The Judgment of Taste and the Formalism Undertaking in the Arts

By Ernesto Carlos Pujazon Patron[±], Chong Choon Woon^{*} & Jose Domingo Elias Arcelles[°]

One of the main reflective activities that have fascinated every human, since pre-Historic times, is about the production and evaluation-critique of a work of art. Art is almost as old as man. It is a form of work, and this work is an activity peculiar to mankind. Man takes possession of the natural elements by transforming it. Man, also dreams working his magic upon nature of being able to transform objects and give them newform by magical means this is the production of what works means in reality, where man is, from the outset a magician. Few questions need to be established to proceed: What are the procedures to follow to analyze a work of art, what inductive processes has to take into consideration and how to establish a detachment between the work of art and the judgement of it or how to evaluate this subjective experience? This paper present two main areas for discussion; first, it establishes definitions of terms and concepts related to "Significant Form", "Form", "Formalism", and "Aesthetics"; and second, the evaluation of the 'Significant Form' in a work of art by using Feldman methos; reaching a conclusion based on the evidence of three work of art presented.

Introduction

The concept "Formalism" can be used in a variety of settings in Aesthetics and art criticism. It is a critical method in literature that considers the text under consideration largely as a word structure, with the major arrangement focusing on the language rather than the implications of the words. The term "formalism" refers to the critical stance that the most essential component of an artwork is its "Form", as in the manner it is created and its purely aesthetic qualities, rather than the narrative content or its relevance to the visible world. History will explain the origins of this term, providing two examples from over 150 years ago and another from less than 100 years ago. The Oxford-English-Dictionary, first published in 1850, was intended to be about politics rather than aesthetics. First, in the early English universities admission an admission was denied to capable and honest students from the working class, whereas students from the highest classes particularly those whose parents were members of the Church of England, were admitted automatically—or "formally", as it were—even if they lacked academic and personal merits; Second, this term may have originated from a 1925 quote by

[±]Professor, Weifang Institute of Technology, China.

^{*}Associate Professor, Weifang Institute of Technology, China.

[°]Senior Lecturer, Pontificia Universidad Catolica del Peru, Peru.

Boris Tomashevsky (1890-1957), a Russian theorist, poet, and literary critic who rejected previous literary theories and paved the way for a new literary direction.¹ He stated a critical approach that analyses, interprets, and evaluates the inherent of a text or narrative that must have a theme and enlist the readers emotions. The question of representation (i.e., what the object should be) and thus the practical significance of the object in its everyday existence do not limit aesthetic perception, but rather how it merely appears to us as we observe its formal qualities as they are directly presented to our senses—the finer distinctions of forms, lines, texture, and colours.² It stresses compositional characteristics such as line, colour, form, texture, and other perceptual aspects in painting rather than the picture's message; In other words, a methodological approach in art studies, a particular idea of an artwork or a stance on the value and an assessment of an artwork.3 If someone believes that a work of art's formal structure is what genuinely defines it, then they will always search for its important significance. In art terms, "form" can be portrayed via the arrangements of its parts or by its components in a final composition. Its "artistic-aesthetic value" is a unique property of a work of art. There are certain degrees of "artistic-aesthetic values" which are a necessary condition for an artifact-item, object to be considered a work of art. Kant's aesthetic theory impacted numerous intellectuals who saw aesthetic formalism as a guiding force in art. It connected with Clive Bell's theory that the "essential feature in a work of art" is the "relations and arrangements of lines and colors"4 as well as Roger Fry's conception of "art," whose essence is the display of "order and variation in the sensual plane".5 Clement Greenberg, an American critic, was particularly vociferous in advocating Kant's theories, which emphasize pure abstract and formal components in art, such as "the flat surface, the shape of the support, the qualities of the colors".6 Without a doubt, "formalism" has significantly contributed to the development of art itself, particularly to the understanding of the uniqueness of individual art forms, the defense of art's right to autonomy and innovation, and the defense of modernist art's explorations and achievements;3 it has also contributed to overcoming the one-sided theoretical assumptions and methodological orientation of art criticism

1. Patrick McCreless, *Formalism, Fair and Foul. The Music Issue* (Emory College of Arts and Sciences, 2013).

^{2.} Mojca Kuplen, "Immanuel Kant and the Emancipation of the Image BT - The Palgrave Handbook of Image Studies," (ed.) Krešimir Purgar, 93-107 (Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2021).

^{3.} Bohdan Dziemidok, "Artistic Formalism: Its Achievements and Weaknesses," *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 51, no. 2 (1993).

^{4.} Clive Bell, "The Aesthetic Hypothesis," in *Modern Art and Modernism: A Critical Anthology* (eds.) Francis Frascina and Charles Harrison (New York: Westview Press, 1982).

^{5.} Fry Roger, Vision and Design (New York: Dover Publications, 1981).

^{6.} Greenberg Clement, "Modernist Painting," in *Modern Art and Modernism: A Critical Anthology* (eds.) Francis Frascina and Charles Harrison (New York: Westview Press, 1982).

and art studies. Immanuel Kant (1724-1804) and Ernest Cassirer (1874-1945), occupies a unique place in the 20th century studies of philosophy, both pays equal attention to the foundation of epistemology and other issues regarding natural science and aesthetics, devoting their attention to the natural sciences and humanistic disciplines;⁷ both believed that human beings can never make sense or know the real world, they can only make of representations (Ideas) about it, in the absence of access to the known world these representations are called "Symbolic Forms" which they acquired the status of Knowledge. Somehow, "The work of art is a distinct and separate object, autonomous and containing its own aim within itself, and yet there is represented therein a new -whole-, a new entire vision of reality and the spiritual universe itself," Cassirer⁸ declared in 1955. (48). Erwin Panofsky (1892-1968) proposed a three-level system for analyzing a piece of art:

- 1. an examination of the formal composition of artistic motifs,
- 2. an iconographical analysis of specific topics; and,
- 3. an underlying ideological assumption and their iconological interpretation; these phases were to be applied progressively, which eventually would lead further into the what the significance of a work of art is?

Panofsky refers to Heinrich Wolflin's (1864-1945) analogous stage of formal analysis as "pre-iconographical description," which deals with the subject matter's primary significance while focusing on the direct pictorial stage of form, color, composition, texture, and medium-materials as pre-requisites of aesthetic responses. "Aesthetics" has transformed further into study of how forms and formal relationships develop expressive power, evoke emotion, and convey meaning. This artistic "formalism" claims that artwork qualities are usually graspable by the sense of sight, touch, or sound. "Art" a book written by Arthur Clive Heward Bell (1881-1964), was published in 1914, despite its flaws, he has the benefit of exposing the notion that the value of an object or work of art is determined by its theme. By adopting a formalist approach and appreciation that was diametrically opposed to the literary method of the time. Bell's renowned "Aesthetic Hypothesis" was as follows:

^{7.} Michael Friedman, "Ernst Cassirer," in *The {Stanford} Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (ed.) Edward N Zalta, Spring 2022 (Metaphysics Research Lab, Stanford University, 2022).

