

Athens Journal of History

Quarterly Academic Periodical, Volume 10, Issue 4, October 2024

URL: <https://www.athensjournals.gr/ajhis>

Email: journals@atiner.gr

e-ISSN: 2407-9677 DOI: 10.30958/ajhis



Front Pages

MARTINHO ALVES DA COSTA JUNIOR

Maurício Wellisch: A Forgotten Modern in Brazil

KARUBAKI DATTA

Entangled in Regional Geopolitics - Tibetans in the Special Frontier Force of India

ILKSOY ASLIM

The United States Role of the Occurrence of Violence in Cyprus

ANETA LIWERSKA-GARSTECKA

The Role of Incubation in Ancient Greek Asklepieions

Athens Journal of History

Published by the Athens Institute for Education and Research (ATINER)

Editors

- Dr. Steven Oberhelman, Vice President of International Programs, ATINER & Professor of Classics, Holder of the George Sumey Jr Endowed Professorship of Liberal Arts, and Associate Dean, Texas A&M University, USA.

Editorial & Reviewers' Board

<https://www.athensjournals.gr/ajhis/eb>

Administration of the Journal

1. Vice President of Publications: Dr Zoe Boutsoli
2. General Managing Editor of all ATINER's Publications: Ms. Afrodete Papanikou
3. ICT Managing Editor of all ATINER's Publications: Mr. Kostas Spyropoulos
4. Managing Editor of this Journal: Dr. Aleksandra Tryniecka

ATINER is an Athens-based World Association of Academics and Researchers based in Athens. ATINER is an independent and non-profit Association with a Mission to become a forum where Academics and Researchers from all over the world can meet in Athens, exchange ideas on their research and discuss future developments in their disciplines, as well as engage with professionals from other fields. Athens was chosen because of its long history of academic gatherings, which go back thousands of years to Plato's Academy and Aristotle's Lyceum. Both these historic places are within walking distance from ATINER's downtown offices. Since antiquity, Athens was an open city. In the words of Pericles, Athens "...is open to the world, we never expel a foreigner from learning or seeing". ("Pericles' Funeral Oration", in Thucydides, The History of the Peloponnesian War). It is ATINER's mission to revive the glory of Ancient Athens by inviting the World Academic Community to the city, to learn from each other in an environment of freedom and respect for other people's opinions and beliefs. After all, the free expression of one's opinion formed the basis for the development of democracy, and Athens was its cradle. As it turned out, the Golden Age of Athens was in fact, the Golden Age of the Western Civilization. Education and (Re)searching for the 'truth' are the pillars of any free (democratic) society. This is the reason why Education and Research are the two core words in ATINER's name.

The *Athens Journal of History (AJHIS)* is an Open Access quarterly double-blind peer reviewed journal and considers papers from all areas of history. Many of the papers published in this journal have been presented at the various conferences sponsored by the [History Unit](#) of the Athens Institute for Education and Research (ATINER). All papers are subject to ATINER's [Publication Ethical Policy and Statement](#).

The Athens Journal of History

ISSN NUMBER: 2407-9677 - DOI: 10.30958/ajhis

Volume 10, Issue 4, October 2024

Download the entire issue ([PDF](#))

<u>Front Pages</u>	i-viii
<u>Maurício Wellisch: A Forgotten Modern in Brazil</u> <i>Martinho Alves da Costa Junior</i>	275
<u>Entangled in Regional Geopolitics - Tibetans in the Special Frontier Force of India</u> <i>Karubaki Datta</i>	291
<u>The United States Role of the Occurrence of Violence in Cyprus</u> <i>Ilksoy Aslim</i>	307
<u>The Role of Incubation in Ancient Greek Asklepieions</u> <i>Aneta Liwerska-Garstecka</i>	323

Athens Journal of History

Editorial and Reviewers' Board

Editors

- **Dr. Steven Oberhelman**, Vice President of International Programs, ATINER & Professor of Classics, Holder of the George Sumey Jr Endowed Professorship of Liberal Arts, and Associate Dean, Texas A&M University.

Editorial Board

- Dr. Nicholas Pappas, Vice President of Academic Membership, ATINER & Professor of History, Sam Houston University, USA.
- Dr. David Philip Wick, Director, Humanities & Education Division, ATINER & Professor of History, Gordon College, USA.
- Dr. Jayoung Che, Head, History Unit, ATINER & Deputy Director of Research, Korean Academy of Greek Studies, South Korea.
- Dr. Edward Anson, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor, University of Arkansas, USA.
- Dr. Romeo-Victor Ionescu, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor, Dunarea de Jos University, Romania.
- Dr. George Kaloudis, Academic Member, ATINER & Professor, Rivier College, USA.
- Dr. Sara Estrella Gil-Ramos, Academic Member, ATINER & Adjunct Professor, Art & History Department, New Jersey City University, USA.
- Dr. Michael Eisman, Academic Member, ATINER & Associate Professor, Temple University, USA.
- Dr. Margit Linder, Academic Member, ATINER & Assistant Professor, Department of Ancient History and Archaeology, University of Graz, Austria.
- Dr. Moshe Gat, Professor Emeritus, Bar Ilan University, Israel.

- **General Managing Editor of all ATINER's Publications:** Ms. Afrodete Papanikou
- **ICT Managing Editor of all ATINER's Publications:** Mr. Kostas Spyropoulos
- **Managing Editor of this Journal:** Dr. Aleksandra Tryniecka ([bio](#))

Reviewers' Board

[Click Here](#)

President's Message

All ATINER's publications including its e-journals are open access without any costs (submission, processing, publishing, open access paid by authors, open access paid by readers etc.) and is independent of presentations at any of the many small events (conferences, symposiums, forums, colloquiums, courses, roundtable discussions) organized by ATINER throughout the year and entail significant costs of participating. The intellectual property rights of the submitting papers remain with the author. Before you submit, please make sure your paper meets the [basic academic standards](#), which includes proper English. Some articles will be selected from the numerous papers that have been presented at the various annual international academic conferences organized by the different divisions and units of the Athens Institute for Education and Research. The plethora of papers presented every year will enable the editorial board of each journal to select the best, and in so doing produce a top-quality academic journal. In addition to papers presented, ATINER will encourage the independent submission of papers to be evaluated for publication.

The current issue is the fourth of the tenth volume of the *Athens Journal of History (AJHIS)*, published by the [History Unit](#) of ATINER.

Gregory T. Papanikos
President
ATINER



Athens Institute for Education and Research

*A World Association of Academics and
Researchers*

23rd Annual International Conference on History & Archaeology: From Ancient to Modern, 2-5 June 2025, Athens, Greece

The [History Unit](#) of ATINER, will hold its **23rd Annual International Conference on History & Archaeology: From Ancient to Modern 2-5 June 2025, Athens, Greece** sponsored by the [Athens Journal of History](#). The aim of the conference is to bring together scholars and students of all areas of history, archaeology and other related disciplines. You may participate as a stream leader, presenter of one paper, chair of a session or observer. Please submit a proposal using the form available (<https://www.atiner.gr/2025/FORM-HIS.doc>).

Important Dates

- Abstract Submission: **29 October 2024**
- Acceptance of Abstract: 4 Weeks after Submission
- Submission of Paper: **5 May 2025**

Academic Members Responsible for the Conference

- Dr. Steven Oberhelman, Professor of Classics, Holder of the George Sumey Jr Endowed Professorship of Liberal Arts, and Associate Dean, Texas A&M University, USA, USA, Vice President of International Programs, ATINER and Editor of the Athens Journal of History.
- Dr. Nicholas Pappas, Vice President of Academic Membership, ATINER & Professor of History, Sam Houston University, USA.
- Dr. David Philip Wick, Director, Arts and Humanities Division & Professor of History, Gordon College, USA.
- Dr. Jayoung Che, Head, History Unit, ATINER & Deputy Director of Research, Korean Academy of Greek Studies, South Korea.
- Dr. Tatiana Tsakirovoulou-Summers, Director, Athens Center for Classical & Byzantine Studies (ACCBS) & Associate Professor, The University of Alabama, USA.

Social and Educational Program

The Social Program Emphasizes the Educational Aspect of the Academic Meetings of Atiner.

- Greek Night Entertainment (This is the official dinner of the conference)
- Athens Sightseeing: Old and New-An Educational Urban Walk
- Social Dinner
- Mycenae Visit
- Exploration of the Aegean Islands
- Delphi Visit
- Ancient Corinth and Cape Sounion

Conference Fees

Conference fees vary from 400€ to 2000€
Details can be found at: <https://www.atiner.gr/fees>



Athens Institute for Education and Research

*A World Association of Academics and
Researchers*

18th Annual International Conference on Literature 2-5 June 2025

The [Literature Unit](#) of ATINER is organizing its 18th Annual International Conference on Literature, 2-5 June 2025, Athens, Greece sponsored by the [Athens Journal of Philology](#). The aim of the conference is to bring together academics and researchers from all areas of literature and other related disciplines. You may participate as stream leader, presenter of one paper, chair of a session or observer. Please submit a proposal using the form available (<https://www.atiner.gr/2025/FORM-LIT.doc>).

Important Dates

- Abstract Submission: 29 October 2024
- Acceptance of Abstract: 4 Weeks after Submission
- Submission of Paper: 5 May 2025

Academic Member Responsible for the Conference

- **Dr. Stamos Metzidakis**, Head, [Literature Research Unit](#), ATINER & Emeritus Professor of French and Comparative Literature, Washington University in Saint Louis, USA.

Social and Educational Program

The Social Program Emphasizes the Educational Aspect of the Academic Meetings of Atiner.

- Greek Night Entertainment (This is the official dinner of the conference)
- Athens Sightseeing: Old and New-An Educational Urban Walk
- Social Dinner
- Mycenae Visit
- Exploration of the Aegean Islands
- Delphi Visit
- Ancient Corinth and Cape Sounion

More information can be found here: <https://www.atiner.gr/social-program>

Conference Fees

Conference fees vary from 400€ to 2000€
Details can be found at: <https://www.atiner.gr/fees>

Maurício Wellisch: A Forgotten Modern in Brazil

By *Martinho Alves da Costa Junior**

This article aims to give visibility to the work of Mauricio Wellisch (1904-1961). An artist active in the first decades of the 20th century, Wellisch stood out especially with his illustrations. He participated in exhibitions as a painter and was a prolific chronicler and critic of the arts. Graduated in law in 1925, he soon embarked on a political career, working continuously at Itamaraty. A career diplomat, he served in numerous cities, such as Antwerp, Prague, etc. During this period, he moved away from his brushes, remaining, however, faithful to writing in a continuous approach to culture and arts in the places he visited. For this work we will focus the analysis on two periodicals, Phoenix and Boletim de Ariel. The first, published between 1924 and 1926, whose proposal was to establish a direction, perceive and act in a post-war world, rising from the ashes through the arts. In addition to Wellisch, the periodical was illustrated by Ismael Nery, Oswaldo Teixeira, A, Voigt, Lleux, among others. In specific cases like Lleux or Voigt the aesthetic is close to that of Mauricio Wellisch.

Foreword

This paper showcases the work of Maurício von Wellisch (1904-1961). The dates on the few remaining notes about the artist are full of controversies. In general, 1905 is considered his most probable birth year, and the year of his death has always been unknown. However, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs archives¹ point out that his date of birth was September 4, 1904. Wellisch was very active in the first decades of the 20th century, gaining particular prominence due to his illustrations. He was showcased in painting exhibitions and was a prolific chronicler and art critic. Nonetheless, his name does not appear in the annals or compendiums of Brazilian modern art history, despite being considered a major force by his peers at the time. This ostracism surrounding Wellisch's name is partially due to his professional choices. He graduated in Law in 1925 and soon embarked on a political career, working continuously at Itamaty, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. He was a career diplomat and served in numerous cities, including Antwerp and Prague. During this period, he laid the painting brushes down but remained faithful to his writing, which incorporated a less artistic vein; he kept drawing from his continuous exposure to the cultures and works of art from the places he visited.

*Professor, Federal University of Juiz de Fora, Brazil.

1. Available in <http://memoria.bn.br/DocReader/764000/3237>. The confusion regarding the year 1905 is likely the result of some documents referring to it as a “probable date”.

The 1920s and 1930s were fundamental for Wellisch and his intense activity in the cultural scene. Two major periodicals described his interests and the characteristics of his work: *Phoenix* and *Boletim de Ariel*, which were undoubtedly the two that most often included the author's contribution in their pages. The first one, published between 1924 and 1926, sought to guide, perceive, and act in a post-war world, using the arts as the stepping stone to rise back from the ashes. In addition to Wellisch, the *Phoenix* was illustrated by prominent names, including Ismael Nery, Oswaldo Teixeira, A, Voigt, and Lleux.

Wellisch's works are clearly linked to his peers, and in specific cases, e.g., Lleux or Voigt, in which the aesthetics are more similar; however, as we will discuss herein, his illustrations hold a certain degree of singularity. It is also possible to link the showcasing of Wellisch's illustrations in *Phoenix* with his writings for the *Boletim de Ariel*, which circulated between 1931 and 1939. His pieces mention renowned names, such as Murilo Mendes and Mario Pedrosa, among many others. In *Boletim de Ariel*, he published his thoughts on art, especially the European scene he experienced from 1925 onwards, as well as theater, dance, and politics; he also advocated for cinema at a time when it was not widely accepted and was still frowned upon as an art medium. Therefore, studying these two periodicals is essential to understanding Wellisch's work and his predominantly melancholic views.

First Appearances

As mentioned previously, Wellisch is rarely mentioned when thinking narrowly or even broadly about the arts and culture of the 1920s and 1930s. At the same time, it is important to highlight that his professional life distanced him from being perceived as solely an artist. Wellisch graduated in Law in 1925 and left for Paris that same year. His main intention during the trip, which lasted two years, was to advance his artistic studies. Upon his return, he wrote an article with clear nods to the modern views he was surrounded by during the period:

The moment is fleeting, time runs, time flies!... Let us live with intensity, the intensity of the present time!... Paris is still the beacon that shines a light on our current life. The "carrefour du monde" is the "rendez-vous" point of all intellectual currents and the faucet of pleasure of all sorts around the world. A formidable turbine that concentrates all energies and transforms them into the greatest forces.²

His euphoric impressions of that environment, to which he adds, "The war, above all, dramatically increased the speed of our current lives", are aligned with the mechanical, productivity-focused, and modern way of thinking. And perhaps

2. Wellisch, Maurício. "A inquietação espiritual da Europa hoje". In *O Jornal*, July 3, 1927.

this image of Europe as a cultural catalyst remains ingrained in the author's spirit, as demonstrated by his brief relationship with Érico Veríssimo.³ Wellisch seems dazzled and optimistic about the moment. At the time, the artist enjoyed a certain level of renown:

Mr. Maurício Wellisch is widely known in our society and our intellectual circles. His name is well-regarded among our cultured and elegant people. Mr. Wellisch is a lawyer and a writer, but above all an artist of exquisite sensitivity. Rio is very aware of the beautiful decorative drawings that he has spread across the colored pages of our magazines and is also familiar with his beautiful paintings, which are a clear testimony of an artist with a unique and personal temperament.⁴

In a certain way, his peers at the time shared a general and generous view of Wellisch. One of the more emblematic registers of this was written by Afonso Arinos de Melo Franco, who mentioned his relationship with the artist in his memoir titled *A alma do tempo: memórias*:

From St.-Gall, we went to Zurich, where I wanted to visit my long-time friend, Maurício Wellisch, who was acting as the consul there. In my view, Maurício is one of the most brilliant, albeit frustrated, intellectuals of my generation. His talent for painting was renowned around the 1920s. He wrote admirably, as demonstrated by his long letters to his friends. He was one of the early enthusiasts of the modernist revolution in the visual arts and literature. However, there was always some level of misalignment between him and his environment (including his family environment during his youth), and a *s'en fichisme* with more despair than disbelief. His complicated, sensitive, dissatisfied spirit might have interfered with his intelligence, which became hesitant before the spectacle of life, between mockery and revolt, an ancestral ache from his persecuted race. Maurício Wellisch was one of those who were more influential than productive; or rather, those whose influence is felt deeper than the importance of their production. He had talent, taste, and culture to a distinguished degree. He left nothing important after his long, painful death. I was one of the few who realized how much Maurício had to give; how much he shared what he never had.⁵

We will later comment on the overwhelming event of his "long, painful death". However, this aspect of non-conformity and his bright spirit seemed to be constantly associated with Wellisch's name. Afonso Arinos comments that Wellisch was more influential than productive, but such statements must be interpreted with some caveats. There is a certain consistency in Wellisch's works, especially from the 1930s onwards. His works of art were undoubtedly few and far

3. This relationship will be addressed in subchapter V.

4. *Idem*.

5. Melo Franco, Afonso Arinos de. *A alma do tempo: memórias*. Rio de Janeiro: TopBooks, 2018, p. 1004.

between, but his presence in the culture of the time did not diminish. If, on the one hand, illustrations and paintings became increasingly rare, his texts about the state of arts, culture, and the political and cultural ways of life were very present until the last year of his life.

Regarding this aspect, Hernani de Irajá wrote a piece to *Fon-Fon* about Wellisch and painted a beautiful portrait of the artist.



Figure 1. Hernani de Irajá, Maurício Wellisch, 1930. *Fon-Fon*, January 18, 1930, p. 50

Irajá's work portrays a very young Wellisch with a conflict-ridden, restless expression, but he can keep it under control with much effort. Voluminous, scraggly hair. His deep eyes, shaded with melancholy, and a plump, stern mouth show a certain non-conformity reflected by his intense look toward the horizon. A potential future, reachable via winding paths, can be seen in Irajá's portrait of his friend. In the text that accompanies the drawing, the author states:

Without forfeiting the dismantling of excessive innovators, Maurício Wellisch was always a "novice" in painting, a creator of unprecedented hymns to human plasticity. As an illustrator, his aesthetics soon unveiled a very personal trait, fragile in appearance but in fact very powerful as a concept, as *truth in art*.⁶

As Hernani de Irajá states, Wellisch had a moderate voice, "influenced by the two illustration schools: the Spanish and the German". However, the influence of these schools in Wellisch's works is up for debate; he is considered modern but

6. Irajá, Hernani de. "Dentro da arte brasileira: Maurício Wellisch". In *Fon-Fon*, January 18, 1930, p 50.

does not fall under the pressure of exaggeration. Irajá describes him as an extraordinarily conscious and critical but also a powerful and precocious artist.

There is a certain pleasure in browsing the pages of periodicals like *Tico-Tico*, *O Beija-Flor* or *Dom-Quixote* to discover Wellisch as a precocious artist and also someone with a determined, strong will. At the age of 11, he began systematically writing to *O Beija-Flor*, requesting for his drawings or texts to be published. The section dedicated to the reader's letters proves how insistent the young aspiring artist was. There is a reply from September 15: "[...] your little drawing was handed over to the artistic censor of 'O Beija-Flor' and only he can say whether they will be useful for us"⁷. Several issues later, Wellisch was still close to the periodical, as he participated in drawing competitions and sent his works directly to the editorial team.

In June 1916, he received a frustrating reply: "Here are the answers to your request: 1st) Currently, we have an excess of gracious offers [...]". With insistence, in August 1917, a first drawing by Wellisch appeared in the periodical, '*Marinheiros americanos*' (American sailors), accompanied by the following note: "The drawing above was penned by our dear and distinguished little friend Mauricio Wellisch, an alumnus of the Collegio dos revmos. Barnabites Fathers – Catette – Rio de Janeiro". In December 1917, they published two drawings and a short story by Wellisch himself, "*A perseverança ou História d'um regato*" ("Perseverance or The story of a stream"). That would be a mark in Wellisch's trajectory, who kept illustrating his writings and creating new works based on other texts.



Figure 2. Maurício Wellisch, *Marinheiros Americanos*, 1917. *O Beija-Flor*, 1917

7. *O Beija-Flor*, September 1915, issue 17.

In addition to *O Beija-Flor*, young Wellisch sent a contribution rejected by *Dom-Quixote*, "the caption is good, but the drawings still lack firm lines. You drew a hand that looked more like a papaya."⁸ Moreover, after some public persistence, he was also published at the *Tico-Tico* drawing contest 1,287 on June 12, 1918.

The 1920s and 1930s

Wellisch's characteristic and peculiar lines indeed emerged in the 1920s, especially from 1925 onwards. His contributions let go of the experimental and childish style of the final years of the first decade of the 20th century and helped establish him as a clear artist of his time, of a culture with *fin-de-siecle* and decadent tones. That is how he illustrates two of his texts, "Nocturno" (Nocturnal) and "Elegia para a que não retorna..." (Elegy to the one who will not return), for *Ilustração Brasileira*.

In the first one, the level of detail, the clothes, the trees, and the stars in the sky give the drawing a very accentuated decorative trait. The woman with the elongated neck and tired, drowsy eyes has long fingers; her elegance is doleful, and her thoughts seem to weigh her down and slightly curve her back. Powerful images have the power to convey the invisible, and the scene conveys the sense of being on another plane at another time. She seems to be walking and passing by a man wearing a floral cloak. Sitting, his right hand holds his face, while his left hand rests on a cane. His eyes are closed but facing the female figure, and they seem to share similar feelings. From Wellisch's text accompanying his drawing: "The silence... void... dark... amphoric... The night... the wind... the cold... – Far from Earth, standing on my marble balcony, I cast a vague and sad look around [...]". The atmosphere created in the drawing reverberates in the text; however, the illustration further strengthens the solitary and mysterious dimension.

8. "Correspondencia" (Mail). In *Dom-Quixote*. December 24, 1919.



Figure 3. Maurício Wellisch, *Nocturno op. 2*, 1924. *Ilustração Brasileira*, January 1925

In “Elegia para a que não voltara...”. Two female figures are near one another. One sits on the piano bench, sad and facing downwards, while the movement of the lights in her black hair follows the sleeves of her dress. The heavy makeup is intense and jarring. The figure is surrounded by music, with the piano, and by paintings, with the easel facing towards her. None of these arts are evoked at this precise suspended moment; they are only indications. They are even ignored by the figures, who are trapped in their own thoughts. The standing figure is intense and powerful, as shown by her very accentuated neck and chest lines. She uses her right hand to open the curtains a bit more and have a better look at something that the observer cannot, some event seems lost, while sadness and melancholy fill the environment. A side view of an oval portrait at the top-right corner suggests some reading. Published in December 1924, Wellisch's text showcases the relationship between music and melancholy in the illustration: "Afternoon fell, enveloped in veils of melancholy. / A sweet caress in the air... A monotonous cicada... a distant sigh... a star that shines under the light veil of the sunset... / In the silence of the park, the ancient flute of the fountain played silvery harmonies...". Although there are texts paired with these two illustrations, they are also independent, distant, and seem to tell different stories. In any case, they are elements of the same thought, expressed in different ways.

At the same time, since he illustrated several newspapers, Wellisch was also an art and culture critic. In *O Jornal*, in December 1927, he illustrated "Um conto de Natal" (*A Christmas Tale*) by Laura Margarida de Queiroz. A virgin and a boy in an art-deco style, with lights falling on the characters in a geometrical pattern, like theatrically arranged spotlights.

