaking his son's nose or regrets that his wife called the police and "started divorce proceedings"[76] the day after he hit Jason. Nevertheless, the direct result is that he loses his wife and children and spends his time "writing letters trying to outline my complicated position on these matters".[77] He whines that "no one ever responded to"[78] his letters because Jeanie and the children choose silence on the subject of Jack's behavior, but Jack persists because he believes that his "side of the story had disappeared into some kind of void",[79] and this is what leads him to "the conviction that I was a victim too, every bit as much as my wife and son".[80]

Perrotta does not provide any examples of the letters that Jack writes to defend his position, but at the end of the story he does provide a glimpse into another one of Jack's attempts to influence his family's opinion of him. When Jack finds out that the championship game will be televised, he e-mails his wife and children asking them to watch the game on cable access, and then he leaves a message to remind them to watch the game all the way to the end. What he wants them to see is the statement that he thinks he is making when, at "full count, bases loaded, two out" and "a score of 1-0," Jack relinquishes his authority on the field. The game was "narrowing down to a single pitch," but Jack was so preoccupied "thinking about Happy Chang"[81] that he does not even see the all-important pitch. Instead of paying attention to the game, Jack "was thinking about Happy Chang and everything he must have been going through at the police station, the fingerprinting, the mug shot, the tiny holding cell",[82] a suggestion that he may be feeling sympathy for the Chinese man who was so rudely treated, but that is too good to be true. When Jack states that "all I could think of just then was the smile on Happy Chang's dirty face as the cops led him off the field",[83] he is saying that the look on Happy Chang's face shows "the proud

75. Perrotta, "The Smile on Happy Chang's Face," 2005, 10.
76. Ibid.
77. Ibid, 16.
78. Ibid.
79. Ibid.
80. Ibid, 15-16.
81. Ibid, 17.
82. Ibid.
83. Ibid.

and defiant smile of a man at peace with what he'd done and willing to accept the consequences".[84]

The fact that Happy Chang is "willing to accept the consequences" of his actions puzzles Jack to such an extent that it distracts him away from performing his job as umpire. When "the ball smacked into the catcher's mitt" and wakes Jack from his "reverie," he "honestly didn't know if it was a ball or a strike".[85] Unable to make the call, Jack quits. He takes off the umpire's mask and the chest protector and walks away. At that moment, he notices that "Mickey Fellner was out of the dugout and videotaping me as I walked past second base and onto the grass. He followed me all the way across center field, until I climbed the fence over the ad for the Prima Ballerina School of Dance and left the ball park".[86] Then, Jack admits that, "that's what I wanted my ex-wife and children to see." He thinks that his leaving the field shows "an umpire walking away from a baseball game, a man who had the courage to admit that he'd failed, who understood that there were times when you had no right to judge, responsibilities you were no longer qualified to exercise," and he foolishly hopes that "they might learn something new about me, something I hadn't been able to make clear to them in my letters and phone calls".[87] Reality, however, bears little resemblance to what he remembers of his walk across the baseball field after he refuses to make a decision that would end the game. Even though he remembers his "walk across the outfield as a dignified, silent journey," he admits that, "I look sweaty and confused, a little out of breath as I mumble a string of barely audible excuses and apologies for my strange behavior," and he knows at that point that, "if Jeanie and the kids had been watching, all they would have seen was an unhappy man they already knew too well, fleeing from the latest mess he'd made: just me, still trying to explain".[88] Unlike Happy Chang, who had a reason to run through the field and strike Carl, Jack has no reason to leave. His walk across the field is not "a dignified, silent journey" but further evidence of his failure.

The question of course is whether Jack has learned anything by this point in his life. When he sees himself on television as the "unhappy man" whom his wife and children "knew too well," he appears to recognize for the first time that he has made a mess and that he is "still trying to explain"[89] himself and his failures to others. Jack also notices for the first time in his life that men who are not white are not treated as well as he is treated by the police. In fact, he even blames his preoccupation with Happy Chang's fate at the police station for his not seeing the ball, which may be another excuse for his bad behavior. The suggestion is that

84. Ibid.
85. Ibid.
86. Ibid, 18.
87. Ibid.
88. Ibid.
89. Ibid.

Jack, who has always thought of himself as being just right, is suddenly rattled out of his complacency by the smile on Happy Chang's face, but other than his sudden awareness that he looks like a loser on television, Jack has learned very little during his year alone. Although he notices that the police officers treat Happy Chang roughly, he does not complain when the police manhandle him. Jack does not see difference; he does not see how the Other is treated. He is a privileged white man complacent enough in his homophobia to abuse his gay son and excuse his inclination for ogling a pretty twelve-year-old girl whom he hopes with all his heart will not turn out to be a lesbian.

Bibliography

Bergling, Tim. *Sissyphobia: Gay Men and Effeminate Behavior.* New York: Southern Tier Editions/ Haworth Press, 2001.

Conley, Cynthia L. "Learning about a Child's Gay or Lesbian Sexual Orientation: Parental Concerns about Societal Rejection, Loss of Loved Ones, and Child Well Being." *Journal of Homosexuality* 58, no. 8 (2011): 1022-1040.

Elias, Robert. "A Fit for a Fractured Society." In *Baseball and the American Dream,* edited by Robert Elias, 3-33. Armonk, New York: M. E. Sharpe, 2001.

Fischer, Shannon. *Person of Interest: Tom Perrotta*. Boston Magazine, October 2010.

Gilbert, Matthew. *Nine Inches by Tom Perrotta*. Boston Globe, 7 September 2013.

Hatten, Charles. "Bad Mommies and Boy-Men: Postfeminism and Reactionary Masculinity in Tom Perrotta's *Little Children*." *Critique: Studies in Contemporary Fiction* 48, no. 3 (2007): 230- 249.

Loftin, Craig M. "Unacceptable Mannerisms: Gender Anxieties, Homosexual Activism, and Swish in the United States, 1945-1965." *Journal of Social History* 40, no. 3 (2007): 577-96.

Ohlin, Alix. *Nine Inches, Stories by Tom Perrotta*. The New York Times, 13 September 2013.

Perrotta, Tom. "The Smile on Happy Chang's Face." In *The Best American Short Stories 2005*, edited by Michael Chabon, 1-18. New York: Houghton Mifflin, 2005.

Rotella, Carlo. *"Binding Boston with a Story." Rev. of "The Smile on Happy Chang's Face"*. Boston.com, 30 August 2010.

Rothman, Emily F., Mairead Sullivan, Susan Keyes, and Ulrike Boehmer. "Parents' Supportive Reactions to Sexual Orientation Disclosure Associated with Better Health: Results from a Population-Based Survey of LGB Adults in Massachusetts." *Journal of Homosexuality* 59, no. 2 (2012): 186-200.

Sanford, Jason. *Story of the Week: 'The Smile on Happy Chang's Face.'* Available at: http:/www.sto rysouth.com/comment/2006/01/story_of_the_day_the_smile_on.html.

Savran, David. "The Sadomasochist in the Closet: White Masculinity and the Culture of Victimization." *Differences: A Journal of Feminist Cultural Studies* 8, no. 2 (1996): 127-52.

Somerson, Wendy. "Becoming Rasta: Recentering White Masculinity in the Era of Transnationalism." *The Comparatist* 23 (1999): 128-40.

Wallace, David L., and Jonathan Alexander. "Queer Rhetorical Agency: Questioning Narratives of Heteronormativity." *JAC: A Journal of Rhetoric, Culture, & Politics* 29, no. 4 (2009): 793-819.

Warner, Michael. *The Trouble with Normal: Sex, Politics, and the Ethics of Queer Life*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1999.

Athens Journal of Humanities & Arts - Volume 10, Issue 2, April 2023 – Pages 123-134

Body Lands:
Image Performativity in Object and Shadow

*By Monica Toledo Silva**

We should not stay, but pass, not belonging anywhere.
Maurice Blanchot

The epistemological investigations concerning the visual arts of sculpture and video proposed in this essay begin in a performative field of research on the Greek islands of Kos and Crete. The intentional act of creating images from my own shadow meeting archeological objects brings an insightful approach to an update of these aesthetic languages, inspired by semantic displacement and ageless nomadism phenomena. The research is based on cognition, philosophy and body studies, as well as the modern concepts of minimalist art.

From original minimalist art theories to an aesthetic field of investigation activated by performative actions of image creation, I intend to propose a new approach to the arts of sculpture and video by generating embodied images in ancient sites. This experience is born of a desire to deepen an understanding of nomadism and migration as ageless human acts that also reflect upon art.

During a field research for migrant traces in millennial rocks forgotten along the centuries in urban outskirts of Greece, suddenly turned into archeological and corporeal presences and random testimonies of life, I explored a borderless sensation of space and territory. Crossing these physical traces through open fields around Athens, Crete and Kos, I recreated a body trajectory over time, by performing images with my video camera. Shooting within my self-projection as a shadow over these Hellenic rocks, their presence was made active, displacing time and place as sculptural and site-specific contexts were fused, once related to performance.

This essay explores the idea of sculpture "challenged by the contingency of perception",[1] that occurs in the outskirts of archeological sites of Greece, with objects uncategorized and available for sight. An active perception generates sensuous experiences and affects the landscape—both the environment's and the body's—as well as enables one to shift dialogical procedures in different art languages. This broadens the understanding of sculpture as a living object through moving image media (video in its capture and projection actions). In this context the essay also intends to displace formal notions of both site-specific and land art.

*Professor, Pontifical Catholic University of Minas Gerais, Brazil.

1. Hal Foster, *O complexo arte-arquitetura* (São Paulo: Ubu, 2017), 132.

This practice of tracing absent bodies (embodied as objects, i.e. the ancient rocks) offers a space of interaction where an imagined map is created by both presences. To inhabit timeless gestures brings a performative body in a visual form —my presence as a shadow plays with an absent figure (the material vestige) — which plays in the video language; an emergent time and place embody a nomadic being (myself).

Art practices related to this embodied field experience proposition were presented as two video installations, *Tracing Mermaids* (Artist Residence Mudhouse, in Crete/GR, 2018), and in 2019 as *Body Lands* (during the Winter Festival of UFSJ at Adro Arts Gallery, São João del Rei, MG/Brasil). My first intention was to meet new aesthetic experiences moving through those unknown lands in order to challenge grounded fields of visual arts, more especially sculpture and video, engaged to embodied performance.

Body's intentional presence, made visible, activates imagination in sensuous contexts. Walking through Crete's mountains, beaches and petroglyph stones left in the open on both Greek islands has been a practice of image creation and connection to other forms of being. Therefore, a discussion about territoriality, active perception, embodied landscapes and performing images, focuses on an expanded understanding of sculpture as both performative and visual.

Minimalist sculpture has qualitative principles applicable to performative procedures of a body practice intended to meet and share a new time and space. Modern notions of displacement apply to this minimalist sculpture in a semiotic context and semantic sphere of body discourses. Corporealities play in sculpture and video—performing images—in an expanded aesthetic experience.

The number of people who have been there over the decades have thus generated other shared experiences with these same objects and will always be unknown (for instance, a child, a homeless person...). In the same way, their events or encounters remain to be imagined. In minimalist arts, the status of meaning and subject are embedded in reality, in a subject/object ambiguity, seen as a phenomenological experience.

Art historian Rosalind Krauss[2] argues that each given meaning "depends on how a being contains a latent experience of simultaneity." As in this context, between states, my presence in a random ancient spot where I meet "sculptural" objects (Hellenic rocks) taken as marks of the presence of bodies who have trod their routes, elaborating a symbolic subject to the object I perceive and recreate.

Minimalist would in this aspect be a contraction and its expansion, beyond recognition, says Michael Fried; "Minimalist work would be somewhere between the object and the monument."[3] The porosity of this artistic language allows the encounter of bodies (human and mineral) reversing these original "states" into images and another temporality in an audiovisual piece (Figures 1 and 2).

2. Ibid, 57.
3. Ibid, 61.

My relation to Hellenic rocks outside catalogued, named objects affects me as long tracks of unknown presence of bodies—as from migrants who left a trace of their existence in a certain spot—in a visible narrative in body lands, and by this process attests a trajectory.


Figures 1 and 2. *Study for the Tracing Mermaids Installation, 2018, Ierapetra/Crete Source:* Monica Toledo Silva.

The practice I experienced by performing encounters, where living bodies are fused in my aesthetic, meets a poststructuralist version that criticizes categories of representation. When I lose my category of subject and turn an image into an object, susceptible to any other body, myself being this other subject, as a body vestige. I meet a Hellenic trace, a rock body, and take it as a presence to my performing acts of affected perception and gesture. Mapped categories are surpassed to inhabit the encounter where we turn transitory and alternate qualities of intention as presence-absence and material images (my body projected as shadow over the object-subject) in simultaneous body presentations.

In this fresh space of encounter, in which we grasp the object "varying positions and spatial context," minimalist art "seeks to discover and project objectuality," as Fried suggests. As another, object as trace, body as image. This essay seeks to qualify presence in sculpture and video as possibilities of an embodied performance, to suggest the phenomenon of nomadism as a timeless human presence.

Sculpture as Object

Richard Serra[4] describes sculpture in terms of a "topological place" delimited "through motion; a dialectic between walking and looking at the landscape." Thus, I look for a condition of sculpture in its phenomenological approach; it "exists in primary relation to the body. Not as its representation, but as its activation."

4. Ibid, 167.

Krauss suggests that "the specificity of a place is not so much its end as its means - its environment is the body in destination." Thus, an object comes to signify the place where it is, and it also reframes this place (affected by "other" presences). Sculpture for Foster[5] would be both subject and local: "an exchange between place and subject, (re)defining the topology of a specific site through the motivation of a specific viewer. An overlap of different spatialities and subjectivities, so that experience can be sensorially retained."

The spatiality of these bodies also assigns us (me and the rocks) new fields of images. My subjected-objected body is present not only by registering the object (the rock subject), but also through my shadow. This, insistently made visible by the island's summer sun, determined my visual presence in the scene I create and provides a simultaneity to another past and present—the Hellenic object and my body. In its insistence on being itself visible in the scene, it illustrates and fulfills a desire to fuse media boundaries of video and sculpture in a visual performance and expands the perception of time itself in this moment of togetherness.

The enunciative dimension of the object—a rock and a material sign—plus an aesthetic temporality of my own image and the past (the mineral-archeological vestige, as in Figure 3), generates a confluent present moment. A performative body in a given place of my passing body leaves a mark of a previous one. Donald Judd also beckons other domains of objects: their presence would imply a new concern with perception—that is, with the subject.[6] Fosters continues: "The contingency of the reception of the body in a particular place and time generates this complex alternation of anticipated futures and reconstructed pasts."

Judd will call "specific objects" a "returning to forms - to volumes - their intrinsic power, inventing forms that would be an obstacle to the whole process of belief before the object."[7] The detachment of the object from its statute—of an Hellenic ruin, a rock, a minimalist sculpture, a scenic object or material vestige—grants its intervention in space, a place to be territorialized by my gesture, performed as shadow (Figure 4). Subjects guarantee present objects an existence of their own; the imaging production is related to this nature of sensuous attributions of power and availability for exchanges.

Plus, when in my performing path I come across an object which I take as a subject—a lived body—it is in my desire to generate an availability for exchanges in an aesthetic form (as a sense of belonging, cognitive or epistemological possibilities of engagement). In this way I am also taken as an object, being some sort of existence to the emerged in this place of exchange and expanded temporality.

5. Ibid, 42.
6. Ibid, 59.
7. Ibid, 41, 46.


Figures 3 and 4. *Study for the Tracing Mermaids Installation, 2018, Ierapetra/Crete*
Source: Monica Toledo Silva.