^{8.} Ernst Cassirer, *The Philosophy of Symbolic Forms* (New Haven & London: Yale University Press, 1955).

^{9.} James Shelley, "The Concept of the Aesthetic," in *The {Stanford} Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (ed.) Edward N Zalta, Spring 2022 (Metaphysics Research Lab, Stanford University, 2022).

^{10.} Pauline Ducom, Clive Bell et La France 'Art, Love and Thought' (1904-1939), 2013.

"There must be some-one quality without which a work of art cannot exist; possessing which, in the least degree, no work is altogether worthless. What is this quality? What quality is shared by all objects that provoke our aesthetic emotions? What quality is common to Sta. Sophia and the windows at Chartres, Mexican sculpture, a Persian bowl, Chinese carpets, Giotto's frescoes at Padua, and the masterpieces of Poussin, Piero della Francesca, and Cezanne? Only one answer seems possible – 'Significant Form'. In each, lines and colours combined in a particular way, certain forms and relations of forms, stir our aesthetic emotions. These relations and combinations of lines and colours, these aesthetically moving forms, I call 'Significant Form'; and this 'Significant form' is the one quality common to all works of visual art." (p. 8)

For him, just one response stands out: "Significant Form." Lines and colors are blended in a unique way in each, and specific "form" and relationships of forms elicit our aesthetic feelings. He referred to these artistically moving "forms," these interactions and combinations of lines, colors, and these "Significant Forms," as the one feature that all works of visual arts share. He also highlighted that at this point to make aesthetics evaluation may be purely subjective business, since all data collected through the sense of sight or hearing may be based on personal experience of a particular emotion or feeling. Although the work of art that provoke this particular emotion vary from individual to individual and the system of aesthetic can have no objective validity. It will be very arguable that if any system of aesthetic evaluation to be based on objective truth is worth of discussion.¹¹ Clement Greenberg (1909-1994) advocated a variant of this "formalism" during the Abstract Expressionist era, from the 1940s until the 1970s. Many others, on the other hand, have highlighted "form" as an important aspect of the artistic process. Ernst Fischer (1899-1972), for example, wrote art as labor, collective vs individual, formalism and socialist realism, creating a larger range of subject and articles on the history of art form as well as critical realism in "The Necessity of Art, A Marxist Approach, 1959,"12 in which he said:

"In order to be an artist, it is necessary to seize, hold and transform experience into memory, memory into expression, material into form. A work of art does not have to be understood and approved by everyone from the start" (210), and further:

"Art is the giving of form, and form alone makes a product into a work of art. Form is not something accidental, arbitrary or inessential (no more than the form of a crystal is any of those things). The Laws and conventions of form are the embodiment of man's mastery over matter; in them, transmitted experience is preserved and all achievement is kept safe; they are the order necessary to art and life" (p. 211).

4

^{11.} Bell, Art (New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company Publishers, 1914).

^{12.} Ernst Fischer, *The Necessity of Art: A Marxist Approach* (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1959).

It is not necessary to be a Marxist to respond to these concepts, which make the argument for the importance of "form" as clearly as Clive Bell does. The "form" is not a frivolous concept, but rather a crucial aspect of the artistic process that necessitates the artist's involvement. The free harmony between imagination and understanding that occurs in the aesthetic perception of the object's the "form" also evokes the expression of an aesthetic idea: "in all beautiful art, what is essentially consists in the "form", which is purposive for observation and judging, where the pleasure is at the same time culture and disposes the spirit to ideas".13 Kant's aesthetic conception of "formalism" tends to add a philosophical dimension to the development and understanding of modern art in that it offers an explanation for apprehending and appreciating the image independently of its objective information; an image can be valued and worth looking at even if it does not depict a specific object,13 he was referring to abstract artworks. Roger Fry (1866-1934) was an English painter and member of the Bloomsbury Group, a group associated with writers, intellectuals, philosophers, and fine artists in the first half of the twentieth century, alongside others such as Virginia Stephen (later known as Virginia Woolf), John Maynard Keynes, E.M. Forster, and Lytton Strachey; Their contribution focuses on supporting young artists in the early development of the twentieth century. The Bloomsbury group convened in the Clive and Vanessa Bell residence in London's Bloomsbury neighbourhood and the area around the British Museum.¹⁴ In 1906, Fry, met Paul Cezanne, a painter, and as a result of that encounter, he began producing essays on the works of Cezanne, Paul Gauguin, Henri Matisse, and Vincent van Gogh, who saw a blending of classical painters' structural knowledge with impressionism's colour study. Fry's materialist "formalism" theory of expression is founded on "emotional aspects of design," which are linked to basic circumstances of our physical existence and emotions.¹⁵ Clement Greenberg (1904-1994) was the eldest of four children; his parents were first-generation Jewish Lithuanian immigrants who lived in Norfolk, Virginia but made New York City their permanent home; he worked in a series of jobs with newspapers and as an American art critic during the modernist era; his radical ideas continue to exert and influence in today's world, as championed by champions of modernist abstraction and colour field painting. Greenberg believed that artists such as Arshile Gorky (painter), David Smith (sculptor), Willem de Kooning (painter), and Jackson Pollock (painter) were producing work that was far better to anything produced in Europe during the Cold War. Edmund B. Feldman (b, 1924), stated in 1992 that "formalism" exercises have had a significant impact on art training in schools and university

^{13.} Kuplen, "Immanuel Kant and the Emancipation of the Image BT - The Palgrave Handbook of Image Studies," 2021.

^{14.} Britannica, T. Editors of Encyclopaedia, "Bloomsbury Group," in *Encyclopedia Britannica*. 20 February 2021.

^{15.} Michalle Gal, "Art and Form: From Roger Fry to Global Modernism by Sam Rose," Estetika: The European Journal of Aesthetics 57, no. 2 (2020).

art departments, resulting in an aesthetic judgement of an artwork.¹⁶ Why is "formalism" so appealing to art instructors, and do its impacts need to be eliminated from the pedagogy of art as a tool for judging artwork? An explanation of "formalism" in basic terms of aesthetic has generally been believed to relate to the position in art philosophy that the attributes of an artwork is worth to be assessed are in the formal sense of being accessible by direct experience alone, typically by hearing of seeing. So pedagogical "formalism" is a concept that focuses aesthetic and critical attention on the meaning, or should be, and arrangement of the visual characteristics of a work of art, such as lines, colors, textures, space, shapes, and forms, naming a few. The Feldman technique is an inductive strategy that leads to a logical conclusion by inferring conclusions (generalities or informed guesses) from the evidence (specifics of the artwork) gathered from the work of art. Inferences about an artwork are built on the basis of presumed facts which is based on accessible data. He also argued that Formalism art theorists are a blend of formal and romantic inclinations frequently connected with philosophical idealism (German Idealism), Kant aesthetics, and the French "Art for the sake of Art" movement. The artist's emotional understanding of the spiritual tenor of an age is extended and expressed in Bell's concept of "Significant Forms". Where emotion associated with an artistic experience differs significantly from emotion encountered in ordinary life.