In the same periodical, in 1930, Wellisch published two reproductions of works he had sent to the *Salon d'Automne*, in Paris, *Retrato de Sr. Jack Sampaio, filho do Dr. Carlos Sampaio* (Portrait of Mr. Jack Sampaio, son of Dr. Carlos Sampaio), and *Algeriana* (Algerian woman). The text *Criticando a Crítica* (Criticizing Criticism) is a study, or rather, an essay according to Alain's definition, a type of text that is very present in Wellisch's writings.

Despite those who today attack or despise Wilde's "aestheticism", current critical pieces are permeated, albeit unintentionally, with Wilde's aphorisms. The role of the critic should not be to provide a synthesis but rather an analysis. He must not place himself before the art object 'as an artist before nature', but as a mathematician before a theorem.⁹

Thus, the artist and essayist assesses the work of contemporary critics and, suspicious of the quality of literature or fine arts, refrains from providing any tangible example. The text seems almost abstract. It advances with the same tone:

Alas, ours is a time when currents of opinion are like currents of air; the art is what flows inside it... And above all hover the critics, like a wind, swarming with all the microbes. Summarily supporting or condemning. And everyone deems themselves holder of the right to summarily approve or condemn.¹⁰

Such reading might find echoes today and is part of the very nature of the work of criticism. Wellisch cites some of Alain's books over these years; in fact, his writing is similar to the philosopher's. In *Propos sur les beaux-arts*, Chapter 69 of *La générosité*, Alain states:

To freely judge the sciences, one needs effort; to freely judge the fine arts, one needs courage; because from the moment catalogs or labels no longer guide us, it feels a little too free; I feel sorry for the judge, he will have bad times ahead. [...] Or, let us walk through history; let us dance on the ruins, let us shave the beards of the Gods. The work is poorly paid; but we cannot have everything. Freedom or power, a choice must be made.¹¹

Alain, unlike Wellisch, makes the diagnosis and moves towards a prognosis. On the other end, the artist is left to face a dead end. There is not much salvation, and the artist is condemned to the commonly shallow work of criticism. This taste for a dysphoric world appears in Wellisch's texts from the mid-1930s onwards, as shown below. Over these years, he attended several balls, including the 2nd Spring Ball, the fine arts ball of 1927.

9. Wellisch. Maurício. "Criticando a crítica". In *O Jornal*, March 30, 1930.

10. Idem.

11. Alain. *Propos sur les Beaux-Arts*. Paris : PUF, 1998, pp. 69-70.

Drawings like *Viver como os pássaros... Ou como as flores do campo* denote a period of convergence. If, on the one hand, his works of the time carry a characteristic aesthetic strength and convey a sense of *fin-de-siecle*, they also coexist with geometric aspects of art-deco. The two figures glued together, an amalgam comparable to the strength of *Jupiter et Thétis*, by Ingres, from 1811, or *L'amour des âmes*, by Jean Delville, from 1900. The figures carry the same heavy eyes, filled with sluggishness and melancholy. The strength of the male figure is contrasted with a certain delicacy, with his right arm outstretched, ready to welcome the birds. The nature at the feet of the female figure is mingled with her dress, conveying a very close relationship with nature, a kind of lost Arcadia from a time that is not part of time itself.



Figure 4. Maurício Wellisch, *Viver como os pássaros... ou como as flores do campo*, not dated. Ink on paper, private collection

Phoenix and Boletim de Ariel

As mentioned at the beginning, to better understand Maurício Wellisch's presence, it is necessary to consider his contributions to the periodicals *Phoenix* and *Boletim de Ariel*. These periodicals encompass the artist's main contributions from the 1920s and 1930s, with his illustrations being published in the first and his various texts in the second. *Phoenix* was launched in the backdrop of a post-

war world as a potential way of rising out of the rubble, starting, of course, with culture. The pessimistic, melancholic, and sometimes hopeless and cruel world where forces and efforts are useless and doomed to failure does not seem far off from the period and, above all, from Wellisch. The artist will explore this idea in several of his illustrations for the periodical. He illustrated several issues and was a constant contributor to the magazine in 1924, especially for the first one, published in January. He did not work for *Phoenix* when he went to Europe, in 1925, and only contributed to it again in 1926 (at a much lower frequency).

Wellisch worked intensely on the first issues. He illustrated texts, created the cover and *ex-libris*, as well as designs for sponsors, capital letters, etc. For example, in *Canto da Renúncia* (Renunciation Song), in March 1924, Wellisch drew from this feeling of living in a tired, melancholic, and hopeless world. The line embezzlement and the apparent luxury come close to the immeasurable weight of life or, more pragmatically, of living. This is an illustration of a text by Camargo de Macedo.

"Why do you come so late? I am the priest of the melancholic altars. I will no longer pray in the splendid Christmas masses. I no longer see weddings in my white chapel. The baptismal sponge of the innocent grows dry in my hands. The haloed hand of the Lord descends upon my bald forehead... Why do you come so late?"¹²



Figure 5. Maurício Wellisch, *Canto da Renúncia*. 1924. *Phoenix*, March 1924

The image shows a tired, burdened priest, lost in introspection. He is weary of the world and carries out his role without intent or purpose. His left arm hangs with a ring on the long finger, and the immeasurable pressure of gravity is perceivable. The figure is light and, at the same time, weighs heavily on the

12. Macedo, Camargo de. "Canto da renúncia". In *Phoenix*. March 1924.

ground. The right arm stretches towards the trident-like chandelier before him, releasing smoke that transforms into decorative motifs.



Figure 6. Maurício Wellisch, *O homem da multidão*. 1924. *Phoenix*, April 1924

In *O homem da multidão* (The man in the crowd), Wellisch uses a particular tone and presents a personal interpretation of the short story by José Geraldo Vieira. At the center of the illustration, the man in the crowd is elegant and charming. He is surrounded by mysterious and suggestive characters, flanked by two naked female figures whose private parts are whimsically hidden by their long hair. Sitting on an improvised throne, his feet are next to women's heads or, more appropriately, entities from another plane, whose hair vibrates like flames. At the center is an effigy, an apparition that truly concentrates the lines and energies of the drawing.

Wellisch's illustrations in *Phoenix* also included texts that were not necessarily published. Like *O DOM* (THE GIFT), based on the homonymous short story by Marcel Schowb, from his book *Cœur Double*. The author – who to this day is little published – was one of the major forces of symbolist French literature, and the proximity of his writings to Maurício Wellisch is noteworthy.¹³

13. Sylvain Goudemare's studies are the key to understanding Schowb's presence. More specifically, see the biography *Marcel Schowb or Les vies imaginaires, biographie*. Paris: Le Cherche-Midi, 2000. And the preface of *Oeuvres*, published by Phébus in 2002, "Comment était faite l'lampe d'Alladin?". Pp.12-21.

Even if Wellisch immediately left for Paris after his studies, the most prominent influence in his art did not come from the island of Saint-Louis. In the quote mentioned above by Hernani de Irajá, the author points out how Germany and Spain served as "inspirations" for the artist. It is, in fact, likely that they acted as his beacons. However, a closer analysis of von Stuck, Lovis Corinth, or Chicharro's engravings shows more differences than true convergences. Nonetheless, his work philosophy seems to find more like-minded individuals among the English. Due to their well-defined lines, ambiguous and mysterious figures could appear alongside the drawings and engravings of Adolf Gustav Mossa. However, compared to others, like Aubrey Beardsley, the drawings seem to brighten up. Works like *Venus between Terminal Gods*, of 1895, are proof of this. The engravings based on the *Tannhäuser* have more decorative elements, other cultures, and synthetic lines. However, in addition to Beardsley, who seems to be his main influence, artists like Jessie Marion King, Eric Gill, or William Thomas Horton (all active between the end of the 19th century and the first decades of the 20th century) are each intense in their own way and connected to what Wellisch accomplished in those years.

The yearnings of *Boletim de Ariel* were deeply literary, at least in the issues between 1931 and 1939 (resuming years later, between 1973 and 1977). The *Boletim* is one among several publishing houses that released their own periodicals. Tania Regina de Luca comments on the purpose behind the *Boletim*:

Texts with a more general approach to painting, cinema, literature, and biographical curiosities, in addition to excerpts from chapters, also appeared with some frequency, as well as notes on awards, such as those offered by the Sociedade Felipe d'Oliveira or the prestigious Humberto de Campos, instituted in 1936 by Editora José Olympio, which selected one unpublished book per year. However, literary production was incorporated into the *Boletim* a bit later, from the sixth issue onwards (from October/ 1934 to September/1935); from that moment forward, four pages were reserved for fictional works. Sometimes, part of the issue was dedicated to specific authors, whether due to death or a celebration of centenaries, e.g., for João Ribeiro or Goethe.¹⁴

Wellisch contributed to the periodic with essays, reviews, and chronicles. At an important period in the author's life, he established himself at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Itamaraty, and was constantly traveling. In one of his first chronicles in the periodical, writing on the topic of love and taking inspiration from João do Rio, he describes a pessimistic trajectory full of dead ends, like in his illustrations for the *Phoenix*.

14. Luca, Tania Regina de. "Periódicos lançados por editoras: o caso do Boletim de Ariel (1931-1939)". In *Revista História*. V. 36 issue 32. 2017, p. 10.

All love is easily tyrannical. Wherever there is love, there is hidden hate, which will not fail to explode as soon as love turns into passion. For those in love, this soon becomes the truth or, at least, what they believe to be their truth [...] What is the biggest mistake of one who fell in love? Because, on the one hand, they focus their entire spirit towards it, thus generating love from an act of will, regardless of the fatality of passions; on the other hand, the person no longer sees their beloved "but, in its place, an idol, which they dress up, consider divine, and believe in..."¹⁵

However, in these somewhat troubled years and with an evident change of perspective for Maurício Wellisch with the advancement of his work at Itamaraty (notably the commercial relations between Brazil and several countries), the tone of his writings became more optimistic. Far from the hopelessness that marked the 1920s, his eyes were directed toward a brighter, more euphoric world.

Abroad, the evolution of Brazilian intelligence has been followed and referred to by sincere friends of our country (which are more numerous than we think) in books, articles, and reports written by the most renowned intellectuals. In France, Luc Dartain is our best advertiser [...].¹⁶

Wellisch's writings are also innovative and convey a crystal clear way of thinking. In the August 1938 issues, he discussed cinema in a text titled *O Filosofo e a lanterna mágica* (The Philosopher and the magic lantern). More specifically, cinema as art, a key topic for the medium that, not without controversy, was seen as a potential candidate of high praise. In the text, the author even opposes Alain, who, as we have seen, was one of his inspirations. While the French philosopher struggled to neutralize the artistic force of cinema, Wellisch had no doubts. "In truth, cinematographic and theatrical spectacles do not belong to the same plane; Cinema is not an essentially dramatic art, but a visual one [...] It is not about participation [of the spectator] but rather communion".¹⁷

Tenacious Writing

After growing accustomed to a different world, the Paris of the 1920s, Wellisch took up another position in a diametrically different place, the United States in the years between 1942 to 1945. He was invited by Stanford University

15. Wellisch, Maurício. "Meditações sobre as causas e os efeitos". In *Boletim de Ariel*. December/1932.

16. Wellisch, Maurício. "Depoimentos estrangeiros sobre o Brasil novo". In *Boletim de Ariel*. September 1938.

17. Wellisch, Maurício. "O Filosofo e a lanterna magica". In *Boletim de Ariel*. August 1938.

in Palo Alto to teach a Portuguese course.¹⁸ He found himself in the United States in 1944 with Érico Veríssimo. Veríssimo was invited to teach Brazilian Literature at the University of Berkeley. He wrote two books about his stay, *Gato preto em campo de neve* (Black cat in a field of snow, 1941) and *A volta do gato preto* (The return of the black cat, 1947). In the latter, he wrote a few lines about Wellisch and the antagonistic world between them seems clear:

March 6. Today, I was introduced to Maurício Wellisch, vice-consul of Brazil in San Francisco. We talked for some time, and I found out that our opinions on politics, art, literature, and life in general differ greatly. It's as if he was on one side of the San Francisco Bay and I was on the other, trying to communicate in signs to no avail. [...] Wellisch is one of those intellectuals who saw Paris "in the good old days" – and this enchanted vision still haunts him, preventing him from adapting to other lands, other ways of life.¹⁹

Their opposite worldviews and very distant perceptions prevented them from keeping in contact. Veríssimo is one of the few who described Wellisch as someone we could consider alienated, trapped in a now impossible past. During these years, Wellisch contributed to *A manhã* with several translations.

His collaborations with periodicals were unrelenting until the 1960s. On January 31, 1960, in an article for the *Correio da Manhã*, he wrote some sensitive and vivid reflections on Prague.

Unlike Paris and Zurich, Prague, a foggy, sooty, introverted city, welcomes visitors with much more modesty. The city airport is timid, like someone who apologizes to the well-dressed foreigner for welcoming him while poorly dressed. Prague reminds us of an impoverished grand lord who, in his ancient mansion, only had two modernized rooms left to accommodate his guests: two large hotels with a Western level of comfort. And with a fashion show in one of them, over Sunday tea, to the sound of a muted orchestra...²⁰

It is one of the last known texts by Wellisch. The notes from 1961 are not encouraging: he was worn down by an illness and returned to Brazil in a hurry after suffering for months.

18. A MANHÃ. November 29, 1942, p. 9.

19. Veríssimo, Érico. *A volta do gato preto*. São Paulo: Companhia das Letras. 2007, pp. 132-133.

20. Wellisch, Maurício. "Praga, a cidade dourada". In *Correio da manhã*. January 31, 1960. There is another essay published in *Jornal do Brasil*, July 12, 1961, titled "Ah! Como a vida é cotidiana!" (Oh! How mundane life is!), which uses a tone and tackles a topic that is somewhat reminiscent of a young Wellisch. This was Wellisch's last writing out of the ones that have been found.

Due to the need to hasten his return to Switzerland, from where he will depart on a Panair do Brasil SA plane on Wednesday, the 6th of this month at 9:40 pm, flight number 22, and due to the impossibility of saying goodbye in person to the countless friends and colleagues who would comfort him with their visits to the hospital where he spent four months in this city, he gives his sincere thanks for these manifestations of faithful friendship, which have deeply moved him.²¹

A note dated October 1, 1961, confirms the grieving: "Brazilian diplomat Mauricio Wellisch passed away. The deceased, who was 56 years old, was consul general of his country in this city from 1955 to 1959 [...] Mr. Wellisch passed away in a nursing home in this city after a long illness."²²

Wellisch's works in fine arts or literature compose a homogeneous whole. His trajectory was accompanied by transformations or paradigm shifts connected to the cultural moments he lived through. *Phoenix* and *Boletim de Ariel*, among many other periodicals, are a testament to the strength of his thoughts and his pencil, forged in a very personal way, without a clear-cut set of shared groups or ideals.

Bibliography

- Alain. *Propos sur les beaux-arts*. (Comments on fine arts.) Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1998.
- _____. *Vingt leçons sur les beaux-arts*. (Twenty lessons on fine arts.) Paris: Gallimard, 1931.
- Dom-Quixote. "Correspondencia". (Correspondence.) December 24, 1919.
- Funcionarios do Ministerio Das Relações Exteriores. Rio de Janeiro, issue 0001, 1938.
- Goudemare, S. *Marcel Showb ou Les vies imaginaires, biographie*. (Marcel Showb or Imaginary lives, biography.) Paris: Le cherche-Midi, 2000.
- Irajá, de H. "Dentro da arte brasileira: Mauricio Wellisch". (Inside Brazilian art: Mauricio Wellisch.) In *Fon-Fon*, January 18, 1930.
- Luca, de T.R. (2017). "Periódicos lançados por editoras: o caso do Boletim de Ariel (1931-1939)". (Periodicals launched by publishers: the case of Boletim de Ariel (1931-1939).) *Revista História* 36, no. 32 (2017).
- Macedo, de C. (1924). "Canto da renúncia." (Chant of renunciation.) In *Phoenix*. March 1924.
- Melo Franco, de A.A. (2018). *A alma do tempo: memórias*. (The soul of time: memories.) Rio de Janeiro: TopBooks, 2018.
- Navarro, de S. *La danse des symboles*. (The dance of symbols.) Translated by Translation by Fran Marwell. Paris: Les éditions mazarines, 1936.
- O Beija-Flor, September 1915, issue 17.
- Schowb, M. *Ceuvres*. (Works.) Paris: Éditions Phébus, 2002.
- Veríssimo, É. *A volta do gato preto*. (The return of the black cat.) São Paulo: Companhia das Letras, 2007.

21. Correio da Manhã. September 5, 1961.

22. Jornal do Comércio. October 1, 1961.

- Wellisch, M. "A inquietação espiritual da Europa hoje." (Europe's spiritual restlessness today.) In *O Jornal*, July 03, 1927.
- _____. "Criticando a crítica". (Criticizing criticism.) In *O Jornal*, March 30, 1930.
- _____. "Meditações sobre as causas e os efeitos." (Meditations on causes and effects.) In *Boletim de Ariel*. December/1932.
- _____. "Depoimentos estrangeiros sobre o Brasil novo." (Foreign statements about the new Brazil.) In *Boletim de Ariel*. September 1938.
- _____. "O Philosopho e a lanterna magica." (The Philosopho and the magic lantern.) In *Boletim de Ariel*. August 1938.
- _____. "Praga, a cidade dourada." (Prague, the golden city.) In *Correio Da Manhã*. September 5, 1961.
- _____. "Ah! Como a vida é cotidiana!" (Oh! How mundane life is!). *Jornal Do Comércio*, Oct. (1961).

Entangled in Regional Geopolitics - Tibetans in the Special Frontier Force of India

By Karubaki Datta*

The Special Frontier Force (S.F.F.) was raised by the Intelligence Bureau of India in the immediate aftermath of the Indo China war of 1962. Initially composed of Tibetan youths, it was known as the Establishment 22. Records indicate that it was raised by India in coordination with US intelligence Agency, the C.I.A. and with full endorsement of Washington. The force was trained by C.I.A., among other things to collect intelligence from across India's China border with the help of electronic devices. The C.I.A. patronage was gradually withdrawn after 1964. In India, the force was commissioned to action in Chittagong Hill tracts in 1971, on the eve of Indo Pakistan War over Bangladesh issue. Later they took part in Operation Bluestar in Punjab and fought in the war of Kargil in 1999. Their activities and operations had so far been kept under total secret. Recently they were employed by the Government of India in the border faceoff with China in Ladakh in August 2020. The death of Nyima Tenzin of S.S.F. turned the spotlight on them and their sacrifice was highlighted. The importance of the S.F.F. in India's security set up has to be understood in the context of the regional geopolitics and India's Tibet policy. The force was raised in the era of Cold war when the C.I.A. was helping the Tibetan resistant warriors, the Chushi Gandruk, fighting from Mustang in Nepal. India, too was ready to help them even if covertly, to get back Tibet's political status. Raising of the force gave not only a job opportunity to the Tibetan refugee youths but served their nationalist aspirations and suited India's need of a trained mountain force post 1962 to combat China in the Himalayan region. But following the withdrawal of the C.I.A., Sino US rapprochement in the 1970s and the subsequent end of the Cold War, the priorities changed in the US and India's policy towards China also went through several phases. The recent deterioration of relations with China has once again brought Tibetan issue to the limelight. India's recognition of the S.F.F. actions in the war indicates how India, in order to put pressure on China is giving space to the Tibetan CTA (The Government in Exile, in India) and the Tibetans in S.F.F. The Tibetans have not been able to achieve independence but they are now being used in the political rivalry of the two regional powers.

Introduction

The Special Frontier Force of India, composed basically of Tibetan refugee youths, was formed in 1962 and it continues to be an elite military force in the high altitudes of the Himalayas. History of this force is multi-dimensional and has to be understood in the particular historical context of the period. The International political scenario of this era of Cold War, geo politics of the region and India's own security concerns born out of military vulnerability vis a vis

*Professor, Centre for Himalayan Studies, University of North Bengal, India.

China provided the rationale behind the formation of this special armed force. Inherent in the history of this force is also the gradual evolution of India's Tibet policy.

After maintaining a policy of non-interference in Sino Tibetan relations in the 1950s when newly emerged Communist China asserted political supremacy over Tibet, independent India under P.M. Jawaharlal Nehru actually tried to develop friendly ties with China on the basis of the concept of *Hindi Chini Bhai Bhai*, i.e., Sino Indian brotherhood and the Buddhist principles of *Panchsheel*. The relations changed drastically when, following an uprising against the Chinese in Lhasa in March 1959, India opened her doors to the Dalai Lama when He fled His motherland followed by about 80,000 refugees from Tibet. Accepting Dalai Lama as an honoured guest on humanitarian grounds, India allowed Him to settle down in India with his countrymen and even to set up His Government in Exile. Policies were undertaken to allot lands for Tibetan refugee settlements, arrange jobs for the refugees and setting up of schools for the children. China was naturally irked by the developments and these, coupled with the border problems culminated into the 1962 Sino Indian war. Unprepared for the turn of events, India was badly thrashed in the war. Regarded as a foreign policy failure with far reaching consequences, this brought about a fundamental change in India's security concerns. The raising of the S.F.F. has to be placed in this political context.

At another level, in this period of Cold War in a bipolar world, the relation between the U.S. and Communist China was at its worst. U.S. through its intelligence agencies naturally kept an eye on the anti-Chinese uprisings in parts of Tibet and even began to assist those rebels fighting for independence of their homeland. C.I.A had already become involved in the fight.

The US and the Indian interests converged to some extent in this. Both the Tibetan rebel forces and the S.F.F. raised by India to combat the Chinese in high altitude if need be, initially received assistance and training from the C.I.A. This joint action did not last long. With the changing geo political scenario and improvement of relations with China, the C.I.A. gradually withdrew from the project of assisting Tibetan resistance movement, and India's sending of the S.F.F to Tibet for direct confrontation with China became a distant probability. The political contexts have changed but its very existence and status remain as a chapter in the history of regional geo politics of that period as a reminder of how India has tried to use the Tibetans in her relations with China.

Raising of the Force - The Political Context: National and International

The Special Frontier Force (S.F.F.) composed basically of Tibetan refugees in India, also known as Establishment 22 and Vikas Regiment is a part of the Indian armed force but with a difference. This difference originates from the circumstances

under which it was raised as well as the objectives that it was expected to pursue. From the very beginning it maintained a distinct identity of its own and was different from the Indian armed forces in terms of both its composition as well as the special training they received from the Indian Intelligence Department and to some extent from C.I.A. (Central Intelligence Agency that is regarded as the World's premier foreign intelligence agency vital to the U.S. national security) In order to understand why it was so, one has to turn to the international politics of the Cold War era, U.S involvement in Sino Tibetan relations as well as the geopolitics of South Asia and India's Tibet policy - shaped by India's relations with China. It was the interplay of all these forces that invited direct intervention of CIA and the formation of the SFF in 1962 as an extension of Tibet policy of both India and the USA. C.I.A.'s involvement started with interest in Tibetan resistance movement to China.