This tension between the autonomy of an artistic language and its dispersion in a new relational context reminds us of Barthes (1968): "I, who see, become part of the landscape I see." The sculpture in the extended field, as presented by Krauss (1978), ignores this act of simultaneously perceiving and acting of embodying and involving the encounter to a third place of creating sense where both bodies are transformed (through my intentional-disturbing presence). The object (rock) becomes sculpture through my gaze that sees it as a body trace, a subject attested by the video performing traces modeled by the action of time; a materiality over the centuries which also lost its original meaning.

"Only when stable as a format can the work suspend objectivity, transcend literalism, and acquire the quality of being present."[8] Aligned to this, Morris also conceives of shifting the focus from the object to the situation. Objectuality becomes experience: the sculpture is turned into subject in presence and performance (in this work, in visuality) of my body.

Considering that our body expresses singular and diverse modes of presentation of the self, I am myself a multiplicity of others, embodied at the intersection of "components of partial utterances on all sides of individual identity."[9] This partial otherness focuses beyond identification, and the very genesis of enunciation is taken up by the flow of "processual creation."

This is the connection that defines site-specific art: it is not the site that would have a specificity, nor the work, but the connection. It is the displacement that raises the question of the site of the work. Says Cauquelin:[10] displacement "embodies contingency, linear causality, the weight of states of affairs and meanings that beset us with a choice of irreversibility and singularization." The displacement of my body is recorded by the encounter with an embodied other (an actual mineral existence, yet a rock body)—a materiality of its own displace. Therefore, this trajectory is exposed in a video installation as an event.

8. Ibid, 63.
9. Felix Guattari, *As três ecologias* (Campinas: Papirus, 2011), 97, 123.
10. Anne Cauquelin, *Frequentar os incorporais* (São Paulo: Martins Fontes, 2008), 72.

A Timeless Presence: Rock Bodies

Since the Middle Ages, theologians feel the need to distinguish the concept of *imago* from *vestigium*: what is visible around us should be seen as the trace of a lost resemblance. Heidegger has defined the "fundamental mode of feeling in every situation: the revelation that privileges the being-there." In this being, nothing will be definitive: "life will no longer be there but elsewhere, where the body will be dreamed, somewhere."[11]

Visibility processes the forms through which we share our experiences, which includes impermanence and a multitude of inner actions. "Movement is both sign and symptom that all presence is haunted by disappearance and absence. This stepping into invisibility of both movement and presence generates a new nervousness within the project of writing performativities."[12]

For Tony Smith[13] a minimalist sight is a dialectical image that carries a latency. This frustrates an iconographic analysis that considers it a symbol or allegory, since it demands a perceptive, expanded attention. "The object of the image would only be a component of form, which may also be the medium of expression." In this thread the presentation of the object would be renounced: "art must be liberated from the object, which extends beyond its appearance and through our knowledge of its interior."

An image, a sound, a map, do not speak—they are not communicating devices—but latent enunciators of landscapes (narrativities). Rock bodies as imagined marks of trajectories: singular reality generated through my intention. In body lands I perform affected by the landscape. The imagined and materialized mark (the evidence of the rock) will be the image that I form from my own body through my shadow cast on the subject-object (overlaying the rock). My action generates a spatial duration that triggers an unreported phenomenological process.

In my wanderings I imagine moving narratives while crossing opened fields of archeological unmapped treasures. The image I trace and catch includes me as a shadow. The rock image is its own presence from its previous history in my virtuality and, in this creation of a new spatiality, I map another mode of presence. The space is experienced by this meeting of bodies performing a new cartography, as modes of presence between the rock and the shadow.

In this situated image of a real (virtual, mineral, human) body—rock and shadow, past and present—subjects and objects of themselves, we come across the category of heterogeneity. I present as video pieces a drama that does not represent, a trajectory as a dramaturgy of the body. My path creates a landscape as a mode of presence, and I meet this other body that makes sense in my intention.

---

11. Georges Didi-Huberman, *O que vemos, o que nos olha (*São Paulo: Editora 34, 2013), 40

12. Randy Martin, "Dance and its Others," in *Of the Presence of the Body* (ed.) André Lepecki (Wesleyan University Press, 2004).

13. Didi-Huberman, *O que vemos, o que nos olha,* 2013, 82, 95.

The landscape performs in me and I experience a sculpture as a living material (Figures 5 and 6).

Figures 5 and 6. *Study for the Tracing Mermaids Installation, 2018, Ierapetra/Crete*
Source: Monica Toledo Silva.

Foster beckons art as a sculptural experience in itself, as Serra points it as a "process that modulates by pertinent procedures in motivated structures." These principles are to meet their various systems (metaphysical, scientific, psychoanalytic, animistic), involved in the art experience, bypassing the problem of enunciation. What should be stated in the enunciation are transfers, Serra suggests.[14]

According to Guattari,[15] the multiplicity of enunciative instances of the order of polyphony of language can formulate significant breaking points, as well as objects losing their given meaning. A discursive phenomenological approach enables a heterogeneity of manifested expressions. The expression x content reversibility, as an alternative to Saussure-inspired structuralists[16] and in favor of a visual expression, becomes investigative for a body that does not generate a map, but instead moves through random routes. Site, place and presence: the visible as a performed gesture.

If the discontinuity of the places of the body is always given, how can one overcome fissures of the lived space, if it is at the risk that the body will displace organic oneness? With the discourse that its dispersal will emerge from the void where it raises some unknown figures?"[17]

14. Foster, *O complexo arte-arquitetura*, 2017, 86, 165.
15. Guattari, *As três ecologias*, 2011, 31, 39.
16. Ibid, 34, 85.
17. Marc le Bot in Henri-Pierre Jeudy, *Le corps comme object d'art* (Armand Colin, 1998).

Perception and Performance

A created landscape as an extension of the body emerges as a visual solution of this set of attention; a landscape that also shifts in past and future times and is not tied to a spot: it is both singular and affected. The unfolding of a landscape as body phenomenon intensities. To create a landscape is to inhabit a time and a space created by a body in a present mode—to inhabit an embodied image.

For phenomenology philosopher Maurice Merleau-Ponty,[18] perception promotes an articulation of ideas and actions. In these, there occurs a process of reduction--the "liberating a thematic object from its effectiveness, operating a free variation". In this context corporeality is articulated on a multiplicity of levels: it is "constitutive of all experiences of the object;" corporeality "as a bond between me and things is the subject—object of sensitive experience"; and a reflection on it would reveal an "inadequacy of ordinary descriptive categories - subject and object, interiority and exteriority."

For Merleau-Ponty,[19] the living being is not a pure identity but a field: the "latent being is multiple, born in the thickness of a temporality and the availability of the being for diverse perspectives." Language would be merely an "articulation of a general expressive function." The minimalist object, therefore, in this approach, "engages the subject" in its given field.

Didi-Huberman[20] offers an idea: "the conception of language that transcends our lived experience incites us to search beyond the enunciation." In our memories, affections, traces, we perform discourses in visual forms. Landscapes of the other, landscapes of myself —subject and object mixed in virtual narratives.

Krauss[21] brings specificities that allow us to shift the attention from the object to the relation—to what she calls "specific relation". The way the object nature becomes exchangeable in a given situation will be in tune to a body behavior itself. The relationship between the object and its place, the meeting of objects and subjects, may characterize "intersubjective dialectics."

Presence is placed in what is preserved. The other is a sign, index of the past; object of chance; archaeological history; potential memory of a passing body, that my performance updates. Thus we return to a contemporary notion of sculpture: performing an embodied continuity, occupying a spatial narrativity, connected to the notion of land art.

Presence as a given spot dedicated to a reminder of a body not so much as a mark but rather as a performative continuity of dialogic presentations. This dramaturgy that emerges from the encounter meets presence as an intervention field promoting the end of categories (virtual/material, object/sculpture) and

18. Maurice Merleau-Ponty, *O visível e o invisível* (São Paulo: Perspectiva, 2005), 33, 36.

19. Ibid, 66, 190.

20. Didi-Huberman, *O que vemos, o que nos olha*, 2013, 119.

21. Ibid, 66.

enables a path of performed displacements, acting as a space of visibility: the visible as a performed gesture. This imagined gesture of visible acts as a performance of mobility: visibility itself as the act of being present.

The creation of a dramaturgy of the body is a trajectory through territories marked by presences that renew the present. It promotes in me a landscape as a state of presence. "Enunciative subjectivity, a narrative event, consists on situation and environment."[22] The presence of the other as an intervention in my affected body generates a perceptive image that will be the creation of body images—from my body's encounter with this other, in a "displacement in which something presents itself (as an action, idea, image) and gains visibility by establishing a new process with its surroundings."

Alain Martin suggests that the non-place of art resides in the body. Its dynamics of displacement, which at any moment, updates and turns a place into a territory, opens a space that comes from a "need to create fissures". In this cartography elaborated by body paths, I update my state of presence in the trace (the path remains) of the other. I perform the imaginary mark of the other and this trace that I perceive and perform (through the image I create) reinvents the non-place of art in a visuality generated by the encounter.

Greiner[23] beckons on the "stage prior to language and artistic genres, at which body movement destabilizes evidence - that kind of movement would be the performative." Through cognitive processes, "image is not just what one sees, and vision is completed by a perceptive network."

The attributes of site-specific and land art meet us here. The idea of cartography as a performance generated by body spatiality is related to movement as an enunciative form and cartography itself as a mode of presence—to map an affected path. My trace is in their trace; the processes of visibility that meets the desire for visuality (my shadow meeting the other). Art as language, medium, narrative and aesthetics allows a previous dialectical spatiality, the "dialectic at work".

Territory as an appropriation of a place that becomes singular, performed by the body. Territory that is not only physical and that generates meanings. The presence of the other (Hellenic rocks designed by time) is organized in this remaining territory where what remains is organized in infinite possibilities of attachment to the present time. The rocks perform their presence in my shadow, an image affected by my own mobility in this path of moving cartography. Body lands become what evolves, not what remains.

A random minimalist sculpture comes into existence as a body since the encounter with my image creates this territoriality that legitimizes a place. The

22. Ibid, 95, 121.

23. Christine Greiner, "A percepção como principio cognitivo da comunicação: uma hipótese para redefinir a prática da performance," in *Corpo em Cena 6* (São Paulo: Anadarco, 2013).

shadow's (the image of my present body) quality of recategorization this place touches the object and evolves it to a body, live thus petrified as visual noise out of the landscape.

"A presence cannot simply be distinguished from absence - the two are complex in their relation."[24] The quality of shadow as a virtuality creates interference in the present and acts as an image that touches the object, which is not a ruin but visual noise and virtuality, like a self of its own. This phenomenological meeting of bodies—rock and shadow, body and image, two moving figures that present themselves—demarcate a dynamic territoriality which is performed because it is not tracked, planned or mapped.

Medium becomes a singular cartography made by the displacement quality of bodies and of territories, creating possibilities. This creation of spatiality will be embodied and updated in the images of these subject and object exchanged to object and subject of one another. "The immemorial, the precise places of what is absent from our knowledge, the role of the forgotten in language is to intensify the absence inherent in memory. Immemorial is both presence and absence, intensified."[25]

"A time-crafted sight that would allow time to be unfolded as a thought, that would leave time to space in order to retract in another way, to convert over time."[26] Phenomenology turns itself into artistic substance. Fried evokes the critical distance of the temporality of time, past and to come, approaching and receding simultaneously; the experience of being distanced or invaded by the presence of another body.

Henri Bergson brings the concept of corporeality linked to virtuality and actualization, as its subdomains. Thus is the dramaturgy of the body: a mode of presentation of a self and another as an extension of one's own; dramaturgy as a performance of affection when meeting bodies in a sudden simultaneity of times are embodied to the present in every form. Ruins have just met a new visuality.

This very intensity of place brings into play the mobility of spatiality.
Karmen Mackendrick

Bibliography

Cauquelin, Anne. *Frequentar os incorporais*. (Inhabiting Non Corporeality.) São Paulo: Martins Fontes, 2008.

Didi-Huberman, Georges. *O que vemos, o que nos olha.* (What we See, What Sees us.) São Paulo: Editora 34, 2013.

Foster, Hal. *O complexo arte-arquitetura*. (The Complex of Art-Architecture.) São Paulo: Ubu, 2017.

24. Didi-Huberman, *O que vemos, o que nos olha*, 2013, 142.

25. Cauquelin, *Frequentar os incorporais*, 2008, 43.

26. Didi-Huberman, *O que vemos, o que nos olha*, 2013, 150.

Greiner, Christine. "A percepção como principio cognitivo da comunicação: uma hipótese para redefinir a prática da performance." (Perception as a Cognitive Principle of Communication: A Hypothesis to Redefine the Performance Practice.) In *Corpo em Cena 6*. São Paulo: Anadarco, 2013.

Guattari, Felix. *As três ecologias*. (Thee Three Ecologies.) Campinas: Papirus, 2011.

Jeudy, Henri-Pierre. *Le corps comme object d'art*. (The Body as an Object of Art.) Armand Colin, 1998.

Martin, Randy. "Dance and its Others." In *Of the Presence of the Body*, edited by André Lepecki. Wesleyan University Press, 2004.

Maurice, Merleau-Ponty. *O visível e o invisível*. (The Visible and the Invisible.) São Paulo: Perspectiva, 2005.

Silva, Monica Toledo. "Cosmologies and Body Politics in Imaging Performances from the Americas." In *Venturing into the Uncharted World of Aesthetics*, edited by Linda Ardito and John Murungi (England: Cambridge Scholars Publishing Ltd., 2022).

Athens Journal of Humanities & Arts - Volume 10, Issue 2, April 2023 - Pages 135-148

Picture-Skin, Music-Muscle: The Intersemiotic/Intermedia Body of Olney São Paulo's *Manhã Cinzenta*

By Antonia Cristina Pires[*], *Gustavo Tanus*[±] *& Filipe Schettini*[‡]

The film *Manhã cinzenta* (1969), by Brazilian filmmaker Olney São Paulo, is a fictional documentary in a short film, which works with fictional space scenes and real elements (clipping from newspapers, movie posters, radio news, images from student marches, and police repression). As a political-artistic form of resistance to the 1964 Brazilian civil-military dictatorship, it is a manifest against authoritarian regimes, also referring to the Latin American dictatorships of 1960-1970. Based on the work of Rajewsky and Clüver, we analyzed, from the intermediate texture, the relationship between image and music, respectively, "epidermis and muscle" by Wingstedt, threads of an artistic and political texture as elements of the constitution of a multimedia body: metaphor of resistance. The film can contribute to breaking with the logic of domination - a logic that is structured by the monopoly of discourse about the past, which in current times has been trying to extinguish from history, from memory, the violent event of the Brazilian civil-military coup. For this reason, it is important to study it, due to the importance of this film as one of the most significant films about resisting, having also been a metaphor for the life of the filmmaker himself.

First lines

When the 'nerve endings' between the music-muscle and the picture-skin connect, one gets to watch a newborn multimedia baby enter the world, starting to breathe. As if that was not enough: then you try to shift the music track by two frames in relation to the visuals – and suddenly the baby starts kicking, jumping and screaming joyfully. The happy marriage between image and music is a fascinating example of when the whole becomes something much bigger than the sum of the parts.[1]

Our existence as a nation requires that we seek/instigate reflections on what our issues are, in terms of representation or representativeness, of how we deal with unequal relation among people, or of unfoldings of these asymmetries. It is necessary thus to reflect upon events of a recent past and then we think, as Walter Benjamin on his "Theses on the philosophy of history", that nothing should be

∗Researcher, State Institute of Historical and Artistic Heritage of Minas Gerais, Brazil.
±Researcher, Federal University of Rio Grande do Norte, Brazil.
‡Researcher, Federal University of Minas Gerais, Brazil.

