Tobias Smollett: Critiques, Criticisms, and The Critical Heritage – 1730-70

The Critical Heritage series, published by Routledge and Kegan Paul, brings together contemporary critiques of authors active in 1730-70, including Pope, Swift, Fielding, Johnson, Smollett, and Sterne. Many pieces are attributed to named authors, but an Appendix to this paper extracts nearly one hundred comments written anonymously. The paper raises for wider academic discussion, the proposition that most of those anonymous pieces were authored by Tobias George Smollett (1721-71). The year 2021 is an apt time to revisit Smollett an author, representing the tercentenary year of his birth. The paper draws on research into his career, revealing Smollett contributed to London periodicals from c.1731. He was in London by early 1737; replacing Jacob Ilive as literary editor for Edward Cave’s The Gentleman’s Magazine. A selection of Smollett critiques and criticisms is discussed, along with the Marforio and Pasquin dialogues. The paper canvasses, and provides references to, a selection of separately published works newly attributed to Smollett.

Introduction

A decade of study has focused on Tobias George Smollett (1721-71), with full open-access research notes available as The Lost Works of Tobias Smollett. The process has identified many works attributable to Smollett, including criticisms of Pope, Fielding, Cibber, Hogarth, and others. The range of published material reveals Smollett’s personality, and allows picking of his style with increasing confidence; a notional template aiding to identify his anonymous works. This paper discusses selected of his critiques and criticisms in 1730-70; to indicate the nature of his relationships with literary and publishing contemporaries.

Smollett was narcissistic, with an intense desire for peer recognition, initially offering flattery to contemporaries, but when that failed, attacking with literary criticism. This preoccupation, and his absence at Cartagena, delayed Smollett’s cognisance of a sea change in English literature, represented by a public mood swing from satire and poetry, to romantic prose; largely initiated by Samuel Richardson’s Pamela. Smollett’s blind-spot perpetuated his writing poetry and fighting satiric battles, about which there was less and less reader interest. Fielding, via The Champion, did address well-intentioned caution towards Smollett, but being self-opinionated and dogmatic, Smollett obstinately continued as a follower, rather than as a leader. Smollett critiques of Pope, Fielding, Sterne, and others are included in The

1. D. Shelton, The Lost Works of Tobias Smollett and the War of the Satirists...
2. D. Shelton, Author Attributions in English Literature – 1730-70. (ATINER – under peer review)
Critical Heritage series, but listed there as anonymous. Many criticisms are omitted, particularly for Pope and Fielding. Additionally, there are implicit criticisms of Smollett in literary works of Pope, Fielding, and Hogarth which have lain unrecognised. Uncovering their trail is complicated by Smollett’s predilection for publishing anonymously.

Smollett was christened in March 1721, and attributed with The Modern Poets of November 1731, when not yet aged eleven. That raises a focus on his age and ability. Whilst unusual, he was not unique; the poet Caroline Symmons (1789-1802) wrote from an early age; with a date of 24 November, 1800, for her first published poem, Zelida. In age, upbringing, and poetical ability, Caroline Symmons is a benchmark for making Smollett attributions. As with Smollett, she was an admirer of Milton, but at age 14 she died from consumption. In 1812 the Monthly Review published a detailed, ten page, account of her life and works;³

It remains truly extraordinary that so young a lady (she who must then have been little more than eleven years old) should have projected a long poem, and have actually executed a considerable part of it in a style of force and grandeur … Mr W[rangham] informed us that, from her infancy, she discovered indications of very superior powers of intellect, and that in her seventh year he had first an opportunity of forming an estimate of them.⁴

Contemporary Periodicals

For over thirty years, Smollett was an inveterate contributor, with a notional template enabling many to be identified. They appear across a variety of titles; often in papers financially stressed, and short-lived. Based in Glasgow, his age was unknown to London editors, with his early works judged on merit. Editors of struggling papers were grateful for anonymous contributions, especially if received gratis. Although writing anonymously, the whole was fertile ground for Smollett, with many contributions readily accepted and published; thus allowing him to remotely, and rapidly, develop literary respectability, later widening his corpus by addition of satire and opinion pieces; being often described as, “our correspondent in the North”.⁵