Literature Review

There is a substantial literature and publication on "formalism theorists" and the concept of "Significant Forms" dating back to its inception. Nonetheless, this research uses a historical technique as the major point of reference for understanding the meaning of "Formalism", "Significant Forms", "Aesthetics", and how an item-object has merely visual or material value or meaning. This discourse builds on and defines key language used in the development of the previously discussed difficulties. To reiterate, the purpose of this article is to investigate how it might be used as an evaluation tool for an artwork such as a painting. The classification system may then be used to comprehend general literature that is available in print or electronically via the internet. This discussion may be useful as a recommendation in the field of fine arts, particularly painting; raising awareness among institutions, students, teachers, and art practitioners about the struggle to understand these distinguishing factors and underlying process for art experts using this formal methos of evaluation. The authors anticipate that it will also serve as a springboard for further research into the issue as part of a larger effort to promote creative discourse and practice in general.

6

٠

^{16.} Edmund Burke Feldman, "Formalism and Its Discontents," *Studies in Art Education* 33, no. 2 (1992): 122-126.

Objective

The goal of this research is to define and investigate the origins of the meanings of the concepts of "Significant Forms" and "formalism" as it is used by various theorists, as well as to provide a formalistic method in the visual evaluation of three artworks using the Feldman method from the 18th century; a classism period in art. The discussion's findings and consequences may help to demonstrate and provide a clear and better understanding of these concepts in the subject of art-aesthetics, as well as to prepare information, particularly in the field of fine art. This study hopes that it will be able to strengthen its existence with the assistance of a serious and focused approach for instructors, artists, and practitioners who are interested in the evaluation of an artwork.

Methodology

This study employs an empirical approach of direct observation and visual analysis on a number of well-known historical paintings using Feldman's method, which focuses on the various techniques, materials, and themes utilized during the creative process described as four steps of evaluation such as: description (describe what is seen in a work of art), analysis (what relationship exists among what is seen in a work of art), interpretation (what is the content and mean of what is seen in a work of art), and (what is the evaluation of the work of art). It also clarifies the terms of "Significant Form" and "formalism". Beside also provide a better understanding of these distinctions, a detailed explanation and description of the terminology or ideas employed throughout this research are required.

Results and Discussion

We could all agree solely on a single question: how do we determine the aesthetic qualities of an artwork? How should the beauty of an artwork be judged? Or, what is the mechanism of this evaluation? We are not approaching this judgement from the standpoint of economics, as in turning the artwork into monetary value or market pricing. An easy way to evaluate an artwork is to study its context and background; it may also aid to understand the artist life and may assist to grasp what was or may have been in the artist's thoughts, experience at the time of its production, whether it is a painting or sculpture in broad terms. Another issue that may arise in this discussion, is how to reconcile the aesthetic value with the nominal-commercial price; or what determines the commercial value of a work of art. Throughout the years, philosophers, many professionals such as gallery owners, experienced purchasers, collectors, curators,

critics, and other knowledgeable persons have wrestled with these problems. As with cash, the market worth of art is determined by collective intentionality; there is no innate, objective value. This worth is created and sustained by human specification and proclamation;¹⁷ even Plato (c, 428/427 or 424/423 – 348/347 BC) thought the arts to be dubious because they were a "mimesis," a copy of reality. We may have reach to understand, defend, and conclude that humans judge something by its form or appearance, by its structural visual elements such as color, texture, line, form, and shape that can be extracted from the visual image represented to make sense of it in the spectator's mind; this approach led us to deciphering or decoding the art work into basic aesthetic elements referred to as "formalistic" art evaluation. Using this "formalism" technique would entail to considerate its intellectual roots from Plato and Aristotle through Kant to the experimental avant-garde and present goal of conceptual art.18 Within visual art studies and the components and principles of design, "form" refers to anything that is three-dimensional and encloses volume, with length, breadth, and height, as opposed to its shape, which is two-dimensional. It is critical to practice comprehension of these aspects and structure as a whole. They can provide positive innovation to the design process's visualization.¹⁹ Creating or constructing a "form" necessitates the use of fundamental visual components like point, line, and plane, as well as a set of principles and rules to organize it in a compositional or structural means. This may be expressed on two levels: philosophically and visually. In connection to the arts, it can refer to the general forms adopted by artworks as its physical nature of expression, or it can relate to various components of shape, color, and texture that make up the work of art. Light and shadows are used by visual artists working on a two-dimensional surface to generate and portray the illusion of three-dimensional shapes. Point, line, and plane are the most fundamental components in visual studies because they allow artists and designers to create pictures and structures in both two and three dimensions. There remains one unanswered question: what are those "Significant Forms" that cause us to rise and generate such strange feeling caused by a piece of art? The answer should be explained through the concepts of the following authors.

One of the most important figures in "Formalism" was Bloomsbury writer and art critique Arthur Clive Heward Bell, who was born in East Shefford, Berkshire, UK in September 1881 and died in London in 1964; he was the third of four children. His father was a civil engineer who made a fortune in coal mines in Wiltshire, England, and Merthyr Tydfil, Wales. Clive Bell observed and stated in

^{17.} Micheal Findlay, *The Value of Art; Money, Power, Beauty* (Munich London New York: Prestel Publishing, 2014).

^{18.} Vera Mevorah, *The Expressiveness of Form-Formalism in Art. Art History* (Widewalls Editorial, 2017).

^{19.} Charles Wallschlaeger, and Cynthia Busic-Snyder, *Basic Visual Concepts and Principles, for Artist, Architects and Designers* (Iowa: WCB. Wm. C. Brown Publishers, 1992).

his essay on aesthetics: What are the key elements in a work of art that separate it from other types of works or objects? and he "tried to develop a complete theory of visual art...in the light of which the history of art from, paleolithic days to the present becomes intelligible."18,20 If we diverge from the premise that appreciating a work of art provokes a distinctive reaction or feeling in us by awakening our basic instincts of sight, hearing, taste, or touch, we name it an "aesthetic emotion". This "aesthetic emotions" occur in an individual when he or she is fascinated by the distinctive beauty of a piece of art. Because all works of art have some characteristics, we may identify the class of "work of Art" from other kinds of work by establishing a conceptual categorization.²¹ So, how then can we explain it? Alternatively, what are the characteristics shared by all works of art that make our "aesthetic emotions" tremble? Last Super by Leonardo da Vinci, or the Sistine Chapel by Michelangelo, a Mexican sculpture; and a Japanese woodblock image of Mount Fuji. These paintings, as well as others works of art throughout history, have what Clive Bell refers to as "Significant Forms".22 These fundamental relationships of lines, colors, shape, and texture are mixed in a certain way as well as other forms which are paired with other forms to incite our "aesthetic emotions". This theory set by Bell's would give a definite meaning to terms such as "good drawing", "magnificent design" or "ill-organized" "bad-composition".21 It may be to argued at this point those aesthetic judgements are totally subjective, because every evaluation is dependent on personal facts, knowledge or experiences which certainly involve our sense touch, sight or hearing. The object that incites those emotions may differ from person to person, and the method of evaluating from the aesthetic standpoint that object may lack of objective validity.²² It would be good to admit that any aesthetic assessment over a work of art is a question of "personal preference". One of the most contentious and basic questions debated in Western Philosophy is the nature of "beauty" in the context of art. It's been compared and associated to other fundamental philosophical principles and concepts such as "truth", "friendship", "justice", and "kindness" 23 in any of work of art, its classification, comparation and definitions may fall short and inaccurate for some people.²⁴ The philosophical definition of "beauty" as a concept in the arts context, if it is objective or subjective is one of the most investigated issues of disagreements. From the classical stand point Wolfflin describe it from the conception of the Renaissance period as:

^{20.} Semir Zeki, "Clive Bell's 'Significant Form' and the Neurobiology of Aesthetics," *Frontiers in Human Neuroscience* (2013).

^{21.} Ibid.

^{22.} Thomas E. Wartenberg, *The Nature of Art, An Anthology* (Australia: Thomson Wadsworth, 2007).

^{23.} Crispin Sartwell, "Beauty," in *The {Stanford} Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (ed.) Edward N Zalta, Summer 2022 (Metaphysics Research Lab, Stanford University, 2022).

^{24.} Dennis Sporre, *Perceiving the Arts, an Introduction to the Humanities* (New Jersey: Prentice-Hall Inc, 1981).

The central idea of the Italian Renaissance is that of the "perfect proportion". In the human figure as in the edifice, this epoch strove to achieve the image of perfection at rest within itself. Every form developed to self-existent being, the whole freely coordinated: nothing but independently living parts.... In the system of a classic composition, the single parts, however firmly they may be rooted in the whole, maintain a certain independence. It is not the anarchy of primitive art: the part is conditioned by the whole, and yet does not cease to have its own life. For the spectator, that presupposes an articulation, a progress from part to part, which is a very different operation from perception as a whole.²³

This is primordial Western conception of beauty which appears everywhere from the neo-classical architecture, sculpture, literature, music, painting and others. Aristotle in the "Poetics" said:

"To be beautiful, a living creature, and every whole made up of parts, must ... present a certain order in its arrangement of parts". ²⁵

This notion was inspired by the "Canon" of the sculpture Polykleitos (late fifth/early fourth century BC). The term "canon" is derived from the old Greek word "kann," which means "rule"; although it has other meanings, it is most commonly used to refer to "a rule or law of a church". 26 According to Merriam-Webster.com,²⁶ it also refers to the kind of harmonic and quantifiable proportions among the parts that are distinctive of classically beautiful items. Plato (c. 428/427 or 424/423 BC) portrayed a virtuous mind as symmetrical as well. Aquinas' "Summa Theologica" identifies three important prerequisites for beauty: a) Integrity or perfection; b) Other things that are harmed include unattractive; and, c) proportion, consonance, and clarity. That is, "beauty" has a realist, ontological base (the notions of good, morality, society, and law are formed from the structure and functioning of the mind in this approach), which seeks the classification and explanation of phenomena, objects of inquiry that are set to be examined. This brings two explanations on "beauty": First, "beauty" exists in the object that we experience, not only within the eye of the beholder; as a result, our assessment of it might be correct or incorrect in an objective sense.²⁷ Second, identifying and enjoying "beautiful" objects is a talent that may be beneficial for some and problematic for others, or there may be components of this "beauty" that we have still yet to comprehend or learn to perceive.²⁷ These are broad requirements, but Aquinas undoubtedly considered the integrity, proportion, and clarity found in living creatures.27 Every work of art is a complicated organism of

^{25.} Sartwell, "Beauty," 2022.

^{26.} Merriam-Webster.com Dictionary, s.v., "Canon".

^{27.} Louis Caruana, "To Marvel at the Manifold Connections: Philosophy, Biology, and Laudato Si," *Gregorianum* 102, no. 3 (2021): 617-631.

interconnected components.²⁸ These units can be studied without regard for any aesthetic evaluation and/or be described in a non-aesthetic way. However, it should be evaluated in a methodical and critical manner. An aesthetic challenge for an architect, sculptor, or painter is to create the entire piece from little components as the structure reveals or emerges gradually as one. They have control over this order, even if compromise is part of the process of making a one-of-a-kind work of art. Art is defined as being expressive in essence through the structure of its visual aspects, principles, and physical medium, and its definition might be accurate or inaccurate. We might state that a poem "rings true," implying that the author is sincere and insightful. We might also describe a musical work as "shallow" or "superficial,"²⁹ implying that the composer lacks of comprehension or sensibility. All of those aesthetic assessments of responses to works of art are perfectly consistent with the notion of artistic content as an artistically expressed interpretation of reality in connection to human life.

Aesthetic Perception and Common Factors

How do you determine the worth of an artwork? It is possible to use a variety of approaches to assess it; selecting the best or worse option might stimulate the evaluation; offering references is another option for indicating the importance of the judgement. We live in a world of facts and figures, therefore a logical approach to begging would be a beneficial and familiar strategy to employ in this study; in fact, utilizing a cognitive point of view would be surely helpful, as we would alter our aesthetic sensibility. First, identify objects that can be seen, heard, or touched. Second, acquire the new visual language of those elements; third, grasp why and how those items are viewed and linked to the image content, for example, using a two-dimensional surface painting.³⁰ We make aesthetic decisions every day of our lives. We notice a work of art, an item; we selected to respond to this aesthetic inquiry by examining all of the components, looking for consistency in our observation as meticulous assessment is made from one to the next, arousing our senses. Bell's supposedly inductive process leads him to the conclusion that what actually counts in visual arts, at least, is the arrangement and relationship of formal components in such a manner that they effect the observer in a certain -aesthetic- way.31

^{28.} Theodore Meyer Greene, *The Arts and the Art of Criticism* (Michigan: Princeton University Press, 1965).

^{29.} Ibid.

^{30.} Sporre, *Perceiving the Arts, an Introduction to the Humanities* (New Jersey: Prentice-Hall Inc, 1981).

^{31.} Johan Snyman, "The Significance and Insignificance of Clive Bell's Formalism," *Navorsingsartikels. Koers* 58. no. 2 (1993).