1. Johnny Wingstedt, "Narrative Music: Towards and Understanding of Musical. Narrative Functions in Multimedia" (Lulea, Sweden: University of Technology, School of Music, 2005).

considered lost to history (1st edition, 1940).[2] In this past, one is to find events that still concern the present time; such as the movements for the consummation of the Brazilian civil-military dictatorship of 1964 and which today echo in the attempts to disregard its weight in the maintenance of the dominant *status quo* and disqualify the discourses that prove the violence of the antidemocratic regime.

Together with these movements there is the passage of time; when it does not bring to the national agenda the debate of the excesses and barbarism of the dictatorship, it throws us into the forgetfulness of exception policies (which lurk around us), reflected in the many slaughters of today. Having said that, we have the great (ethical) task of deconstructing the passive forms of relationship with this past, which are therefore going against conformity to history. And, we believe, we have the task to elaborate tactics to break with the logic of dominations, which always seek justification for murders, fratricide, the oppression of the minorities and the deviant ones, and for the annihilation of their discourses.

The approximation of aesthetics and politics has to be thought in the sense that they are inseparable, since they are part of the reconfiguration of the visible and the possible, of that which can be thought. In this sense, art and politics have always been entwined as to reaffirm certain ways of looking at and reflecting on the sensible world, as discussed Jacques Rancière in his essay about the link between ethic and aesthetic.[3] Hence, the point is to think of these interlinkages not only by a "common" that can be, and is, shared, and which maintains its exclusive parts, part of the "distribution of the sensible",[4] but also by what can surpass, in an effort to break with the logic of unequal distribution, and seeks to cross the border of this common one. We believe it is interesting to evidence interlacings of this, the slits and ripping in the fabric.

Therefore, our objective is to do a reading of the medium-length film *Manhã cinzenta* [Gray Morning] (1969),[5] by filmmaker Olney São Paulo[6]. It stands as one

2. Walter Benjamin, "Sobre o Conceito de História," in *Obras Escolhidas I – Magia e Técnica, Arte e Política* (São Paulo: Brasiliense, 1994), 223-232.

3. Jacques Rancière, *Partilha do Sensível: Estética e Política* (São Paulo: EXO Experimental Org. & Ed. 34, 2005).

4. Ibid.

5. This film, which is a transit between documentary and fiction, through language strategies: poetry, allegory, science fiction, shows the resistance against the established dictatorial regime, over the mobilization of students who gathered and took to the streets. This film, who is an allegory of Latin American totalitarian regimes, has Alda and Silvio and other students as protagonists, who are arrested in the midst of repression and, tortured in prison. The characters are judged in a judgment controlled by a robot, an electronic brain that, contrary to popular belief, was subjective and biased.

6. Olney Alberto São Paulo was born in Riachão do Jacuípe, in the countryside of the state of Bahia, on August 7, 1936. He grew up in Feira de Santana, a neighboring city in Bahia's backwoods. At age 19, Olney took part in his first film production, joining the

of the most significant films of resistance to the civil-military dictatorship of 1964 and is also a metaphor of the life of the filmmaker himself, appearing as a wound in his body shattered by torture as he dared to produce it with the Institutional Act No. 5[7] in effect.

Thus, it is necessary to pursue not only an aesthetic as a path of a sensible appreciation or perception, but to meet an ethics based on the study of the text – including its intermedia relations – that can be seen as these modes of "distribution of the sensible."[8] This paper begins with discussions about the intermedia relations pointed out by Irina Rajewsky and Claus Clüver, to whom notions of intermedia are crossed as a reference made inside a text to another text that shares a different semiotic system, and even its relational capacity as a possibility. That being said, the aim of this paper is to observe the encounter between image and music in *Gray Morning* in an attempt to understand such encounter as the relationship between the skin and the muscle of a filmic body – this gestated body-movie, this multimedia being Wingstedt describes. Our interest is in both the phenomenon of intersemiotic transposition that can be observed in the transit procedure between these systems, and in the modes of dialogical sharing of their similarities and differences, within the space of the film where intersemiosis takes place.

---

production and acting as an extra in Alex Viany's *The Windrose* (1955), which was recorded in Feira de Santana. He also participated, as direction and production assistant, continuist and actor, in the film *Mandacaru Vermelho* (1961), by Nélson Pereira dos Santos. At the time, he wrote two documentary scripts: *O bandido negro,* about a legendary country figure, and *O vaqueiro das caatingas*, about the everyday life of the herdsmen of the hinterland. These scripts were not carried out due to lack of resources. He participated in the short-films: *Um crime na rua* (1955), which he directed and acted in, besides writing the script; *O profeta da Feira de Santana* (1970), with script, editing, direction and co-production; *Cachoeira: documento da História* (1973), also with script and direction; *Como nasce uma cidade* (1973), script, direction and production; *Teatro brasileiro I:* origem e mudanças (1975), script and direction; *Teatro brasileiro II:* novas tendências (1975), script and direction; *Sob o ditame do rude Almajesto: sinais de chuva* (1976), script and direction; *A última feira livre* (1976), direction. Medium-length films: *Manhã cinzenta* (*Gray Morning)* (1969), script, direction and production; *Pinto vem aí* (1976), script and direction; *Dia de Erê* (1978), script and direction. Feature films: *Grito da terra* (1964), script and direction; *O forte* (1974), script and direction; *Ciganos do nordeste* (1976), script, direction and production; *O Amuleto de Ogum* (1974). He died in Rio de Janeiro on February 15, 1978, a few years after he was arrested and tortured for the film this paper analyzes.

7. The Institutional Act No. 5 was a decree issued by President Artur da Costa e Silva in 1968. It allowed prior censorship of cultural productions and the media, curfews, disproportional attacks on those who opposed the coup d'état, and the loss of individual guarantees with the suspension of the habeas corpus; the latter led to unjust, arbitrary and violent imprisonment and also the coercion of citizens whom the coupists judged contrary to the imposed regime.

8. Rancière, *Partilha do Sensível:* Estética e Política, 2005.

Indeed, the transit between distinct arts São Paulo operates in *Gray Morning*, which results in an intermedia fabric, emphasizes a relation in which the music is not mere background but part of the scenes. Music in *Gray Morning* is some sort of sound-metaphor interacting with the visual as to reiterate the central question of the film: the unveiling of Latin America's situation at that moment, plunged into the darkness of dictatorships and the annihilation of civil rights.

Possible Transits: Some Considerations on the Intermedia/Interart Theory

The interaction between textualities, or "semiotic interaction"[9], is important for considering the aspects of Olney São Paulo's poetics. Interaction here means the encounters between textualities belonging to distinct semiotic systems, such as cinema and music, which in *Gray Morning* reveal how "the whole becomes something much bigger than the sum of the parts."[10] To that end, we return to Irina Rajewsky's studies of interart/intermedia, and Claus Clüver's intersemiotic studies; these are important for the interpretation of transits and border dissolutions in São Paulo's texts.

This phenomenon presupposes that there are tangible boundaries between individual media, as well as media specificities and differences. In typifying the modes of interaction between the media, intermediality happens through the crossing of the borders between different artistic manifestations. Irina Rajewsky draws three groups of phenomena: the mediatic transposition, operated by cinematographic adaptations and novelizations (transformation of the film into a novel); the combination of media, such as "opera, film, theatre, illuminated manuscripts, computer or Sound Art installations, comics";[11] and the intermediality in the sense of reference, in which one work mentions another: a literary text that mentions a film, or a film that mentions a painting, etc. The first relates to the genesis, being oriented to the production process; it can be observed in the transposition that is necessary for the story's transformation into film.

> Here the intermedial quality – the criterion of a medial border crossing – has to do with the way in which a medial configuration comes into being, that is, with the

9. Vitor Manuel Silva, *Teoria da Literatura* (Coimbra, Portugal: Livraria Almedina, 1986).

10. Wingstedt, "Narrative Music: Towards and Understanding of Musical. Narrative Functions in Multimedia," 2005.

11. Irina Rajewsky, "A Fronteira em Discussão: O Status Problemático das Fronteiras Midiáticas no Debate Contemporâneo Sobre Intermidialidade," in *Intermidialidade e Estudos Interartes: Os Desafios da Arte Contemporânea* (ed.) Thaïs Flores Diniz and André Soares Vieira (Belo Horizonte: Fale/UFMG, 2012), 51-74.

> transformation of a given medial configuration (a text, film and so on) or of its substratum into another medium.[12]

Rajewsky's "combination" is a conjugation of media that, from a historical perspective, becomes a new form. In the third group, she places the mentions that one work makes of the other, when the intermedia relation occurs not only in the process of media formation but, in Werner Wolf's words, "in the signification and/ or structure of a given semiotic entity" (quoted in Rajewsky).[13] The phenomenon of intermedia in itself extrapolates, according to Clüver, what is commonly defined as arts, that is:

> Music, Literature, Dance, Painting and other Plastic Arts, Architecture, as well as mixed forms such as Opera, Theater, and Cinema and also what we define as media, which includes both print media and Cinema, Television, Radio, Video, as well as the various electronic and digital media that emerged most recently[14].

For Clüver – who chooses "intersemiotic texts" over "intermedia texts", because not every sign system is essentially a media – "the intersemiotic text ... uses two or more sign systems and/or media in a way that the visual and/or musical, verbal, kinetic, and performative aspects of its signs become inseparable".[15] He also calls attention to the term, "intermediality", used by Jörg Helbig in his important *Intermediality: theory and practice of an area of interdisciplinary studies* (our translation)[16]. The concept can be understood as: 1. relations between media in general (intermedia relations); 2. transpositions from one medium to another (intermedia or intersemiotic transpositions); 3. union (fusion) of media, that is, multimedia texts and mixed media.[17] One can see the difference between the possibilities of the term. Rajewsky defined intermediality from the notions of transposition, combination, and referencing; Clüver, in turn, echoes Helbig and defines it as intermedia relations, intermedia transpositions, and media fusion.

Regarding these definitions, it is interesting for us to think of intermedia as a transit, sharing and relationship modes that, according to Wingstedt, constitute the "multimedia being" – São Paulo's film, in our case – born of the relation between skin and muscle: image and music, respectively, composing a body. It is important to emphasize that the Intermediality Theories point to the interlacing between cinema and music, as well as to the combination of documentary and fiction, operated by Olney São Paulo, as we will see below.

---

12. Ibid, 56.
13. Ibid.
14. Claus Clüver, "Inter Textus / Inter Artes / Inter Media," *Aletria* 14 (2006): 11-41.
15. Ibid, 20.
16. Original German title: Intermedialität: Theorie und Praxis eines interdisziplinären Forschungsgebiets (Berlin: Erich Schmidt, 1998).
17. Ibid, 24.

Encounters, Proximities: Analysis of the Image/Music Intermedia Relation in *Gray Morning*

The Skin-Image

In August 1969, Olney São Paulo brought to light one of the most important and significant films in the history of Brazilian cinema: the medium-length film *Gray Morning*. The film was vetoed by the Public Entertainment Censorship Service on the grounds that it was "highly subversive and incit[ed] the people against the leaders", that is, the military who took power in 1964 after a coup supported by segments of civil society (the economic elite and part of the middle class). Opposing the censor's argument, São Paulo told the newspaper *Última hora* in September of that year that the film was "a desperate song to love and freedom", pointing to the deep humanism surrounding his production.

In 1968, a year of great turbulence and intense cultural effervescence in the world and in Brazil, the Brazilian civil-military dictatorship became even more repressive with the enactment of the Institutional Acts that overruled the Constitution, and with intense vigilance over everything and everybody. As a result, the street protests in the city of Rio de Janeiro intensified. From March of that year, when high school student Edson Luís de Lima Souto was murdered by the police at Calabouço – a restaurant frequented by underprivileged students – to December 13, when Institutional Act No. 5 (AI-5) was decreed, parades organized by the student movement took to the streets of Rio's city center. The movements generated confrontations with the repression forces, resulting in arrested, wounded, and dead people. It was in such a violent and obscure context that São Paulo decided to shoot a feature film composed of three episodes. One of them is based on his own short story, "Gray Morning", published in 1966, in the compilation *A antevéspera e o canto do sol*.[18] The other two episodes were not shot as result of the censorship's ban the following year.

Gray Morning is a 21-minute half-length production, made in 35mm black and white film, in which fictional staging is combined with scenes of rallies and real confrontations. In one of the marches, the protagonist was placed by São Paulo among the protestors to be filmed giving a speech, in a radical break with the boundaries between the genres that make up the film: fiction and documentary.

Although São Paulo produced several other works, *Gray Morning* would tragically and permanently mark his trajectory. This "revolutionary, sign-disintegrating film-explosion"[19] as Glauber Rocha calls it in his 1981 book *Revolução do Cinema Novo* (*New Cinema Revolution*), would lead its creator to be

18. Olney São Paulo, *A Antevéspera e o Canto do Sol, Contos e Novelas* (Salvador: Quarteto Press, 2016).

19. Glauber Rocha, *Revolução do Cinema Novo* (Rio de Janeiro, Brazil: Alhambra/ EMBRAFILME, 1981), 366.

included in the National Security Law as a dangerous, order-destabilizing individual. He was imprisoned and tortured afterwards, which compromised his physical and emotional integrity. After the Censorship Service banned the movie, they also destroyed its negatives and copies. Only one remained: hidden in the archives of the Museum of Modern Art in Rio, it was located in 1994 and aroused the interest of intersemiotic/intermedia researchers. It should be noted that, despite its tragic trajectory in Brazil, *Gray Morning* had its importance recognized in other countries: it won the award for best media at the 19th International Week in Mannheim, and was awarded at the 1972 Oberhausen Festival in Germany.

At the beginning of *Gray Morning*, during the presentation of the initial credits, there are images of the street with a road sign, an arrow, pointing towards the viewer; everyday people walk and perform their routines, in some shots that allude to the classic short-documentary *Rain*, released in 1929, by Joris Ivens and Mannus Franken. But in contrast to this film, that included Lou Lichtveld's modern and harmonious compositions, this scene in *Gray Morning* is accompanied by the song "Gloria", which is part of the *Misa Criolla* (Creole Mass), and goes: "Gloria a Dios / en las alturas // y en la tierra paz a los hombres, / [...] paz a los hombres / que ama El Señor [...]"[20] (Glory to God / in the heights // and peace to men on Earth, / peace to men / who love the Lord, our translation). The *Misa Criolla* was composed by the Argentine musician Ariel Ramírez[21] in 1964; the moment was considered a folklore boom in Argentina, as all sorts of musicians were approaching the Latin American popular culture. As Díaz said, the aim at that moment was to recover the Latin-American as an idea of cultural union of the countries of Latin America, without, however, regressing with respect to the particularities of each region.[22] This work, in particular, mixes elements of erudite music and the Andean tradition so as to reread the Judeo-Christian religious tradition.

"Gloria" is doubly ironic in the opening scene. While it underlines the tragic-dramatic tenor of the situations narrated from then on (as peace among people is precisely what was not celebrated in those moments of repression), one recalls the kind of "peace" advocated by the so-called Family Marches with God for Freedom of March 1964, a series of public events that represented the middle class – an

20. Ariel Ramírez, "Gloria (Carnavalito-Yaraví)," in Misa Criolla/Navidad Nuestra (ed.) Ariel Ramírez (Charango: Jaime Torres. Argentina: Philips, 1996).

21. Ariel Ramírez is an important composer, pianist and music director. He was born in Santa Fe, Argentina, on September 4, 1921. He researches about South-American traditional rhythms and sonorities, about instrumentalists and popular singers, those who came to integrate his compositions, and his compositional methods. In addition to being a musician, he was researcher of popular music and the country, having been responsible for the analysis and selection of Argentine rhythms such as Zamba, Vals criollo and Tango, for musical collections.