But, for a successful paper like Cave’s The Gentleman’s Magazine, which attracted a better class of poet, his poems were subject to delay. In contrast, the ready acceptance of his poems by London Magazine inflated Smollett’s ego, and puffed his literary arrogance. So much so that, by September, 1734, he was

---

⁴. The Monthly Review, 1813 - Page 182
⁵. D. Shelton, The Lost Works of Tobias Smollett and the War of the Satirists …
ready and able, in London Magazine, in pieces well illustrating his character, to use scatology to abuse Cave; and dullness to abuse Cave, as Cavius, and Richard Russel, who wrote as Bavius in The Grub-street Journal;

Epigram on the Gentleman’s Magazine
Like t__d of quality in gilt close-stool,
Said the bright bard of brightest ridicule;
And tho’ thy labour, C__e, he could not mean,
It suits full well thy monthly Magazine.
Thy title page the gilded stool explains,
Where all within is excrement, not brains.

Another
Cavius and Bavius differ but a letter,
Compare their works you’ll understand ’em better!
If Bavius dulness pleads ’tis with design,
But Cavius birth-right pleads in every line.6

Smollett soon realised to mock Cave was imprudent, Hence, the next year Smollett refocused his criticism at literary editor, Jacob Ilive, who wrote as Sylvanus Urban in The Gentleman’s Magazine. Smollett used his London Magazine platform of August, 1735, to scorn Ilive in two adjacent letters, and three poems; all arrogantly critical of Urban’s purported mangling of his poems in The Gentleman’s Magazine (Figure 2).7

To the Author of the London Magazine.
Sir, Having a just quarrel with Mr Urban for his frequent unjustifiable Practices of mangling the pieces that are sent him to publish, I must beg the Favour of you to insert the following Poem in your Magazine, in order to present him with a Nosce teipsum, and to let him know that he is no Poet.
Your humble Servant; Archilochus.

To Mr Sylvanus Urban, on his own wretched Madrigals, and the horrid Abuses committed upon the Poems of Others (Figure 2).

To the Author of the London Magazine.
Sir, This mighty Man of ours, S. Urban. takes the Liberty not only of nauseating the Publick with his own Enunciation, but also to alter according to Pleasure both Sense and Diction in the Performances of others; so that his Correspondents blush to see his Brats enter the World under their respective Names. Yours &c.

To Sylvanus Urban, and Character of Sylvanus Urban (Figure 2).

Page 506 of the same 1735 London Magazine includes more Smollett derisive criticism; To Mr Sylvanus Urban, on his male-treating the Performances of his Correspondents. The 1734-35 criticisms are examples of Smollett writing

multiple pieces on a single theme, sometimes ad nauseam. As criticisms of Urban, the non-de-plume of Ilive, they registered with Cave. In 1736 Ilive was terminated for an error over a poetry prize, with Smollett’s pieces aiding him in assuming the mantle of Sylvanus Urban. In brief, the error related to Lady Elizabeth Hastings, and Ilive’s announcement she and General Oglethorpe would be on the obverse and reverse of a gold medal, to be awarded as a poetry prize. Lady Elizabeth was deeply offended to be publicly identified as donor of the prize and, as the medal would imply them as two parts of a whole, to thereby suggest she and Oglethorpe were lovers. The medal was instead struck with Archbishop Tillotson on one side, and General Oglethorpe on the other: the circumstances imply it was won by Smollett (Figure 1).  

Figure 1. Gold medal of Tillotson and Oglethorpe

Smollett was published in multiple periodicals, with many contributions identified in open-access research notes. He started with poetry, then progressed to social satire, religious comments, and politics: gravitating from contributions to publishing his own pamphlets and novels; from late 1740, and especially after his 1741 return from Cartagena. Clues to his pieces are that he was able to reprint his essays or letters from other papers, into The Gentleman’s Magazine or London Magazine.