Aesthetic Definition

The American Revolution (1775-1783), the French Revolution (1789-1799), and the Napoleonic Wars (1803-1815) were among the events that distinguished the 18th century's development; the "aesthetic" concept came to be increasingly valued during this time period. Edmund Burke (1729-1797) proposes a "philosophical study into the genesis of our perceptions of the sublime and beautiful". Subsequently 100 year later, in 1959, Frank Sibley published a series of writings advocating an overall aesthetic approach. He said: "there is not rule-orcondition-governed, but required a heightened form of perception which one might call taste, sensitivity of judgement"; It takes "taste or perceptiveness" to specify the certain way in which we represent objects aesthetically;³² what exactly does the "exercises of this taste" involve? ... he does say it at least "it is with an ability to notice or see or tell, that thing has certain qualities that I am concerned".33 In the assessment of "Significant Form", the vast majority assess any fine arts from its very own viewpoint perhaps producing realities whereupon to base their perspectives utilizing a solitary word like wonderful, pleasant, or fascinating; where these inductions infer that the subject in conversation adjusts with ordinary European guidelines of flawlessness magnificence, equilibrium or evenness arranged inside their own social foundation or individual inclination known as "great taste" which associate their portrayal somewhat of fact and objectivity of the world³² and has nearly nothing or not much to do with the objective nature of crafted by workmanship. Few art critics can describe beauty as anything other than the skilled blending of traits that pleasure the senses of sight, hearing, and touch. A portrait painting of a lady or man, a seascape, or a nonrepresentational (non-objective) artwork such as an abstract painting, regardless of its quality, qualified to persuasively explain what is in the image.³⁴ A piece of art that has withstood the test of time cannot be ignored or dismissed altogether from its own history, a Roman sculpture for example, and anyone who cannot find joy in it is missing out on a magnificent visual aesthetic experience. There is no intention to imply that all works of art have equal significance and merits. A work of art that is good for anyone, need not to be among the best of its kind.³⁵ As there are enormous differences in age, temperament, education, geographical location, and financial resources all play a role in determining what causes us to react to this aesthetic form in a particular manner, the logical conclusion can be

^{32.} Nathan Fish, "Intentionality's Role in Bringing Art to Life. Meditations," *The Undergraduate Philosophy Journal at UCLA* 8 (2021): 39-56.

^{33.} Peter Kivy, "Aesthetic Aspects and Aesthetic Qualities," *The Journal of Philosophy* 65, no. 4 (1968): 85-93.

^{34.} Barbara Whelpton, *Art Appreciation, Made Simple* (United Kingdom: W.H. Allen & Company Ltd, 1970).

^{35.} Bruce Miller, *The Arts and the Basis of Education* (London: University Press of America, Inc., 1993).

set that there is no canon stablish to evaluate with similar experiences. Leon Tolstoy (1828-1910), author and late-nineteenth-century social thinker, had a more spiritual perspective: "Art is a human activity consisting in this, that one man consciously, by means of certain external signs, hands on to others feelings he has lived through, and that others are infected by these feelings and also experience them." Is it significant that another member of the same audience may hold a different opinion or judgement on the same work of art? Basically, most people's opinions may differ; this is particularly common to any society, each of us would appreciate color, composition, materials, texture shape and form based on own personal experience.

Form Definition

"Form" and line are extremely closely associated in definition and effect; "Form" is enclosed in the shape of an item, and forms are frequently employed to explain "form." The physical shape of every item is determined by its borders, just as a line is defined by its bounds.³⁷ When an object's spatial orientation or surroundings changes, whether it is positioned right-side-up or up-side-down may alter significantly. Visual shapes impact one another, and thus changes how the borders are seen. However, it is not until "form" and "shape" meet, such as in sculpture that a shape becomes truly three-dimensional. Abstract art is the most obvious example of the use of shape, but the element of shape, organic and geometric alike, is central to much if not most artwork.³⁸ Literally, a "form" is the space described by the line or shape that circumscribes that boundary; for example, a building is a "form," as is the tree; in art and as a visual element, a "form" may also be related to its three-dimensionality rather than its bidimensionality; most people would perceive and describe the tree by its shape rather than its actual "form". 39 Shapes are two-dimensional, whereas the "form" are three-dimensional. This is the general rule of thumb. The perceived shape emerges from the interaction of the physical item, the light acting on the object, sending information, and the viewer's nervous system. These definitions are natural notions that are used as language in visual studies or visual evaluations. Artists use and express these aspects graphically, bringing them to life through graphic means.40 "Form is the visible shape of content," stated painter Ben Shahn.³⁷ Arnheim explains that shape serves to tell us about the nature of objects by their exterior appearance, such as a teacup and a knife, both of which provide

^{36.} Barry Hartley Slater, "Aesthetic," in The Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy, 2021.

^{37.} Rudolf Arnheim, *Art and Visual Perception: A Psychology of the Creative Eye* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1954).

^{38.} Alan Pipes, Foundation of Art & Design (London: Laurence King Publishing, 2008).

^{39.} Sporre, Perceiving the Arts, an Introduction to the Humanities, 1981.

^{40.} Wallschlaeger, and Busic-Snyder, Basic Visual Concepts and Principles, for Artist, Architects and Designers, 1992.

us information about their purpose. This idea of shape may be described in two ways: first, every shape is a "kind of shape," and second, each "kind of shape" is viewed as the "form" of a large class of things. This is independent of the item displayed in the viewer's retina at any particular time. Strictly speaking, it is decided by the entirety of visual experiences that everyone has had with that item over our lives, which is embedded in a spatial and temporal context. It is recommended that any participant begin the assessment of any piece of art by questioning whether or not it meets the person's own standards for quality, excellent taste, or simply lovely, loves or dislikes. The virtues of any work-object that interests the participant should be the basis for the study of a work of art. Leading to the development of one's own particular ideals and philosophy, which are backed by reason and logic rather than personal opinion. The participant is advised to be neutral in the language and only should refer to the visual evidence that the work of art offers, it should begin with the visual identification and description, then moving their way through visual analysis and final visual interpretation; then the participant would reach to which type of judgment is more appropriated for the work of art which been examined. The purpose of art criticism is not always to illustrate how consistently the participant's consideration of a work of art leads to their own ultimate assessment, but to broaden the variety of ideas, values, and joy you might derive from a work of art.

The participant may choose to make the following important decisions: 1) Formalism: emphasizes the formal aspects and visual features of art; 2) Expressivism: emphasizes the significance of communicating ideas and sentiments to the audience through their senses in a persuasive and strong manner, with an emotional effect. 3) Instrumentalism: emphasizes the value of a piece of art's social goal or utility in influencing society. 4) Emotionalism: emphasizes the necessity of emphasizing the expressive characteristics of a piece of art in communicating various feelings, moods, and ideas.

Present three visuals for debate and analysis utilizing Feldman's formal approach of visual analysis, which arouses our aesthetic feeling. Here is the first work of art to be examined:



Plate 1. *Jacques-Louis David. "The Death of Socrates", 1787. Oil on Canvas. 129.5 cm x 196.20 cm*

Source: https://customprints.metmuseum.org/detail/489178/david-the-death-of-socrates.