22. Claudio Díaz, Una Vanguardia en el Folklore Argentino: Canciones Populares, Intelectuales y Política en la Emergencia del "Nuevo Cancionero", 9.

expression of conservatism – fearing a communist threat alleged by large information systems.

It is worth remembering that irony, as a figure of speech, consists in pointing out the opposite of what is being said or shown, in order to denounce a certain situation and cause a reaction in the receiver – reader, listener, spectator. Because of its oppositional nature, irony destabilizes absolute truths, revealing the reverse of certain discourses as it exposes their incongruities.[23] Irony can be, among other categories, tragic or dramatic; the aforementioned scene is an example of the latter. This type of irony is associated with situations that have a tragic outcome and whose elements, in the scene, indicate such outcome to the reader/viewer.[24] 19th-century existentialist philosophers, chiefly Kierkegaard and Schopenhauer, employed this type of irony in their writings.

Open and closed shots alternate; the first kind suggests a certain normality in the routine of the city, and the second arouses interest making it look like an environment with displaced elements, denouncing some sort of irregularity. In a classroom, the young protagonists listen to a rock song (symbol of rebellion and freedom in those times); they seem apprehensive, and a young woman dances. Through a tracking shot, the camera moves from the living room window and allows us to see the cove of Botafogo Beach, in Rio de Janeiro, and in this movement focuses on the dancing woman who seems oblivious to her surroundings. The dance, however, points out its potency and rebellion with the specific expression that the movement of the body ascends.

As the cove appears through the window, the light saturation suggests the occurrence of something while the group is in the classroom. The scene shifts to (factual) student marches, in resistance to the coup, in which there is confrontation. In a new intermedia relation, the march "The Washington Post" ensues. The piece was composed by John Philip Sousa, in 1890, as many other military marches that he was hired by the homonymous newspaper to compose. Sousa was so successful that the newspaper would become recognized by his march.[25] Again, music acts as an ironic element, reminding the spectator of the US support of the Brazilian military coup.

In another intermedia relation, the sound of the military march "Semper Fidelis", composed in 1888, also by Sousa, excerpts from the *Autos de Devassa* – a pleading against the Minas Gerais *inconfidentes* of the eighteenth century, accused of betraying the Portuguese crown. Then Silvio, one of the protagonists, reads the final paragraph of *The Plague*, by the Algerian philosopher Albert Camus,[26] which is an allegory of Nazism and all regimes of exception. In contrast to the military

23. Linda Hutcheon, *Teoria e Política de Ironia* (Belo Horizonte: UFMG Press, 2000), 98.

24. Hudson Aragão, Ironia e Literatura: Interseções.

25. Paul Bierley, *John Philip Sousa: American Phenomenon* (Miami, USA: Warner Bros Publications, 1973).

26. Albert Camus, *La Peste* (France: Gallimard, 1947).

march, excerpts from *É proibido proibir* ("It is forbidden to forbid"), by Caetano Veloso, a famous Brazilian singer and composer.[27] This song is significant because it was composed during the resurgence of the violence of the dictatorial regime, standing as a chant for freedom. The song shows us the paths to resistance through its song that poetically uses the artifice of prohibition, which is the symbolic weapon of dictatorial regimes, as an element to create the feeling that it is necessary to resist and to fight for freedom. The song still had an interesting episode, having been performed and booed at the 3rd *Festival Internacional da Canção* (International Song Festival). Thus, the execution became a mess: Caetano was booed by the public, which refused any dialogue and turned their backs on him. In this performance the famous rock band called Os Mutantes participated; in addition to Gilberto Gil, who was part of the execution, was hit by a tomato. In response, he took it from the floor and bit it. The outcome of the event was Caetano's disorienting discourse that pointed out, roughly speaking, that there is only one tree of intolerance, and its branches prohibit the argument of the other or causes the curtailment of citizen rights. At that moment, the criticism was carried out by the public who saw, without performing a contextual analysis, saw in the Os Mutantes's electric guitars and their dissonances a possible approximation with US politics.

In the film, a new report, on the radio, of a massacre of workers, and the soundtrack retakes the verses of the *Misa Criolla*. The scene returns to the streets as at the beginning of the film, but now, instead of people in their routines, there is smoke, violence, and strong police repression. These are factual confrontation scenes; as in other scenes of the film, deliberately staged scenes are combined with documentary scenes, forming a hybrid and powerful portrait of the country's period. There is a simultaneity of scenes and times; the classroom from the beginning takes turns with the scenes of a barracks where young prisoners are tortured. At this moment, there is an imagery metaphor in the scene in which there is a movie theater surrounded by policemen and the poster of Anatole Litvak's film *The Night of the Generals*, released in 1967,[28] screened as criticism of the regime in a cinema in the neighborhood of Cinelandia shortly after the murder of student Edson Luís.

Under a musical phrase of the *charango*,[29] Silvio appears inside the classroom, expressing concern. Soon, it shifts to him descending the barracks stairs, which he had gone up with Alda, another protagonist. In the torture scene, the soldier asks him a question, already certain of the answer: "And the machine guns, is not it

27. Caetano Veloso, *É Proibido Proibir* (Brazil: Philips, 1968). Retrieved from: https://www. youtube.com/watch?v=afwWdtUl0kY. [Accessed 18 April 2021]

28. Anatole Livtak, *A Noite dos Generais* (France; United Kingdom; Northern Ireland, 1967).

29. A small Andean string instrument, traditionally made from armadillo shells. Oxford Dictionary (Oxford: University Press, 2017).

true that they had machine guns?" The scene shows the cruelty and violence of torture.

In an intermedia relation, a voice on the radio states while a military march is heard: "It is in the resurrection of the elites that chaos can be disintegrated and justice built, order established, and for that..."[30] It returns to the same classroom of the beginning of the film, the young people talk about torture and the coup, in a dialogue in which each complements the other. It ends with Silvio's consideration: "[...] No one is 'people' anymore. We are not anything anymore. The people will be massacred. First the bullet, then the hunger, slowly, everything will come against the people..."[31]

To the sound of "Señor tiene piedad de nosotros" ("Lord have mercy on us"), that is part of the *Misa Criolla*, the kaleidoscopic assembly of the film is realized again. Young people being shot and the after-torture waiting room, where a young woman rehearses a dance, are mixed. The focus returns to the classroom, where students listen to the news about repression. Alda says: "Scoundrels! [...] But they will find me standing!", and starts the dance seen in the beginning of the film. *Gray Morning* ends with the murder of the couple, Alda and Silvio, to the sound of the song "Credo", of the *Misa Criolla*, in the desire that hope does not die with them.

The ban on the film is part of a denied dialogue, which does not end the dialogical relations established in the meshes of the filmic text; even because such denial was due precisely to the fact that the film brings intermedia elements of revelation, presentation, and contestation of the current coup. The assembly of these elements contributed to the construction of *Gray Morning* as a counter-discourse to authoritarianism, a counterpoint between the voice of the Other (the oppressed, represented by the students and the workers) and the voice of the Same (dictators, businessmen, and the middle class).

Muscle-music

Here we observe the intersemiotic/intermedia relation between music and cinema in *Gray Morning*. Music is so powerful an artistic element that its junction with other art forms very commonly potentializes both. A clear example of this is its junction with cinema, where "[music's] suggestive potential to enrich [cinema's] narrative strategies" stands out[32] and in which musical harmonies suggest emotions and geographic spaces. Moreover, music leads the editing pacing and the actions in the scenes.

30. Olney São Paulo, *Gray Morning*, 12: 10-12: 22, our translation.

31. Ibid, 12: 32-13: 03, our translation.

32. André Baptista, "Funções da Música no Cinema: Contribuições para a Elaboração de Estratégias Composicionais" (Federal University of Minas Gerais, 2007).

The phrase "film was never silent" leads to an obvious reflection: although in its first decades of life cinema could not emit ambient sounds and the speeches of its characters, the screenings were accompanied by musical pieces, usually played live but which could also be recorded versions. These pieces accompanied the sensations presented in the films, but with time they became more sophisticated, independent, and began to add their own sense to the films. Eventually there was the introduction of modern music into cinema, which sometimes accompanied the films themselves, as in the previously cited example of the short documentary *Rain*. Over time, what dominated the cinema was the use of music as an element that helped create illusionism, as in the Hollywood naturalistic cinema.

At the time *Gray Morning* was made, the use of music had reached new heights, and popular songs were commonly used in films, such as "The Sound of Silence" by Simon & Garfunkel in the American film *The Graduate* (1968) by Mike Nichols; or the songs "Antônio das Mortes" and "Deus e o diabo na terra do sol", both sung by Sérgio Ricardo in the homonymous film by Glauber Rocha, where they were used in the same non-diegetic sense.[33]

One of the greatest scholars on the use of music in cinema is writer and composer Michel Chion; some of his analyses on the subject are directly applicable to *Gray Morning*, in which music exert several functions. One of these functions is to reiterate the change of environment and situation, as when the initial credits show the urban environment to the sound of Ariel Ramírez's "Gloria" and music functions as an extradiegetic element (produced by an imaginary source absent from the action), or like when the scene cuts to the classroom where Alda is dancing to the sound of a rock and roll song, which is a diegetic element (executed within the action). In the latter, there is a time/space device in which the music to which Alda dances serves to situate the spectator in a specific cultural period, and, by extension, to characterize the students in the scene.

> Those who have gone mountain climbing know that it is very hard to render the magnitude of a mountainous setting in images, even using extreme long shots, because in the mountains there are few precise points of reference for scale and no clear perspectival lines. This is where music comes to the rescue. A string chord with only perfect intervals (as in the symphonic poems of Richard Strauss or Vincent d'Indy) or scoring that includes all registers from very low to very high helps evoke the enormity of space that the image cannot express. [...].[34]

Following the analyses, numerous combinations occur in the film, where "if we try different songs – different styles and/or different cultural codes – in a

33. Sérgio Ricardo, and Glauber Rocha, *Deus e o Diabo na Terra do Sol*: Movie Soundtrack (Brazil: Companhia Brasileira de Discos. Vinil, LP, Album, Mono, 1963).

34. Michel Chion, *Music in Cinema* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2019), 28.

single scene, each one will result in a particular reading of this scene."[35] In *Gray Morning*, music also has an ironic intention/function, which is the case of "Gloria" and the military marches by John Philip Sousa. In this regard, we enter another question raised by Chion: music as a summary of the film or scenes, where it attributes feeling or sense to images, such as the scenes in which excerpts from "É Proibido Proibir" are played.

Very apparent in the film is the use of added value, a term mentioned by Chion in *Music in cinema*, which is "the effect by which the audio-viewer spontaneously projects information, emotion, or mood conveyed by a sound element onto what she sees, as if this meaning naturally emanated from the image."[36]

In *Gray Morning*, be it through the rock music of the initial scene or through John Philip Sousa's marches, the musical pieces add sense and emotional value to the scenes, besides reinforcing or creating speeches, granting the images greater power.

As for the structuring fluidity of the *leitmotiv* (a concept coming from Wagner's operas that associates a certain musical theme with a role in the plot), São Paulo applies subtle forms that mark characters, or their speeches and actions, such as the excerpts of Veloso's song that relate to Alda and Silvio's moments and underline youth's social-political engagement; Sousa's marches as metaphors/ references to militarism and dictatorship, or the constant struggle against it; and the *Misa Criolla*, which reflects society's outcry – be it for freedom, justice, or hope – and can vary in meaning when the editing generates tragic irony.

Final Touches

Seeking to overcome the limits and prohibitions of the adverse political-social context, Olney São Paulo mobilized a vigorous exercise of language to compose his film, using various artifices to highlight the prohibitions, the silencing imposed on cultural-artistic productions by the military regime's censorship. One of these devices is the intermedia of cinema and music, as this article has showed. Another one is the hybridization of genres, the mixture between fiction and documentary, which becomes an eloquent signic interweaving, projecting itself against the silence that hung in the outer context (the Brazil of the civil-military dictatorship). Many other aspects characterize the filmmaker's work as an "intermixture": the technical resources used, for instance, or the approaches to other cinematographic aesthetics, such as Russian formalism, Italian neorealism, and the French *nouvelle vague*.

35. Baptista, Funções da Música no Cinema: Contribuições para a Elaboração de Estratégias Composicionais, 2007, 21.
36. Chion, *Music in Cinema*, 2019, 240.

(Re)watching *Gray Morning* means bringing to this moment of threat to democracy in Brazil (and in the world) reflections on history and the political-cultural memory of an era of authoritarianism and repression, important for understanding the present. In this sense, *Gray Morning* looks not only at the context contemporary to it, that is, the Brazilian and Latin-American dictatorships of the 1960s and 1970s, but also to their genesis: Nazifascism and the Cold War. Thus, by intertwining art and politics, São Paulo not only bequeathed to posterity a record of that moment, through the filmic text analyzed here; he expresses, within the intermedia fabric of fictional documentary, the notion that coups and dictatorships can always return if the remembrances of their oppression and violence are erased from the memory of societies.

Bibliography

Aragão, Hudson. *Ironia e Literatura: Interseções. (*Irony and Literature: Intersections.) Retrieved from: https://goo.gl/eHQhWW. [Accessed 18 April 2021].

Baptista, André. *Funções da Música No Cinema: Contribuições para a Elaboração de Estratégias Composicionais. (*Functions of Music in Cinema: Contributions to the Development of Compositional Strategies.) M.Sc. Thesis. Federal University of Minas Gerais, 2007.

Benjamin, Walter. "Sobre o Conceito de História." (Theses on the Philosophy of History.) In *Obras Escolhidas I – Magia e Técnica, Arte e Política*, translated by Sergio Paulo Rouanet, 223-232. São Paulo: Brasiliense, 1994.

Bierley, Paul. *John Philip Sousa: American Phenomenon*. Miami, USA: Warner Bros Publications, 1973.

Camus, Albert. *La Peste*. (The Plague.) France: Gallimard, 1947.

Chion, Michel. *Music in Cinema*. Edited and translated by Claudia Gorbman. New York: Columbia University Press, 2019.

Clüver, Claus. "Inter Textus / Inter Artes / Inter Media." (Between Texts / Inter Arts / Inter Media.) Translated by Elcio Loureiro Cornelsen. *Aletria* 14 (2006): 11-41.

Díaz, Claudio. *Una Vanguardia en el Folklore Argentino: Canciones Populares, Intelectuales y Política en la Emergencia del "Nuevo Cancionero"*. (An Avant-Garde in Argentine Folklore: Popular Songs, Intellectuals and Politics in the Emergence of the "New Songbook".) Retrieved from: http://www.mdp.edu.ar/humanidades/letras/celehis/congreso/2004/actas/ponencias/9/2_Diaz.doc. [Accessed 18 April 2021].

Hutcheon, Linda. *Teoria e Política de Ironia*. (Irony's Edge: The Theory and Politics of Irony.) Translated by Julio Jeha. Belo Horizonte: UFMG Press, 2000.

Livtak, Anatole. *A Noite dos Generais*. (The Night of the Generals.) France; United Kingdom; Northern Ireland, 1967.

Oxford Dictionary. Oxford: University Press, 2017.

Rajewsky, Irina. "A Fronteira em Discussão: O Status Problemático das Fronteiras Midiáticas no Debate Contemporâneo Sobre Intermidialidade." (Border Talks: The Problematic Status of Media Borders in the Current Debate about Intermediality.) Translated by Isabella Santos Mundim. In *Intermidialidade e Estudos Interartes: Os Desafios da Arte Contemporânea*, edited by Thaïs Flores Diniz and André Soares Vieira, 51-74. Belo Horizonte: Fale/UFMG, 2012.