Below is a provisional assessment of his periodical publishing history to 1770, some papers being short-lived. Some imply Smollett seeking to establish his own periodical, and/or involved in prolonging the life of those close to literary demise, e.g. The Literary Courier of Grub-street and Old Common Sense:

- **The Gentleman's Magazine** (1731-70). Smollett contributor from c.1731, literary editor c.1737-54
- **The Grub Street Journal** (1730-36) Smollett as contributor from 1731
- Revived as **The Literary Courier of Grub-street** (1738) Appears to involve Smollett.
- **The Auditor** (1733-34) Smollett as contributor
- **London Magazine** (1732-70) Smollett contributor from c.1732, literary editor c.1742-54
- **The Prompter** (1734-36) Smollett as contributor
- **The Universal Spectator** (1728-46) Smollett as contributor from c.1734
- **Old Whig; or the consistent Protestant** (1735-38) Smollett as contributor
- **The Daily Gazetteer** – under varying titles (1735-70) Smollett as contributor
- **The Political State of Great Britain** (1711-40) Smollett as contributor c.1737-40
- **The History of the Works of the Learned** (1737-43) Smollett as contributor

Common Sense or the Englishman’s Journal (5 Feb 1737- 9 Feb 1740) Smollett as contributor
Competing was Old Common Sense (26 Nov, 1737-16 Jun, 1739) Appears initiated by Smollett
Country Common Sense (1739) Appears initiated by Smollett
The Champion: or, British Mercury (1739-43) Post Fielding issues seem to involve Smollett
Scots Magazine (1739-70) Appears initiated by Smollett, as literary editor/contributor
Westminster Journal (1741-70) Smollett initial contributor/editor as Thomas Touchit
The Ladies Magazine; or, The Universal Entertainer. (1749-53) Smollett as contributor
Old England; or, the Constitutional Journal (1743-51) Smollett as contributor
Miscellaneous Correspondence (1742-48) Smollett as editor/contributor
London Evening Post (1727-70) Smollett as contributor from c.1745
British Magazine (1746-50) John Hill, and Smollett as contributor
The Remembrancer (1747-48) Smollett as contributor
The Monthly Review (1749-70) Smollett contributor to early issues?
Royal Magazine; or, Quarterly Bee (1750-51) Peter Bayle; Smollett pseudonym, ex Pierre Bayle?
The Critical Review (1756-70) Established by Smollett
Grand Magazine of Magazines; or, Universal Register (1758-59) Appears to involve Smollett?
Royal Female Magazine (1759-60) Appears to involve Smollett?
British Magazine: or, Monthly Repository (1760-67) Smollett as editor/contributor

The following is a tentative summary of Smollett’s early journalistic career, writing anonymously or under pseudonyms. His contribution thread runs via The Grub-street Journal in 1731-36, which he sought to revive as The Literary Courier of Grub-street in 1738. In parallel he had many poems printed in London Magazine and The Gentleman’s Magazine; occasional contributions were also published in The Auditor, The Prompter, and Old Whig. Pieces were reprinted in The Gentleman’s Magazine and London Magazine, as were Smollett social satires, first published in Universal Spectator, and opinion pieces reprinted from The Daily Gazetteer. From 1737 Smollett wrote reviews for inclusion in The History of the Works of the Learned.

By early 1737 Smollett had assumed the mantle of Sylvanus Urban at The Gentleman’s Magazine; in the 1740s also filling a similar role at London Magazine, and holding those roles until c.1754. In March 1737 he published A Vision of the Golden Rump in Common Sense: The resultant fracas led to his departure, switching to the competing, Old Common Sense. In 1739 he initiated the launch of Scots Magazine. Fielding established The Champion in 1739, but after he sold his interest, Smollett made occasional contributions, and in 1741

aided publishing of a two volume collection. After Cartagena, he wrote for
Westminster Journal, and for Old England until it ceased publication; then
London Evening Post, and early issues of The Monthly Magazine. In 1756 he
launched the Critical Review to ensure positive reviews. He also wrote for
Royal Magazine, Miscellaneous Correspondence, Grand Magazine of Magazines, and
Royal Female Magazine.