According to Feldman,⁴¹ the four stages of art criticism are as follows: beginning with Description, which is to describe what is observed in a work of art or cataloguing what an art object appears to comprise. What do you notice in the piece? Regarding the image: An elderly man dressed in a white robe sits straight on a bed in the center of the image. His left hand is in the air, making a violent gesture, while his right hand is stretched over a cup containing poison hemlock. This elderly gentleman is Socrates, who is sentenced to death by the Athenian authorities for corrupting the youth and refusing to acknowledge the city's Gods. Socrates is surrounded by men of all ages, most of them are in various states of emotional anguish, in contrast to him, who stays serene. Plato said in Phaedo that Socrates might have gone into exile but instead chose to die. He delivers the final lesson of his philosophy, which is to embrace death boldly. Oil paint on canvas was used in this picture, which was completed in 1787. In terms of technique, David employs color to accentuate the emotion in this painting. The shades of red in the painting are more muted on the edges and become more vibrant in the center, culminating in the dark red robe of the man holding the cup of poison, which is generally interpreted as offering the cup to Socrates rather than receiving it after Socrates had consumed its contents. Socrates and Plato, the only two calm guys, are dressed in a striking bluish-white. This painting's more subdued color palette may be a response to critics of David's Oath of the Horatii, who labelled

^{41.} Feldman, "Formalism and Its Discontents," 1992, 122-126.

his colors "garish". It is a Neoclassic Realism style; as for the visual texture, the work of art texture is rich and settled, and every element or visual component plays an important role in demonstrating the dramatic effect of each participant. Socrates' wife, Xanthippe, is portrayed in panic in the backdrop, waving her right hand and hurrying up the stairs. Colors are established in general; the brightness of the colors employed as composition concentrates at the center of the canvas and progressively darkens to the painting boundaries. Moving on to the work of art analysis, it should be describing the relationship between the items stated and what relationships exist between what is seen, as well as what the mood of the artwork is. "The Death of Socrates" marked the beginning of the Neoclassicism period; this work invokes passion, drama, and melancholy, with an underlying message of opposition against France's harsh authoritarian rule of the time. Plato is shown on the artwork from left to right as an elderly guy with a grey robe. Despite the fact that Plato would have been a young man at the time of Socrates' death, he is depicted as being about the same age as Socrates. Critics frequently assert that the manner in which a concept is represented and communicated is far more essential than the idea itself. The Interpretation is critical in understanding what all of the previous observations imply, moving on to the substance and meaning of the work of art and what this artwork has to communicate. This picture was inspired by Plato's account of Socrates' dying days in Phaedo: "To dread death, gentlemen, is to believe oneself knowledgeable when one is not, to believe one knows what one does not know." No one knows whether death is not the greatest of all benefits for a man, yet folks fear it as if it were the greatest of ills. - Socrates was a powerful thinker, a political hero, and one of the most authoritative philosophers. His death, as a victim of intolerance and oppression, is regarded as a blot on Athenas democracy, and while Socrates characteristically professed his own ignorance regarding many of the (primarily ethical) subjects he investigated (e.g., the nature of piety), he did hold certain convictions with confidence, including that: (1) human wisdom begins with acknowledging one's own ignorance; (2) the unexamined life is not worth living; (3) ethical virtue is the only thing that matters; and (4) a good person can never be harmed, because whatever misfortune he may suffer, his virtue will remain intact; and Why did the artist decide to create this work of art? This artwork depicted the ancient topic of Socrates' trial and execution, with an underlying message of rebellion against France's oppressive ruling power at the time. The French Revolution began to change the nature of political power a few years after this artwork was created. The artist picks this medium to work with specifically because of its classical subject matter, harmonious composition, and exact draughtsman-ship; three fundamental attributes that distinguish the neoclassicism period or work of art. For the visual composition, the artist employed art elements and concepts such as color, form, line, shape, space, texture, and value. These ideas are not just linked, but also overlap to form an aesthetic vision. Finally, in determining the worth of an art item, what is the appraisal of the work, and was this piece of art successful?

This painting took on symbolic significance; Plato is an elderly guy wearing a grey robe if the canvas is read from left to right. Despite the fact that Plato would have been a young man at the time of Socrates' death, he is depicted as being about the same age as Socrates. Critics frequently assert that the manner in which a concept is represented and communicated is far more essential than the idea itself. The image is centered on the space between Socrates' left hand and the cup, and the man holding the cup is unable to look into Socrates' eyes and is depicted in excruciating suffering. Crito, Socrates' oldest and most loyal disciple, is holding Socrates' leg. There is no space for variation, and changing, altering, or adding any other visual feature or components of this work of art would be difficult, if not impossible. The selected topic, composition, and material usage all play vital roles in maximizing the aesthetic value, component, and moral notion of this piece of art. The image is centered on the space between Socrates' left hand and the cup, and the man holding the cup is unable to look into Socrates' eyes and is depicted in excruciating suffering. Crito, Socrates' oldest and most loyal disciple, is holding Socrates' leg. There is no space for variation, and changing, altering, or adding any other visual feature or components of this work of art would be difficult, if not impossible. The selected topic, composition, and material usage all play vital roles in maximizing the aesthetic value, component, and moral notion of this piece of art.

The second work of art to be examined as follows:



Plate 2. *Jacques-Louis David.* "The Death of Marat", 1793. Oil on Canvas. 162cm x 128cm Source: https://medium.com/thinksheet/great-paintings-the-death-of-marat-by-jacques-louis-david-ad9848d939e.

Continuing with Feldman's four stages of art criticism, the first is Description, which is to explain what is observed in a work of art or to list what an art object appears to comprise. What do you notice in the work? In the artwork, an idealized version of David's dead companion Marat is portrayed carrying his murderess' letter of introduction. This man, Marat, is laying in a bathtub with a few artefacts of a man who committed himself to the betterment of the French citizen. He holds a pen and a piece of paper that his assassin handed him before murdering him; on the floor lies the murder weapon, a bleeding knife that has opened a deadly wound that operates in the same way that the painting's