Ramírez, Ariel. "Gloria (Carnavalito-Yaraví)." In *Misa Criolla/Navidad Nuestra*, edited by Ariel Ramírez. Charango: Jaime Torres. Argentina: Philips, 1996.

Rancière, Jacques. *Partilha do Sensível: Estética e Política. (*The Politics of Aesthetics: The Distribution of the Sensible.) Translated by Mônica Costa Netto. São Paulo: EXO Experimental Org. & Ed. 34, 2005.

Ricardo, Sérgio, and Glauber Rocha. *Deus e o Diabo na Terra do Sol:* Movie Soundtrack. Brazil: Companhia Brasileira de Discos. Vinil, LP, Album, Mono, 1963.

Rocha, Glauber. *Revolução do Cinema Novo*. (New Cinema's Revolution.) Rio de Janeiro, Brazil: Alhambra/EMBRAFILME, 1981.

São Paulo, Olney. *A Antevéspera e o Canto do Sol*, Contos e Novelas. (The Day Before and the Song of the Sun, Short Stories and Novels.) Salvador: Quarteto Press, 2016.

São Paulo, Olney, C. Leite (Producers), and Olney São Paulo (Director). *Manhã Cinzenta*. (Gray morning.) Director of Photography: José Carlos Avelar. Brazil. 22min, Black-and-White Film, 35mm. 1969. Retrieved from: https://youtu.be/b6X65a16nxA. [Accessed 12 April 2021].

Silva, Vitor Manuel. *Teoria da Literatura*. (Literature Theory.) Coimbra, Portugal: Livraria Almedina, 1986.

Veloso, Caetano. *É proibido Proibir*. (It is Forbidden to Forbid. Music.) Brazil: Philips, 1968. Retrieved from: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=afwWdtUl0kY. [Accessed 18 April 2021].

Wingstedt, Johnny. *Narrative Music: Towards and Understanding of Musical. Narrative Functions in Multimedia*. Licentiate Thesis. Lulea, Sweden: University of Technology, School of Music, 2005.

Athens Journal of Humanities & Arts - Volume 10, Issue 2, April 2023 – Pages 149-176

Bonding and Bridging: Perceptions of Social Capital in Community Music

*By Elizabeth Bucura**

This case study explores four participants' experiences with community music (CM) workshops in Austria intended for the university, community, and growing immigrant and refugee populations. The Austrian government encourages cultural integration, potentially furthered through musical activities. Social capital theory, specifically of bonding and bridging, as well as democratic rights of inclusion, enhancement, and participation frame this inquiry. The purpose of this study was to investigate participants' perceptions of bonding or bridging capital in CM workshops. Research questions included, (a) What are participants' experiences of bonding or bridging? (b) What are their perceptions and experiences of inclusion, enhancement, or participation? and (c) What role might music play in fostering relationships among diverse participants? Data were collected primarily through interviews and observations and analyzed by coding transcripts for themes that were then compared across participants and with relevant literature. Data suggest community-building activities and purposeful collaborations might create capital, yet bridging capital depends on a confluence of circumstances, including empathetic leadership and activity structures that take virtual needs into account. Implications include the capacity for those with social capital to become bridging people.

Introduction

How might people of diverse backgrounds engage and connect in meaningful ways? This question lies at the heart of community music (CM). CM exists in all societies, including among the earliest humans,[1] but has been notably difficult to define.[2] Shippers and Barleet describe CM as a flexible and inclusive social musical activity.[3] Leglar and Smith categorize CM into three purposive categories,

*Assistant Professor, University of Music and Performing Arts Graz, Austria.

1. Nicholas Bannan, *Music, Language, and Human Evolution* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012, 10).

2. Cathy Benedict, "The Social/Cultural Economy of Community Music: Realizing Spectacle," in *CMA XI: Projects, Perspectives, and Conversations; Proceedings from the International Society for Music Education (ISME) 2008 Seminar of the Commission for Community Music Activity*, (ed.) Don D. Coffman (Tel Aviv: International Society for Music Education, 2008), 120–129; Huib Schippers and Brydie-Leigh Barleet, "The Nine Domains of Community Music: Exploring the Crossroads of Formal and Informal Music Education," *International Journal of Music Education* 31, no. 4 (2013): 455; Kari K. Veblen, "The Many Ways of Community Music," *International Journal of Community Music* 1, no. 1 (2007): 5-21.

3. Schippers and Barleet, "The Nine Domains of Community Music: Exploring the Crossroads of Formal and Informal Music Education," 2013, 455, 468.

including (i) education; (ii) performance with an educational component; and (iii) culture, socializing, or entertainment with no specific educational objective.[4] There are also therapeutic aspects of CM as a social and cultural phenomenon that can build individual and communal expressivity.[5] CM can play a role in maintaining cultural resilience and building community vitality as well as contribute to sustainability for groups who are isolated or exist in small numbers.[6]

This study describes a CM workshop series in Austria developed with the intent to foster inclusive musical opportunities among the university school of music, local community, and growing immigrant and refugee populations. The Austrian government has encouraged integration of language and values, goals that are potentially furthered through participation in social activities such as music.[7] European traditions of *Bildung*, or the German tradition of self-cultivation through personal and cultural maturation, have centered on music and the arts in general and have played a critical role in socialization and enculturation.[8] *Bildung*, in fact, may have the potential to disrupt hegemonic structures in music and education.[9] Though the Austrian CM group is designed to be voluntary, inclusive, and welcoming, scholars have raised concerns with a passive acceptance of CM activities as inherently good, prompting critical inquiry into how CM is situated, who names its successes, and how those successes are determined.[10]

In this pilot study, I investigate CM participants' perceptions of social capital,[11] considering specifically categories of bonding and bridging capital.[12] Three

4. Mary A. Leglar and David S. Smith, "Community Music in the United States: An Overview of Origins and Evolution," *International Journal of Community Music* 3, no. 3 (2010): 348.

5. Brynjulf Stige, Gary Ansdell, Cochavit Elefant, and Mercédès Pavlicevic, *Where Music Helps: Community Music Therapy in Action and Reflection* (England: Ashgate, 2010; Abingdon, England: Routledge, 2016), 9. ProQuest Ebook Central.

6. Chris Gibson and Andrea Gordon, "Rural Cultural Resourcefulness: How Community Music Enterprises Sustain Cultural Vitality," *Journal of Rural Studies* 63 (2018): 259-270.

7. The Expert Council for Integration, *Integration Report 2019: Integration in Austria—Statistics, Developments, Priorities* (Vienna: Expert Council for Integration, 2019), 3.

8. Geir Johansen, "*Musikdidaktik* and Sociology," in *Sociology and Music Education (*ed.) Ruth Wright (London: Routledge, 2010), 208; Ruth Wright, "Democracy, Social Exclusion and Music Education: Possibilities for Change," in *Sociology and Music Education* (ed.) Ruth Wright (London: Routledge, 2010), 263-282.

9. Christopher G. Small, *Music, Society, Education: An Examination of the Function of Music in Western, Eastern and African Cultures with Its Impact on Society and Its Use in Education* (Hanover, CT: Wesleyan University Press, 1977).

10. Benedict, "The Social/Cultural Economy of Community Music: Realizing Spectacle," 2008, 119.

11. Pierre Bourdieu, "The Forms of Capital," in *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education* (ed.) John G. Richardson (New York: Greenwood, 1986), 241-258.

categories of potential participants emerge: university members (e.g., students and professors), refugees and immigrants, and Austrian community members. Research questions included, (a) What are participants' experiences of bonding or bridging in the CM workshops? (b) What are participants' perceptions and experiences of inclusion, enhancement, or participation? and (c) What role might music play in relationships among diverse participants in a CM workshop?

This paper begins with an introduction of the topic and the research questions. The Literature Review follows, providing an overview of scholarship related to CM, theory of bonding and bridging capital, and democratic rights of participation, which frame this study.[13] The third section, Methodology, details site and participant selection, my relationship as researcher to the participants, and what and how data were collected for analysis. In the Results section, I present data relevant to the research questions. I follow this in the Discussion section with a thorough analysis of the data, aiming to provide answers to the research questions. Finally, the Conclusion section reviews key findings and implications for future research and for CM.

Literature Review

In this section, I aim to provide an overview of the definitions and purposes of CM established in the literature as well as discussions of cultural identity and resilience as they relate to CM. I then outline the framework for this study, which is based on Bourdieu's social capital theory and conceptions of bonding and bridging capital.[14]

Community Music

Despite the ubiquity and long history of CM globally,[15] a generally accepted

12. Robert D. Putnam, "*E pluribus unum*: Diversity and Community in the Twenty-First Century; The 2006 Johan Skytte Prize Lecture," *Scandinavian Political Studies* 30, no. 2 (2007): 137-174.

13. Basil Bernstein, *Pedagogy, Symbolic Control and Identity: Theory, Research, Critique* (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 2000).

14. Bourdieu, "The Forms of Capital," 1986; Putnam, *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 2000); Theda Skocpol, *Diminished Democracy: From Membership to Management in American Civic Life* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2003).

15. Bannan, *Music, Language, and Human Evolution*, 2012; Alexandra Kertz-Welzel, "Daring to Question: A Philosophical Critique of Community Music," *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 24, no. 2 (2016): 113-130.

definition remains elusive.[16] A mostly unquestioned, therefore problematic, assumption of CM's inherent goodness of enhancement and empowerment nonetheless persists notwithstanding its equivocality.[17] According to the Community Music Activity Commission of the International Society for Music Education, CM is a universal right, and that beyond involving people in music-making, CM activities "provide opportunities to construct personal and communal expressions of artistic, social, political and cultural concerns; contribute to the development of economic regeneration; enhance the quality of life for communities; encourage and empower participants to become agents for extending and developing music in their communities."[18] CM is commonly considered one way by which political and public participation can better people's situations.[19] Gibson and Gordon note that CM can play a role in maintaining cultural resilience and building community vitality as well as contribute to sustainability, specifically for those experiencing isolation or a lack of critical mass in their communities.[20]

Though the definitions are vague, authors generally describe CM as flexible and inclusive social musical activities that may involve the following three aspects: music of a community, communal music-making, or an organized musical group with a leader from the community.[21] Leglar and Smith define purposes CM, which may have: education; performance with an educational component; and culture, socializing, or entertainment with no specific educational objective.[22] Kertz-Welzel highlights the transformative musical vision of CM, "characterized by social justice, cultural democracy, participation, and hospitality," but notes that establishing a close collaboration between CM and school music scholars "could be useful in order to implement the notion of everybody's musicality more thoroughly in the discourse and practice of music

16. Helen Phelan, "Practice, Ritual and Community Music: Doing as Identity," *International Journal of Community Music* 1, no. 2 (2008): 143-158; Schippers and Barleet, "The Nine Domains of Community Music: Exploring the Crossroads of Formal and Informal Music Education," 2013; Veblen, "The Many Ways of Community Music," 2007.

17. Kertz-Welzel, "Daring to Question: A Philosophical Critique of Community Music," 2016; Benedict, "The Social/Cultural Economy of Community Music: Realizing Spectacle," 2008, 121.

18. International Society for Music Education, "Community Music Activity Commission (CMA)," ISME Commissions and the ISME Forum, International Society for Music Education.

19. Marissa Silverman, "Community Music and Social Justice: Reclaiming Love," in *The Oxford Handbook of Music Education* (ed.) Gary E. McPherson and Graham F. Welch (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), 2: 155-167.

20. Gibson and Gordon, "Rural Cultural Resourcefulness: How Community Music Enterprises Sustain Cultural Vitality," 2018, 264, 268.

21. Lee Higgins, *Community Music: In Theory and in Practice* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012).

22. Leglar and Smith, "Community Music in the United States: An Overview of Origins and Evolution," 2010, 348.

learning."[23] Stige et al. also describes therapeutic aspects of CM, including relationships between music and wellbeing, as well as social circumstances.[24]

Social Capital

Bourdieu developed the theory of capital, a concept of power and access in social life involving forms of cultural, social, and economic capital and focusing on categories of class, supremacy, conflict, and the ways in which capital might be formed.[25] According to the theory of social capital, relationships are a resource secured by material or symbolic exchanges.[26] Through these exchanges, reciprocity and trustworthiness may grow with continual investment into building and maintaining social capital.[27] Jones describes social capital as "a disposition toward and practice of cooperating with others."[28] Mutual cooperation may therefore enhance goals of diversity and inclusion. Although diversity has the potential to promote distrust and exclusion however, interactions can also potentially create understandings and bonds.[29]

Associations, as in groups people join, which can promote friendships, memberships, and connections with others, are an important source of social stability.[30] Associating physically, however, has become difficult with the growth in popularity of virtual communications and entertainment that diminish person-to-person interactions.[31] The loss of personal connection and association, and thus social capital, have had repercussions,[32] that can include weakened social connections.

Austria has, in recent years welcomed an influx of refugees and immigrants.

---

23. Kertz-Welzel, "Daring to Question: A Philosophical Critique of Community Music," 2016, 127.

24. Stige, Ansdell, Elefant, and Pavlicevic, *Where Music Helps: Community Music Therapy in Action and Reflection*, 2016, 7, 11.

25. Bourdieu, "The Forms of Capital," 1986, 248-252; Mark Konewko, *Actual Connections in a Virtual World: Social Capital of Eric Whitacre's Virtual Choir* (Athens: Athens Institute for Education and Research (ATINER), 2012).

26. Bourdieu, "The Forms of Capital," 1986, 248-249.

27. Putnam, *Making Democracy Work: Civic Traditions in Modern Italy* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993).

28. Patrick M. Jones, "Developing Social Capital: A Role for Music Education and Community Music in Fostering Civic Engagement and Intercultural Understanding," in Coffman, *CMA XI*, 131.

29. Putnam, "*E Pluribus Unum*: Diversity and Community in the Twenty-First Century; The 2006 Johan Skytte Prize Lecture," 2007, 142, 159.

30. Putnam, *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community*, 2000, 48-64.

31. Richard Florida, *The Rise of the Creative Class: And How it's Transforming Work, Leisure, Community and Everyday Life* (New York: Basic Books, 2002).

32. Jones, "Developing Social Capital: A Role for Music Education and Community Music in Fostering Civic Engagement and Intercultural Understanding," 129.

Although this has historically been the case, new waves of migration began in 2015, making Austria one of the EU countries taking in the highest numbers[33]. The Austrian government instituted policies and programs that encourage and help refugees socially integrate into Austrian society.[34] Community music can offer opportunity for further cultural participation. Music may be uniquely situated to foster connections among diverse people because it has the possibility to build strong social bonding[35] as well as tolerance, cultural understanding, and economic gain.[36] According to Jones, building social capital should stand as an explicit goal of both community music and music education in order to foster intercultural understandings and civic engagement.[37] Jones stakes music as a "perfect mediating space for people of different groups."[38]

Westerlund, Partti, and Karlsen note the important social role CM can play, despite challenges associated with significant shifting cultural demographics due to migration.[39] Schiavio et al. point out problematic assumptions of Western classical art music as the best.[40] As scholars note, these views tend to be furthered by institutional values, which may marginalize other musical practices, particularly among those with low social capital in a particular place, for instance, for immigrants or refugees.[41]

Benedict highlights problems with assuming CM is inherently good,[42] pointing to a need for critical considerations of *how* it is good (if it is) and in what ways. CM is often assumed to foster positive associations and enjoyable music-making opportunities among diverse others, and to guide social justice efforts. As a field of practice now increasingly defined by academic institutions and their

33. Helen Womack, *Vienna Learns the Benefit of Giving Warm Welcome to Refugees* (UNHCR, December 12, 2018).

34. The Expert Council for Integration, *Integration Report 2019: Integration in Austria—Statistics, Developments, Priorities*, 2019, 3.