The US interest in Tibetan resistance movement originated in the 1950s when following the defeat of the Kuomintang in the Civil War in China the People's Republic of China (PRC) was set up under the leadership of Mao tse Tung. This also brought about a change in Sino Tibet relation as PRC made an open declaration of bringing Tibet under its control and the Seventeen Point Agreement was also signed by Tibet.¹ The gradual extension of Chinese authority to Tibet through takeover of the villages of Kham in Eastern Tibet had already given rise to a series of independent uprisings from 1949 onwards. These protests were often coordinated by local families and monastic leaders and gradually intensified and eventually entered Lhasa. The rebels finally decided to unite their separate citizen soldiers into a voluntary army and took the name of *Chusi Gandrung* in reference to the four rivers and six ranges of Kham. *Chusi Gandrung* had its inaugural ceremony in Lhoke region, south of Lhasa in 1958. Gompo Tashi, an eminent businessman in Lhasa took the initiative to coordinate the fighters.²

The resistance movement against China drew the attention of the C.I.A. itself. The U.S government had already taken notice of Communist China's policy towards Tibet and even offered help to the Tibetan government after invasion by China in 1950. Now with the situation taking a turn towards open confrontation, the Tibetans requested the U.S for military aid in 1955. In the summer of 1956 C.I.A. opened its Far Eastern Division and decided to support the resistance movement. An initial group of six Tibetan resistance fighters were trained for four months in map reading and radio transmissions in the island of Saipan in

1. Communist China launched an attack against Tibet on October 7, 1950 Tibet surrendered and the subsequent negotiation resulted in the signing of the Seventeen Point Agreement in 1951. The circumstances under which Tibet signed it, however is a matter of controversy. The agreement brought about some far reaching reforms of Tibetan government and gave rise to resentments that ultimately culminated into a revolt in 1959 leading to the flight of the Dalai Lama.

2. For some details of the movement see Michael Harris Goodman, *The Last Dalai Lama: A Biography*, Rupa & Co. 1996, pp. 253-264, chapter 18, 'Four rivers, six ranges.'

North Pacific. Then they were given training in parachute jumping in an island that they believed to be Philippines³ and then airdropped in Tibet. The secret training of Tibetans continued in U.S. first in Virginia and then from 1958 onwards in secret Camp Hale in Colorado.⁴ Thus the history of the Tibetan resistance movement became a part of the broader history of the Cold War in South Asia. Tibet became an important component in U.S. Cold War strategy in Asia. As in the previous century, Tibet remained a 'pawn in the imperial chessboard'. The U.S. and also India emerged as the key players. By 1958 C.I.A. backed by the U.S. State and Defence Departments had become fully committed to support the Tibetan resistance movement. More than 500,000 pounds, and 250 tons of equipment, both arms, ammunitions and medical supplies were dropped by the C.I.A. to the resistance force from 1957-1961.⁵

With the flight of the Dalai Lama to India in 1959 many *Chusi Gandrug* units too also shifted to India and took up jobs in Darjeeling and Sikkim. Later on, under the leadership of Gompo Tashi and Gyalo Thondup, one of Dalai Lama's elder brothers, almost 200 leaders and 3000 soldiers met in Kalimpong where they decided to move out of India and set up operations in Mustang in Nepal. Mustang was a territorial enclave extending into Tibet some 350 miles southwest of Lhasa. Even though it was nominally under Nepal it was ruled by a king who had Tibetan ancestry and practised Buddhism. Gompo Tashi was familiar with the area and had travelled several times to that place for trading purpose. Selection of this place was approved by both the C.I.A. and Gyalo Thondup. India was also aware of the developments. U.S. even provided training to men who were chosen as leaders and some recruits received training in India itself before leaving for Mustang. In Mustang the C.I.A. trained guerrillas provided training to other soldiers.

Two airdrops of supplies consisting of arms, ammunitions and food were made in 1962 and 1965. Later on C.I.A. even provided financial support to the resistance movement via the intelligence headquarters in Delhi. In fact, India too became involved in the operations particularly since the war with China in 1962. In fact it was at this juncture that India took the decision to directly recruit Tibetans in the Indian armed forces for defence of border in the Himalayan region. This force was the Special Frontier Force. The decision was taken with full support of the C.I.A. that agreed to provide them some training. The history of the guerrilla fighters of *Chusi Gandrug* and the origin of the S.F.F. are interconnected, the common factors being the resistance against China's takeover of Tibet. The U.S.

3. Ibid, p. 261.

4. Ibid, Chapter 19, End of an era, pp. 267-278. Kenneth Conboy and James Morrison, *The CIA's Secret War in Tibet*, University Press of Kansas, 2002 is a detailed history of CIA's role in Tibetan resistance movement.

5. John Kenneth Knaus, *Orphans of the Cold War; America and the Tibetan Struggle for Survival*, BBS Public Affairs, New York, 1999, p. 155.

and the Indian interests converged due to the Geo political realities of this Cold War era.

India's Tibet policy was determined by her own national security interests and went through some changes in accordance with her relations with China.

After India's independence (1947) the subcontinent was partitioned. Both India and Pakistan had their own problems and war had also broken out between the two over the issue of Kashmir. Pakistan was first closely linked with the U.S and later with China. India did not openly join any camp and apparently proclaimed Nonaligned status. In reality initially she coveted both the U.S and Soviet Union at least till the 1970s. Prime Minister Nehru, eager to maintain good relations with China was unwilling to openly criticize China before 1959 over its Tibet policy, Nehru repeatedly advised the Dalai Lama to practice patience and wanted to follow a policy of non-interference. When Dalai Lama visited India on occasion of the 2,500th birth anniversary of the Buddha in 1956, Chou En-lai also happened to be on a state visit to India. Dalai Lama had personal meetings with both the leaders and was assured by Chou of no drastic action in Tibet. Disturbed by the critical and fast deteriorating situation in Tibet arising from the Seventeen Point Agreement, He had been advised by many to stay back in Tibet but when the situation was explained to Nehru, the latter advised him to return back on the basis of the assurances given by Chou. Rather he advised him and his brother Gyalo Thondup to go for a democratic movement as a legitimate alternative.⁶ In 1959 when the Dalai Lama took refuge in India He was accepted as an honoured guest and India allowed him to run the Government in Exile from Indian soil and provided all assistance to rehabilitate the Tibetan refugees who had followed Him. It was basically on humanitarian ground - India clarified. India however took a soft stand towards the guerrilla fighters of the resistance movement in India. Even though they were not allowed to cross the border into Tibet, India was aware of how they were regrouping themselves for a new fight from Mustang and the interest that C.I.A took in helping them.

The year 1962 was to make a significant change in the mode of US as well as Indian support for the Tibetan resistance. As a result of the border wars between India and China, India became a major partner of the Tibetan resistance movement against China.

Before the border confrontation with China, Nehru had given the control of all border activities to Mullik, head of the Intelligence, an authority that he retained from 1951 to October 1959. By 1959 Mullik had created 67 check posts along the frontier stretching over 2000 miles by a staff of 1,334 employees trained in Tibetan and Chinese and capable of decoding Chinese communication in southern Tibet. After that Indian army was excluded from the Himalayan border areas, as its primary mission became the defence against Pakistan. The defence of the North Eastern Frontier Agency or N.E.F.A. in short, (present Arunachal

6. M. H. Goodman, op cit. Chapter 17, "A special sort of gentleness", pp. 239-251.

Pradesh, the North Eastern state of India, through which the MacMahon Line passes and the border dispute with China exists) was entrusted to the Assam Rifles, a paramilitary force under the Minister of External Affairs. Unprepared to face the Chinese assault, India was badly thrashed in the war in 1962.⁷ Nehru was severely criticised for a failed Foreign policy with regard to China and felt betrayed.

When the India China conflict broke out the U.S.A. was preoccupied with the Cuban crisis and it was only after the Russian withdrawal that U.S.A. turned attention to India. On November 19th Kennedy responded to Nehru's desperate call for help by offering to send a high level mission to assess what the U.S. could do to help India. Even though China declared ceasefire on December 1 a U.S. mission headed by one of America's most distinguished politicians and diplomat Averil Hardiman was on its way within a day.

In an analysis of the Sino India conflict it was noted that 'continued strengthening of the Indian defensive position and possible disruption of Chinese supply lines through guerrilla activities were the primary means of denying this area of Peiping's political -military penetration, short of escalating the conflict into a major war.'⁸ This strategy was generally accepted by both the countries. Washington and London would provide bulk of military hardware to restore India's military establishment. It was also decided that C.I.A. would develop an on the ground intelligence collection capability to determine Chinese strengths and weaknesses inside Tibet to be exploited by the guerrilla action. The Tibetans who would now carry out these missions would be trained at Camp Hale. C.I.A. would also continue its support to the force that had come into being under its patronage in Mustang.

In a separate programme, a new force was to be created in India by Mullik to guard India's Northern border and C.I.A. would provide logistical and training support to that paramilitary force. Unlike the Mustang force, this new force was to remain solely under Indian direction.⁹

Even though actually formed after 1962, it appears that Major General Uban the commander of India's Twenty Second Mountain Regiment during World War II had already contemplated raising a troop with the Tibetan refugees a year before 1962. 'One year before', he said,

"I had made a tour of the border, - almost all of it on foot - and in the process had ruminated on our vulnerability up there. And while on this trek, the thought occurred to me that we should have some Tibetans stationed with our border patrol. There were already thousands of Tibetan exiles inside the Indian border with nothing to do. I thought "If you leave these warriors alone, they'll probably do some mischief. The

7. John Kenneth Knaus op cit, p. 250.

8. Memorandum for Secretary Rusk, November 17, 1962, Hilsman papers, Sino Indian border clash 1962, box 1, folder18, Kennedy Library. Quoted by John Kenneth Knaus, *ibid*, p. 265.

9. John Kenneth Knaus, *ibid*, pp. 265-66.

best answer is to hire them, get them in shape and anyway, the Indo Tibetan border is the most crucial point of our dispute with China. We must have some people belonging to that area, so that they can inform us and deliver valuable information to us.”¹⁰

This new force was the Tibetan manned Special Frontier Force officially created by Mullik on 14 November 1962. An all-Tibetan force, it was popularly known as “Establishment 22.” A name given to it by Commander Major General Uban.¹¹ When word got around, the Tibetan refugees flocked in Dehradun from there to be transported to S.F.F. home base in the Himalayas 120 miles from Tibet. Gyalo Thondup too was involved in the project. He said that until 1962 India had consistently rejected his appeals to train Tibetans as resistance fighters inside Tibet, but now, the attitude changed dramatically. He was summoned to New Delhi where he worked out an agreement with Mullik and K.L. Mehta of External Ministry to encourage Tibetans to join S.F.F. They wanted 6000 troops but eventually ended up training a force twice that number. The call actually provided an opportunity for young men who had not been able to join the Mustang contingent and yet remained committed to serve the motherland. Within a month, 6000 Tibetan men, mostly soldiers from the Tibetan army, the Dalai Lama’s bodyguards, and resistance fighters volunteered. The recruits were happy to be trained and eager to fight. The organisation was designed to be an ultra secret department within the Indian armed forces that continues to be so till this day. Like the earlier Tibetan resistance fighters, the new recruits to Establishment 22 were true patriots who never thought of the consequences for themselves’, he wrote.¹² Half of these men were more than 45 years of age, and some were even near sixty. The chief political leader Jamba Kalden was 43. The older generation were itching for a final showdown with the Chinese and had managed to edge out the younger candidates.¹³ Later they were joined by two companies of women who were given six months of basic training identical to Indian army’s. The initial training was strict exercise and guerrilla tactics. They were given supplemented training by CIA in commando tactics, guerrilla warfare techniques, sabotage and the use of explosives. They became highly proficient in the use of light arms, learned rock climbing, and parachute jumps which qualified them for paratroopers wings. The most important training was going to be the airborne training. As per plan, all members of Establishment 22 were to be qualified paratroopers. If the Tibetans were to operate behind Chinese lines the logical means of infiltrating them to the

10. Quoted from an interview with Uban. Mikel Dunham .*Buddha’s Warriors: The Story of the CIA Backed Tibetan Freedom Fighters, the Chinese Invasion and the Ultimate Fall of Tibet*, Jerem6 P. Tarcher/Penguin, New York, 2004, Chapter 10, ‘Last Stand’, p. 359.

11. John Kenneth Knaus op cit., p. 271.

12. Gyalo Thondup *The Noodle Maker of Kalimpong: The Untold Story of my Struggle for Tibet*, Penguin Random House India, 2016, pp. 223-224.

13. Kenneth Conboy and James Morrison op cit, p. 184.

other side of the Himalayas would be by parachute. They were commanded by Tibetan officers.¹⁴

According to Thondup, the original agreement called for these men only inside Tibet presumably to organise resistance activities there and not merely to defend India's border or perform other missions for India.

In case of war with China the Indian Government was said to have a secret plan to win Tibet's independence with the S.F.F. in the lead. Mullik, in his memoir *The Chinese Betrayal* wrote that he was convinced that Nehru himself was preparing for the day when it would be possible for India to reestablish Tibet in a semi-independent if not independent status. In case of another war with China, the Tibetans could be used in the front lines of a war waged in their own country.¹⁵ The Indians never said as much to the Tibetan troops but the illusion that they were preparing for their own war kept them going. In practice however, this ultimate goal remained distant and secondary. The force was authorised to act only on the Indian side of the frontier and not to cross into Tibet. The U.S provided light arms and instructions for this. For the Tibetans it was also a kind of repayment for Indian hospitality.

Tibetans were trained by the Indian Central Intelligence Bureau (C.I.B.) and, after training, would either stay with the C.I.B. or go on to a leadership post in a new Tibetan force in the Indian military. The Mustang Tibetans regarded the S.F.F. as the *Chushi Gangdrug* branch in India.

In addition to Establishment 22, the Indian Ministry of Home Affairs also set up an Indo-Tibetan Border Police Force (ITBF) under its auspices in October 1962. Both forces were stationed in border areas. As understood by the Tibetans, even though the I.T.B.F. included Tibetans in its ranks, Establishment 22 was specially created "to restore independence to Tibet." Based in Chakarta near Dehra Dun, the S.F.F. was initially trained by both U.S. and Indian officers but was led by four Tibetan commanders—Ratu Ngawang, Gyatso Dhondup, Jampa Kalden, and Jampa Wangdu. Both Ratu and Gyatso were from Lithang, Andrug Gompo Tashi's district; Jampa Kalden was from Chamdo; and Jampa Wangdu was from Lhasa.

Descriptions are given about how that secrecy was maintained and the identity of 12 Tibetans initially selected for the parachute jumping training were carefully concealed. Agra was the only training centre for airborne training facilities. Tibetans were placed in crude barracks far from the training centre and jumps were scheduled around noon when, the sun was in the midsky and not many were around. As an added precaution, cap badges were arranged for them with the number 12 along with crossed *kukri* knife blades of Gurkha Rifles for the duration of their stay in Agra. The number 12 was selected to give an impression that they were Gorkhas. After independence from the British, the Indian army had inherited 7 regiments of Gorkhas recruited from Nepal. Along with four

14. John Kenneth Knaus, op cit., pp. 272.

15. Ibid, p. 272.

more regiments that were transferred to the British army, the last regiment was numbered 11. Hence the selection of 12 for the S.F.F. on the assumption that most lowland Indians would be unable to differentiate between the features of the Gorkhas and the Tibetans.¹⁶

The United States provided them with arms and instructions. American interests were served by the firsthand intelligence gathered by the force as well as the prospects for the rebirth of the resistance movement. Like the Indians, the Americans however saw the force as potential rather than actual combatants for the long term cause of Tibetan independence. But it was going to be a secret exercise, to be kept secret not only from the Indians but from the bulk of the Indian military as well.

Regular updates were provided to Nehru regarding the regiment and he was even invited to visit the hill camp. Afraid that the Indian P.M. addressing Tibetan combatants on Indian soil would make a diplomatic disaster, he initially refused to give a speech but he became visibly moved after the visit and when they presented him his favourite rose bud he became so emotional that he said that India did back them and 'vowed that they would one day return to an independent country'.¹⁷

Mullick said that he was convinced that Nehru himself was preparing for the day when it would be possible for India to reestablish Tibet in a semi-independent if not independent status. Furthermore, war with China, previously unthinkable, had become a reality by then. If it broke out again in future, the Tibetans would then be in frontlines of a war waged in their own country. Nehru did not live long after this and this ultimate goal was to remain distant forever, and secondary to the protection of India's border. The frontier force was authorised to act only on the Indian side of the frontier and not to cross into Tibet for the purpose of challenging the Chinese. After the death of Nehru (27 May 1964), the Geo political realities began to change and Indo U.S. relations became strained over the issue of Kashmir. Shastri was the P.M. for a short period (9 June 1964 to 11 January 1966) and was succeeded by Indira Gandhi. She had a meeting with President Johnson, in Washington which turned out to be a success and the Indo US relation got back some of the lustre it lost during the previous year's Kashmir crisis. By this time the American aid to Mustang guerillas had become somewhat irregular. Funds were again provided for both the Mustang guerrillas and the S.F.F. Sensing an opportunity the C.I.A. in April asked the 303 Committee to approve a major \$18 million Tibetan paramilitary package. Part of this was earmarked to maintain the Mustang force for a three year term. The package also included a funding for 5000 man increase in Establishment 22.¹⁸ In order to justify its proposal, C.I.A. even suggested that the force could be utilised in the event of an all out hostility

16. Kenneth Conboy and James Morrison, *op cit*, Chapter13, 'Chakrata' pp. 176-187.

17. *Ibid*, p. 187.

18. *Ibid*, p. 219.

between the U.S and China over the war in Vietnam. Rather than justifying the Tibetan operation solely on its own merits, C.I.A. now was trying to loosely fix it to the Indo China policy. But this seemed like a geopolitical fantasy. It was highly unlikely that India would agree to draw the wrath of China by sponsoring a Tibet front if the U.S and China went to war over Vietnam.¹⁹ Funds were still flowing to the guerrillas in Mustang. The money sent through in a clandestine manner was utilised in Pokhara for purchase of foodstuffs and textiles to be shipped to the guerrillas via mule caravans. However following some differences with the Mustang leadership over the plan of action the C.I.A. decided to restrict the supply of funds to them and initiated a process of winding up its programme for Mustang. Relation with the Establishment 22 or S.F.F. continued for a few more years. Most of the actual training however was being imparted by Uban's men. C.I.A basically provided some advice and funds. As a part of that plan a new team of advisors was brought in to boost its level of assistance to Chakrata. Among them was Tucker Gougelman who was brought in as the senior advisor of all paramilitary forces in India in 1966. After serving in intelligence offices in various capacities in different countries, he was finally in Vietnam advising the South Vietnamese special branch of police cum intelligence. In India, in addition to organising the Establishment 22, he was given the charge of managing the mountaineering expeditions aimed at placing a nuclear powered censor atop the Nanda Devi summit.²⁰

This time, India was eager to increase the number of Tibetans at Establishment 22 and even decided to recruit Gorkhas into the unit. The S.F.F. by this time had increased to five or six companies with 172 guerrillas in each company grouped into battalions commanded by Tibetan political leaders. The Indians saw this as a means of expanding the mandate and abilities of the force beyond things Tibetan.

The Tibetans were not happy with the prospect of inducting Gorkhas into their force as they represented two distinct cultures and their ethnic characteristics were different. This would lead to an ethnic dilution they feared. To keep peace within the force, a cap was set and no more than 700 Gorkhas would be taken in. Moreover in order to restrict the mixing of the two ethnic groups, the Gorkhas would be segregated into their own group at Chakrata. Though given the same paramilitary training as in the previous S.F.F. cycles, Gorkha group was relegated primarily to base security and administration.²¹

As years passed, the probability of fighting for their own homeland was becoming a distant dream for the Tibetans. Rather they were being utilised for intelligence collection from the high altitudes. They worked for India from bases along the frontier from Kashmir border. Two companies set up a base on the Siachen glacier to the eastern Himalayan peaks that separated Tibet from the

19. Ibid.

20. Ibid, p. 225.

21. Ibid, pp. 225-26.

Northeast Frontier Agency. From these bases they conducted cross border reconnaissance operations to place sensors for detecting nuclear and missile tests and devices for intercepting Chinese military communications. Several bases were established in Ladakh and N.E.F.A. especially to support their operations.²²

The S.F.F. in Action

The S.F.F had carried on some missions outside India also. Back in 1964, the team had staged a brief but deadly foray from Nepal toward Tingri when the force inherited the wiretrap mandate from Joelikote.²³ Nearly all the communications between China and Tibet used overground lines supported by concrete or improvised wooden poles. The C.I.A. had already started a wiretrap programme in southern China using teams from Laos. The S.F.F proved up to the task. In a project code named GEMINI, it began infiltrating from N.E.F.A. with recording gear during 1966 to supply the guerrillas while they filled the tapes. An ARC²⁴ C46 was dispatched to an airfield near Siliguri in Qwest Bengal. The results were mixed. The S.F.F. did a good job but what they collected was not of much use. The project was finally deserted after a newspaper reported about the mysterious flights over Sikkim.²⁵

One of the last C.I.A. supported operations took place in 1969. Four S.F.F. were trained in the use of sophisticated 'impulse probe' wiretraps. Buried underneath a telephone line, the trap transmitted conversions to a solar powered relay station established on a border mountaintop in N.E.F.A. The data was later relayed to a base further south. Although several traps were installed successfully two S.F.F. members disappeared.²⁶

The regimental song of the SFF gives some ideas about their activities so far. Their Tibetan identity is also highlighted in the song.

*We are the Vikasi
The Chinese snatched Tibet from us and kicked us out of our home
Even then, India kept us like their own
One day, surely one day we will teach the Chinese a lesson
Whenever opportunities arise we will play with our lives
In the Siachen glacier we got our second chance*

22. Jonn Kenneth Knaus, op cit., p. 273.

23. Kenneth Conboy and James Morrison, op cit. chapter 15, 'The Joelikote Boys', pp. 196-204, 227.

24. Kenneth Conboy and James Morrison op cit. pp190-191 Aviation Research Centre created by the Intelligence Bureau in 1963 as a front to coordinate aviation cooperation with the CIA.

25. Ibid, p. 227.

26. Ibid, p. 242.

*Our young martyrs have no sadness whatsoever
 Whether it is Kargil or Bangladesh we will not lose our strength
 Whenever opportunities arise we will play with our lives
 Where there is our Potala Palace and lovely Norbulingka
 The throne of the Dalai Lama was dear even then
 Remember those martyrs of ours who sacrificed with their lives
 Let's sing together Hail to our Tibet Hail to our Tibet Hail to our Tibet²⁷*

History records how the S.F.F. was raised by India with a broader objective of utilising those Tibetans, in case of a confrontation with China, to organise resistance activities there, to restore the independence of Tibet if possible and not merely to defend India's border. But so far that objective has not taken any concrete shape. They have fought and sacrificed their lives but that was certainly not against China for their motherland.