The Critical Heritage Series

Figure 3. The Modern Poets

Methodical, detailed, and logical Smollett research has identified many
published contributions from 1731, whereas conventional wisdom credits him
with nothing until 1746. A corpus of literary criticism, for potential attribution
to Smollett, is in the Critical Heritage series covering Pope, Swift, Fielding,
Johnson, Smollett, and Swift. One hundred anonymous criticisms are extracted from those volumes, and listed in the Appendix to this paper; listing the publication, date, and relevant volume. Those listed are all believed to display Smollett DNA, and are offered for academic research. The chronological order discloses a publishing pattern over time, as an aid in attributions. Selected remarks by author are below, especially on *The Modern Poets*, a poem in *The Critical Heritage* for Fielding; and relevant also to Pope and Swift.

*The Grub-street Journal*, 18 November, 1731. (Fielding 3) is an extract from a longer poem, *The Modern Poets*, which appeared in *The Gentleman’s Magazine*, November, 1731 (Figure 3). The poem mentions multiple, previous and current, poets and satirists: and thereby enables those named to be excluded as author. The poem purports to be, “By a young Gentleman of Cambridge”, which is a typical Smollett red-herring; he often used Cambridge or Oxford to divert from his Glasgow location. In November, 1731 Smollett was under eleven, but well-educated, and soon to attend Glasgow university. The poem is aabbccdd, his preferred form, and five lines herald Smollett as a nervous newcomer; one self-conscious of his Scottish accent;

To make our nervous language soft and sweet;
From Waller and from Dryden phrases chuse,
To smooth the roughness of your Highland muse.
Thus the skill’d tapster to the harsher stale,
To please the palate, adds the milder ale.

In *The Modern Poets*, Smollett seeks to impress Swift, Arbuthnot, Young, and Pope; he closes;

Let her the foplings charm; ’tis excellence,
Enough for me, to please the men of sense.
T[heobald] or Bays [Cibber] may ne’er a smile bestow,
But cry the verse is bad, the satire low;
D[ennis] may snarl, and give the poets laws,
(Who for a treat would grumble out applause);
Or buskin’d F[ielding] cry my verses down,
And swear that none but he can please the town.
This snarling tribe would ne’er my anger move,
Shou’d Swift, or Arbuthnot, or Young approve:
Shou’d Pope, to whom I’ll dedicate my lays,
Shou’d he but smile - I’d count their censure praise (Figure 3).

A 1732 work attributed to Smollett is, *Of Modern Wit, An Epistle to ... Sir William Young*, where line 8 includes similar nervousness; “The rude Essay of

an unskilful Muse” (Figures 4, 5). Of Modern Wit pairs with The Modern Poets in a reference to Young, together with matched; aabbccdd form, style, length, theme, gutted names, content, and in seeking peer recognition from Young. As author of both, one on wit and one on poetry, Smollett shows knowledge of the classics, poetry, and of literary figures. He is critical of Fielding, but praises Swift, Young, and Pope. At age sixteen, Smollett made other attempts to gain favour from Pope; as in London Magazine, September 1737, To Mr Pope, by a Youth of Sixteen: (Figure 6). In this Smollett again nervously admits his discordant Scottish accent, and unskilled muse, in seeking Pope’s approval, “Harsh jarring grates the ear, and discord sings; Such is the verse my unskill’d muse inspires”.

Figure 4. Of Modern Wit

---


When Pope declined to respond, Smollett published multiple poems, increasingly critical of Pope, but continued to be ignored. This prompted Fielding to use his Court of Censorial Enquiry to indict Pope for his silence. It was not until 1742, that Pope’s *New Dunciad* retaliated; casting Smollett as a plaid clad Scottish whore, for his ghost writing of, *An Apology for the Life of Mr Colley Cibber*;¹⁵

¹⁵. D. Shelton, Smollett, Champion IV - Court of Censorial Enquiry; Smollett &
When lo! a harlot-form soft-gliding by, [Harlot Smollett is Cibber’s literary whore.]

With mincing step, soft voice, and languid eye; [Smollett is an effeminate dandy.]

Foreign her air, her robes discordant pride [Discordant Scots dialect and arrogant manner.]

In patch-work flutt’ring, and her head aside, [Patch-work flutt’ring, a loose Scottish plaid.]