35. William Murray Dabback, *Toward a Model of Adult Music Learning as a Socially-Embedded Phenomenon* (University of Rochester, 2007); Stephanie Pitts, *Valuing Musical Participation* (Hampshire, UK: Ashgate Publishing, 2005).

36. Jones, "Developing Social Capital: A Role for Music Education and Community Music in Fostering Civic Engagement and Intercultural Understanding," 133.

37. Ibid, 133.

38. Ibid, 135.

39. Heidi Westerlund, Heidi Partti, and Sidsel Karlsen, "Teaching as Improvisational Experience: Student Music Teachers' Reflections on Learning During an Intercultural Project," *Research Studies in Music Education* 37, no. 1 (2015): 55-75.

40. Andrea Schiavio, Dylan van der Shyff, Andrea Gande, and Silke Kruse-Weber, "Negotiating Individuality and Collectivity in Community Music. A Qualitative Case Study," *Psychology of Music* 47, no. 5 (2018): 706-721.

41. Small, *Music, Society, Education: An Examination of the Function of Music in Western, Eastern and African Cultures with its Impact on Society and its Use in Education*, 1977.

42. Benedict, "The Social/Cultural Economy of Community Music: Realizing Spectacle," 2008.

accompanying research, rules, roles, degrees, and systems, complexities arise in assumptions of CM, that is, as a community activity that was historically external to the university, now sometimes housed within, and governed by structures and traditions of institutions that may fundamentally change it.[43] Kertz-Welzel recommends philosophical inquiry to better understand and implement CM.[44]

CM is a culture in and of itself; when it goes unquestioned however, we deny our own submission to, and acceptance of, rules and practices that normalize and support existing hierarchies of people and musics.[45] Benedict draws on the work of Illich[46] to point out that these systems, and those ruling them, often seek to define those in poverty. Those in power not only tend to define others and their supposed needs, but also tend to control the rhetoric, resources, and terms in the form of institutional performance.[47] "If community music schools and programs are framed and organized by that which is determined legitimate the transmission and rendering of standard, prescribed, then normative treatments become authoritative."[48] Control, domination, and power, therefore, must be carefully considered in CM contexts.

Bonding and Bridging Capital

Putnam defines two forms of social capital, *bonding* and *bridging*, and claims both are necessary for a peaceful society. Bonding capital centers on connections of shared characteristics or interests, for example, spirituality, race, or age. Bonding capital is a connection among people who share, or who are perceived to share such similarities, often in identifiable ways. Shared similarities, however, may be also viewed in only one way, for instance race or gender.[49] Claridge described bonding capital as inward-looking, which might perpetuate one's identity and reinforce homogeneous groups.[50]

Bridging capital, however, involves connections *between* social groups that may be perceived as different.[51] People may come from diverse backgrounds,

43. Ibid.

44. Kertz-Welzel, "Daring to Question: A Philosophical Critique of Community Music," 2016.

45. Benedict, "The Social/Cultural Economy of Community Music: Realizing Spectacle," 2008, 121.

46. Ivan Illich, *Deschooling Society* (New York: Harrow Books, 1972).

47. Benedict, "The Social/Cultural Economy of Community Music: Realizing Spectacle," 2008, 123; Illich, *Deschooling Society*, 1972.

48. Benedict, "The Social/Cultural Economy of Community Music: Realizing Spectacle," 2008, 126.

49. Putnam, *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community*, 2000, 22-23.

50. Claridge, *What is Bonding Social Capital?* (Social Capital Research & Training, January 6, 2018).

51. Putnam, *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community*, 2000, 22-23.

including for example ethnic, racial, or religious identities.[52] Bridging connections may result in a broad trust through cooperation and growing familiarity.[53] While bonding capital is necessary for bridging, it does not guarantee its result because bonding may connect a commonality and encourage participation in a group without necessarily connecting others perceived as unalike. Bridging capital therefore is outward-looking, promoting connection among diverse people.[54] Ideally, bridging capital results in collective actions, such as cooperation between groups for mutual benefit.[55] When opportunities are created for meaningful interactions, diverse group members can begin to perceive shared identities toward bridging.[56]

Inclusion, Enhancement, Participation

This study explored participants' conceptions of Bernstein's democratic rights, *inclusion*, *enhancement*, and *participation*, as they relate to CM. Bernstein describes inclusion as a right to be involved not only physically, but also intellectually, socially, and culturally.[57] This might include, for instance, opportunities for people to see themselves reflected in cultural imagery that demonstrates value for them and their voices. Importantly, inclusion does not imply conformity or acculturation; rather, inclusion encourages autonomy and individuality,[58] within a state of acceptance and participation.

Bernstein's right of enhancement involves tools for critical reflection, not only of what occurs at present, but also of what possibilities might exist into the future. This might include, for instance, a vision of future musical possibilities or a reflection of things one takes for granted. Lastly, participation involves a right to take part, not only in existing structures, but also in those that can be adapted and changed. For example, having opportunities to express opinions—and receiving others' respect for doing so.[59]

---

52. Putnam, ""*E Pluribus Unum*: Diversity and Community in the Twenty-First Century; The 2006 Johan Skytte Prize Lecture," 2007.

53. Dietlind Stolle, Stuart Soroka, and Richard Johnston, "When Does Diversity Erode Trust? Neighborhood Diversity, Interpersonal Trust and the Mediating Effect of Social Interactions," *Political Studies* 56, no. 1 (2008): 60.

54. Claridge, "*What is Bonding Social Capital?* 2018.

55. Larissa Larsen, Sharon L. Harlan, Bob Bolin, Edward J. Hackett, Diane Hope, Andrew Kirby, Amy Nelson, Tom R. Rex, and Shaphard Wolf, "Bonding and Bridging: Understanding the Relationship between Social Capital and Civic Action," *Journal of Planning Education and Research* 24, no. 1 (2004): 64-77.

56. Putnam, "*E Pluribus Unum*: Diversity and Community in the Twenty-First Century; The 2006 Johan Skytte Prize Lecture," 2007, 164.

57. Bernstein, *Pedagogy, Symbolic Control and Identity: Theory, Research, Critique*, 2000.

58. Wright, "Democracy, Social Exclusion and Music Education: Possibilities for Change," 2010, 264-268.

59. Ibid, 276-277.

Methodology

The purpose of this study was to investigate participants' perceptions of bonding or bridging in the CM workshops they attended or in which they participated. I carried out this case study[60] bound by the CM workshop series. Interviews with and observations of the four participants were the primary data sources, but observations and artifacts were also included. I analyzed the data by coding transcripts for themes that I then compared with relevant literature.

Workshops

The site of investigation, the CM workshop series, existed prior to my own participation. It had been intended as an inclusive musical opportunity with a low barrier for participation.[61] The workshops addressed two simultaneous purposes: promoting social interactions and stimulating continued musical and artistic interactions that focused on negotiating both individual and group subjectivity.[62] It was created as an opportunity for anyone—from any background and of any age—to musically express themselves while socializing with others. At the same time, the workshop series also existed as a portion of a university class on music pedagogy.[63] Those that took the workshops as a class completed weekly pedagogical reflections with facilitators, and led at least one brief portion of teaching under the guidance of a facilitator. The workshop series provided open ensembles that revolved among different themes like dance, theatre, choir, and percussion. The workshops were intended for anyone: "refugees and migrants, students, citizens of Graz of all ages including elderly people, university students and sometimes staff."[64] Prior years also included gamelan but were not offered at the time of this study (held virtually during the COVID-19 pandemic).

Participants

The participants in this pilot study included four university students who I was able to recruit for a sample of convenience. I co-facilitated the course, and

60. John W. Creswell and J. David Creswell, *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches* (Los Angeles: Sage, 2018).

61. Andrea Gande and Silke Kruse-Weber, "Addressing New Challenges for a Community Music Project in the Context of Higher Music Education: A Conceptual Framework," *London Review of Education* 15, no. 3 (2017): 375-376.

62. Andrea Schiavio, van der Shyff, Gande, and Kruse-Weber, "Negotiating Individuality and Collectivity in Community Music. A Qualitative Case Study," 2018, 712.

63. Gande and Kruse-Weber, "Addressing New Challenges for a Community Music Project in the Context of Higher Music Education: A Conceptual Framework," 2017, 376.

64. Ibid, 378.

workshop facilitators included a revolving pool of regular community members who each taught one of the topics: drumming, singing, or theatre. Students were familiar with, if not also comfortable with virtual classes—most university classes had moved online using the same platform during the prior year, and many continued to be held that way. It is possible that community participants may have been deterred, however by the new virtual format or may not have had the tools for online participation (e.g., technological skills, a device compatible with the hosting platform, a stable internet connection) in a way that was perhaps not as difficult for university students.

The four participants were Lillian, Karina, Maya, and Kai. Lillian and Kai were both international students who had moved to Austria from abroad. Karina and Maya were both from Austria. All participants were women in their 20s. The participants had different experiences with the CM workshops and while most were new, it was not uncommon for new people to come in and out of the group. At the time of this study Maya had only attended one session. Lillian and Kai were also was relatively new, both having participated in only a few sessions. Karina, however, shared with me that she had not missed a weekly workshop in the past year. Each had previously been aware of the workshops and all began attending due to a course requirement. All reflected they should have attended early-on, expressing their enthusiasm for their experiences. While it is possible they exaggerated their enthusiasm for my benefit as I currently held an instructor role, I got the feeling they were genuine, and none participated as members of my own class. All participants were thoughtful and reflective about their experiences of participation in the workshops, providing rich interview data.

Researcher

A year prior to this study, I had been invited by a colleague to provide two workshops on topics of my choice. I facilitated both folk dance and creative community singing workshops. These experiences leading my own CM workshops were enjoyable and I wondered about other workshops, teachers and their approaches, program goals, individuals' motivations, and interactions among attendees. Additionally, at the time of this study I was a new professor of music pedagogy at this institution and had begun co-facilitating the workshop series. While the weekly teachers were external to the university, I provided administration for the program, which included delegating tasks to a student assistant and familiarizing myself with the history of the program and making plans for the future. My workshops and administrative role gave me some understanding of the scope of the program and provided an overview of the semester, yet I considered myself new. While I conducted my research, I also co-administered and participated in the program each week. It is possible my roles within the organization may have influenced participants' responses. However, no participants were members of the course and therefore did not receive a grade

from me. Also, most of the participants were completing their degree programs and had no obvious reason to exaggerate their feelings. Although participants and I saw each other's faces in the online group, we did not know one another.

Data and Analysis

Interviews and observations were the primary sources for data collection. I conducted semi-structured interviews with all four participants: interview questions provided the base for discussion, and I asked follow-up questions naturally as opportunities arose during the conversation. I attended the workshops as participant–researcher; I took limited observation notes during the workshops as I was also a participant. Students took part in reflection meetings at the conclusions of the workshops, which I also attended. After each, I immediately recorded observation notes based on my experiences in the workshops and reflection meetings. Additional data comprised a collection of artifacts, such as flyers, website promotions and social media posts or comments, and posters. I created transcripts of interview recordings and reviewed them for accuracy. I sent transcripts to participants for member checking to ensure they felt accurately represented by their words. They had the opportunity to omit or further explain any of their thoughts. Only a few minor changes were requested, however. I then coded transcripts and reviewed them with observation notes for emergent themes. I diagrammed these themes and selected relevant, representative quotes, which I present in the Results section below.

Results

Five categories emerged from these findings: inclusion and sense of welcome, lighting candles, pacing and accessibility, awkwardness and fatigue, and goals. I present participants' voices in each category below, letting them speak for themselves whenever possible.

Participants had different experiences and circumstances in the CM workshops. Relatively new to the program, Lillian and Kai had only attended a few workshops when I began data collection. Karina, who had attended the workshops weekly for nearly a year, noted that she had some expectations about the sessions based on prior experiences with the teachers and regular attendees. She said, "Last semester I didn't miss one session as a student." Maya had attended the fewest sessions—only one. The workshops, however, were designed for drop-in participation—even if only once—I therefore considered her perspective an important source of insight as she was one of many with such limited experience and could speak to her initial feelings and interpretations that might affect continued participation or not. During this study, the COVID-19 pandemic necessitated that all sessions were held virtually. This factor seemed to

play a foundational role in participants' experiences. Not only were the CM workshops new to most of them, but the online experience of learning and participating musically was also relatively new. As aforementioned, it may have nevertheless been easier for these university students than a typical community member.

Inclusion and Sense of Welcome

Kai expressed that she was initially anxious the first time she logged in concerned that she might be asked to sing alone. She said she grew more comfortable, however when she realized this would not be a requirement of her. Lillian recalled that the first time she attended a workshop, she logged in during an ongoing conversation: "When I came in, he [the facilitator] was already talking to people and asking them how they were doing and things like that. So, I don't know. I kind of came in, in the middle of a conversation or something and it was with people that I did not know."

Kai expressed enthusiasm for the choir teacher, who she felt infused the virtual session with musicianship and energy. Kai said, "It's hard to keep the energy and the motivation of the students up, but I think she did a very good job of doing that, and it felt just as good as an in-person lecture, I thought. And the students, they were, I think also very motivated; there were a couple of people standing up and just swaying to the music while singing, even when they're on mute."

Lillian noted that virtual breakout rooms played a positive role for her during other (university) online classes, however these other courses were not used in the scope of data collection for this study. Lillian liked the breakout rooms because they allowed connections to form when people got a chance to talk, and therefore offered a sense of inclusion: "When we do lectures online, we are separated into groups and do our assignment for those 10 minutes or whatever. And then we come back into the bigger room. If we incorporated that with music, or to show each other the excerpt that we practiced or something, then that could be a way to maybe get to know people that way." Lillian and Kai both said they were not able to connect with others during CM virtual sessions, which focused only on large-group skills.

Lillian reflected that her feelings of connection and familiarity with others were important in that they would impact her motivation and confidence to speak to people she did not know. While she did not speak to other members during the virtual sessions, she considered what she would do in-person when given the chance. She said:

> If we were live [in-person in a classroom] and there were the water breaks, I definitely would probably go talk to people that maybe I've had class with, and then if they were talking with somebody who I didn't know, then that would be a way for me to

> be introduced to somebody new. But I don't think that if somebody were to come up to me, I'm not that kind of person, I think it would just be like circumstances, and that's how it has to be, it has to be natural. And if, I don't know, a situation happens and then we're all just kind of discussing or something, then a conversation also can flow that way.

Kai said that she was glad to see familiar faces the second time she attended. She said, "I've seen familiar faces of the same people in both [of the first] sessions. And even though I don't know them personally—I just met them online—but when I logged in and saw those faces, I was like, "Oh!" I was relieved to see, "Oh, I know her face." And that just made me feel a bit excited . . . and you can see the names, whereas in person, you would have to remember."

Karina however, a longstanding attendee, spoke about the ease with which she would be able approach and meet new people. She described former in-person sessions from the year prior, saying,

> I think it was nice because the group changed a little bit and you had also other people you can get to know and you just—I love to meet new people. And I think that's really nice because in this context it's really easy because you have something to talk about really fast because you've all done the same course, or you've just sang the same songs, and so you can connect with them. … I also find it interesting that there are also some people, they come every time, for example, to the choir, so you see them every three weeks and so it's also nice to see, "Oh, they are here again," and yes, I think that's really a good, good thing.