The first major operation in which they took part was the war against Pakistan over the issue of Bangladesh in 1971. India was secretly supporting the resistance fighters from East Pakistan. Major General Uban, now considered one of India's most seasoned experts in nonconventional warfare, was placed in charge of a guerrilla training programme of 10,000 East Pakistani youths in Chakarta.²⁸ The S.F.F. had by this time grown into 64 Tibetan companies in addition to the support units, C.I.A.'s contact with them had almost come to an end and they had not participated in any serious combat till now. Seven companies were even said to be put in charge of traffic control in Ladakh. Uban lobbied to involve this elite unit in contingencies against East Pakistan. Dharamsala (where the Central Tibetan Administration or the Dalai Lama's Government in Exile is based) had to be consulted before the final decision. It was a hard choice for the Tibetan Government as refusing the permission would appear to being ungrateful to India while they felt they themselves had no quarrel with Pakistan. After considering all the pros and the cons, Dharamsala gave approval.²⁹

By late October 3000 Tibetans were brought in to the Indian border adjacent to East Pakistan's Chittagong Hill Tract (C.H.T.). It was decided that S.F.F. would be charged with staging guerrilla raids across the C.H.T. The force began its Operation Eagle in the second week of November. By the time all-out war was officially declared in early December, the S.F.F. had already been inside East Pakistan for about 3 weeks. At the time when Pakistan capitulated and Bangladesh emerged as an independent state within two weeks of outbreak of the war S.F.F. were within 40 miles of Chittagong port. Taking leave of their normal practice they paraded through Chittagong. A total of 23 Indian officers and 45

27. Several versions of the song with video of their training and parachute jumpings is available on the inter net, e.g., [youtube.com/watch?v=kiOgwtkoVpo](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=kiOgwtkoVpo). The songs are generally in Hindi.

28. Kenneth Conboy and James Morrison, op cit., p. 242.

29. Ibid, p. 243.

Tibetans were awarded for their gallantry, 580 Tibetans received cash bonus. However, 49 Tibetans had paid with their lives for the birth of a nation that was not their own.³⁰

After the late 1970s some changes were brought in when the S.F.F. was used in the new role of (CT) combating terrorism. In 1977 some 500 commandos from the force were sent to Sarasawa for a possible action against rioters during national elections and the election that passed off peacefully. After this only 60 commandos were retained for CT duties and 500 army troops were sent to Sarasawa for CT training, forming a new elite detachment known as the special group under the command of the S.F.F. IG. By early 1984 the elite Special Group became the primary CT force in India and they participated in the Operation Bluestar to flush out terrorists from the Golden Temple in Amritsar between 1st and 10th June 1984.³¹

One Battallion of Tibetan S.F.F.s is normally stationed on the Siachen glacier with other Indian army troops. In 1985 they played a pivotal role in Operation Meghdoot to capture Siachen from Pakistan They also had a role in Operation Vijay in Kargil against Pakistan from May to July , 1999 and also for checking of insurgency in Kashmir. All this do find mention in their regimental song but what the song does not mention is the function of intelligence collection from the high altitudes that has become their specialty from the very first days. Nor is it clear whether they were used in Operation All Clear in Bhutan³² to flush out the United Liberation Force of Assam (U.L.F.A.) insurgents who had taken refuge in Bhutan. According to one report, they were indeed employed there in Bhutan, dressed in the uniform of Royal Bhutan Army. According to one anonymous report, the efficient shelling and destruction of general headquarters of ULFA in Samdrup Jhonkar could not have been done by inexperienced force like Royal Bhutan Army. So far, the Government of India however has not mentioned their role in any such operation.

The S.F.F. continues to be an elite and ultra secret regiment of the Indian armed force Even though it is placed under an army officer of the rank of Major General, it is not directly under the Indian army. Recruited and trained by the R.A.W. (Research and Analytical Wing), it is placed under the Cabinet Secretariat. It has six battalions and the units have their own rank structures. It also has its own insignia which in reference to Tibet is a snow lion. In spite of the fact that there are several websites available with their primary history and achievements, the Government of India continues to maintain silence about their actual role in

30. Ibid, pp. 243-245.

31. bootcampmilitaryfitnessinstitute.com/elite-specialforce/indian-elite-special-forces/indian-special-frontier-force-sff, accessed on 16.3.23.

32. This was launched on December 15, 2003 in southern districts of Bhutan to flush out two rebel outfits ULFA and NDFB of Assam who had set up camps in Bhutan Intervention of the Indian army was widely suspected by a section of the media. The involvement of the SFF was also speculated without any proof.

high altitude intelligence gatherings. Information about the force, along with its composition, functions and operations are kept under total secrecy. Even though the Tibetans themselves are quite familiar with its functioning, the youths who are in service are trained not to discuss their profession with outsiders and even the retired personnel who agree to talk, do so on the condition of anonymity. In fact, even their sacrifice is hardly ever brought into light. It is difficult to get any detailed or authentic information about their operations and engagements from secondary sources. Keeping in mind the special character of the force they are encouraged to develop familiarity with their cultural heritage and the basic issues underlying Tibet China relations. In the southern district of Sikkim, the Tibetan Kunphenling settlement camp in Ravangla is situated adjacent to the army cantonment. It is a centre for the S.F.F regiment and being so, it is common for the Tibetan youths of Ravangla to join the force. There are several recruits from the surrounding Tibetan settlements in Darjeeling district as well. In the cantonment, as the author had the chance to observe once, certain special days from the history of Tibet like the uprising day of 10th March was celebrated with hoisting of the Tibetan flag and the (Indian) officer in charge takes the guard of honour. The Tibetan youths were taught the basic facts of Tibetan history and chronology through a small library. Documentation of important events and contemporary developments among the Tibetan community both in and outside their motherland were also maintained along with a collection of paper clippings from newspapers

It is only recently that some information about the force came to the public domain when the role of the S.F.F was openly acknowledged by the army in August 2020 in the operation to occupy previously unoccupied heights in Chusul sector in Eastern Ladakh. The context was the recent Sino Indian confrontation in Ladakh and the specific issue the death of Nyima Tenzin, a S.F.F. cadre near Pangong lake in Ladakh from a landmine dating the 1962 war. Another S.F.F cadre was also injured. The sacrifice attracted media attention. It was discussed in T.V and newspapers and the internet was proliferated with some websites with basic information about the force. The coffin of Nyingma Tenzin, was draped in both Indian and Tibetan flags. Many people, most of them Tibetans from Ladakh, assembled and he was put to rest with chants of *Bhrat mata ki jai* (hail to India), *Jai Tibet* (hail to Tibet) and *Vikas Regiment Zindabad*. Posters were put up with 'He lived for the love of Tibet and died for the love of India'.³³ All this naturally put the spotlight on the role of the Tibetans in Indian army and revived the Tibet issue once again in Indian political discourse. Even members of the C.T.A were allowed to express their observations. BJP's General Secretary Ram Madhab, members of the Exile Tibetan community, the Dalai Lama Himself and some representatives of Indian army were present in the funeral. Ram Madhab initially shared a picture of himself at Tenzin's funeral. The political leadership and the

33. [Economictimes,indiatimes.com/news/defence/sff-tibetan-hero-who-died-while-foiling-china-incursion.....](https://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/defence/sff-tibetan-hero-who-died-while-foiling-china-incursion.....) accessed on 27.1.23.

Indian army however refrained from commenting on the S.F.F. Even Ram Madhab deleted his photograph later. This was interpreted by some analysts as part of Indian strategy of sending a signal to China, i.e., to put pressure on China by reviving the Tibet issue. In other words, the Tibetans were used to serve the national interest of India. Palden Sonam, a political analyst, believes that death of the soldier highlighted the Tibet issue and renewed solidarity among Indians for Tibetan cause, it is unknown, he pointed out, whether Ram Madhab deleted his photograph because of pressure from New Delhi or Beijing. The Indian Government seemed tactful here. "It lets the media report freely about the SFF and its role, while it remains silent." he commented.³⁴

Conclusion

The regiment was and still is regarded as an elite force with particular expertise in collection of intelligence, paratrooping and guerilla warfare in the mountains. Their activities are still kept under a veil of secrecy. They have sacrificed their lives for India - both within and outside the country. Initially it was their patriotism and commitment to free their motherland from Chinese control that inspired the Tibetans to join the guerilla force of *Chusi Gandrug*. There used to be a close relation between the *Chusi Gandrug* and the S.F.F and several from that guerilla outfit shifted to the S.F.F. Some of the S.F.F veterans still remember how in those days some of the first generation soldiers were middle aged and even *lamas* (monks) by profession. They did not have proper uniforms and some were even dressed in monk's robes.³⁵ But the situation changed over the years and in 2009 the remunerations, emoluments and pensions of the force were revised to give parity with those of the Indian army. Being so, joining the S.F.F has now become just a profession for many Tibetan youths who are physically fit and has an adventurous bent of mind. The fire with which their forefathers had initially joined the force have gradually died down. It was learnt from the veterans that there is a considerable number of vacancies in the force and not all the youths are interested in joining the profession any more. Opting for Indian citizenship and going abroad is regarded as a better career option to them.³⁶ They are aware that with the Tibetan issue reaching a practical stalemate,

34. dw.com/en/india-china-tension-soldiers-death-puts-spotlight-on-tibetans-in-india/a-54913740, accessed on 27.1.23.

35. For life experience of some such guerilla warriors who had taken part in Bangladesh war and are now settled in Arunachal Pradesh see 'They came, they fought, they stayed', the hindu.com/news/national/other-states/they-came-they-fought-they-stayed/article176443356erc, accessed on 27.1.23.

36. Information collected from some veteran SFF personnel in Darjeeling. They agreed to speak on condition of anonymity.

fight for Tibet and the possibility of returning to their homeland looks like a distant possibility.

History of the S.F.F. in the Indian armed force reminds one of a particular period of time when Tibet's independence from China still appeared possible. It is about how India's Tibet policy has evolved over the years. Its story is also about how over the years the commitment of the Tibetan youths in the force gradually diverted to safeguarding the security concerns of India that has now become their second home.

Bibliography

- Batabyal, Guru Saday. *Politico – military Strategy of the Bangladesh Liberation War*, 1971. Routledge, South Asia Edition, 2022.
- Conboy, Kenneth, and James Morrison. *The CIA's Secret War in Tibet*. USA: University Press of Kansas, 2003.
- Das, Gautam. *China, Tibet, India: The 1962 War and the Strategic Military Future*. Military Affairs Series. New Delhi: Har Anand Publications Pvt Ltd, 2009.
- Dunham, Mikel. *Buddha's Warriors: The Story of the CIA backed Tibetan Freedom Fighters, the Chinese Invasion and the Ultimate Fall of Tibet*. New York: Jeremy P. Tarcher/Penguin, 2004.
- Ginsburgs, George, and Michael Mathos. *Communist China and Tibet: The First Dozen Year*. The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, 1964.
- Goodman, Michael Harris. *The Last Dalai Lama: A Biography*. Calcutta: Rupa Paperback, 1996.
- Kharat, Rajesh. *Tibetan Refugees in India*. New Delhi: Kaveri Books, 2003.
- Knaus, John Kenneth. *Orphans of the Cold War: America and the Tibetan Struggle for Survival*. New York: Public Affairs, 1999.
- Mishra, Keshav. *Rapprochement Across the Himalayas: Emerging Indo China Relations in Post-Cold War Period (1947-2003)*. New Delhi: Kalpaz Publications, 2004.
- Mishra, Mallica. *Tibetan Refugees in India: Education, Culture and Growing up in Exile*. New Delhi: Orient Blackswan, 2014.
- Roemer, Stephanie. *The Tibetan Government in Exile: Politics at Large*. London: Routledge, 2008.
- Thondup Gyalo, and Anne F. Thurston. *The Noodle Maker of Kalimpong: The Untold Story of my Struggle for Tibet*. U.K. and U.S.A.: Penguin Books, 2015.

The United States Role of the Occurrence of Violence in Cyprus

By Ilksoy Aslim*

Cyprus used to be under occupation of the foreign states for many centuries and sovereignty usually with few exceptions was not transferred peacefully. As it is well known, in the 19th century, use of force in international relations was seen as normal. In the 1878 however, transformation of sovereignty in Cyprus from the Ottoman Empire to the United Kingdom (UK) was by peaceful means. The UK ruled Cyprus mostly in peace until the uprising in 1931. The upheaval of the Greek Cypriots against the UK was to unite Cyprus with Greece (Enosis). The uprising was settled by violence and the constitutional rights suspended immediately. In 1955 when the riot of the Greek Cypriots occurred again this time the UK was successful to get support of Türkiye¹ and the Turkish Cypriots and converted the anti-colonial struggle to the ethnic strife. Clearly, the occurrence of violence in Cyprus in 20th Century begun during the British period but it continued after the colonial period. Although the United States (US) refrained direct involvement to Cyprus problem it assisted to the formation of the Republic of Cyprus by 1960s. During the Cold War conditions, the US had to involve to the Cyprus problem because of two reasons: Firstly, in order to prevent a war between Türkiye and Greece, the two “motherlands” of the Turkish and Greek Cypriots; secondly to stop the violence between two local communities. In Washington DC the US leadership met with Greek and Turkish prime ministers in 1964 and they decided to solve the Cyprus problem forever. In Geneva the US representative had several meetings with the officials of Greece and Türkiye. There, the US former secretary of state offered his plan that included the use of violence for the dissolution of the Republic of Cyprus. The US plan could not be implemented at the time but after 10 years, its spirit became the source of the violence in Cyprus. In this study mainly the role of the US in occurrence of violence in the island will be studied.

Introduction

In order to understand the US role of violence in Cyprus shortly we have to understand the meaning of statehood and means of using coercion. According to Max Weber, the state is a political entity that holds the legal monopoly of exercising physical power over a particular territory.² This was not different for the colonial powers. When the colonial states began to have colonies they extended their sovereignty to that region and established the mechanisms for

*Lecturer, Bahçeşehir Cyprus University, Cyprus.

1. The Republic of Turkey is known as Republic of Türkiye at the United Nations from June 2023 after formal request of Ankara.

2. T. Waters, & D. Waters (Eds.), (2015), *Max Weber in Weber's Rationalism and Modern Society*, Palgrave, London.

using physical power. Many indigenous people in the colonies actively served in the colonial administration and the security forces. These forces which can be called as “local troops” were used as cheap labor by the European colonial powers and facilitated the control of the empire.³ These troops were also used by the colonial powers against “freedom fighters” in Africa, the Middle East and Asia, where insurgency was in question.⁴ Nevertheless, the colonial powers needed other means beside open violence. Their main tool was the colonial laws. Colonial governments using the laws that they produced, defined those who oppose their regime as criminals. Walter Benjamin explains the relationship between the law and the use of force by saying, “to make the law is to make power”.⁵ In this context, colonial administrations tried to suppress the rebels by applying martial law in cases where the normal rules of law did not work and the UK did not act differently in Cyprus. The US after 1964 had to involve to the Cyprus issue as being the leader of the Western World and found two fragmented societies that were affecting the interests of the West by leading Türkiye and Greece to confront each other. This treat would make US to involve more to the problem and prepare a plan that would have consequences on Cyprus.

The Source of Violence in Cyprus after the World War II

The theorists who may best describe the structural relationship between colonialism and violence after the World War II are Frantz Fanon and Aimé Cesaire. According to them, the main element of establishing and maintaining colonialism is violence.⁶ For them, violence also was an important tool used against the independence movements in the colonies. However, Niall Ferguson does not agree with the evaluations of these theorists. Ferguson argues that the positive aspects of the British Empire in terms of modernization and development outweigh the negative ones.⁷ We have to remember that before the World War II, the UK was seen as the hegemon power of the world and its legacy continue to be influential in international relations during the following period. It is undeniable that UK carried its own “civilization” with its socio-economic structure from colonial imperium to its colonies. However, it is also clear that the UK did not

3. P. Dwyer, P. & A. Nettelbeck, (Eds.), (2018), *Violence, Colonialism and Empire in the Modern World*, Cambridge Imperial and Post-Colonial Studies Serie, Cambridge, p. 7.

4. M. Thomas & Others, (2018). *Crises of Empire: Decolonization and Europe's Imperial States, 1918–1975*, London: Hodder Education, p. 414; T. Waters (ed. and trans.), (2015). *Max Weber in Weber's Rationalism and Modern Society*, Palgrave, London.

5. Dwyer, *opcit*, p. 11.

6. *Ibid.*

7. N. Ferguson, (2002), *Empire: The rise and demise of the British world order and the lessons for global power*, Basic Books, New York.

hesitate to use excessive violence when it was necessary. For example, thousands of men courted death by the British in India in 1857.⁸

The Greek Cypriots after realizing that they could not get their goal at the United Nations (UN) through Greece, they planned to realize Enosis by means of violence. On April 1, 1955, the Greek Cypriots established a secret organization namely EOKA (The National Organization of Cypriot Fighters) for Enosis. This uprising had different consequences for Greek Cypriots and Turkish Cypriots. The Greek Cypriot in the colonial security forces who did not want to clash with EOKA resigned *en masse*. In order to fill the gap created by the Greek Cypriots the British administration recruited the Turkish Cypriots to the security forces instead of them. Now EOKA's target became the Turkish Cypriots concentrated in the UK security forces. Asmussen argues that the main reason for the colonial administration to recruit the Turkish Cypriots in its police forces was that the British did not trust the Greek Cypriots because of their possible tie with EOKA.⁹ Gülboy approaches differently and associates the preference of the Turkish Cypriots with the colonial policy of the UK. Accordingly, the colonial administration used to use another group to suppress a social revolt, and in this case the British aimed to construct a conflict between the societies for their own interest.¹⁰ Both views had some truth. It was clear that the colonial administration could not trust the Greek Cypriots because of the possibility of EOKA connection and these troops were used by the colonial powers against "freedom fighters." In this context, it was in accordance with the general policies of the UK to use the Turkish Cypriots against the rebellion initiated by the Greek Cypriots. In any case, during the British colonial period the Cypriots became familiar to use of force and coercion.

One of other dimension of the UK's efforts to prevent Enosis was its success to involve Türkiye in the Cyprus issue. The UK called a tripartite conference, which was held in London in August 1955. Accordingly, the participants would only discuss the problems in the Middle East.¹¹ However, contrary to the plan the Cyprus issue was mainly discussed at this meeting. The UK's effort to bring Türkiye to the meeting was aiming to balance the Greeks claim with the Turks. The London Conference failed due to the 6-7 September Events against the Greek minority in Istanbul.¹² The 6-7 September Events further strained the relations between the two communities in Cyprus which would affect the relations

8. B. Chandra & Others, (1989), *India's Struggle For Independence (1857-1947)*, Penguin books, p. 10.

9. J. Asmussen, (2011) "Conspiracy Theories and Cypriot History: The Confort of Commonly Perceived Enemies", *The Cyprus Review*, Vol. 23. No. 2, Spring, p. 130.

10. P. E. Gülboy, (2015), *Sömürgeci Ulus Devlete Kıbrıs Cumhuriyeti* [The Republic of Cyprus from Colonial to Nation State], Khora Yayınları, Lefkoşa, p, 224.

11. R. F. Holland, (1985), *European Decolonization 1918-1981: An Introductory Survey*, Palgrave Macmillan, London, p. 254-255.

12. *Ibid*, p. 255.

between Türkiye and Greece. Clearly, as long as the established order was not opposed, the colonial administrations did not prefer use of violence. However, the fact that the EOKA began to use violence against the British prompted the UK to take action on both Türkiye and Turkish Cypriots against the Enosis policy. The British getting the Turks in the Cyprus issue would change the perception of the international community on Cyprus and the anti-colonial struggle between EOKA and the UK could be shown as Turkish-Greek conflict.¹³ When EOKA started its actions, it tried not to specifically target the Turkish Cypriots. However, as some Turkish Cypriots were in the colonial security forces, this created the conditions under which they would also be subjected to the violence of the EOKA. According to Hitchens, Foreign Minister Harold Macmillan thought that the way to neutralize the Greek Cypriots was to mobilize the Turkish Cypriots. As expected, when the colonial administration included the Turkish Cypriots in their own security forces, it caused them to be target of EOKA. The policy implemented by the UK was successful and the anti-colonial struggle turned into an internal ethnic conflict. Also as mentioned above in the international arena it was presented as “the Turkish-Greek” conflict.¹⁴ Reddaway stated that the number of auxiliary police reached 1,770 in 1958 and 1,700 of them were Turkish Cypriots.¹⁵ Meanwhile, it was a well-known but unspoken fact that Turkish Cypriot leaders encouraged Turkish Cypriot youth to join the UK security forces as part of their policies.¹⁶ Accordingly, Turkish Cypriot policemen would help the Turkish Cypriot leadership while fighting against EOKA by taking part in the security forces.¹⁷ Sadrazam also supported this view and stated that the Turkish Cypriots, who were the auxiliary police, contributed greatly to the distribution of weapons brought to the island from Türkiye.¹⁸ As a result, while Turkish Cypriots in the UK security forces died during the fight against EOKA and they were not perceived as British casualties but Turkish. The perception was that EOKA was killing the Turkish Cypriots. When the Turkish Cypriots began to attack against the Greek Cypriots in 1958, the relations between the two communities deteriorated and ethnic violence gradually increased. As can be seen, ethnic violence in Cyprus was organized by the leaderships of the two communities and the foreign powers.

13. N. Kızılyürek, (2016), *Bir Hınç ve Şiddet Tarihi* [A History of Resentment and Violence], İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi, İstanbul, p. 103-104.

14. C. Hitchens, (1994), *Cyprus*, Quartet Books, London, p. 43.

15. J. Reddaway, J. (1986), *Burdened With Cyprus: The British Connection*, K. Rustem and BRO & Weidenfield and Nicolson Ltd, London, p. 90.

16. For the explanations of one of the Volkan leaders Şakir Özel is in K. Keser, (2016), *Kıbrıs'ta Yeraltı Faaliyetleri ve Türk Mukavemet Teşkilatı* [Underground Activities in Cyprus and Turkish Resistance Movement], IQ Kültür Sanat Yayıncılık, İstanbul, p. 166.

17. Kızılyürek, (2016), *opcit*, p. 105.

18. H. Sadrazam, (2013), *Kıbrıs'ın Savaş Tarihi* [War History of Cyprus], Vol. 2, Söylem Yayınları, Lefkoşa, p. 581.

US Policies after the Collapse of the Bi-communal Republic and Violence in Cyprus

The conflict on Cyprus in the 1950s resulted the involvement of the US in the issue. While the republic was established, three NATO members, the UK, Türkiye and Greece became the guarantors of the new state. The UK ceded the island to the Republic of Cyprus, while it had two sovereign military bases. Since the relations between the two communities became tense in the 1950s, the survival of the state in Cyprus depended on mutual goodwill and working together. The most important problem was that the leaders of the new state adhered to the policies of Enosis and Taksim (partition) and did not protect the Republic of Cyprus sufficiently. The problems regarding the constitution and municipalities could not be overcome. On December 21, 1963, with the first bullet fired the island began to experience war and violence once again. While the “motherlands” Türkiye and Greece supported their communities, they abandoned their global task of the Cold War, containing the USSR and they focused on their national interest. The US and the USSR had to make a deal at the UN to stop the violence in Cyprus. The Resolution 184 of March 4, 1964, made the Greek Cypriots the sole owner of the state until the problem would resolved. With this decision, the parties accepted the deployment of an UN Peacekeeping Force in Cyprus.