After Smollett became aware of the New Dunciad attack, he offered an olive-branch to Pope, by republishing, with minor changes, By a Youth of Sixteen, in Scots Magazine, June 1742 (Figure 7)

Figure 6. Sixteen – Sept. 1737

Pope - II - 1741-43 ; Smollett & Pope - III - Anti-Pope prints and Tom-Tit ; Smollett & Pope - IV - The Dunciad - 1742-44
Alexander Pope - The Critical Heritage


1. An Epistle to the Little Satyrst of Twickenham, March 1733. (Pope 78), is assessed as a Smollett criticism of Pope, in seeking to provoke a reaction, and hoping for a dialogue.16 (Figure 8).
2. The Prompter, November, 1735. (Pope 66), titled Ordure from Grub Street, refers to scatology, a common theme for Smollett; who is also attributed as 1733 author of, Human ordure, botanically considered.... By Dr. S-----t, which reads as crude schoolboylavatory humour. The reference to 'Dr S-----t' is an aspirational pun, on Smollett's divinity intent seeking, 'T. Smollett, D.D.' (Figure 9).17
3. An Epistle ... from South Carolina, 1737. (Pope 67), sometimes attributed to Thomas Dale but believed by Smollett, with "South Carolina" as word-play on "North Britain", i.e. Scotland.18 Items 71 and 85 are often attributed to Lord Hervey, but are part of Smollett's attack on Cibber and Pope.19 Sawney and Colley, 1742. (Pope 72) is also a Smollett attack directed at Pope and Cibber.20
4. The Gentleman’s Magazine, page 96, February, 1734. (Pope 80c) refers to “the Occasion of a Letter from the North, sign’d A.Z.”, with “the North” a clue to Smollett. A Letter from Mr Cibber, 1742. (Pope 91) is from A Letter from Mr Cibber to

17. D. Shelton, Smollett, Merryland, A Voyage to Lethe, Cupid & Hymen ...
19. D. Shelton, Pope II - anti-Pope Attacks 1741-42
Mr Pope, by Smollett, not Cibber. Item 92 is from The Champion, 31

Figure 8. An Epistle

Figure 9. Human Ordure

August, 1742, and illustrates Fielding’s ire about Smollett’s attacks on Pope.

An omission from CH Pope, and attributed to Smollett, is one of the first pieces written after Pope’s death. It appeared as a eulogy signed J.C. in The Gentleman’s Magazine for June 1744; following an account of Pope’s will, A true copy of the Last Will of Alexander Pope. The eulogy purports to praise Pope, but includes subtle innuendos show Smollett regarding himself as equal of Pope. Also attributed to Smollett is a rushed work after Pope’s death, under the pseudonym of William Ayre, Memoirs of the Life and Writings of Alexander Pope, Esq. (Pope 97), related to this is Remarks on Squire Ayre’s Memoirs, 1745. Pope’s death was a literary blow for Smollett; the “fun” had gone from provoking Pope, and opportunity for financial gain from attacks on Pope was lost. This indicates a shallow aspect of Smollett, he was a prolific satirist, but his satire was motivated by, and directed towards, his narcissistic personality, more than satire as an art form.

Jonathan Swift – The Critical Heritage

Swift The Critical Heritage, edited by Kathleen Williams, Barnes & Noble 1970, largely omits anonymous reviews of Swift, but an anonymous Swift item, absent from The Critical Heritage, was published in The Gentleman’s Magazine, March 1743 (Figure 10). Although included in the 1743 issue, it is dated Dublin, 1740, and headed; “The Scotsman’s Yearning, For the sight of the Rev. Dean Swift. Written by a gentleman who lately came to this Kingdom, and having made several attempts to see his reverence, could not by reason of his ill state of health.” The 1740 date and Dublin location are key to attribution.

In 1741 George Faulkner published on behalf of Smollett, An Apology for the Life of Mr Tho’ Cibber Comedian, being a Proper Sequel to the Apology for the Life of Mr Colley Cibber, Comedian. It is deduced Smollett traveled to Dublin in June 1740 to arrange its publication, on leave from HMS Chichester via a navy dispatch sloop. The Scotsman’s Yearning shows several attempts to meet Swift, possibly via an introduction from Laetitia Pilkington. The event prompting Smollett to publish a 1740 poem in 1743, is revealed in a snide comment on Swift at the end of the poem; “He has since been shewn by his servants, to spectators for a Penny a piece; on which his friends have taken out a Commission of Lunacy.” Other links allowing an attribution to Smollett include his use of a Scottish dialect, and his authority, as literary editor at The Gentleman’s Magazine.