Lighting Candles

Lillian remembered feeling indifferent to the CM workshops prior to attending. While she was aware of them through advertisements, she said she felt no connection to them at that time. That changed when a friend mentioned them to her, and then she met one of the facilitators who guest-spoke in a university class. She said,

> I would see the posters around the university. I've been [a student there] maybe a couple of years. And I wasn't really ever interested because it was just like, I just had so much on my plate already. I think it's also a difference between people who do music like, as a hobby versus as a profession. So, I think that's why I was never really interested in it. And then it kind of rang a bell when I met somebody in a program. I randomly saw him and he said, "Oh, I'm doing drum circle," which drum circle, it wasn't something that interested me actually. He was like, "Yeah, I'm doing for music thing," … then that kind of like, I guess shed a little bit of um, because otherwise I would just see the posters. And then that was a few years ago. The professor's name just slowly started coming into my world, you know, a little bit. And he also did a talk, he was a guest speaker in one of our classes. So, then we really got to know him there. And then, that's how that all started coming. I guess it has to do with getting to know

> people, I guess that's where it all starts. … I just imagine, you know, like he lit one candle and then you just light another candle and then slowly that'll kind of spread.

Participants seemed to "light candles" for one another in other ways, too. Raina expressed feeling a little nervous the first time she attended, but told me one thing that helped her gain comfort and a feeling of welcome was watching other participants get involved. Despite that during the choir session participants were virtual and singing on mute, Kai described watching others sway or dance to the backtrack. She felt their engagement helped her. She said, "the students, they were, I think very motivated. There were a couple of people standing up and just, you know, swaying to the music while singing, even if they're on mute . . . watching that made me feel, you know, more secure, not embarrassed or anything." Kai also noted that the instructor herself was motivating in a similar way. She described her as "very social, very energetic—uplifting. She naturally motivates the students to be creative. She's very creative herself, I think."

Pacing and Accessibility

During choir, Lillian told me she felt uncomfortable singing alone in her apartment even though she was a vocalist. While Kai was similarly worried about that initially, she said she had fun doing it in the moment, referencing the backtrack to which participants sang along. Kai acknowledged that others might feel differently. While describing how accessible the drum circle felt to her, Lillian laughingly stated that she had not realized how much she liked it until she started describing it to me and reflecting on her experience:

> I didn't realize I liked it so much, but I think [the teacher] was super accessible to non-musicians. He made it in such a way where he didn't make you feel like you're taking a step backwards as a musician. He still challenged us. It would have been interesting for non-musicians, but I'm not sure because I've been a musician all my life, so I can't speak for them. But, for me it was broken down in such an intelligent way and an accessible way that I felt extremely comfortable. If I compare that, for example, with choir, I felt even as a musician, it [choir] was too fast for me.

Lillian juxtaposed the accessibility she felt when drum circling with the pace of the choir:

> I asked myself, did I miss a [choir] session? Because like I had the feeling that I missed something, because I felt like she was, I don't know, five steps ahead, and that some other people were also with her, with those five steps. Yeah. And then I was like, I thought this was one of the first classes, but apparently not as I was a little confused about that. And then like, as if everybody, and then of course we just zoomed through, literally, we really went through it.

Other participants, however, described their enjoyment of choir, and the pace at which the instructor led them. Karina however, had participated in choir before, with the same instructor. Maya knew the instructor previously in other contexts, and may have had some familiarity because of it. Kai did not know her and lacked previous experience but described enjoying it nonetheless.

Awkwardness and Fatigue

When reflecting on the choir experience that she felt had been too fast-paced, Lillian noted that it had felt awkward online:

> It was for me, honestly, a little awkward to sit in my room, and, you know I have my headphones on and I'm just piecing out these exercises and I'm sitting in my chair, you know? And I think if we were live … I think singing is a like, I'm not saying that other instruments are not as connecting, but I'm saying that in this choir setting where it is a non-soloistic singing, which means that we are dependent on the person next to us to create sounds, I think it was kind of a missing that element that one would want in any music session. I was just at home, sitting in a chair, singing these tones; it felt awkward.

For Kai however, who had attended the same session, the pace and accessibility felt right. She said it was fun for her but she felt it would also be accessible for others even if they did not read music. She noted that although the instructor used standard notation, it did not appear to concern attendees. The instructor played or sang each part and Kai felt it would possible for someone to learn entirely by ear. Kai also told me that she had looked forward to CM participation because she personally enjoyed informal music making, even when at a lower level of complexity than what she studied at the university. She seemed to appreciate musical activities that involved all levels of musicianship. She recalled living at home prior to university studies and enjoying such activities. She said, "My dad has a couple of friends who play instruments, not professionally, or they just started the guitar. So, I would often go along with him to play in a group with just simple chords. And for me, I enjoy that the most, you know, playing just simple chords, but with people who just love music." For Maya, involvement, accessibility, and participation boiled down to attitude. She said, "I think to really enjoy these kind of things, you have to be at least a bit open or interested in something. I think that's a complex, or complexes are a really big part of that. Have a lot of them and you feel more uncomfortable being there than comfortable, then. Yeah. But that's, that's of course an individual thing."

Both participants spoke about the ways technology interfered with what would otherwise be familiar, spontaneous interactions, for instance the problem of audio lag or pauses as individuals unmuted or re-muted themselves to offer a thought, as well as technical issues that could delay the session (e.g., audio failure, internet problems). Karina said,

> I think that's also something that, um, causes that you can't just talk, so you have to be, "Oh, okay. I want to say some things, so I'm going to turn on the microphone," and it's not so spontaneous. Like, if you just talk and then, "Oh yeah, sure, I just wanted to jump in there." So [now] it's more, "Oh, is it okay? Or, is someone else going to say something?" It also causes some breaks. And what's also not so good in online is when there are problems like technical issues, and you just have to wait. … It's also like "really?"

Karina mentioned her feelings of fatigue that could quickly set in when interacting virtually. She said, "You have to talk to the whole group … so it's like you have to concentrate more and it gets like, we have to focus. I do get tired [in a] shorter time. So, if it's important, then it's okay. I can concentrate for two hours, but in, in front of the laptop I get just a little headache."

Goals

It was not always clear to participants what the facilitators' goals were, which could have been because teachers were able to set their own tone for their workshops, and these likely differed among them and perhaps among their own sessions depending on who or how many attended any particular session. Some teachers provided an overview of their workshop to participants at the beginning, which may have helped participants understand the pacing of the session and the decisions they made in order to accomplish end goals, like singing a four-part vocal arrangement with accompaniment track as a concluding activity.

The overarching goals of the CM workshops differed a great deal from students' other university courses, and they expressed appreciation for the inclusivity and connections these workshops could offer. Karina said, "The idea why it started is really nice, that they just wanted to open the university so that everybody has something he can come to and experience. And it's not only for the students." Lillian similarly stated, "It gives people a chance to do music for free and, you know, come as you are and come and go as you please. I think the concept is great. I think it's inviting." Maya noted the possibility for insecurity to interfere with people's participation, however. She stated that making workshops accessible should be an explicit program goal if it was not already, saying, "Everybody has their own thing . . . and so, I think it's very important for workshops to be at a level that is equal enough that everybody can kind of follow and understand."

Discussion

I organized the data in this study with a construction of bonding and bridging capital as a frame. Bernstein's pedagogic democratic rights (i.e., inclusion, enhancement, and participation) can be supportively enacted to promote both forms of capital.[65] I correlate bonding capital with the right of inclusion and bridging capital with both rights of enhancement and participation.

Inclusion involves physical, intellectual, social, and cultural connections; a reflection of oneself in cultural imagery; feelings of value for voice and self; and autonomy. These pillars could guide practice toward building bonding capital through shared and identifiable characteristics and interests. *Enhancement* concerns critical reflection and a consideration of future possibilities as well as attempts to gain perspective of one's own norms. *Participation* means having voice, expressing opinions, and contributing to adaptation and change within a group. Both enhancement and participation rules can guide practice toward bridging capital. Bridging capital, as a goal, requires trust and cooperation with others to connect and grow in familiarity. Importantly, these outcomes ideally promote possibilities for collective action through shared identities that benefit the group. Here I discuss two larger themes that emerged from this study: connections and transformation.

Connections

Data suggest that community-building activities and purposeful, collaborative opportunities might foster bonding capital. Bridging capital, however, depends on a confluence of circumstances, including a sense of belonging, empathetic leadership, activity structures, and perceived benefits of social positioning. Both forms of capital were manifest in the workshops to varying degrees, though the recent loss of in-person workshops due to the COVID-19 pandemic impacted the manner in which they appeared.

Lillian connected comfortably with fellow music students participating in the workshops because she identified with them as musicians and students. Although she was interested in meeting participants from outside that sphere, like community participants, she stated that she would only feel comfortable engaging them if a familiar peer were already speaking or working with them. To make herself comfortable, Lillian relied on a *bridging person*, or a person with whom she had built bonding capital, to connect her with others she did not know and perceived as unalike. Karina conversely described comfort and motivation to meet new people. She described appreciating this aspect of the CM workshops as much as the musical aspects. Karina would likely be a bridging person for

65. Putnam, *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community*, 2000; Bernstein, *Pedagogy, Symbolic Control and Identity: Theory, Research, Critique*, 2000, xx–xxi.

participants like Lillian, helping them make the social connections Schippers and Barleet describe of inclusion, support, and networking.[66]

Karina appeared to possess a great deal of both cultural and social capital, according to Bourdieu's descriptions:[67] she was living in her own country, speaking her first language, and had attended the workshops for a significant amount of time. She was familiar with regular attendees and was aware of the occasional or choral-only attendees, as well as new people, like Maya. She had made friendships and acquaintances with other attendees as she bonded with them, and had developed some expectations of what different teachers' sessions would be like and what would be expected of her as a participant. This provided her both power and access, outcomes of social and cultural capital.[68] This could have contributed greatly to Karina's comfort in approaching unfamiliar people, although it could also be an aspect of her personality that gave her confidence to engage others beyond her familiar social circle. Nevertheless, comfort and confidence in approaching others provides additional social capital, which can be used as a resource in the development of social strata.[69] Karina's growing relationships created reciprocity and trustworthiness over time that contributed to feelings of social stability.[70]

The right of inclusion is involvement physically, intellectually, socially, and culturally.[71] Participants in this study participated virtually, but workshops included physical involvement, like dancing, synchronizing movements and actions with a backtrack or drum, and games, while teachers encouraged physical involvement in my observations, the nature of virtual platforms somewhat restricted users' range of motion when attempting to remain in the video frame.

Teachers also encouraged intellectual participation through questioning and discussion, although these primarily took place after the workshops for only the students who participated as a course member. Nevertheless, there were some attempts to allow participants to speak, albeit in limited ways. According to Karina, who had previously taken the course, contribution in discussions was considerably easier when in-person. She said she held back in virtual discussions because it was difficult to avoid inadvertently interrupting someone, and the discussion sometimes felt unnatural in the clunky process of unmuting and re-

66. Schippers and Barleet, "The Nine Domains of Community Music: Exploring the Crossroads of Formal and Informal Music Education," 2013, 461.

67. Bourdieu, "The Forms of Capital," 1986, 244-245, 249.

68. Ibid, 248-249.

69. Ibid, 251-252.

70. Putnam, Putnam, *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community*, 2000; Skocpol, *Diminished Democracy: From Membership to Management in American Civic Life*, 2003. For further discussion of reciprocity and trustworthiness in bridging and bonding relationships, see Putnam, *Making Democracy Work: Civic Traditions in Modern Italy*, 1993.

71. Bernstein, *Pedagogy, Symbolic Control and Identity: Theory, Research, Critique*, 2000.

muting microphones. Some groups may also have been uncomfortable or less experienced with technologies, hindering participation. Students who took the workshops for class, however, also participated in a designated reflection time after the close of the workshops each week and contributed to a discussion forum. These participants had additional opportunities for reflection and discussion with one another and the teacher, though mediated either through an online written platform, or online video platform.

Socially, the CM workshops seemed designed to initiate connections. Karina described past in-person sessions that had included time to speak informally in the beginning and end as well as a water break halfway through, where participants and the teacher got to know one another, where they were able to group up and chat in their own ways. The nature of virtual meetings, however, made informal conversations—crucial for bonding connections—difficult to fully achieve.[72] As participants described, when one or two people speak, they dominate "the virtual floor," inhibiting others' opportunities to connect with any others. Lillian described her first workshop as slightly awkward, as she joined during an informal conversation between the teacher and a participant and therefore could not introduce herself to anyone new, say hello to someone familiar, or be welcomed by the teacher. However, Lillian also described the helpful presence of breakout rooms in her other classes, which allowed for small groups to speak more freely, informally, and candidly than they could otherwise, mimicking a similar kind of chat they might have in an in-person moment. These insights are significant as diminished personal connections can deeply affect people and societies, both culturally and economically.[73]

Participants spoke about involving their friends. Lillian pointed out the importance of organic connections, opportunities to involve others through one's own intrinsic interest. While she felt posters and advertisements were helpful in spreading a level of awareness, she felt that participants responded more readily to personal invitations from someone familiar (including participants asked to come by professors or for a class assignment). This was the case for Karina, who had later continued to come out of her own interest. These moments of so-called candle lighting may be some of the most valuable bonding opportunities. Feelings of inclusion and welcome may be greatly enhanced when specifically asked to attend, particularly when that person is at least somewhat known or perhaps bonded in some way.

Although Jones stated that CM activities should explicitly intend to bring about intercultural understandings,[74] the workshops in this study were complex.

---

72. Florida, *The Rise of the Creative Class: And How it's Transforming Work, Leisure, Community and Everyday Life*, 2000.

73. Jones, "Developing Social Capital: A Role for Music Education and Community Music in Fostering Civic Engagement and Intercultural Understanding."

74. Ibid, 130-144.

They involved overlapping areas of cultural intersection that included the cultures of the university, the country of Austria, the city, immigrants or refugee groups, curricular and extracurricular students, and so on. Participants may have seen their own cultural reflection[75] in different musical practices like drumming, singing, or theatre. They may also have seen themselves reflected in other cultures (e.g., with particular teachers or professors), like Kai and Lillian, who were not Austrian, and the choir teacher, who was also a foreigner. However, it is also possible they did not see important cultural aspects of themselves displayed at all, coming from entirely different countries than the choir teacher. This is one of the big challenges of CM, due to changing cultural demographics in the city and university, while adhering to differing attendees from week to week.[76] The culture of university music schools is also a significant consideration when attempting CM endeavors, which may exist in tension with a dominance and prioritization of Western classical art music in these spaces,[77] for instance the pervasive use of standard notation. While this was expressly comfortable for participants in this study, they were all university music students who knew and made use of standard notation extensively. While participants felt the sessions would nonetheless be accessible for others, this cannot be addressed with study data.

Transformation

Bridging connections may result in a broad feeling of trust through cooperation and growing familiarity. For those who had only attended virtual sessions, like Lillian, bridging connections were more challenging to achieve. Karina had been able to draw on connections she had made in-person prior to the shift to virtual workshops. During the in-person sessions, informal conversations (e.g., during water break, pre-session time, ending time), the ability to be an active member of discussions, collective musical activities (e.g., games, singing together, drumming together), and interactivity (e.g., partner activities, small group discussion, musical arrangement, practice time) had helped her make connections.

Ideally, bridging capital results in collective action to mutually benefit all

75. Bernstein, *Pedagogy, Symbolic Control and Identity: Theory, Research, Critique*, 2000, quoted in Wright "Democracy, Social Exclusion and Music Education: Possibilities for Change," 2010.

76. Westerlund, Partti, and Karlsen, Teaching as Improvisational Experience: Student Music Teachers' Reflections on Learning During an Intercultural Project," 2015, 55-75.