It soon became clear that the UN resolution could not solve the problems. Türkiye did not find the solution of the UN satisfactory and began to express it more loudly.¹⁹ In order to reach an acceptable solution Ankara would like to make a military intervention to Cyprus. Athens on the other side demanded to “solve the problem through Enosis” and The US officials started a debate at the State Department of the US. As a result of the discussions, the US plan for Cyprus took shape.²⁰ The plan was proposing a NATO country to rule Cyprus instead of a “wolf in priestly dress.” While the US was discussing possibility of this scenario, on June 4, 1964, Prime Minister İsmet İnönü informed the US ambassador to Ankara that government of Türkiye decided to intervene in Cyprus as a result of the pressure of the Turkish Cypriots, the opposition parties and the public.²¹ Meanwhile, the “Johnson Letter,” which would damage the relations between Türkiye and the US was delivered to Prime Minister İnönü on 5 June. This letter would push Türkiye to have rapprochement with the USSR and being closer to Non-Aligned countries.²² The US officials were thinking according to the “Western” interest and the NATO members had common obligations in defense.

19. CH JUSMMT Ankara, 12.3.1964, POL 23-8 CYP, box 2081, NARA.

20. Ball to Rusk, 27, 10.5.1964/TOSEC, POL 23-8 CYP, box 2084, NARA.

21. T. Bahçeli, (1990), *Greek-Turkish Relations since 1955*, WestPoint Press, Boulder, San Francisco & London, p. 63.

22. Rusk, Deptel to Ankara 1290, 5.6.1964, “Message from Johnson to İnönü”, POL 23-8 CYP, box 2085, NARA.

Also, with the decision taken within the NATO in 1956, it was agreed that the problems between the allies should be resolved by peaceful means.²³ The Johnson Letter opposed intervention in Cyprus and declared that the US weapons could not be used for this purpose. This letter prevented Ankara's intervention but existing influence of the US on Türkiye was also eroded.

In the following period, the US tried to reach a solution through Türkiye and Greece and proposed a plan in which non-peaceful methods could be used. George Ball, the US Under-Secretary of State, who is the most experienced person on Cyprus, has been appointed head of the new US initiative.²⁴ Until mid-June, Ball met with the leaders of the UK, Türkiye and Greece to clarify his thoughts.²⁵ According to Ball, Greece realized for the first time that the Cyprus problem was dragging Athens into the war, and started to talk about a negotiation process in which the Cypriot President Makarios did not participate. Having received the support of Türkiye for a US initiative after Greece, Ball presented his report at 11 June to President Johnson.²⁶ Johnson invited İnönü and Greek Prime Minister George Papandreu to Washington DC and he received a consent of them to discuss the US Plan in Geneva.²⁷ The talks would be within the UN initiative but under the auspices of Dean Acheson, the former US secretary of state. The proposed document was called Acheson Plan, suggested a kind of Enosis while giving Türkiye a sovereign base, it also ensured the security of the Turkish Cypriots. The great part of the island would be given to Greece and the Turkish Cypriots would gain autonomy at the local level.²⁸ According to the US, this plan was a solution that the Greeks could accept as Enosis and the Turks as Taksim. As can be seen, the US plan aimed to effectively eliminate the Republic of Cyprus. The fact that the Cypriots were not represented in the talks in Geneva showed that the plan was aimed to be imposed on them. While preparing the plan, the US thought that the agreements between Türkiye and Greece would be sufficient and assumed that they would persuade their communities in Cyprus. As can be seen, one of these methods was the use of violence, if necessary, against those who opposed the plan.

23. Report of the Committee of Three on Non-Military Cooperation in NATO, 13 December, 1956]; Memorandum of the Telephone Conversation of the Turkish Ambassador and the Secretary, 4.6.1964, POL 23-8 CYP, box 2085, NARA.

24. Telcon between Johnson and Rusk, 9.6.1964, POL 23-8 CYP, box 2081, NARA.

25. Rusk to Ankara 1337, 11.6.1964: POL 23-8 CYP, box 2085, NARA; G. W. Ball, (1982), *The Past Has Another Pattern: Memoirs*, W. W. Norton & Company, New York, London, pp. 352-355.

26. Memorandum from Ball to Johnson, Subject: The Cyprus Problem, 11.6.1964, POL 23-8 CYP, box 2085, NARA.

27. Memcon between the US and the Turkish Delegations, 22.6.1964 & Memcon between the Greek and American Delegations, 24.6.1964, POL 23-8 CYP, box 2085, NARA.

28. Acheson to Ball, Embtel 114, 14.7.1964: POL 23-8 CYP, box 2085, NARA 2087.

The US Plan

Acheson started the negotiations with the Turkish representative Nihat Erim on 9 July. Apart from that, he continued his contacts with the UN mediator.²⁹ After Acheson presented his own proposals, Erim “presented the partition plan of the Turks” as a counter-suggestion. Acheson thought that a Turkish base could be established on the Karpaz peninsula and Türkiye’s “need for security” would be met. Acheson claimed that the security and welfare of Turkish Cypriots could be solved within the scope of Enosis. Accordingly, Turkish Cypriots would have a local and autonomous administration under the control of the Greek government. In addition, one or more regions with a Turkish Cypriot majority would be created and these area(s) be administered by the Turkish Cypriots. In this/these region/ regions, the Turkish Cypriots would have their own police, courts, water administrations and powers to build regional roads, apart from levying taxes.³⁰ In short, the US plan essentially gave the majority of the island to Greece, while the Karpaz peninsula was presented to Türkiye as a sovereign territory. Türkiye found the US plan as positive and stated that it could accept it.

The US wanted the plan to be discussed in secret and to inform the Cypriots after the agreement of the parties. However, the contents of the talks were leaked outside and Makarios became aware of the details of the plan. Makarios immediately went to Athens to reject the plan and tried to get the support of the Greek people. The prediction of the US that “Greece decides and Greek Cypriots accept it” did not come true and Makarios managed to gain the support of the Greek public. The US ambassador, Labouisse, reported the success of Makarios in Athens on July 31st: “Yesterday, Archbishop Makarios was at the center of Greek policy, pushing the Papandreou government behind the scenes. [...] The center of the Hellenism was Nicosia, not Athens.”³¹ During his meetings with the Greek government in Athens, Makarios also received a promise from Prime Minister Papandreou that the US plan would be rejected.

Despite Papandreou's promise to Makarios, he gave up on his promise as a result of the great pressure exerted by the US on Greece and Athens decided to continue the talks in Geneva.³² Hearing this decision of Papandreou, Makarios restarted the military attacks against the Turkish Cypriots. According to Drousiotis, this military attack was intended to collapse the talks in Geneva. Because the continuation of the conflicts in Cyprus would strain Turkish-Greek relations and

29. The report of the NSC meeting, 4.8.1964: Records of Undersecretary of State George W. Ball, 1961-1966, Lot 74D272, Entry 5175, Cyprus 1 Contingency Plans to Cyprus VI Miscellaneous, box 12, NARA.

30. Acheson to Ball, Embtel 92, 11.7.1964/92, POL 23-8 CYP, box 2087, NARA.

31. Labouisse, for Acheson, Embtel Athens 187, 31.7.1964: POL 23-8 CYP, box 2087, NARA.

32. Labouisse to Acheson, Embtel Athens 197, 2.8.1964: POL 23-8 CYP, box 2089, NARA.

the negotiations would fail.³³ The UK's past plans for Cyprus have fueled increased violence on the island. In the same way, the US plan of 1964 caused a re-experience of ethnic violence in Cyprus from the very beginning.

The increase of violence in Cyprus caused Acheson to intensify his work even more. Acheson's initial goal was to reduce the differences between the positions of Greece and Türkiye and to prevent the talks from collapsing. According to the US representative, progress on Turkish Cypriot rights and Papandreou's attitude towards the transfer of UK military bases to NATO under Turkish command had to be seen positive. Thus, both Türkiye's security would be ensured and its prestige would be preserved. Acheson also claimed that it would be possible to transfer the sovereignty of Meis (Kastellorizo), a Greek island to Ankara.³⁴ Acheson's philosophy was to satisfy Ankara by meeting Türkiye's security needs and ensuring that the rights of Turkish Cypriots. However, Acheson, who was thinking within the framework of global policies, could not understand why Türkiye was giving more importance to "double Enosis" as he was waiting Ankara to show its satisfaction.³⁵ Türkiye's expectation of a sovereign base ended with Greece's response to Acheson. Although Greece accepted the base proposal in its reply to Acheson on 10 August, it insisted that the base would be leased, not sovereign.³⁶ For the US, the bases being sovereign or leased meant practically the same thing and Türkiye should have understood this point.³⁷

In this process, Prime Minister Papandreou worked on the plan and decided that by Enosis the problem could finish. The Enosis decision however should be taken in the (Greek Cypriots) House of Representatives of Cyprus. Papandreou sent Defense Minister Petros Garoufalias to Cyprus to get Makarios consent on Enosis. While Makarios said he could accept Enosis, he wanted the "impossible" and brought up the condition that the UK should remove its bases from the island and not give any base to Türkiye.³⁸ While the aforementioned process was going on in Cyprus, Papandreou's proposal for a parliamentary decision and said that if the Parliament could not take a decision, the coup route could also be tried. According to the US representative, all that was needed was a secret

33. Drousiotis, M. (2008), *The First Partition: Cyprus 1963-1964*, Alfadi Publications, Nicosia, pp. 234-235.

34. Labouisse, Embtel Athens 116, 14.7.1964: POL 23-8 CYP, box 2088, NARA.

35. Acheson to Ball, Embtel Geneva 168, 21.7.1964: POL 23-8 CYP, box 2090, NARA.

36. Labouisse to Acheson, Athens 260, 11.8.1964: Records of Under Secretary of State George W. Ball, 1961-1966, Lot 74D272, Entry 5175, Cyprus Crisis - Athens Telegrams 1 to Cyprus Crisis - Geneva Telegrams 1, box 14, NARA.

37. Labouisse, Embtel Athens 327, 17.8.1964: 1964-66, POL 23-8 CYP, box 2090, NARA.

38. Drousiotis, *opcit*, p. 279.

agreement between Greece and Türkiye.³⁹ As can be seen, the US plan, which came to the fore for peaceful purposes, also left the door open for a coup when necessary. In fact, the problem for the US was that Türkiye did not trust Papandreou and that the Greek Prime Minister was not strong enough to control Makarios.⁴⁰

Makarios' uncompromising stance caused the US to play their cards a little more openly. When US Department of State officials offered Greece to play the leading role and it should contact directly with the Greek Cypriot National Guard Commander General Georgios Grivas. On August 20, Ball sent the new "American" plan to Athens to be conveyed to Papandreou. What had to be done for the US was clear, and Greece could not be told how to achieve Enosis. Responsibility was on Greece and Papandreou had to strive to achieve success.⁴¹ However, due to Greece's refusal to give land to Türkiye from Cyprus⁴² and Türkiye's refusal to give consent anything less than a sovereign base on the island,⁴³ Acheson announced on 22 August that the plan was rejected by the parties and the Geneva talks failed.⁴⁴

During his time in Geneva, Acheson was in constant communication with the US missions in Washington DC, Athens and Ankara. After the parties rejected the plan the George Ball requested Acheson to continue his task and determined how Enosis could be implemented in practice. According to Acheson, both Greece and Türkiye had sufficient strength to achieve their aims. The US preferred Greece's Enosis plan and not Türkiye's Taksim plan. For this reason, Greece had to take more responsibility and work on Enosis. For this, Greece should assure Türkiye that the security and well-being of the Turkish Cypriots would be protected so that it could prevent Ankara's military intervention. After the agreement with Türkiye, Enosis had to be carried out by the Commander of the National Guard Grivas and the Greek troops on the island.⁴⁵ Meanwhile, in practice the US should encourage Greece and Türkiye to make an agreement

39. Acheson to Rusk, Embtel 426, 19.8.1964: Records of Under Secretary of State George W. Ball, 1961-1966, Lot 74D272, Entry 5175, Cyprus Crisis - Athens Telegrams 1 to Cyprus Crisis - Geneva Telegrams 1, box 14, NARA.

40. Acheson to Rusk, Embtel 425, 19.8.1964: Records of Under Secretary of State George W. Ball, 1961-1966, Lot 74D272, Entry 5175, Cyprus Crisis - Athens Telegrams 1 to Cyprus Crisis - Geneva Telegrams 1, box 14, NARA.

41. Ball to Labouisse, Deptel Flash 327, 20.8.1964: POL 23-8 CYP, box 2091, NARA.

42. Labouisse for Acheson, Flash Deptel 366, 21.8.1964: POL 27 CYP, box 2089, NARA.

43. Acheson, Embtel Geneva 445, 21.8.1964: POL 27 CYP, box. 2091, NARA.

44. Acheson, Embtel Geneva 461, 22.8.1964: Records of Under Secretary of State George W. Ball, 1961-1966, Lot 74D272, Entry 5175, Cyprus Crisis-Geneva Telegrams II to Cyprus Crisis-Dept's Outgoing Telegrams II, box 15, NARA.

45. Acheson for Ball, Embtel Geneva 462, 22.8.1964: Records of Under Secretary of State George W. Ball, 1961-1966, Lot 74D272, Entry 5175, Cyprus Crisis-Geneva Telegrams II to Cyprus Crisis-Dept's Outgoing Telegrams II, box 15, NARA.

before and after Enosis. The third version of the US plan was conveyed to Papandreou and the Prime Minister invited Makarios to Athens to persuade him before responding to the US request. When Makarios accused the Greek Prime Minister of treason in Athens, all the plans changed. According to Labouisse, Makarios accusation of Papandreou of treason against Cyprus completely “shake” the Prime Minister’s position.⁴⁶ Moreover, Türkiye did not trust Papandreou, and the Greek Prime Minister would not act in Cyprus without Türkiye’s guarantee. The US had to consider its plan after Makarios unequivocal rejection of any foreign base including NATO on the island in response to Enosis. Clearly in this stage the agreement between Türkiye and Greece was considered impossible.⁴⁷

The plan, which was shaped for the 4th time on August 26, aimed to achieve Enosis in Cyprus without an agreement between Türkiye and Greece, but with the help of the US.⁴⁸ Acheson's latest plan gave Greece and Türkiye more responsibility. Accordingly, Türkiye and Greece would avoid fighting among themselves and Makarios would be removed from his post. For this, Greece had enough power on the island and the US would help it if necessary. The last step was the inclusion of Türkiye in the Cyprus case. To this end, the US would direct the Turks to create their own military strategy on the island, top secretly and indirectly. Türkiye would occupy the Karpas peninsula, which it specifically aimed to own but would not go beyond it. When Türkiye landed troops on the island, the Greek media would announce that the landing was not intended to attack any part of the island, but to re-establish the constitutional order on the island in accordance with the Treaty of Guarantee.⁴⁹ As can easily be understood, according to the final version of the US plan, Greece and Türkiye would not enter into any conflicts with each other while taking the previously agreed areas under their control. On the other hand, both sides would be free in their movements while maintaining control in their own territories. This understanding paved way for both sides to use violence in Cyprus during the present period and in the following period.

The last plan of the US never came before the parties but the third version of the plan was giving Türkiye and Greece enough hints that the parties could understand their space to act freely when necessary. The forth plan did not come

46. Labouisse, Immediate Embtel Athens 405, also for Acheson, 25.8.1964: Records of Under Secretary of State George W. Ball, 1961-1966, Lot 74D272, Entry 5175, Cyprus Crisis-Athens Telegrams 1 to Cyprus Crisis-Geneva Telegrams 1, box 14, NARA.

47. Labouisse, Flash Embtel Athens 407, also for Acheson, 25.8.1964: POL 27 CYP, box 2089, NARA.

48. Acheson to Ball, Immediate Embtel Geneva 486, Subject: “Outline of Acheson Plan No. 4”, 26.8.1964: Records of Under Secretary of State George W. Ball, 1961-1966, Lot 74D272, Entry 5175, Cyprus Crisis-Geneva Telegrams II to Cyprus Crisis-Dept’s Outgoing Telegrams II, box 15, NARA.

49. Ibid.

before the parties because of various reasons. The upcoming presidential elections in the US and the need for Türkiye and Greece to take radical decisions for the implementation of the plan were possible reasons why the plan was not brought to the agenda. In addition, it is possible to count the possibility that Makarios had a very strong position in Cyprus and Greece. Nevertheless, the implementation of such a plan would cause more bloodshed on the island that might not decrease the tension between the relevant parties in the short period during the era that Western bloc needed solidarity between the members. However, only after ten years later firstly Greece and then Türkiye intervened militarily on the island in accordance with the spirit of the US plan for their own goals.

Conclusion

Western world, especially the US perceived communism threat during first decades of the Cold War. In this context Washington would like to solve the problems of NATO within the "family" to avoid approaches that would benefit the USSR. In 1960s tension between the US and the USSR in the Far East began to move to the Middle East region. For this reason, it was very important to keep NATO's southern flank out of trouble. When the Republic of Cyprus was formed in 1960, the US considered keeping Cyprus under the control of Greece and Türkiye with the support of the UK. However, this "semi-independent state" collapsed at the end of 1963 as the parties focused on their national goals. As mentioned before the US wanted to solve the Cyprus problem within the NATO organization. However Cypriot President Makarios aimed to take the Cyprus problem to the UN where especially the nonaligned states that Cyprus was a member would give full support to him. Also Makarios would get backing of the communist countries as well. The main goal of the US during this period was firstly to prevent a conflict between Turkey and Greece in order to protect the integrity of NATO's southern flank and secondly to control Makarios actions at the UN. When the island became the arena Cold War confrontation during this period, the US reluctantly had to deal more with the problem. The US attempt to bring a NATO unit to Cyprus as a peacekeeping force was blocked by Makarios and the US had to approve a UN force to come to the island that did not include the Soviet bloc troops. However, the arrival of the UN peacekeeping force to Cyprus was delayed and Türkiye began to claim its military intervention to Cyprus. To prevent Türkiye the US started to work on a plan that would radically solve the Cyprus problem. This was the Acheson Plan which would have devastating effects during 1964 and in the following period.

It will be enlightening to remember that the UK was successful to separate the Greek and Turkish Cypriots after 1955. What the US "could do" during the formation of the Republic of Cyprus was to work on some mechanisms to have links between the two communities. Nevertheless, even the constitution that US

mediated to be produced was divisive in character. The US effort was partly successful because the priority of Washington was to unite the Greek and Turkish Cypriots against communism. Although both leaderships united against communism the communities continue to be fragmented because of the divisive nationalisms. When the two communities at late December 1963 began intercommunal strife the US produce a plan to dissolve the Republic of Cyprus and unite Cyprus with Greece while giving a base to Türkiye. Türkiye at the beginning accepted the first version of the plan because it would have a sovereign base in Cyprus. When the second version of the plan introduced however Ankara rejected the plan. The reason was that the US changed its offer from sovereign to lease base and asked Türkiye to accept it. In the case of Greece contrary to the opinion of Washington Greece did not have enough influence on Makarios to get consent for the US deal. While the plan was being discussed in Geneva, Makarios was able to weaken the Greek government by saying "Greece is selling Cyprus." Makarios did not only ensure more soldiers and ammunition from Greece but was able to start a new military operation against the Turkish Cypriots. The bloodshed continued in Cyprus.

Consequently the Acheson Plan was rejected by all parties. However, the US Plan had its legacy and subsequent effects in the following years. Because what was discussed during the Acheson Plan period had its effect. When the Geneva negotiations process is reconsidered it will be seen that there has been a significant evolution in the mindset of Turkey and Greece after the Acheson Plan.

As discussed above the UK Cyprus policies in the 1950s and the US in the 1960s gave way to the violence on the island. Because of the strategic reasons London did not hesitate to use violence as a tool to maintain its sovereignty in Cyprus. The Acheson Plan was not implemented but had great repercussions in the following years. Perhaps the most dramatic reflection of the US plan was in 1974. Both Greece and Türkiye established the intellectual infrastructure of their plans to intervene in Cyprus inspired by the Acheson Plan. The coup carried out by the Greek military junta in Cyprus on 15 July was highly compatible with the coup scenario proposed by Acheson. Although the US was against the Greek military junta's coup in Cyprus, it could/did not prevent the coup. On 20 July Türkiye was acted within the spirit of the Acheson Plan when landing troops on the island. Türkiye knew it well that the US which could/did not stop Greece, would not prevent it either. For this reason, Türkiye was very comfortable and took control of the north of the island by acting in accordance with its partition plan proposed in Geneva. The Acheson Plan was based on the fact that Greece and Türkiye would not fight because of Cyprus and accordingly the parties did not enter a war at Aegean Sea or Trace in 1974 despite all the tensions. Also the parties during the 1974 events acted more autonomous that they could not do in 1964. In 1964 the Cold War was in full gear and the members of NATO were completely dependent on the global policies of the US. Due to the détente of 1970s the allied countries were freer to implement their own national policies. It was the

détente between US and USSR that made Greece and Türkiye freer than 1964. Clearly, Greece and Türkiye used certain elements of the US plan of 1964 in 1974 which caused violence in Cyprus again and the result was *de facto* division of the island.