composition does. A pen and an inkwell are placed on a modest wood box that serves as a desk. David inscribed it: MARAT, DAVID (TO MARAT, DAVID). Marat's stance, with his immobile arm, is inspired by Caravaggio's "Entombment of Christ," which is held in the Vatican City's Pinacoteca Vatican. Some art resources were utilized in this artwork, such as oil paint on canvas, which was completed in 1793. In terms of technique, David used planar color for the backdrop, the person in the center of the canvas, and a box in front. The upper portion is a plane flat color, while the lower part is a blend of three fundamental colors, including skin color, green, light brown, and white. The colors are established, with the light direction coming from the top of the canvas as the focal point. Analysis, it should be describing the link between the items stated and what relationships exist between what appears, as well as what the mood of the work is. This "pietà of the Revolution," as it has been dubbed, is widely regarded as David's masterpiece and an example of how, when confronted with true passion, Neoclassicism may devolve into tragic Realism. Portraiture was probably despised by Neoclassicism because a modern sitter lacked both the universality and nudity of an ancient statue. The Interpretation is critical in understanding what all of the previous observations imply, moving on to the substance and meaning of the work of art and what this artwork has to communicate. It may appear strange that the death of Marat occurred when the French Revolutionary hero was in his bathtub. However, it was not uncommon; Marat suffered from a skin problem that required him to take long and frequent baths, during which he continued to work and meet other people. This artwork exists in three versions: the first is preserved at the Royal Museums of Fine Arts of Belgium in Brussels, the second in Reims, and the third in the Louvre. David was a close friend of Marat's and backed him politically on several occasions, particularly when they had to vote for the execution of King Louis XVI of France. The French Revolution began to change the nature of political power a few years after this artwork was created. The artist picks this medium to work with specifically because of its classical subject matter, harmonious composition, and exact draughtsman-ship; three fundamental attributes that distinguish the neoclassicism period or work of art. For the visual composition, the artist employed art elements and concepts such as color, form, line, shape, space, texture, and light value. These ideas are not just linked, but also overlap to form an aesthetic vision. The graphic character of those visual symbols aids in the absorption of information by utilizing the brain's ability to interpret sensory information such as color, texture, size, visual orientation, composition, shape, and form. Finally, in determining the worth of an art item, what is the appraisal of the work, and was this piece of art successful? Symbolically, at the height of the Reign of Terror in 1793, David created a monument to his great friend, the dead Jean Marat, replacing Christian martyrs' art motifs for more current themes. There is no opportunity for variation, and it would be difficult, if not impossible, to replace, alter, or add any other visual aspect or components to this work of art. The selected topic, composition, and material usage all play a significant part in maximizing the aesthetic value, component, and moral notion of this piece of art. The subject conveys the ultimate moral worth and self-awareness that each human being may seek... why? ... since this style of painting emphasized strict shapes, sculpted forms, and polished surfaces; historical painting was supposed to serve as moral models. He painted for royalty, extreme revolutionaries, and an emperor, but his political allegiances moved to a generation of students, including Jean Auguste Dominique Ingres. The third and final work of art to be examined as follows:



Plate 3. Jacques-Louis David. "The Intervention of the Sabine Women", 1799. Oil on Canvas. 385 cm x 522 cm

Source: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/The_Intervention_of_the_Sabine_Women#/media/File:F0440_Louvre_JL_David_Sabines_INV3691_rwk.jpg.

Continuing with Feldman's four stages of art criticism, the first is Description, which is to explain what is observed in a work of art or list what an art item appears to feature. What do you notice about the piece? In terms of the image: The Intervention (Abduction-Rape) of the Sabine Women is a mythical event in Rome's history that is claimed to have occurred about 750 BC, during which the first generation of Roman males secured spouses from neighboring Sabine households. It served as a topic for Renaissance and post-Renaissance works of art that combined a properly inspirational example of ancient Roman hardihood and valor with the chance to represent several characters with the opportunity to

depict multiple figures, including heroically semi-nude figures, in intensely passionate struggle. He merged a noble emotional attitude to antiquity with a pictorial style reminiscent of Poussin. In terms of technique, David employs flat colors for the backdrop and the person in the center of the canvas. In the foreground, the painter lets the scene evolve before the viewer's eyes, with pictures of the two fighters holding weapons in their hands, ready to fight, and a lady struggling to separate them, with children at the interpose. The upper half depicts a portion of the citadel and the grandeur of the blue sky with grey clouds, a number of horses and combatants on both sides of the canvas, and children in the middle of the canvas between the two fighters and a woman. The sunshine moves from right to left, casting a shadow on the ground. The graphic approach is as non-Rococo as the subject: solid shapes, stark cubic space, somber color, frieze-like arrangement, and clear lighting. Analysis should describe the link between the items stated and what relationships exist between what appears, as well as the mood of the composition. It was seen as a manifesto for an aesthetic resurgence (the name Neoclassicism had not yet been coined) that would cure Europe of its addiction to tiny curves and boudoir motifs. Portraiture was probably despised by Neoclassicism because a modern sitter lacked both the universality and nudity of an old statue. The Interpretation is critical in understanding what all of the previous observations imply, moving on to the substance and meaning of the work of art and what this artwork has to communicate. David was always preoccupied with revolutionary propaganda. Because the contour was the foundation of the art of painting, it might be held partly accountable for the excessive reliance on drawing that typified European academic painting in the nineteenth century. His art was not always averse to rich chromatic effects, and he was compared to Eugene Delacroix by no less a colorist. The artist picks this medium to work with specifically because of its classical subject matter, harmonious composition, and exact draughtsman ship; three fundamental attributes that distinguish the neoclassicism period or piece of art. For the visual composition, the artist employed art elements and concepts such as color, form, line, shape, space, texture, and value. These ideas are not just linked, but they also overlap to form an aesthetic vision. The graphic character of those visual symbols aids in the process of information absorption by utilizing the brain's ability to interpret sensory information such as color, texture, size, visual orientation, composition, shape, and form. Finally, the Judgment is in determining the worth of a piece of art object, what is the appraisal of the work, was this work of art successful? David created this masterpiece on a 17-foot-long canvas. He opted to utilize extra-long canvas in order to deeply portray the Greek master's style of art: "...the most obvious general qualities of the Greek masterpieces are a noble simplicity and silent magnificence in position as well as in emotion..." This picture was intended to mark a shift from the Roman austere style of painting to a modern kind of pictorial manifesto. In his works, he used some Johann Winclemann theories to his idealization of beauty. There is no opportunity for variation, and it would be difficult, if not impossible, to replace, alter, or add any other visual aspect or components to this work of art. He produced the elaborate brushwork in the picture by using frieze-like compositions with seemingly limited spatial depth, which was helpful in bringing forth color predominance and simplified schemes in a homogeneous light. The selected topic, composition, and material usage all play a significant part in maximizing the aesthetic value, component, and moral notion of this piece of art. The subject conveys the ultimate moral worth and self-awareness that each human being may seek... Why? Because this style of painting favored strict outlines, sculpted shapes, and polished surfaces; historical painting was supposed to serve as moral exemplars.