24. D. Shelton, Pope III - Anti-Pope prints and Tom-Tit - 1740-1745
25. D. Shelton, Pope V - Ayre, Translations and Memoirs of Alexander Pope ...
Gentleman’s Magazine, to publish the poem. Smollett later also wrote in a Scottish dialect about the Jacobite Rebellion, under the pseudonym of Dougal Graham.27 The Appendix does include;

Anonymous criticisms of Houyhnhnmland, 1735 (Swift 18) Being, Critical Remarks upon Gulliver’s Travels; Particularly his Voyage to the Houyhnhnms Country. Part I. By Doctor Bentley. Published from the author’s original Mss, Dublin, Printed at Cambridge for the benefit of the author, reprinted in London, and now reprinted in Dublin, by Geo. Faulkner, 1735. This is believed a Smollett parody, following Swift, and mocking the style of Richard Bentley, even though Kathleen Williams remarks; “This pre-eminent importance of the fourth voyage, whether liked or hated, is further attested to by the charming skit called Critical Remarks upon Gulliver’s Travels; Particularly his Voyage to the Houyhnhnms Country. This is a parody not of Swift but of the critical methods of Dr Richard Bentley, who appears on the title-page as author (the true author may have been John Arbuthnot).”

To Mr Faulkner, Printer
I have five marks, no more or less, 
To put my writings to the press; 
Them print as far as this will go, 
To let this mickle city know, 
That Willy Burn, in Scotland bred, 
As true a lad as ever fired, 
Or cock’d a bonnet on his head, 
Has more than cause to grieve and mourn, 
That like a fool he maun return: 
For which he begs you’ll put in print, 
What follows here, as his complaint. 
Tho’ I have left my warm-side nook, 
And fald aff a’ my gier; 
For ready siller, which I took 
To bear my charges here. 
Have clam up mony a Highland-hill, 
Whase taps gang to the lift, 
Left my poor wife, with chick and chill, 
To come and see, dean Swift. 
Yet never wad I once begrudg’d 
The loss of pot and pan, 
Nor many weary steps I’ve trudg’d, 
To see this doughty man: 
Wha has made a’ the warld to winder, 
Wi’ his bra flaights of wit; 
And gar’d the mickle d___l knock under,

At ilka ither hit.
Wha always, in a mirry mood,
Put folks in the right road;
And wi' his wyles made them grow good,
When they had left their g__d.
But that I maun gae back again
Three hunder myles and mare,
Without a sight of this same dean,
It grieves my heart sou sare.
My wife will cry - the pottage pan,
My bairns will greet for bread,
For rent the laird will curse and ban,
And a' will wish me dead.

Figure 10. The Scotsman's Yearning

[Image of a page from a book]
Henry Fielding – The Critical Heritage

Henry Fielding - The Critical Heritage, edited by Paulson and Lockwood, lists criticisms of Fielding. Selected items are extracted in the Appendix for possible attribution to Smollett; who was intended for the clergy and taught by the grammarian, and controversialist John Love. Smollett wrote anonymously, espousing puritanical views with a “holier than thou” stance, whilst in parallel authoring many works with salacious or scatological content. He expressed envious and anonymous disapproval towards Fielding, including writing as Prosaicus and Dramaticus in The Grub-street Journal.

James Hillhouse noting of these:

Russel's authorship of numerous articles and epigrams signed Bavius, Maevius, and B.B. is revealed in the Memoirs. Russel was quite probably also the Marforio of the attack on Pasquin; this would be indicated especially by the writer's sensitiveness and resentment towards satire on the clergy. On the other hand the insinuation by Fielding's defenders that Prosaicus, Dramaticus, and the rest were mere disguises for Bavius or Russel is certainly not to be accepted. None of them write like Russel ... Dramaticus is continually harping on the fact that he is a gentleman, that his work would be accepted if he cared to exert personal pressure, but that he writes merely for pleasure. 28.