Bibliography

The US National Archives and Records Administration (NARA)

- Acheson to Ball, Embtel 92, 11.7.1964/92, POL 23-8 CYP, box 2087, NARA.
- Acheson to Ball, Embtel Geneva 168, 21.7.1964: POL 23-8 CYP, box 2090, NARA.
- Acheson to Ball, Embtel 114, 14.7.1964: POL 23-8 CYP, box 2085, NARA.
- Acheson to Ball, Immediate Embtel Geneva 486, Subject: "Outline of Acheson Plan No. 4", 26.8.1964: Records of Under Secretary of State George W. Ball, 1961-1966, Lot 74D272, Entry 5175, Cyprus Crisis-Geneva Telegrams II to Cyprus Crisis-Dept's Outgoing Telegrams II, box 15, NARA.
- Acheson, Embtel Geneva 445, 21.8.1964: POL 27 CYP, box. 2091, NARA.
- Acheson to Rusk, Embtel 425, 19.8.1964: Records of Under Secretary of State George W. Ball, 1961-1966, Lot 74D272, Entry 5175, Cyprus Crisis - Athens Telegrams 1 to Cyprus Crisis - Geneva Telegrams 1, box 14, NARA.
- Acheson to Rusk, Embtel 426, 19.8.1964: Records of Under Secretary of State George W. Ball, 1961-1966, Lot 74D272, Entry 5175, Cyprus Crisis - Athens Telegrams 1 to Cyprus Crisis - Geneva Telegrams 1, box 14, NARA.
- Acheson, Embtel Geneva 461, 22.8.1964: Records of Under Secretary of State George W. Ball, 1961-1966, Lot 74D272, Entry 5175, Cyprus Crisis-Geneva Telegrams II to Cyprus Crisis-Dept's Outgoing Telegrams II, box 15, NARA.
- Acheson for Ball, Embtel Geneva 462, 22.8.1964: Records of Under Secretary of State George W. Ball, 1961- 1966, Lot 74D272, Entry 5175, Cyprus Crisis-Geneva Telegrams II to Cyprus Crisis-Dept's Outgoing Telegrams II, box 15, NARA.
- Acheson to Ball, Immediate Embtel Geneva 486, Subject: "Outline of Acheson Plan No. 4", 26.8.1964: Records of Under Secretary of State George W. Ball, 1961-1966, Lot 74D272, Entry 5175, Cyprus Crisis-Geneva Telegrams II to Cyprus Crisis-Dept's Outgoing Telegrams II, box 15, NARA.
- Ball to Labouisse, Deptel Flash 327, 20.8.1964: POL 23-8 CYP, box 2091, NARA.
- Ball to Rusk, 27, 10.5.1964/TOSEC, POL 23-8 CYP, box 2084, NARA. CH JUSMMT Ankara, 12.3.1964, POL 23-8 CYP, box 2081, NARA.
- Labouisse, Embtel Athens 116, 14.7.1964: POL 23-8 CYP, box 2088, NARA.
- Labouisse, for Acheson, Embtel Athens 187, 31.7.1964: POL 23-8 CYP, box 2087, NARA.
- Labouisse to Acheson, Embtel Athens 197, 2.8.1964: POL 23-8 CYP, box 2089, NARA.
- Labouisse to Acheson, Athens 260, 11.8.1964: Records of Under Secretary of State George W. Ball, 1961-1966, Lot 74D272, Entry 5175, Cyprus Crisis - Athens Telegrams 1 to Cyprus Crisis - Geneva Telegrams 1, box 14, NARA.
- Labouisse, Embtel Athens 327, 17.8.1964: 1964-66, POL 23-8 CYP, box 2090, NARA.
- Labouisse for Acheson, Flash Deptel 366, 21.8.1964: POL 27 CYP, box 2089, NARA.

- Labouisse, Immediate Embtel Athens 405, also for Acheson, 25.8.1964: Records of Under Secretary of State George W. Ball, 1961-1966, Lot 74D272, Entry 5175, Cyprus Crisis-Athens Telegrams 1 to Cyprus Crisis-Geneva Telegrams 1, box 14, NARA.
- Labouisse, Flash Embtel Athens 407, also for Acheson, 25.8.1964: POL 27 CYP, box 2089, NARA.
- Memorandum of the Telephone Conversation of the Turkish Ambassador and the Secretary, 4.6.1964, POL 23-8 CYP, box 2085, NARA.
- Memorandum from Ball to Johnson, Subject: The Cyprus Problem, 11.6.1964, POL 23-8 CYP, box 2085, NARA.
- Memorandum, Telcon between Turkish Ambassador and Secretary of State of the United States, 4.6.1964.
- Memcon between the US and the Turkish Delegations, 22.6.1964 & Memcon between the Greek and American Delegations, 24.6.1964, POL 23-8 CYP, box 2085, NARA.
- Rusk, Deptel to Ankara 1290, 5.6.1964, "Message from Johnson to İnönü", POL 23-8 CYP, box 2085, NARA.
- Rusk to Ankara 1337, 11.6.1964: POL 23-8 CYP, box 2085, NARA.
- Telcon between Johnson and Rusk, 9.6.1964, POL 23-8 CYP, box 2081, NARA.
- The report of the NSC meeting, 4.8.1964: Records of Undersecretary of State George W. Ball, 1961-1966, Lot 74D272, Entry 5175, Cyprus 1 Contingency Plans to Cyprus VI Miscellaneous, box 12, NARA.

Books, Articles and Electronic Sources

- Asmussen, J. "Conspiracy Theories and Cypriot History: The Confort of Commonly Perceived Enemies", *The Cyprus Review*, 23. no. 2 (2011).
- Bahçeli, T. *Greek-Turkish Relations since 1955*, Westpoint Press, Boulder, San Fransisco & London, 1990.
- Ball, G. W. *The Past Has Another Pattern: Memoirs*, W. W. Norton & Company, New York, London, 1982.
- Chandra B. & Others. *India's Struggle For Independence (1857-1947)*, Penguin Books, 1989.
- Drousiotis, M. *The First Partition: Cyprus 1963-1964*, Alfadi Publications, Nicosia, 2008.
- Dwyer, P. and A. Nettelbeck (Ed.) *Violence, Colonialism and Empire in the Modern World*, Cambridge Imperial and Post-Colonial Studies Serie, Cambridge, 2018.
- Ferguson, N. *Empire: The rise and demise of the British world order and the lessons for global power*, Basic Books, New York, 2002.
- Gülboy, P. E. *Sömürgeci Ülke Devleti Kıbrıs Cumhuriyeti* [From the Colony to the Nation State Republic of Cyprus, Khora Yayınları, Lefkoşa, 2015.
- Hitchens, C. *Cyprus*, Quartet Books, London, 1994.
- Holland, R. F. *European Decolonization 1918-1981: An Introductory Survey*, 1985, Palgrave Macmillan, London, 1985.
- Keser, K. *Kıbrıs'ta Yeraltı Faaliyetleri ve Türk Mukavemet Teşkilatı*. (Underground Activities in Cyprus and Turkish Resistance Movement.) IQ Kültür Sanat Yayıncılık, İstanbul, 2016.
- Kızılyürek, N. *Bir Hınç ve Şiddet Tarihi*. (A History of Resentment and Violence.) İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi, İstanbul, 2016.
- Reddaway, J. *Burdened With Cyprus: The British Connection*, K. Rustem and BRO & Weidenfield and Nicolson Ltd, London, 1986.

- Report of the Committee of Three on Non-Military Cooperation in NATO, 13 December, 1956, [https://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/official_texts_17481.htm?](https://www.nato.int/cps/en/natohq/official_texts_17481.htm) [Accessed 6 July 2023].
- Sadrazam, H. *Kıbrıs'ın Savaş Tarihi* [War History of Cyprus], Cilt 2, Söylem Yayınları, Lefkoşa, 2013.
- Thomas, M., & Others. *Crises of Empire: Decolonization and Europe's Imperial States, 1918–1975*, Londra: Hodder Education; Waters T. & Waters D. (Eds. and trans.), (2015). 2018.
- Waters, T., and D. Waters (Eds.) *Max Weber in Weber's Rationalism and Modern Society*, Palgrave, London, 2015.
- Weber in *Weber's Rationalism and Modern Society*, Palgrave, London.

The Role of Incubation in Ancient Greek Asklepieions

By Aneta Liwerska-Garstecka*

The sanctuaries of Asklepios served a healing function in the Greek world throughout antiquity. In modern historiography, it is believed that the sick were treated there by incubation, i.e., sleeping in the temple to obtain a divinatory dream. However, the sources are not clear on this matter. In this article, I analyse four sources that, in my opinion, are the most representative of the issue of treatment methods in the Asklepieions. From the classical period, inscriptions describing healings from Epidauros and the comedy "Wealth" by Aristophanes are extremely important, while from Roman times they include "The Sacred Tales" by Aelius Aristides and the Apellas' inscription from Epidauros. It is significant that none of these sources describes the incubation ritual, and the treatment methods presented in them are rational from the viewpoint of contemporary medicine. Incubation was practiced in the Asklepieions, but its role, in my opinion, was much smaller than commonly believed.

Introduction

"(...) the gentle craftsman of body-strengthening relief from pain, Asklepios, the hero and protector from diseases of all sorts"¹ – this is how Pindar, a Greek poet from the 5th century BC, wrote about Asklepios, the later god of medicine. At that time, the cult of Asklepios, initially a hero and later the god of medicine and patron of doctors, began to spread throughout the Greek world. Nearly a thousand years later, the Latin author Macrobius wrote why Asklepios was so closely associated with the art of medicine: "Aesculapius is in charge of prophecies and auguries. And that is not surprising, seeing that the disciplines of medicine and divination are closely allied: a physician foresees both the good states and the bad that a body will experience, just as Hippocrates says that a physician must tell about a sick person "the things that are and were before and those that are going to be», that is, the things that are, that were, and that soon will come to follow. And that squares with prophecies, which know the things that are, that will be, and that were before."² This quote indicates Macrobius'

*PhD Student, Adam Mickiewicz University in Poznań, Poland.

1. Trans. William H. Race, Pind. *Pyth.* III.6-8: (...) τέκτονα νωδυνίας ἡμερον γυιαρκέος Ἀσκληπιόν, ἦροα παντοδαπᾶν ἀλκτῆρα νούσων.

2. Trans. Robert A. Kaster, Macrobius *Sat.* I.20.4-5: "(...) Aesculapius divinationibus et auguriis praesit nec mirum, si quidem medicinae atque divinationum consociatae sunt disciplinae. nam medicus vel commoda vel incommoda in corpore futura praenoscit, sicut ait Hippocrates oportere medicum dicere de aegro, τὰ τε παρεόντα καὶ τὰ προγεγονότα καὶ τὰ μέλλοντα ἔσεσθαι, id est, quae sint, quae fuerint, quae mox ventura sequentur. quod congruit divinationibus quae sciunt τὰ τ' ἔοντα τὰ τ' ἐσόμενα πρό τ' ἔόντα".

belief in the connection between medicine and the art of prophecy. Asklepios was the mythical son of Apollo, hence the suggestion that, like his father, the god of medicine predicted the future. However, it is primarily a metaphor depicting the nature of medical art, as understood by Macrobius. This connection between medicine and predicting the future did exist in ancient times, but it is not always properly understood by modern researchers, which may sometimes lead to drawing incorrect conclusions.³

The popularity of Asklepieions in the ancient world can certainly be evidenced by the effectiveness of the help provided there. Temples of Asklepios were situated in nearly every polis, with the most significant ones being Panhellenic, operating often far from urban centres, attracting patients from across the Greek and later Greco-Roman world. An essential consideration is the historical period under discussion: Asklepieions and their functions evolved over the centuries. Therefore, this paper focuses on sources from the classical and Roman periods, emphasizing the largest and most significant ancient sanctuaries. This choice is informed by both the state of preservation of the sources and the opportunity to observe the changes that occurred over several hundred years of their operation.

The prevailing view in contemporary scientific literature suggests that patients in the Asklepieions were treated through a practice known as incubation, wherein individuals slept in the temple with the aim of obtaining a divinatory dream. The concept of incubation gained prominence through the work of Ludwig Deubner, who published *De incubatione* in 1900. L. Deubner emphasised the significance of dreams in foreseeing the future, particularly in the Christian world during late antiquity. He posited that incubation was a common practice in the pagan world, particularly in sanctuaries dedicated to chthonic gods or heroes associated with the underworld, such as Trophonios, Amphiaraos, and Asklepios.⁴

3. It should be noted here that the connection between medicine, magic and religion also existed much earlier in the ancient Near East. There too, as with the Greeks, dream interpretation was practiced. However, there is no indication that incubation, i.e., sleeping in a sacred place in order to obtain a divination dream, was widespread, as there are very few sources confirming such a practice, particularly concerning healing, see Sally A. Butler, *Mesopotamian Conceptions of Dreams and Dream Rituals* (Münster, 1998), 217-239; A. Leo Oppenheim, *The Interpretation of Dreams in the Ancient Near East* (Gorgias Press, 2008), 187-188; diagnosing diseases through dreams was quite widespread in the ancient Near East, but as a rule it had nothing to do with incubation, see P. J. Eijk, "Divination, Prognosis, and Prophylaxis: the Hippocratic Work "On Dreams" (De Victu 4) and its Near Eastern Background" In *Magic and Rationality in Ancient Near Eastern and Graeco-Roman Medicine*. Edited by H. F. J. Horstmanshoff, M. Stol (Leiden-Boston, 2004), 187-218, especially 215.

4. Ludwig Deubner, *De incubatione* (Lipsia, 1900), 1-14; on incubation and healing dreams in the Christian world: Ildikó Csepregi *Incubation in Early Byzantium: The Formation of Christian Incubation Cults and Miracle Collections* (Turnhout, 2024); I. Csepregi "Who Is Behind the Incubation Stories? The Hagiographers of Byzantine Dream-Healing

Since then, subsequent researchers have generally assumed that incubation was the primary method of treatment in the sanctuaries of Asklepios.

The role of incubation as one of the treatment methods in the Asklepieions has been examined by numerous researchers, including Rudolf Herzog, as well as the authors of an extensive collection of sources on Asklepios with commentary – Ludwik and Emma L. Edelstein.⁵ Eric Dodds' book *Greeks and the Irrational* significantly influenced the understanding of incubation. Dodds argued that the content of incubation dreams experienced by patients in the temple of Asklepios reflected the cultural norms of the time, as well as the particular atmosphere prevailing in the temples, where patients were immersed in stories of miraculous healings before sleep. However, Dodds regarded dreams depicting realistic scenarios, such as surgical procedures, as highly improbable products of imagination. Moreover, he made several simplifications by juxtaposing sources of varying specificity and, notably, from different historical periods.⁶

The theme of incubation is also prominently featured in Lynn LiDonnici's book, where the author presents a new translation of inscriptions from Epidaurus, one of the most significant sources describing healings attributed to Asklepios. These stories are interpreted as accounts of patients' dreams during incubation.⁷ In recent years, two highly important works on incubation have been written. The first, authored by Hedvig von Ehrenheim, focuses on reconstructing the progression of incubation rituals during the classical and Hellenistic periods, drawing from Epidaurian inscriptions, Aristophanes' comedy *Wealth*, and the sacred laws (*leges sacrae*) from the sanctuaries of Asklepios as well as Amphiaraos of Oropos.⁸ The second monograph, by Gil H. Renberg, provides an extensive examination of incubation not only in the Greco-Roman world but also in the ancient Near East.⁹ It is noteworthy that Renberg distinguishes between divinatory and therapeutic incubation. This is, so far, the only such detailed, in-depth, and documented study on the practice currently called incubation.

However, a significant question arises regarding whether ancient sources, often cited as evidence of incubation in the temples of Asklepios, actually

Miracles, in *Dream, Healing, and Medicine in Greece. From Antiquity to the Present*. Edited by Steven M. Oberhelman (London, 2013), 161-187; in the same collective volume also Timothy S. Miller, "Hospital Dreams in Byzantium", 199-215.

5. Rudolf Herzog, *Die Wunderheilungen von Epidaurus. Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte der Medizin und der Religion* (Leipzig, 1931); Emma J. Edelstein, Ludwig Edelstein, *Asclepius. Collection and interpretation of the testimonies* (Baltimore, 1945), vol. I-II.

6. Eric Dodds, *The Greeks and the Irrational* (Berkeley-Los Angeles, 1959), 110-119.

7. Lynn R. LiDonnici, *The Epidaurian miracle inscriptions. Text, translation, and commentary* (Atlanta, 1995), 12: "Most commonly, Iamata tales deal with the practice of 'incubation'".

8. Hedvig von Ehrenheim, *Greek Incubation Rituals in Classical and Hellenistic Times* (Stockholm, 2011).

9. Gil H. Renberg, *Where Dreams May Come. Incubation Sanctuaries in the Graeco-Roman World*, Vol. I-II (Leiden-Boston, 2017).

describe this ritual. Many expressions found in these sources are ambiguous, lacking terms that unequivocally indicate incubation. Another research challenge associated with this issue is whether patients in the Asklepieions primarily received medical assistance, or if healing predominantly involved sleeping in the temple and receiving a divinatory dream. The resolution of this question could be pivotal in attempting to define the concept of so-called temple medicine.

I begin this article by delving into an exploration of what incubation entailed in the ancient Greek world and how it was perceived during that era. Subsequently, I analyse four sources that are regarded as particularly significant for the examination of the *sacred dream* phenomenon in the Asklepieions: namely, from the classical period, inscriptions from Epidauros dating back to the 4th century B.C. and Aristophanes' comedy *Plutus (Wealth)*, and from Roman times, *The Sacred Tales* by Aelius Aristides and the so-called Apellas' inscription from Epidauros. While these testimonies are not exhaustive, I believe they are the most illustrative in terms of understanding incubation, thereby facilitating the derivation of conclusions regarding the nature of the assistance rendered in the Asklepieions.

Incubation in the Greek World

A widely acknowledged definition of incubation is articulated by Fritz Graf in *The Oxford Classical Dictionary*: "ritual sleep in a sanctuary in order to obtain a dream, mostly for healing".¹⁰ Graf identifies the sanctuaries of Asklepios and the Amphiareion in Oropos as the main sites for incubation practices. Moreover, he references the incubation oracles of Calchas and Podalirius, albeit our understanding of their operations remains limited due to the absence of preserved sources that could offer further insights into their functioning.

The term "incubation" originates from Latin (*incubatio*), derived from the verb "incubo", meaning "to lie upon", implying sleeping in a temple. Its Greek equivalent is the word ἐγκοίμησις, which, however, appears only once in the sources, specifically in Diodorus Siculus, within the context of Egyptian gods.¹¹ In sources concerning treatment in the sanctuaries of Asklepios or the temple of Amphiaraos, "sleeping in the temple" is described using various verbs associated with sleep, including καθεύδω, κατάκειμαι, κατακλίνω, κατακοιμάω, ἐγκατακοιμάομαι.¹² Consequently, there was no single Greek term exclusively

10. Fritz Graf, "Incubation", In: *The Oxford Classical Dictionary*, 4th Edition. Eds. Simon Hornblower, Antony Spawforth (Leiden-Boston, 2005), 731-732.

11. Diod. Sic. 1.53.

12. List of Greek words for incubation: Ehrenheim, *Greek Incubation Rituals in Classical and Hellenistic Times*, 15, footnote. 21, and Renberg, *Where Dreams May Come*, 8, footnote. 11.

corresponding to "incubation." This raises doubts as to whether each instance of a source mentioning sleeping or lying in a temple denotes incubation.

In the case of the temple of Amphiaraos, it can be inferred that incubation was the primary purpose for pilgrims visiting there. Amphiaraos, a seer and hero swallowed by the earth, possessed a chthonic nature that enabled him to prophesy the future through sacred dreams, namely incubation.¹³ Conversely, Asklepios, although also considered a chthonic god (originally a hero, only later revered as a deity around the 5th century B.C.), had a distinct nature: he primarily embodied the role of a healing deity, serving as the archetype of a physician who employed both mystical spells and "rational" methods such as surgery and medicinal treatments.¹⁴ It is noteworthy that no source directly outlines the incubation procedure. Of course, this may be due to the fact that no evidence has survived to this day about how the rituals took place and what such treatment looked like. However, analysing the sources that have survived, one may have doubts whether incubation played as important a role as is attributed to it in the sanctuaries of Asklepios.

Inscriptions from Epidauros

The most significant sources from the classical period concerning treatment in the Asklepieion are primarily epigraphic sources. Four stelae with descriptions of healings dating back to around the mid-4th century BC have been preserved in Epidauros.¹⁵ They contain 70 stories detailing the patient's name, the disease they suffered from, and the method of their cure. These texts were composed by priests, drawing upon oral testimonies of cured patients, votive offerings of gratitude, as well as earlier inscriptions that remain unknown to us.¹⁶

13. Albert Schachter, *Cults of Boiotia*. Vol. 1: Acheloos to Hera (London, 1981), 21-23.

14. Pind. *Pyth* III 51-53: τοὺς μὲν μαλακαῖς ἐπαοιδαῖς ἀμφέπων, τοὺς δὲ προσανέα πίνοντας, ἢ γυίοις περᾶπτων πάντοθεν φάρμακα, τοὺς δὲ τομαῖς ἔστασεν ὀρθούς – "some he tended with calming incantations, while others drank soothing potions, or he applied remedies to all parts of their bodies; still others he raised up with surgery", trans. William H. Race; Steven M. Oberhelman, "Inscribing Votive Offerings and Tamata: Narratives, Artefacts, Asklepios, and Panagia Megalochari", *Athens Journal of Humanities & Arts*, Volume 7, Issue 1, (2020), 15-16.

15. IG IV2 1 121-124; LiDonnici, *The Epidaurian miracle inscriptions*, 80-82; these are probably four of the six stelae that Pausanias described: II.27.3.

The stelae (A, B, C and D) are currently in the Archaeological Museum of Epidauros, they are heavily damaged (only a small fragment of stele D has survived), some of the texts are broken, so not all stories can be analysed. The text was written in stoichedon, and you can still see the extraordinary care taken in making the inscriptions, especially when looking at the inscription squeezes.

16. LiDonnici, *The Epidaurian miracle inscriptions*, 40-49.

The original locations of the stelae are still unknown, as they were not discovered *in situ*; instead, their fragments were utilised in the construction of subsequent Christian buildings. There are speculations that they may have been exhibited in the Abaton, where stone bases were found, at least one of which matched the dimensions of one of the stelae.¹⁷ However, recent findings indicate that the dimensions of the four bases found do not align with those of the stelae, and Pausanias reported seeing six. The ancient traveller also notes that they were displayed "within the circle" (περιβολος), indicating placement within the temenos, rather than explicitly within the Abaton itself.¹⁸ Abaton was a relatively small structure¹⁹, suggesting that it may have been dimly lit inside. Placing stelae with inscriptions there would likely have restricted their readability and accessibility to a limited number of people. It is more plausible that the inscriptions were situated outdoors, perhaps in proximity to the Abaton, allowing all visitors, including those accompanying the sick, to read their contents.²⁰

Learning about healing stories undoubtedly influenced the mental outlook of patients. Strengthening the patient's belief in recovery, even if not immediate, was crucial.²¹ The inscriptions employ simple, unsophisticated²² language devoid of medical terminology, often repeating stereotypical formulas. As such, they were tailored for ordinary people, particularly patients awaiting treatment. Notably, most of the depicted events occur during sleep, although the content often suggests this was merely a convention.

The didactic aspect of these stories was equally significant. Patients could learn about what to expect and which ailments could be cured in the sanctuary. They were instructed to offer a votive offering for their recovery, and neglecting to do so could result in a recurrence of the illness. Additionally, several narratives

17. LiDonnici, *The Epidaurian miracle inscriptions*, 15-19.

18. Paus. II.27.3; Ioannis G. Mavrommatidis, *Η Ιωνική Στοά του Ασκληπιείου της Επιδαύρου το λεγόμενον Άβατον* (Αθήνα, 2021), 846-852.

19. Sebastian Prignitz, *Bauurkunden und Bauprogramm von Epidauros II* (München, 2022), 173-175 indicates that the Abaton consisted of three rooms: the front hall (προκοιτατήριον), the inner sleeping room (ἐνκοιμητήριον), and the smallest of them, the so-called Building K, built on the site of an earlier structure. Mavrommatidis, *Η Ιωνική Στοά του Ασκληπιείου της Επιδαύρου το λεγόμενον Άβατον*, 854-857 believes that building K could have served as a surgery room, because this place was the only one in Abaton that was completely closed to the eyes of outsiders.

20. Speculations on this matter are also put forward by Rachel J. Levine, *Dreaming the Divine: Ritual and Architecture at Ancient Greek Healing Sanctuaries of Asklepios* (Toronto, 2008), 257-258.