Conclusion

Although through this paper some pictures were chosen for the discussion; you may have unlimited number of sources available to choose from. You may seek examples from galleries, museums, or online digital exhibitions to discern and judge personally to develop your own taste. Whatever reaction you may reached during the evaluation of this paper, you may disagree with me. For us a work of art is something which intrinsically involves the senses amongst them, the sight, touch, hearing or sound, movement, dance or performance, or sense of smell or a combination of them, some sensible manifestation intended of the human expression. This is not a definition placing the work art in a pedestal, however, each work of art carries an in-depth meaning that characterize the human condition. Whatever the artwork looks like or whatever it was intended or not by its creator, this work has a "Form", it occupied space and time or both. A two-dimensional painting, photograph, printing, or a piece of sculpture which occupied three-dimensional space, a piece of music which does not occupied any physical space but it's represented within the duration of time, a piece of performing art, music and dance occupying space and time, and much more other type of expressions, all these are sublime manifestation of the human ingenuity and there are called by a number of adjective such beautiful, amazing, unique, marvelous, or outstanding. On another hand, the concept of "Form" is not limited to the concern of the overall structure that contains the work of art, it also depends of the smaller units that composed it inner soul. The work of art is also closely tangled to the materials or medium chosen by the artist. These materials may advantage or disadvantage the visual value of the work which in the hand of the artist it is a continuous mental struggle and anguishes process that occurs while the artist makes choices guided by the knowledge or inner feelings, its "intuition". In the traditional works of art, artists seek for unity and variety or both; as today, there are many styles and forms in the work of arts, unlike advances in technology and science, new forms in the arts never replace and old one, most related art techniques are fused to create new art manifestation for example: "Digital mapping projection exhibition, comprising music, visual and performance". Obviously, no all styles can remain indefinitely, Picasso cannot do what Rembrandt did, nor Einstein can do what Newtons did. Arts survive by direct impact on people life swelling the ever-growing reservoir of human manifestation. In "Perceiving the Arts 1981", Sporre's suggested a work of art is always a gestalt: its "form" and its "content" are inseparable. The viewer may pay particular attention to the basic "form" expressed at the moment of appreciating it and considering the content more thoroughly tomorrow. These two concepts are interdependent. I must conclude that under this arrangement of basic elements such as point, line, plane along with the fundamental principles of design such a rhythm, color, contrast, so on and so forth, the artist has profoundly, emotionally and rigorously intellectual experience has come together to spark, arouse and affect us in a such special way called "Significant Form", not been able to say that the same work of art may offer similar response to any other individual experience. Finally, I do not believe that everyone is born with the sensibility or "taste" to appreciated a work of art; however, this is something that can be acquired or learned with a great deal of effort, practice, experience, and enjoyment. This experience in art contributes importantly to the viewer mental development. "Significant Form" stands charged with the power to provoke aesthetic emotions in anyone capable of feeling it. We are in essence patternseekers that use the visual to link the mental and emotion association that forth bring that information into patterns that we can use and decode.

Bibliography

- Arnheim, Rudolf. *Art and Visual Perception: A Psychology of the Creative Eye.* Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1954.
- Bell, Clive. Art. New York: Frederick A. Stokes Company Publishers, 1914.
- _____. "The Aesthetic Hypothesis." In *Modern Art and Modernism: A Critical Anthology*, edited by Francis Frascina, and Charles Harrison. New York: Westview Press, 1982.
- Britannica, T. Editors of Encyclopaedia. "Bloomsbury Group." In *Encyclopedia Britannica*, 20 February 2021. Available at: https://www.britannica.com/topic/Bloomsbury-group.
- Caruana, Louis. "To Marvel at the Manifold Connections: Philosophy, Biology, and Laudato Si." *Gregorianum* 102, no. 3 (2021): 617-631.
- Cassirer, Ernst. *The Philosophy of Symbolic Forms*. Volume 1. Translated by Ralph Manheim. New Haven & London: Yale University Press, 1955.
- Clement, Greenberg. "Modernist Painting." In *Modern Art and Modernism: A Critical Anthology*, edited by Francis Frascina, and Charles Harrison. New York: Westview Press, 1982.
- Ducom, Pauline. *Clive Bell et La France 'Art, Love and Thought'* (1904-1939). 2013. Available at: http://theses.enc.sorbonne.fr/2013/ducom.
- Dziemidok, Bohdan. "Artistic Formalism: Its Achievements and Weaknesses." *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism* 51, no. 2 (1993).
- Feldman, Edmund Burke. "Formalism and Its Discontents." *Studies in Art Education* 33, no. 2 (1992): 122-126.

- Findlay, Micheal. *The Value of Art; Money, Power, Beauty*. Munich London New York: Prestel Publishing, 2014.
- Fischer, Ernst. *The Necessity of Art: A Marxist Approach*. Translated by Anna Bostock, 210. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1959.
- Fish, Nathan. "Intentionality's Role in Bringing Art to Life. Meditations". *The Undergraduate Philosophy Journal at UCLA* 8, (2021): 39-56.
- Friedman, Michael. "Ernst Cassirer." In *The {Stanford} Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, edited by Edward N Zalta, Spring 2022. Metaphysics Research Lab, Stanford University, 2022.
- Gal, Michalle. "Art and Form: From Roger Fry to Global Modernism by Sam Rose." Estetika: The European Journal of Aesthetics 57, no. 2 (2020).
- Greene, Theodore Meyer. *The Arts and the Art of Criticism*. Michigan: Princeton University Press, 1965.
- Kivy, Peter. "Aesthetic Aspects and Aesthetic Qualities." *The Journal of Philosophy* 65, no. 4 (1968): 85-93.
- Kuplen, Mojca. "Immanuel Kant and the Emancipation of the Image BT." In *The Palgrave Handbook of Image Studies*, edited by Krešimir Purgar, 93-107. Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2021.
- McCreless, Patrick. *Formalism, Fair and Foul. The Music Issue*. Emory College of Arts and Sciences, 2013. Available at: https://nonsite.org/formalism-fair-and-foul/.
- Merriam-Webster.com Dictionary, s.v. "Canon." Available at: https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/canon.
- Mevorah Vera. *The Expressiveness of Form-Formalism in Art. Art History*. Widewalls Editorial, 2017. Available at: https://www.widewalls.ch/magazine/formalism-in-art.
- Miller, Bruce. *The Arts and the Basis of Education*. London: University Press of America, Inc., 1993.
- Pipes, Alan. Foundation of Art & Design. London: Laurence King Publishing, 2008.
- Roger, Fry. Vision and Design. New York: Dover Publications, 1981.
- Sartwell, Crispin. "Beauty." In *The {Stanford} Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, edited by Edward N Zalta, Summer 2022. Metaphysics Research Lab, Stanford University, 2022.
- Shelley, James. "The Concept of the Aesthetic." In *The {Stanford} Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, edited by Edward N Zalta, Spring 2022. Metaphysics Research Lab, Stanford University, 2022.
- Slater, Barry Hartley. "Aesthetic." In *The Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. 2021. Available at: https://iep.utm.edu/aestheti/#H10, today's date.
- Snyman, Johan. "The Significance and Insignificance of Clive Bell's Formalism." *Navorsingsartikels. Koers* 58. no. 2 (1993).
- Sporre, Dennis. *Perceiving the Arts, an Introduction to the Humanities*. New Jersey: Prentice-Hall Inc, 1981.
- Wallschlaeger, Charles, and Cynthia Busic-Snyder. *Basic Visual Concepts and Principles, for Artist, Architects and Designers*. Iowa: WCB. Wm. C. Brown Publishers, 1992.
- Wartenberg, Thomas E. *The Nature of Art, An Anthology*. Australia: Thomson Wadsworth, 2007.
- Whelpton, Barbara. *Art Appreciation, Made Simple*. United Kingdom: W.H. Allen & Company Ltd, 1970.
- Zeki, Semir. "Clive Bell's 'Significant Form' and the Neurobiology of Aesthetics." Frontiers in Human Neuroscience (2013).