77. Andrea Schiavio, van der Shyff, Gande, and Kruse-Weber, "Negotiating Individuality and Collectivity in Community Music. A Qualitative Case Study," 2018, 706-721.

groups involved.[78] Opportunities for meaningful interactions between groups can foster shared identities.[79] The virtual-only nature of the workshops during this study likely hindered these opportunities. Despite the challenges of the virtual workshops, study participants seemed to find meaning in them and continued to attend. It cannot be said whether the group shared a sense of identity, but as Karina reflected, "I want it [the CM workshops], so I really have fun to be a part of it. It's just nice. So, every week I see those people and I get to get to know them a little better."

Bernstein's right of enhancement states that people deserve to have tools for critical reflection, not only for the present, but also for their future.[80] Critical reflection was one goal of the workshops, at least for the students enrolled in it as a course. At the end of each weekly workshop, the students met with the teacher and dialogued in a facilitated reflection. For those not taking the workshop as a course, like Karina, it is unclear the extent of their reflection. Interestingly, Lillian said she was surprised by her own reflective insights during an interview with me. Lillian spoke highly of the drum teacher and reflected about why his process was impactful for her and what she noticed about his pedagogical approach. She noted, "I didn't realize I liked it so much." This suggested to me that reflection (albeit through this study interview) was helpful for her and refined the ways she thought about and articulated her experiences.

The workshops gave participants an opportunity to consider music in ways that broadened beyond the university music school culture. Both participants spoke about program goals as inclusive, flexible, and intended for participation rather than musical perfection. They appreciated this aspect of the program, and though they were aspiring professional musicians participating in an open-level program, they expressed satisfaction with the ways they were still challenged musically. Although the musical challenges they experienced during CM workshops were different than ways their university music studies might challenge them, it likely broadened their overall musicianship.

The right of participation is the right to take part not only in existing structures, but also in those that can be adapted and changed.[81] While the students in the class had opportunities to prepare and execute a short CM teaching opportunity under the guidance of one of the teachers (of their choosing), it was not clear to what extent they were empowered to adapt or make changes to the program or within the workshops. Although this was possible, Karina noted that she wanted to fit her prior lesson into the framework

78. Larsen, Harlan, Bolin, Hackett, Hope, Kirby, Nelson, Rex, and Wolf, "Bonding and Bridging: Understanding the Relationship between Social Capital and Civic Action," 2004.

79. Putnam, "*E Pluribus Unum*: Diversity and Community in the Twenty-First Century; The 2006 Johan Skytte Prize Lecture," 2017.

80. Bernstein, *Pedagogy, Symbolic Control and Identity: Theory, Research, Critique*, 2000.

81. Ibid.

established by the teacher. She also said she would want to be sure she really had something to say before unmuting her mic and offering a thought to the group. In contrast, Karina said she was an active participant in the live discussions of the prior year, where fewer barriers existed to contribute (i.e., freed from the un-mute button and limitations of the meeting platform). Karina, a high achieving musician who appeared to have significant social capital in the CM workshops as a university member (student), former course member, regular attendee, and friend or acquaintance of others in the group, was hesitant to adapt or change existing structures. This may indicate that other community participants with less capital would be all the more hesitant to contribute, even if they had reflective insights that could benefit and increase ownership among the group. This is worth considering however, because Gibson and Gordon point out that CM could positively impact cultural resilience and community vitality.[82] This likely depends on participants' willingness to share their perspectives, particularly when they have less social capital and therefore might offer a very different perspective. Conversely, it is also possible that those less enculturated into the workshop series might actually have *more* proclivity to suggest change or improvement, if, that is, they are willing to share it, as they may not take the norms of the workshop for granted yet, and therefore see different and beneficial possibilities. Not only must participants be willing to share however, but their views must be met with acceptance, respect, and to be valued enough to be deeply considered, which may also be furthered through social capital and bonding and bridging connections.

Conclusions

This was a small study with only four participants. While the limited number of participants allowed me to gain in-depth data on their personal experiences, it also limited the data to unique and situated reflections. These limitations are appropriate in a qualitative study, yet they must be taken into consideration when interpreting findings. Also, all participants were women and university students. Further studies should seek a broader participant group that includes diverse community participants and gender identities. Any conclusions I have drawn from the limited data are not generalizable but may nevertheless be informative in developing future studies. Additionally, this study took place during the COVID-19 pandemic; all workshops and interviews took place virtually. An in-person experience, as noted by participants, would have been different and could have yielded different data. However, as Lillian said, "Look, we're in this situation, let's do with it what we can." While all participants expressed desire for in-person workshops, it could be that these virtual

82. Gibson and Gordon, "Rural Cultural Resourcefulness: How Community Music Enterprises Sustain Cultural Vitality," 2018, 259-270.

workshops were particularly meaningful during this pandemic time, as musical connections—even when only virtual—could take on heightened meanings in times of increased isolation.

Despite these qualifications, some implications may be useful for future studies or similar CM programs. Continuity appears to be a key factor in building bonding capital and perhaps bridging capital as well. Longer-range projects that span months or years and provide multiple kinds of opportunities to connect with others can be helpful in creating varied possibilities for community-building. For example, it might take multiple opportunities to see the same faces before attendees finally speak and connect. Program facilitators like myself, and teachers, must encourage members of groups to recognize commonalities, which we can do in part through facilitating personal musical interactions. Considerations must be made however, about the types of repertoire, pedagogical practices or assumptions, and reflections of culture they therefore provide and communicate as valuable. In order to sensitively consider these factors, of course, the attendees themselves must be taken into account, a difficult feat when membership shifts from week to week. Bridging people, who not only have social capital themselves, but who are also able to share it with others, may be an excellent resource in developing interactions and building familiarity among community members. In this study, students participating as part of a class could perhaps have become bridging ambassadors, purposefully fostering connections among themselves and with others beyond their typical social circles. Personality also may play a role as connections must be genuine, that is motivated by the potential to connect with others, rather than coercion or obligation to do so.

Bridging may be necessary musically as well. While musical skills, preferences, and prior experiences can differ widely, instructors can offer varied possibilities for participation so that participants are able to self-select a comfortable level of participation. It is best to make no assumptions about what people already know, including both of university students and community members. Some university students for example, found some CM activities challenging because the musical skills and practices differed from their everyday practices and therefore challenged them when paced quickly. While they had musical capital, they did not have expertise in all types of musical activities. That is, their musical capital had limitations. All individuals have limitations on their varied sources of capital, and therefore recognition of this fact is an ideal way to create commonalities and acknowledge the diverse strengths and weaknesses in any group. All participants —musically prepared or not—may face moments of challenge or even frustration, and this creates some degree of commonality.

It is important for teachers to get to know participants at each workshop. While some may be repeat attendees, the group as a whole in this study changed weekly. This demands extreme flexibility and a willingness to be vulnerable on the part of teachers. Taking the time to gain a sense of the group every time can inform facilitators about who participants are, what experiences they have had,

and what they hope to gain from the session. At the same time, getting to know participants can foster feelings of acknowledgement, respect, and welcomeness that build rapport and connection.

It is possible some attendees may feel uncomfortable with the technology needed to interact in a virtual workshop. As Lillian noted, organic connections are worthwhile. Members who are comfortable with the technology could build connections with those who need assistance. This initiative would establish a collaborative sense of responsibility and care for one another that focus on the group rather than the individual (How can I help you participate?) Similarly, attendees can welcome, invite, and bring along friends, neighbors, and others from within and beyond the university community, as Lillian and Karina had done in the past.

Opportunities for discussion and reflection were important for participants in this study and could lead to what Bernstein describes as enhancement, and what Putnam notes could result in bridging.[83] While students in the class indeed engaged in weekly reflection and discussion, it could also be instructive to invite (and actively include) community members in these discussions, as well as make use of breakout rooms in order to foster increased informal dialogue and small-group musical exchange that was notably lacking in the virtual workshops.

While these implications are certainly an important starting point, they alone cannot suffice in that they attempt to define others, a potential outcome of hierarchies implicated by social systems that include universities and scientific research. Systems and those who organize them—including university systems—may seek to define those without social capital in a particular space. This can occur despite intentions of inclusion. As Benedict notes, those in power not only tend to define others and their needs, but often control the rhetoric, resources, and terms for helping them as a kind of institutional performance.[84]

The very nature of trying to improve community music without input from the entire community—all types of participants—is itself a problem to acknowledge. Any community without voice is then stripped of its right to participation. In order to seek others' diverse voices and perspectives, however, they must not only be welcomed and included, but actively involved. One can open the door, as well as the floor, by inviting others to share themselves, by giving space for informal connections, and by respecting and valuing diverse opinions, perspectives, repertoire, and practices. With explicit intentions, we are more likely to gain insights that could move musical encounters toward transformation—adapting and changing practices beyond any one (dominating) culture. It is important to build musical community and foster connections

83. Bernstein, Bernstein, *Pedagogy, Symbolic Control and Identity: Theory, Research, Critique*, 2000; Putnam, Putnam, *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community*, 2000.

84. Benedict, "The Social/Cultural Economy of Community Music: Realizing Spectacle," 2008; Illich, *Deschooling Society*, 1972.

beyond one's own sphere. To do so is to enhance our own lives and musicianship as well as to identify and enact shared goals that move communities forward together—not for them, but *with* them.

Bibliography

Bannan, Nicholas. *Music, Language, and Human Evolution*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012.

Benedict, Cathy. "The Social/Cultural Economy of Community Music: Realizing Spectacle." In *CMA XI: Projects, Perspectives, and Conversations; Proceedings from the International Society for Music Education (ISME) 2008 Seminar of the Commission for Community Music Activity*, edited by Don D. Coffman. Tel Aviv: International Society for Music Education, 2008.

Bernstein, Basil. *Pedagogy, Symbolic Control and Identity: Theory, Research, Critique*. Revised Edition. Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 2000.

Bourdieu, Pierre. "The Forms of Capital." In *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education*, edited by John G. Richardson, 241-258. New York: Greenwood, 1986.

Claridge, *What is Bonding Social Capital?* Social Capital Research & Training, January 6, 2018, Available at: https://www.socialcapitalresearch.com/what-is-bonding-social-capital/.

Coffman, Don D. (Ed.) *CMA XI: Projects, Perspectives, and Conversations; Proceedings from the International Society for Music Education (ISME) 2008 Seminar of the Commission for Community Music Activity*. Tel Aviv: International Society for Music Education, 2008.

Creswell, John W., and J. David Creswell. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. 5th Edition. Los Angeles: Sage, 2018.

Dabback, William Murray. "Toward a Model of Adult Music Learning as a Socially-Embedded Phenomenon." PhD Dissertation. University of Rochester, 2007.

Florida, Richard. *The Rise of the Creative Class: And How it's Transforming Work, Leisure, Community and Everyday Life*. New York: Basic Books, 2002.

Gande, Andrea, and Silke Kruse-Weber. "Addressing New Challenges for a Community Music Project in the Context of Higher Music Education: A Conceptual Framework." *London Review of Education* 15, no. 3 (2017): 372-387.

Gibson, Chris, and Andrea Gordon. (2018). "Rural Cultural Resourcefulness: How Community Music Enterprises Sustain Cultural Vitality." *Journal of Rural Studies* 63 (2018): 259-270.

Higgins, Lee. *Community Music: In Theory and in Practice.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012.

Illich, Ivan. *Deschooling Society.* New York: Harrow Books, 1972.

International Society for Music Education. "Community Music Activity Commission (CMA)." ISME Commissions and the ISME Forum.

Johansen, Geir. "*Musikdidaktik* and Sociology." In *Sociology and Music Education*, edited by Ruth Wright. London: Routledge, 2010.

Jones, Patrick M. "Developing Social Capital: A Role for Music Education and Community Music in Fostering Civic Engagement and Intercultural Understanding." In Coffman, *CMA XI*, 130-144.

Kertz-Welzel, Alexandra. "Daring to Question: A Philosophical Critique of Community Music." *Philosophy of Music Education Review* 24, no. 2 (2016): 113-130.

Konewko, Mark. *Actual Connections in a Virtual World: Social Capital of Eric Whitacre's Virtual Choir*. ATINER Conference Paper Series, no. ART2012-0205. Athens: Athens Institute for Education and Research (ATINER), 2012.

Larsen, Larissa, Sharon L. Harlan, Bob Bolin, Edward J. Hackett, Diane Hope, Andrew Kirby, Amy Nelson, Tom R. Rex, and Shaphard Wolf. "Bonding and Bridging: Understanding the Relationship between Social Capital and Civic Action." *Journal of Planning Education and Research* 24, no. 1 (2004): 64–77.

Leglar, Mary A., and David S. Smith. "Community Music in the United States: An Overview of Origins and Evolution." *International Journal of Community Music* 3, no. 3 (2010): 343-354.

Phelan, Helen. "Practice, Ritual and Community Music: Doing as Identity." *International Journal of Community Music* 1, no. 2 (2008): 143-158.

Pitts, Stephanie. *Valuing Musical Participation*. Hampshire, UK: Ashgate Publishing, 2005.

Putnam, Robert D. *Making Democracy Work: Civic Traditions in Modern Italy.* Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993.

____. *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 2000.

____. "*E Pluribus Unum*: Diversity and Community in the Twenty-First Century; The 2006 Johan Skytte Prize Lecture." *Scandinavian Political Studies* 30, no. 2 (2007): 137-174.

Schiavio, Andrea, Dylan van der Shyff, Andrea Gande, and Silke Kruse-Weber. "Negotiating Individuality and Collectivity in Community Music. A Qualitative Case Study." *Psychology of Music* 47, no. 5 (2018): 706-721.

Schippers, Huib, and Brydie-Leigh Barleet. "The Nine Domains of Community Music: Exploring the Crossroads of Formal and Informal Music Education." *International Journal of Music Education* 31, no. 4 (2013): 454-471.

Silverman, Marissa. "Community Music and Social Justice: Reclaiming Love." In *The Oxford Handbook of Music Education*, edited by Gary E. McPherson and Graham F. Welch, 2: 155–167. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012.

Skocpol, Theda. *Diminished Democracy: From Membership to Management in American Civic Life.* Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2003.

Small, Christopher G. *Music, Society, Education: An Examination of the Function of Music in Western, Eastern and African Cultures with its Impact on Society and its Use in Education.* Hanover, CT: Wesleyan University Press, 1977.

Stige, Brynjulf, Gary Ansdell, Cochavit Elefant, and Mercédès Pavlicevic. *Where Music Helps: Community Music Therapy in Action and Reflection*. Abingdon, England: Routledge, 2016. First Published in 2010 by Ashgate (England). ProQuest Ebook Central.

Stolle, Dietlind, Stuart Soroka, and Richard Johnston. "When Does Diversity Erode Trust? Neighborhood Diversity, Interpersonal Trust and the Mediating Effect of Social Interactions." *Political Studies* 56, no. 1 (2008): 57-75.

The Expert Council for Integration. *Integration Report 2019: Integration in Austria—Statistics, Developments, Priorities.* Vienna: Expert Council for Integration, 2019.

Veblen, Kari K. "The Many Ways of Community Music." *International Journal of Community Music* 1, no. 1 (2007): 5-21.

Westerlund, Heidi, Heidi Partti, and Sidsel Karlsen. "Teaching as Improvisational Experience: Student Music Teachers' Reflections on Learning During an Intercultural

Project." *Research Studies in Music Education* 37, no. 1 (2015): 55-75.
Womack, Helen. *Vienna Learns the Benefit of Giving Warm Welcome to Refugees*. UNHCR, December 12, 2018.
Wright, Ruth. "Democracy, Social Exclusion and Music Education: Possibilities for Change." In *Sociology and Music Education*, edited by Ruth Wright, 263-282. London: Routledge, 2010.