21. For example, Sostrata from story B5, who was cured after she had already left the sanctuary; here and below, I am using the designations of individual steles (A, B, C, and D) and the numbering of the stories according to LiDonnici., *The Epidaurian miracle inscriptions*, 85-131.

22. Herzog, *Die Wunderheilungen von Epidauros*, 58-60.

depict patients who mocked the notion of instantaneous cures for their ailments. Although they were ultimately healed, they faced repercussions for their disbelief.²³

The majority of the cures recounted on the stelae occur during sleep and are attributed to Asklepios. Typically, the patient arrives at the Asklepieion, falls asleep, experiences a vision while sleeping, and departs the sanctuary the following day healed. However, the descriptions of these dreams often include quite rational actions. In story A4, the god administers medicine into Ambrosia's eye, in A12 Asklepios draws a spear from Euhippus' jaw, while in A13 the god performs surgery on the man's chest, removing leeches and then suturing the wound. Similarly, on stele B, there are additional accounts of such interventions: Asklepios operates on a man's stomach, excises a tumour, and closes the incision (B7) - it is further noted that "the floor in the Abaton was covered in blood".²⁴ In B20, the god "ground up an herb and poured it into his eye," while in B21 Asklepios provided Erasippa with a cup of medicine to ingest, resulting in vomiting. These narratives may indicate specific medical and surgical interventions undergone by patients. As these events occurred within the sanctuary, they carried a religious significance, with Asklepios' role in all healings being emphasised. However, these accounts do not describe incubation, as sleep in these instances was not utilised to receive divine instructions; rather, patients underwent various treatments while asleep. There are theories that this sleep was induced artificially, potentially through the use of substances like opium, as surgical procedures necessitated sedation.²⁵

In some of the descriptions on the stelae, it is unclear how the cure occurred. This ambiguity is evident in stories concerning issues with fertility. For instance, Kleo from story A1 "slept in the Abaton" and upon leaving, immediately gave birth to a boy who, moreover, promptly bathed in the spring and walked with his mother. While these accounts contain elements of fantasy, their purpose was to convey a sense of miraculous events and the extraordinary actions of Asklepios. Similarly, in story A2, Ithmonika "saw a vision" twice, resulting in her becoming pregnant and then giving birth to the desired girl. In B11, Andromache had a dream and subsequently became pregnant, a pattern mirrored in stories B14, B19, and B22. Many descriptions of other ailments are also unclear. For example, the healing of a mute boy who simply made a sacrifice and performed "the required things" and underwent spontaneous healing, as it seems (A5). In story A11, a man named Aischines inserted thorns into his eyes, fell asleep, and awoke healed. Likewise, a stone in a man's penis was removed while he was sleeping (A14).

23. The man in story A3 was named "Unbeliever", and Ambrosia of Athens in story A4 had to offer a silver pig as a votive offering; Mathew Dillon, "The didactic nature of the Epidaurian Iamata", *Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik* 101 (ZPE, 1994), 253-257.

24. All quotations from Epidaurian inscriptions from the 4th century BC translated by Lynn LiDonnici.

25. Helen Askitopoulou et al., "Surgical cures under sleep induction in the Asclepieion of Epidauros". *International Congress Series* 1242 (2002), 15-17.

There are also cures described involving being licked by a dog (A20 and B6), cures of blindness (A18, B2, C22) in an unknown manner, removal of birthmarks on the forehead (A6, A7), treatment for kidney stones (A8), dropsy (B1), tapeworm (B3), headaches (B9), and numerous other similar ailments. What all these described cures have in common is that the patients received specific physical assistance. In these cases, it is not a matter of sleeping in a temple to obtain a dream vision and treatment instructions, but rather the cure itself, likely performed by physicians and/or surgeons present in the sanctuary.

Among the Epidaurian inscriptions, there are stories involving incubation, although they do not pertain to medical treatment. For instance, in B4, a father searching for his missing son slept in the sanctuary and had a vision where Asklepios guided him to his son's whereabouts. Consequently, after seven days, the father found his son. Similarly, in story C3, a woman named Kallikrateia sought to uncover the location of her deceased husband's hidden treasure. She turned to Asklepios and received precise instructions in a dream regarding where to search for the treasure. Of course, she found valuable gold in the place that god had given her in her dream. It appears that Herakleitos of Chios (C20) also approached the god for a similar purpose, i.e. searching for gold, although the text is heavily damaged at this point. From the surviving fragments, it can be inferred that Herakleitos successfully recovered gold he may have previously lost. These narratives exemplify typical instances of incubation dreams, wherein the god imparts instructions and guidance during a dream vision within the sanctuary.

The practice of incubation is possibly depicted in story B1. The patient, Arata of Lacedaemon, was suffering from dropsy, preventing her from traveling to Epidaurus. Her mother slept in her place in the Asklepieion. She experienced a somewhat fantastical dream wherein the god severed her daughter's head, allowing the excess fluids to drain out, and then reattached the head to her neck. Upon the mother's return home, it was discovered that her daughter was cured and had the same dream. Performing a religious act on behalf of another individual is not uncommon, reminiscent of the narrative recounted by Herodotus, where a certain Mys sends a non-Theban to the temple of Amphiaraos to "sleep in the shrine" on his behalf to obtain a divination, as Thebans were prohibited from entering.²⁶ Amphiaraos prophesied during his incubation sleep, so it can be assumed that something similar happened in the Asklepieion. However, in Arata's case, we are not dealing with fortune-telling or future prediction. The outcome of sleeping in the temple is healing, indicating some form of intervention, albeit not within the sanctuary itself. Since there is no alternative interpretation for this story, it can be inferred that Arata was healed through incubation in this instance.

26. Hdt. 8.134; Ehrenheim, *Greek Incubation Rituals in Classical and Hellenistic Times*, 88-89.

The text of the Epidaurian inscriptions lacks descriptions of the rituals accompanying visits to the Asklepieion. This is one of the reasons why it is so complicated to interpret the treatment's nature, specifically whether it relied on the practices of physicians or surgeons, or if the religious aspect held greater significance. A hint regarding rituals is found in story A5, where the boy is mentioned as having "performed the opening sacrifices and did the required things." Given the sacred nature of the Asklepieion, it is reasonable to expect that sacrifices and specific rituals were deemed necessary. "The required things" were probably activities so widely known, perhaps also performed in other sanctuaries, that there was no need to name them specifically; for the Greeks they were obvious. Expressing gratitude to Asklepios for the healing was also deemed necessary. It is probably no coincidence that a plaque (pinax) appears in the first story as an offering of thanks. Other offerings included a silver pig (A4), a mug (A10), and even dice (A8). Additionally, in three stories, payment of *iatra*, i.e. doctor's fee, is mentioned (A5, B2, and B5). While this could be viewed as an expression of gratitude, it also implies the presence of doctors at the Asklepieion.

The content of the Epidaurian inscriptions does not provide a clear answer to the question of the nature of the assistance received by the sick there. However, the descriptions suggest that the patients were treated by medical practitioners or surgeons. This is primarily indicated by the specific and tangible results of the cures. Incubation also seems to have been practiced in the Asklepieion, albeit to a limited extent.

"Plutus" (Wealth) by Aristophanes

Aristophanes' comedy, performed in 388 BC, particularly one of its scenes, is regarded as the sole source depicting treatment through incubation in the Asklepieion. However, the credibility of this source may be questionable since it is a work of literature. The scene depicting the Asklepieion is comedic and undoubtedly exaggerated, but for it to resonate with the audience, it likely drew from real practices.²⁷

In the comedy, the protagonists, seeking wealth, opt to cure the god Plutus (Wealth), who is blind. Intriguingly, their initial plan involves consulting a doctor. However, due to the high cost, they abandon this option, as reflected in the line,

27. Ar. *Pl.* 665-747; Ehrenheim, *Greek Incubation Rituals in Classical and Hellenistic Times*: 17-18; as the second literary source from pre-Roman times, Hedvig von Ehrenheim mentions *Mimiambi* of Herodas from the 3rd century BC, but there is only a description of making a sacrifice for the sick, and the work focuses on the description of works of art in the Asklepieion and does not contain a report on treatment in the sanctuary.

"The pay's not here, so the profession's not there either".²⁸ Consequently, they resolve to "to bed him down in Asclepius' temple."²⁹ This portrayal highlights the Asklepieion as an alternative to medical intervention.

In the play, the account of Wealth's visit to the sanctuary is narrated by one of the characters, Karion, a slave who relays the incident to his wife. The setting is the Asklepieion, likely located in the Athenian port of Piraeus.³⁰ Initially, as part of the purification ritual, Chremylos and Karion, along with the god, opt to immerse Wealth in the sea and bathe him in cold water. The practice of symbolic purification before entering sacred precincts was common, and bathing in seawater was believed to possess special cleansing properties.³¹ However, this was not typically observed before visiting the Asklepieion. It appears that in the case of Wealth, it was intended purely for comedic effect, as a simple sprinkling with water or washing of the hands and face would have sufficed for cleansing. As indicated in the few surviving *sacred laws* (*leges sacrae*), the emphasis was on ritual purity rather than the necessity of bathing.³² It is worth noting that at the beginning of the comedy, when Chremylos and the slave Karion encounter Wealth, he is depicted as unkempt and dirty.³³ This likely prompted the need for a bath, and the comedic aspect was amplified by treating the bath as a ritual purification before visiting the sanctuary.

When the characters entered the sacred precinct, they burned cakes (*popana*, singular: *popanon*) and preliminary offerings – *prothymata*³⁴ – on the altar. This practice was in accordance with the customs of the time, as we find references to preliminary offerings in an inscription containing *sacred laws* from the Asklepieion in Piraeus, dating back to the 4th century B.C., a period close to the time when Aristophanes' play was performed.³⁵ The sacred laws require a preliminary sacrifice to be made to other deities associated with Asklepios

28. Trans. Alan H. Sommerstein, *Ar. Pl.* 408: οὔτε γὰρ ὁ μισθὸς οὐδὲν ἔστ' οὔθ' ἡ τέχνη.

29. Trans. Jeffrey Henderson, *Ar. Pl.* 411: κατακλίνειν αὐτὸν εἰς Ἀσκληπιοῦ. The word κατακλίνειν literally means "lay down", and the entire phrase can also be translated as "lay a sick person in the temple of Asclepius" (LSJ). Therefore, it is not necessarily about spending the night in a sanctuary. A. H. Sommerstein's translation is slightly less adequate here: "to have him spend the night in the sanctuary of Asclepius."

30. There are also speculations that the action takes place in Athens itself; different views on this subject: Ehrenheim, *Greek Incubation Rituals in Classical and Hellenistic Times*, 17, footnote 31; Renberg, *Where Dreams May Come. Incubation Sanctuaries in the Graeco-Roman World*, 133-136.

31. Ehrenheim gives examples, *Greek Incubation Rituals in Classical and Hellenistic Times*, 36.

32. Renberg, *Where Dreams May Come. Incubation Sanctuaries in the Graeco-Roman World*: 241.

33. *Ar. Pl.* 84-85: "Chremylus: Then tell me, how come you're walking around in such a filthy state? Wealth: I've just come from Patrocles' place; he's not had a bath since the day he was born." trans. A. H. Sommerstein.

34. *Ar. Pl.* 659-661.

35. LSCG 21.

(including Apollo, Hermes, Iaso, Akeso), which is omitted in the comedy, probably due to the past pace of the story.³⁶ After making sacrifices, the characters place Wealth in the Asklepieion and prepare their place to rest.³⁷ It is implied that patients had to bring their own bedding and some other items, but Aristophanes does not specify what these were. The expression *ὡς νομίζεται* used in the text means "as is the custom". We do not learn what it was customary to bring with them to the Asklepieion or what to wear. Hedvig von Ehrenheim, based on the translation of A.H. Sommerstein: "the customary garb", draws from this the conclusion that it is possible that the incubators in Piraeus could have been dressed in simple, white clothes.³⁸ The researcher highlights sources mentioning the wearing of white clothes in the Asklepieion, such as the *Hymn of Isyllos*³⁹, *The Sacred Tales*⁴⁰ of Aelius Aristides, and a heavily damaged inscription containing sacred laws from Pergamon.⁴¹ However, all these accounts refer to white clothing in the context of holidays, processions, or other rituals performed in honour of the god. There is no indication that any special clothing was required for patients visiting the sanctuary for treatment. It can only be assumed that the attire must have been comfortable if patients were expected to lie down or sleep, but any conclusions on this matter remain speculative. Furthermore, Aristophanes' description does not provide any insights into this aspect.⁴²

Karion, when asked by his wife whether there were other sick people in the Asklepieion, mentions that there were many people there, although he only specifies the presence of the thief Neocleides, who was blind.⁴³ The storyline involving the blind thief, juxtaposed with his proficiency in his craft, is evidently comedic, aimed at entertaining the audience. Karion then recounts what he observed while unable to sleep. It is important to note that this sequence does not occur within a dream; Karion, who covered himself with his cloak and peered at the god through a hole in it, witnessed the entire situation while awake. The portrayal of the priest caught stealing cakes and figs from the sacred table, intended to evoke laughter from the audience. Finally, the god Asklepios himself,

36. Ehrenheim, *Greek Incubation Rituals in Classical and Hellenistic Times*, 50.

37. Ar. *Pl.* 662-663: "we bedded Wealth down (*κατεκλίναμεν τὸν Πλούτον*) in the proper fashion, and rigged up bunks (*στιβάδες*) for ourselves", trans. J. Henderson.

38. Ehrenheim, *Greek Incubation Rituals in Classical and Hellenistic Times*, 75-77.

39. *IG IV2 1*, 128, line 17-21.

40. Aristid. *Or.* 48.30-31.

41. LSAM 14.

42. Ar. *Pl.* 624-626: τὰ στρώματ' ἐκφέρειν ἐχρήν αὐτόν τ' ἄγειν τὸν Πλούτον, ὡς νομίζεται, καὶ τὰλλ' ὅσ' ἐστὶν ἔνδον ἠύτρεπισμένα – "You should be bringing out our bedding, and also bringing Wealth himself in the customary garb, and all the other things that have been got ready in there", trans. A.H. Sommerstein; "it's time to fetch the bedding and bring out the god himself, with due ceremony, as well as the other things we've got ready", trans. J. Henderson.

43. Ar. *Pl.* 664-668.

accompanied by his mythical daughters – Iaso and Panacea, appeared. This was also a highly exaggerated, comedic element, as the god assumed the role of a physician, meticulously visiting all the patients and examining their ailments.⁴⁴ He was equipped with a stone mortar, pestle, and a box, which, as later revealed, were essential for preparing medicines.⁴⁵ Asklepios proceeded to prepare a poultice (φάρμακον καταπλαστόν) for Neocleides, applying it to his eyes and rolling his eyelids. The action, causing pain to Neocleides, served as a form of punishment for him – it was another manoeuvre by Aristophanes aimed at amusing the audience, as well as the fact that not only was the patient not cured, but Asklepios inadvertently worsened his blindness.

Finally, the god approaches Wealth. A supernatural element is introduced here, as Asklepios wipes Wealth's eyelids, then Panacea covers the sick man's head, and suddenly two large snakes emerge from the temple. Karion observes as the snakes appear to lick Wealth's eyelids. This action results in Wealth's healing. The snake was a symbol of Asklepios, and it also features in Epidaurian inscriptions, where it is depicted as curing various ailments by licking or through other, unspecified means.⁴⁶

Analysing Aristophanes' text, one might question whether it truly depicts incubation. The renowned comic playwright presents a scene of treatment in Asklepios' sanctuary, which is evidently exaggerated, interwoven with comedic elements meant to entertain the audience, along with supernatural occurrences. This scene can be interpreted similarly to the viewpoint of Alan H. Sommerstein⁴⁷, the editor and translator of Aristophanes, who suggests that everything depicted until the patients fall asleep is a realistic portrayal. Further events described by Karion, such as the appearance of Asklepios and his daughters and the actions performed by the god, could not have been witnessed by those undergoing incubation, according to Sommerstein; thus, they are artistic creations by Aristophanes. However, akin to the Epidaurian inscriptions, in "Wealth", Asklepios' interventions and the outcomes of the treatment are tangible: Wealth recovers his sight through the administration of medicine and other undisclosed actions, while Neocleides undergoes specific medical procedures that result in pain. Aristophanes' portrayal may aim to depict the doctor as the embodiment of the god himself, with snakes serving as a form of therapeutic agent. If the healer were not Asklepios but an ordinary individual – a physician aided by assistants – this scene would be rather realistic and potentially less engaging for the audience.

44. Ar. *Pl.* 707-709: "and he went right round, looking very carefully at all the patients' afflictions", trans. A.H. Sommerstein.

45. Ar. *Pl.* 716-725.

46. For example, A17: a snake healed a man's finger by licking it, B13: Tersandros healed by a snake; Edelstein & Edelstein, *Asclepius. Collection and interpretation of the testimonies*, vol. II, 228.

47. Alan H. Sommerstein, *Introduction*. In *Aristophanes Wealth*. Edited with translation and commentary by Alan H. Sommerstein (Warminster, 2001), 13.

The scene described by Aristophanes may not necessarily have been a depiction of the patrons' imaginings at the Asklepieion but rather could have been a reflection of situations occasionally observed by the sick in the sanctuary.

The Sacred Tales by Aelius Aristides

In Roman times, the most significant Asklepieions underwent a slight transformation and became specialised spa centres. This transformation is evident in the substantial expansion of the sanctuaries of Asklepios in Epidaurus and Pergamon.⁴⁸ These expansions included the construction of buildings to accommodate patients who sometimes stayed for extended periods, as well as the addition of swimming pools, baths, and areas for socializing. The sanctuaries evolved into luxurious venues frequented by the Greco-Roman elite. One of the members of such elites, who frequently visited the Asklepieion in Pergamon, was Aelius Aristides, a rhetorician and sophist living in the 2nd century, known for his many preserved orations.

The Sacred Tales (Hieroi Logoi), six orations titled as such by Aristides himself, were not meant for public speaking. In these orations, the author recounts years of struggle with various illnesses and the methods used to treat them. However, above all, Aristides wrote them, as he claims, at the behest of Asklepios – a deity with whom the rhetorician had a deeply personal relationship, considering him his mentor and benefactor.⁴⁹ Aristides sought guidance from Asklepios for various matters, especially concerning his persistent health issues. He frequently describes dreams in which the god appears to him, offers diagnoses, and prescribes treatments.⁵⁰

It is indeed challenging to infer from Aristides' text the situations in which he underwent the incubation ritual, as he does not describe any associated rituals. The word that might suggest the rhetorician is writing about incubation is "κατάκλισις," meaning "making one to lie down." This term appears only twice in *The Sacred Tales*. In the second oration, Aristides mentions "my incubations

48. Two excellent doctoral dissertations provide detailed descriptions of these expansions, clearly visible on the plans of both of these sanctuaries.: David R. Hoot, *The Sanctuary of Asclepius at Epidaurus in Roman Times* (University of Florida 2014), 49; Ece S. Okay, *Healing in Motion. The Influence of Locotherapy on the Architecture of the Pergamene Asklepieion in the second century CE* (Los Angeles, 2016), 24.

49. Aristid. Or. 48.1-4.

50. For Example, Aristid. Or. 47.6-9; 48.7; for the role of dreams and methods of treatment in *The Sacred Tales* see: Aneta Liwerska, *Asklepios i medycyna w II w. Metody leczenia w Świętych mowach Eliusza Arystydesa* (Asklepios and medicine in the 2nd century - methods of treatment in "The Sacred Tales" of Aelius Aristides) (Poznań, 2020), 42-67.

throughout the whole Temple"⁵¹, and in the third oration, he states, "I was sent from the incubation which I was performing (ἐγκατεκεκλίμην) in the Temple of the Saviors."⁵² Additionally, in another excerpt from the second oration, the term κατακλίσις appears, but here the rhetorician simply writes about insomnia: "the impossibility of reclining at night."⁵³ Only in one instance does he indicate that he was lying in the sanctuary according to a dream vision: "I was lying, in accordance with a certain dream vision, between the doors and the latticed gates of the Temple, and the god gave me the following verse as an oracle...".⁵⁴ Here, the term ἐγκατεκεκλίμην is used, meaning "put to bed in a place", similar to the previously quoted fragment.

Aristides visited the Asklepieion occasionally for most of his life, but at the onset of his illness, he spent two years in Pergamon, referring to this period as *Cathedra*: "we came to the Cathedra in Pergamum."⁵⁵ In another passage, recalling the events of that time, he employs a similar expression: "during the Cathedra in Pergamum."⁵⁶ In this context, the term "cathedra" is translated by C.A. Behr as "the time of inactivity," during which Aristides underwent incubation at the Asklepieion.⁵⁷ Behr, however, casts doubt on the idea that anyone could reside on the sanctuary's premises, especially for an extended period, given the absence of a designated incubation area there. Aristides likely lived in the city of Pergamon, either with his friend Asklepiakos or at an inn.⁵⁸ The distance between the sanctuary and the city was small, making it feasible to visit daily. Moreover, Aristides's phrase ἐν Περγάμῳ suggests that he stayed in the city itself, rather than at the sanctuary, for two years. In the sacred laws from the Asklepieion of Pergamon dating from the Hellenistic and later Roman periods, two structures are referenced: a small and a large enkoimeterion. Given their names, they were likely utilised for incubation or patient treatment.⁵⁹ It is conceivable that incubation might have occurred in other buildings within the sacred precinct as well.⁶⁰ These locations seem not to have been intended for extended stays but rather for intermittent visits for incubation or treatment purposes.

51. Aristid. *Or.* 48.80: διὰ παντὸς τοῦ ἱεροῦ κατακλίσεις. All fragments of Aristides in the translation by Charles A. Behr.

52. Aristid. *Or.* 49.7: ἐπέμφθη μὲν ἀπὸ κατακλίσεως, ἦν ἐν Σωτήρων ἐγκατεκεκλίμην.

53. Aristid. *Or.* 48.57: ταῖς νυξὶν ἀμηχανία κατακλίσεως.

54. Aristid. *Or.* 48.71: ἐγκατεκεκλίμην μεταξὺ τῶν τε θυρῶν καὶ τῶν κιγκλίδων τοῦ νεῶ κατὰ δὴ τινα ὀνειράτος ὄψιν.

55. Aristid. *Or.* 48.70: ἐπὶ τὴν ἐν Περγάμῳ καθέδραν ἦλθομεν.

56. Aristid. *Or.* 49.44: ἐπὶ τῆς ἐν Περγάμῳ καθέδρας.

57. Charles A. Behr, *Aelius Aristides and "The Sacred Tales"* (Amsterdam, 1968), 26.

58. Behr, *Aelius Aristides and "The Sacred Tales"*, 29-30.

59. AvP VIII 161A; LSAM 14.

60. Hedvig von Ehrenheim, *Identifying incubation areas in Pagan and Early Christian times* (Athens, 2009), 249-251; The buildings and places of probable incubation are

No fragment of *The Sacred Tales* explicitly indicates an incubation ritual. H. von Ehrenheim suggests that Aristides' text reflects the evolving nature of incubation in Roman times, which could be practiced anywhere within the sanctuary, outside its sacred confines, or even in one's own home.⁶¹ However, there are serious doubts as to whether one can speak of incubation every time Aristides describes a divinatory dream. The challenge lies in the lack of corroborating sources to confirm whether rhetorician's experiences were shared by others visiting the sanctuary. Consequently, it is impossible to verify Aristides' narrative due to the absence of alternative perspectives.

It is known that there were also doctors in the Asklepieion of Pergamon. Aristides had contact with them, and they sometimes gave him advice. An example is Satyros, probably the teacher of Galen himself, who recommended Aristides to use the healing cataplasm, which, unfortunately, did not help the rhetorician.⁶² There was also Theodotos, who interpreted Aristides' dream visions.⁶³ A certain Asklepiakos likely served as a temple attendant but also possessed medical expertise.⁶⁴ Aristides' treatments reflected a rational approach, considering the medical knowledge of the time. The rhetorician frequently engaged in bathing rituals, including mud baths⁶⁵, river baths⁶⁶, and sea baths.⁶⁷ It happened that god, as Aristides claimed, forbade him to bathe when he had stomach problems.⁶⁸ Additionally, the rhetorician used various plant-based remedies such as elaterium⁶⁹, wormwood⁷⁰, the so-called royal ointment containing malabathron⁷¹, kyphi – an Egyptian herbal concoction⁷², and the so-called mixture of Philo⁷³, which included opium among other ingredients. He also received dietary recommendations.⁷⁴ From this, we can infer the pivotal role of the Asklepieion of Pergamon in providing medical care and genuine assistance to patients. Aristides would also visit Allianoi, situated a few kilometres away, where a lavish spa complex existed, likely somehow affiliated with the Asklepieion

identified by Okay, *Healing in Motion. The Influence of Locotherapy on the Architecture of the Pergamene Asklepieion in the second century CE*, 92-112.

61. Ehrenheim, *Identifying incubation areas in Pagan and Early Christian times*, 251.

62. Aristid. *Or.* 49.8-11.

63. Aristid. *Or.* 50.38.

64. Aristid. *Or.* 49.21-23.

65. Aristid. *Or.* 48.74.

66. Aristid. *Or.* 48.48-49.

67. Aristid. *Or.* 48.54-55.

68. Aristid. *Or.* 47.59.

69. Aristid. *Or.* 48.63.

70. Aristid. *Or.* 48.28-35.

71. Aristid. *Or.* 49.21.

72. Aristid. *Or.* 47.26.

73. Aristid. *Or.* 49.29.

74. Aristid. *Or.* 49.34-35.

of Pergamon. Excavations uncovered a plethora of surgical tools there, suggesting the performance of surgeries and medical procedures.⁷⁵ Furthermore, medical instruments dating back to the Roman period have been unearthed in Epidauros and Pergamon.

It is noteworthy to highlight the significant role of divinatory dreams in ancient times, particularly during the Roman era. Dream interpretation held considerable popularity, encompassing not only medical dreams but also those relating to various aspects of human life. Dating back to the 2nd century AD, Artemidoros' work *Oneirocritica*, or *The Interpretation of Dreams*, provides insights into dream meanings based on the dreamer's identity and circumstances. Artemidoros mentions medical dreams, noting instances of people being healed through this means, including cases in Pergamon.⁷⁶ He also suggests that some individuals believe that medical knowledge originated from such divine guidance received in sanctuaries. While the claim may be somewhat exaggerated, it is important to highlight that the interpretation of dreams was indeed a subject of study by among others: Hippocrates, Aristotle, Herophilos, and even Galen.⁷⁷ Interpreting dreams and linking them with health was such an important factor in medicine that doctors and scientists referred to it. Among them, Galen is the sole individual to mention receiving instructions from Asklepios in a dream,⁷⁸ hinting that he may have undergone incubation.

The dreams recounted by Aristides could have been integral to his extensive therapeutic journey, yet they may not always have been associated with incubation, which entails seeking divine guidance through sacred sleep within the sanctuary. This is particularly evident since many of his dreams occurred outside the Asklepieion. Considering the nature of Asklepios' sanctuaries, their healing purposes, and the presence of medical practitioners, it is plausible to assume that incubation was just one facet of their operation, and not necessarily the primary one.

Apellas' Inscription from Epidauros

Of the epigraphic records from the Asklepieions, few have survived from Roman times, and they offer less extensive information compared to the classical period Epidaurian inscriptions discussed earlier. The inscription of Apellas⁷⁹ stands out as unique since it is the sole testimony from Epidauros dating to the

75. Aristid. *Or.* 49.1; 49.3; a detailed inventory of these findings: Daniş Baykan, *Allianoı Tip Aletleri* (Surgical Instrument from Allianoı) (İstanbul, 2009).

76. Artem. 4.22.

77. Details on this topic: Steven M. Oberhelman, *Dreams in Graeco-Roman medicine* (Berlin, 1993), 121-156.

78. Oberhelman, *Dreams in Graeco-Roman medicine*, 139.

79. IG IV2 1, 126.

2nd century AD, and remarkably, it is exceptionally well-preserved. This inscription represents the longest epigraphic account from a patient, presented in the first person.⁸⁰

The patient in question is Marcus Julius Apellas from Mylasa in Asia Minor. He himself acknowledges at the beginning that he was "sent for by the god"⁸¹ due to persistent illness and digestive issues. Apellas spent a minimum of nine days in the sanctuary, undergoing treatment through two main avenues: firstly, he received detailed medical advice, and secondly, he was required to make offerings not only to Asklepios but also to Epione, Asklepios' mythical wife, and the "Eleusinian goddesses."⁸² The instructions purportedly received by Apellas from the god⁸³ resemble prescriptions one might expect from a physician: "to consume cheese and bread, and celery with lettuce, to wash myself on my own, to exercise on the track, to take lemon peels in advance (and) to soak (them) in water, to rub against the wall in the bathhouse by the akoai, to use the upper level as a place for walking, (to engage in) passive exercises, to smear myself with wrestling sand, to go about barefoot, in the bathhouse before getting into the warm water to pour wine over myself, to bathe on my own...".⁸⁴ Asklepios also recommends Apellas to drink milk with honey for indigestion⁸⁵, rub himself with

80. Renberg, *Where Dreams May Come. Incubation Sanctuaries in the Graeco-Roman World*, 169; Aneta Liwerska, "Inskrypcja Apellasa jako źródło poznania charakteru opieki nad pacjentem w asklepiejonie epidauryjskim w II w. n.e." (The Apellas Inscription as a source of knowledge about the nature of patient care in the Asclepieion of Epidauros in the 2nd century AD), *Klio. Czasopismo poświęcone dziejom Polski i powszechnym*, t. 52 (1), 2020, 3-29.

81. IG IV2 1, 126, line 2-3: μετεπέμφθη ὑπὸ τοῦ θεοῦ. All fragments of this inscription in the translation by Gil Renberg.

82. IG IV2 1, 126, l. 14: κοινῇ θῦσαι Ἀσκληπιῶ, Ἠπιόνῃ, Ἐλευσεινίαις.

83. IG IV2 1, 126, l. 5-6: ἐπεὶ δὲ ἐγενόμην ἐν τῷ ἱερῷ ἐκέλευσεν... - "When I was present in the sanctuary he ordered me...".

84. IG IV2 1, 126, l. 7-13: τυρὸν καὶ ἄρτον προλαβεῖν, σέλινα μετὰ θρίδακος, αὐτὸν δι' αὐτοῦ λούσθαι, δρόμῳ, γυμνάζεσθαι, κισθίου προλαμβάνειν τὰ ἄκρα, εἰς ὕδωρ ἀποβρέξαι, πρὸς ταῖς ἀκοαῖς ἐν βαλανείῳ προστρίβεσθαι τῷ τοίχῳ, περιπάτω χρηῖσθαι ὑπερῶ, αἰώραις, ἀφῆ πηλώσασθαι, ἀνυπόδητον περιπατεῖν, πρὶν ἐνβῆναι ἐν τῷ βαλανείῳ εἰς τὸ θερμὸν ὕδωρ οἶνον περιχέασθαι, μόνον λούσασθαι.

85. IG IV2 1, 126, l. 16-17: μέλι ἔμβαλλε εἰς τὸ γάλα, ἵνα δύνηται διακόπτειν - "Add honey to the milk, so that it will be able to cut through".

salt and mustard⁸⁶, and use dill with oil for headaches.⁸⁷ The patient also had to pay the doctor's fee, i.e. the *iatra*.⁸⁸

In the inscription, there is also an indication that Apellas received a dream from Asklepios: "When I asked the god to release me more quickly, I thought [i.e., in a dream] that I exited from the abaton in the area of the akoai fully anointed with mustard and salt, and a small boy holding a smoking censer led me, and the priest said, "You have been cured, but it is necessary to pay the medical fees." And I did the things I had seen".⁸⁹ None of the typical terms indicating incubation are employed here; instead, the term ᾤμην is used, meaning "I thought" in the sense of "it seemed to me." However, the final words clearly indicate that Apellas acted upon what he perceived, presumably in his dream. It is noteworthy that it was not Asklepios who appeared to Apellas, but rather the priest. While this does not exclude the possibility of an incubation dream – given that it was sent by god – the description is so concise that we can only speculate it was a *sacred dream* received within the sanctuary.

It is crucial to highlight that the inscription was issued by Apellas as a votive offering of gratitude to the god and the sanctuary for his cure. Its aim was, on the one hand, to present the way in which the patient was cured, but above all, it was to show the power and agency of Asklepios. The motivations behind its presentation determined its content, hence the inclusion of supernatural themes. However, once again, we lack definitive indications that would allow us to conclusively determine whether incubation took place. The offerings mentioned in the inscription were customary in every sanctuary and do not appear to have had any specific connection to incubation in this instance. Once more, the source fails to provide insights into the incubation ritual, leaving us to speculate about its practice in Epidauros during that period.

86. IG IV2 1, 126, l. 17-18: <v>ἀπυῖ καὶ ἄλσιν κεχρημένος ὅλος – "fully anointed with mustard and salt".

87. IG IV2 1, 126, l. 26-27: ἐπιμείναντί μοι ἄνηθον μετ' ἐλαίου χρήσασθαι πρὸς τὴν κεφαλαλγίαν εἶπεν – "He said to me, as I remained there, that for my headache I should use anise with olive oil".

88. IG IV2 1, 126, l. 20: χρῆ δὲ ἀποδιδόναι τὰ ἱατρὰ – "it is necessary to pay the medical fees".

89. IG IV2 1, 126, l. 17-21: ἐπεὶ δὲ ἐδεήθην τοῦ θεοῦ θᾶττον με ἀπολύσαι, ᾤμην <v>ἀπυῖ καὶ ἄλσιν κεχρημένος ὅλος ἐξιέναι κατὰ τὰς ἀκοὰς ἐκ τοῦ ἀβάτου, παιδάριον δὲ ἠγείσθαι θυμιατήριον ἔχον ἀτμίζον καὶ τὸν ἱερέα λέγειν "τεθεράπευσαι, χρῆ δὲ ἀποδιδόναι τὰ ἱατρὰ." καὶ ἐποίησα ἃ εἶδον (...)

Conclusions

The sources mentioned above do not offer a definitive portrayal of treatments in Asklepieions, as they vary in form and audience. However, one might be tempted to infer certain conclusions from them. Primarily, most of these sources do not provide a detailed account of the incubation ritual. The Epidaurian inscriptions from the 4th century BC are crafted in a style reminiscent of dream descriptions, yet the content suggests actual interventions by doctors or surgeons. Importantly, the outcome of these actions is specific: patients are cured. The descriptions exhibit occasional exaggeration, incorporating unrealistic elements as part of the literary convention, yet the treatment outcomes remain specific. These texts notably lack divinatory dreams or instructions from Asklepios regarding treatment. Instead, they depict the administration of drugs and surgical procedures purportedly carried out by a god, though it is theorised that these actions were realistically performed by surgeons and physicians. The account of Arata of Lacedaemon (B1) is the sole narrative casting doubt on the actual involvement of physicians. Other instances of incubation, involving prophetic dreams, do not pertain to treatment. Hence, it can be postulated that the *sacred dream* constituted only a minor aspect of the activities at the Asklepieion.

Analysing Aristophanes' comedy leads to similar conclusions. Wealth's visit to the Asklepieion does not represent an instance of incubation. Treatment is administered through pharmacological agents, akin to a conventional medical consultation, albeit within the sacred confines of the sanctuary, involving requisite rituals and sacrifices. Lying down in the sanctuary did not signify an incubation for divinatory dreams; rather, it facilitated examination by a physician and subsequent treatment. The nature of Aristophanes' work means that we cannot treat the text literally, but at the same time we must be aware that the audience in the theatre received a parody of a real situation that they knew from their own experience. Therefore, the description of Wealth recovery can be treated as close to reality.

During the Roman period, the character of the Asklepieions, at least in Epidauros and Pergamon, changed slightly, as evidenced by the new buildings and spaces created at that time. *The Sacred Tales* by Aelius Aristides shows us the image of a sanctuary as a place where the sick could spend time on various activities and exercises, but also get advice from a doctor, and maybe even a surgeon. This source may indicate the practice of incubation. Aristides has divinatory dreams in the Asklepieion, but he also dreams in other places, outside the sanctuary. He also does not describe the incubation ritual, although he tries to interpret each dream, sometimes with the help of doctors and staff at the sanctuary. However, it is impossible to unequivocally treat any of Aristides' descriptions as evidence of incubation. The situation is similar with Apellas' inscription, which does not contain any indication that the sick person underwent the incubation ritual. It is true that he received instructions, as he claimed, from

god, but the inscription was a votive offering of thanks to Asklepios because the treatment took place in the sanctuary, so it must have included references to the role of Asklepios and his agency. The instructions allegedly received from the god are consistent with the medical practice of the time, and Apellas probably received them from doctors or temple staff.

Based on the above sources, it is difficult to definitively determine the role of incubation in the treatment of patients at the Asklepieion. However, they do not suggest its special significance. Incubation was certainly practiced due to the chthonic nature of the god Asklepios, but ancient testimonies rather indicate that patients received medical assistance in the Asklepieions. This was the essence of temple medicine: providing medical aid in accordance with contemporary medical knowledge but within the sacred precinct. The specific rituals and sacrifices performed by patients were integral to receiving this assistance. The psychological disposition of patients was also crucial; their faith in healing within such sanctified spaces had to surpass that of visiting a *secular* physician. Given the scarcity and limitations of sources, we can infer that incubation was practiced as one of several methods of aiding patients when other treatments were ineffective or unavailable. However, it was not the predominant form of treatment in the Asklepieions.

Acknowledgments

The research was funded by the National Science Centre, Poland, under research project no. 2021/41/N/HS3/00975.

I would like to thank the Polish Archaeological Institute at Athens for help in carrying out research in Greece, and Dr Daniela Summa from the Berlin-Brandenburg Academy of Sciences and Humanities for the opportunity to familiarize myself with the squeezes of Epidaurian inscriptions stored in Berlin.

Bibliography

Texts and Translations

- Aelius Aristides. *Quae supersunt omnia*, volume II. Edited by Bruno Keil, Weidmann, Berolinum, 1898.
- Aristophanes. *Wealth*. Edited with translation and commentary by Alan H. Sommerstein. Aris & Philips Ltd., Warminster, 2001.
- _____. *Frogs. Assemblywomen. Wealth*. Edited and translated by Jeffrey Henderson. Loeb Classical Library 180. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2002.
- Artemidorus Daldianus. *Onirocritikon Libri V*. Edited by Roger A. Pack, B.G. Teubner: Lipsia, 1963.

- AvP VIII = Habicht Ch. *Die Inschriften des Asklepieions*. *Altertümer von Pergamon VIII 3*, Berlin, 1969.
- Diodorus Siculus. *Library of History*, Volume I: Books 1-2.34. Translated by Charles Henry Oldfather. Loeb Classical Library 279. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1933.
- Herodotus. *The Persian Wars*, Volume IV: Books 8-9. Translated by Alfred D. Godley. Loeb Classical Library 120. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1925.
- IG IV² 1 = *Inscriptiones Graecae IV: Inscriptiones Argolidis*, editio minor, fasc. 1: *Inscriptiones Epidauri*. Edited by Fridericus Hiller de Gaertringen, Berolini apud Gualterum de Gruyter est socios, 1929.
- LSAM = Sokolowski F. *Lois sacrées de l'Asie Mineure*. Editions É. de Boccard Paris, 1955.
- LSCG = Sokolowski F. *Lois sacrées des cités grecques*. Editions É. de Boccard Paris, 1969.
- Macrobius. *Saturnalia*. Volume I: Books 1-2. Edited and translated by Robert A. Kaster. Loeb Classical Library 510. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2011.
- Pausaniae Graeciae descriptio*. 3 Vols. Edited by Maria Helena Rocha-Pereira, BSB B.G. Teubner Verlagsgesellschaft, Leipzig, 1973-1981.
- Pindar, *Olympian Odes. Pythian Odes*. Edited and translated by William H. Race. Loeb Classical Library 56. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1997.

References

- Askitopoulou H., Konsolaki E., Ramoutsaki I.A., M. Anastassaki M. "Surgical cures under sleep induction in the Asclepieion of Epidauros", *International Congress Series 1242*, 2002, 11-17.
- Baykan D. *Allianoi Tıp Âletleri* (Surgical Instrument from Allianoi). İstanbul, 2009, diss.
- Behr C. A. *Aelius Aristides and „The Sacred Tales“*. Adolf M. Hakkert: Amsterdam, 1968.
- _____. (Trans.) *P. Aelius Aristides, The complete works*, vol. II, Orations XVII-LIII. E.J. Brill: Leiden, 1981.
- Butler S. A. L. *Mesopotamian Conceptions of Dreams and Dream Rituals*. Ugarit-Verlag: Münster, 1998.
- Csepregi I. "Who Is behind the Incubation Stories? The Hagiographers of Byzantine Dream-Healing Miracles" In *Dream, Healing, and Medicine in Greece. From Antiquity to the Present* Edited by Steven M. Oberhelman, Ashgate: London, 2013, 161-187.
- _____. *Incubation in Early Byzantium: The Formation of Christian Incubation Cults and Miracle Collections*. Brepols Publishers: Turnhout, 2024.
- Deubner L. *De incubatione capita quattuor*. B.G. Teubner: Lipsia 1900.
- Dillon M.P.J. "The didactic nature of the Epidaurian Iamata", *Zeitschrift für Papyrologie und Epigraphik* 101, 1994: 239-260.
- Dodds E. *The Greeks and the Irrational*. University of California Press: Berkeley-Los Angeles, 1959.
- Edelstein E.J., Edelstein L. *Asclepius. Collection and interpretation of the testimonies*. vol. I-II, Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins Press, 1945.
- Ehrenheim von, H. *Identifying incubation areas in Pagan and Early Christian times*. In *Proceedings of the Danish Institute at Athens VI*. Edited by E. Hallager, S. Riisager, Athens, 2009, 237-275.
- _____. *Greek Incubation Rituals in Classical and Hellenistic Times*. Universitetservice AB: Stockholm, 2011.

- Eijk P. J. *Divination, Prognosis, and Prophylaxis: the Hippocratic Work "On Dreams" (De Victu 4) and its Near Eastern Background*. In *Magic and Rationality in Ancient Near Eastern and Graeco-Roman Medicine*. Edited by H. F. J. Horstmanshoff, M. Stol, Brill: Leiden-Boston, 2004, 187-218.
- Graf F. "Incubation" In *The Oxford Classical Dictionary*, 4th Edition. Eds. Simon Hornblower, Antony Spawforth. Oxford University Press, 2012: 731-732.
- Herzog R., *Die Wunderheilungen von Epidauros. Ein Beitrag zur Geschichte der Medizin und der Religion*. Philologus. Supplementband 22, Heft 3, Dieterich'sche Verlagsbuchhandlung: Leipzig, 1931.
- Hoot D.R. *The Sanctuary of Asclepius at Epidauros in Roman Times*. University of Florida 2014, diss.
- Levine R.J. *Dreaming the Divine: Ritual and Architecture at Ancient Greek Healing Sanctuaries of Asklepios*. Department of Art (Ancient History), University of Toronto, 2008, diss.
- LiDonnici L.R. *The Epidaurian miracle inscriptions. Text, translation and commentary*. Scholars Press: Atlanta, 1995.
- Liwierska A. *Asklepios i medycyna w II w. Metody leczenia w Świętych mowach Eliusza Arystydesa (Asklepios and medicine in the 2nd century – methods of treatment in the "Sacred Tales" of Aelius Aristides)*. Scripta Minora XIII pod red. Józefa Dobosza, Wydział Historii UAM: Poznań, 2020.
- _____. "Inskrypcja Apellasa jako źródło poznania charakteru opieki nad pacjentem w asklepiejonie epidauryjskim w II w. n.e." (The Apellas Inscription as a source of knowledge about the nature of patient care in the Asklepieion of Epidauros in the 2nd century AD), *Klio. Czasopismo poświęcone dziejom Polski i powszechnym*, t. 52 (1), 2020, 3-29.
- LSJ = Liddell H.G., Scott R, Jones H.S. *A Greek-English lexicon*. Clarendon Press, Oxford: 1996.
- Mavrommatidis I.G. *Η Ιωνική Στοά του Ασκληπιείου της Επιδαύρου το λεγόμενον Αβατον*. Αθήνα, 2021, diss.
- Miller T. S. "Hospital Dreams in Byzantium" In *Dream, Healing, and Medicine in Greece. From Antiquity to the Present* Edited by Steven M. Oberhelman (Ashgate: London, 2013) 199-215.
- Oberhelman S.M. *Dreams in Graeco-Roman medicine*. In: *Aufstieg und Niedergang der römischen Welt II.37.1*. Edited by W. Haase, H. Temporini, Walter de Gruyter: Berlin, 1993, 121-156.
- _____. "Inscribing Votive Offerings and Tamata: Narratives, Artefacts, Asklepios, and Panagia Megalochari", *Athens Journal of Humanities & Arts*, Volume 7, Issue 1, 2020, 15-44.
- Okay E.S. *Healing in Motion. The Influence of Locotherapy on the Architecture of the Pergamene Asklepieion in the second century CE*. University of California, Los Angeles, 2016, diss.
- Oppenheim A. L. *The Interpretation of Dreams in the Ancient Near East*. Gorgias Press, 2008 (original edition: The American Philosophical Society, Philadelphia, 1956).
- Prignitz S. *Bauurkunden und Bauprogramm von Epidauros II (350-300)*. Verlag C.H. Beck, München, 2022.
- Renberg G.H. *Where Dreams May Come. Incubation Sanctuaries in the Graeco-Roman World*. Vol. I-II, Brill: Leiden-Boston, 2017.
- Schachter A. *Cults of Boiotia*. Vol. 1: *Acheloos to Hera*. University of London, Institute of Classical Studies, Bulletin Supplement Number 38.1, 1981.