Hillhouse's reason for suggesting Russel as Marforio is weak, and better fits Smollett. Hillhouse's observation, “Prosaicus, Dramaticus, and the rest were mere disguises”, also suits Smollett's trait of adopting Latin-type pseudonyms ending, "...us". 29 Smollett was training for the clergy; hence, "the writer's sensitiveness and resentment towards satire on the clergy". Smollett proudly defined himself as a gentleman, his grandfather being knighted by King William; thus, “Dramaticus is continually harping on the fact that he is a gentleman”. The Grub-street Journal reviews are critical of Fielding and his works, but, with Smollett as an unknown author, hard to counter, and the embryo of Fielding's animus towards Smollett: they include;

The Grub-street Journal, 15 June, 1732. (Fielding 4) is a six-page critique of the script of The Modern Husband, signed Dramaticus, and often attributed to Sir William Yonge [Young as above], but he would have seen the play and remarked on the acting. Instead the review is attributed to Smollett. Although purportedly after attending a performance, that he was in Glasgow, and did not view the play, is indicated by; "These, Mr Bavius, are the reflections that occurred to me in reading the Modern Husband. I found indeed, here and there, but very sparingly scattered, a touch that implied good sense and reflection; but, like an April sun, it

29. D. Shelton, Author Attributions in English Literature – 1730-70. (ATINER – under peer review)
only shews itself, and away; bad weather returns, and we have a great deal of
filth to struggle through.” In 1732, Smollett was intending to become a
clergyman, and hence his puritanical reference to scatology, “a great deal of filth”.
The Grub-street Journal, 8 June 1732. (Fielding 6) is signed Prosaicus, and
attributed to Smollett. A clue is a plea to publish, a frequent Smollett
characteristic; “I hope, without any apology, you’ll give this letter a place in your
next”. Smollett rehearses a pulpit sermon, in criticising Fielding and his plays;
“The depravity of modern taste has long been complained of”, and “The success
of this piece will determine whether the age is fallen to the lowest ebb”. Fielding
was irritated and responded to Smollett with a letter signed Philalethes. Smollett
was encouraged by Fielding’s acknowledgement, initiating an
antagonism lasting until Fielding’s death. In The Old Whig, 8 April, 1736. (Fielding 23), Smollett writes “A Letter to a Friend in the Country”, a style he used for
scores of later pamphlets.

The Grub-street Journal Nos. 330 and 332, 22 April and 6 May, 1736 (Fielding 25), has Smollett adopting the pseudonym of Marforio, for a twelve page review of Fielding’s Pasquin. By 1736 Smollett had published many pieces, and was bursting with youthful arrogance. As a pair of statues at Rome, Marforio was rival of Pasquin. Hearing of Fielding’s Pasquin, Smollett saw opportunity to adopt the mask of Marforio, and so provoke Fielding. In 1736 Fielding was twice the age of Smollett, and lamed by gout. As an extra layer of insult, the statue of Pasquin (Figure 12) is old and battered, with Marforio (Figure 11) near perfect, to imply Smollett as youthful, fashionable, and preferable.

Figure 13. Political Dialogues

Wilbur Cross notes a lost play performed by John Rich's company on 10 April, 1736; this was likely written by Smollett; Marforio, A Theatrical Satyr, being a Comi-Tragical Farce call’d The Critick of Taste; or, a Tale of Tub, with “Tub” as snide reference to Fielding’s corpulence. In it, Marforio refers to Pasquin as his “witty brother”. Smollett is also attributed with, Political dialogues …. Translated from the original Italian. Smollett learned Italian in order to translate other works, and pretends this is a translation (Figure 13). Then, Second political dialogues between the celebrated statues of Pasquin and Marforio at Rome ... published the Twenty-Fifth Day of last March (Figure 14) The date of 25 March,

33. D. Shelton, Pope V – Ayre, Translations and Memoirs of Alexander Pope
1737 is significant, being straddled by *The Vision of the Golden Rump*, published in *Common Sense*, on 19 and 26 March, 1737.

Figure 14. Second Dialogues

References to a “packet” in *Political Dialogues*, and “Pacquet” in, *Second Political Dialogues*, are to Fielding’s lost manuscript, the Golden Rump, reputedly critical of Royalty. He and Smollett knew of their competing Golden Rump mss.; as noted in *Second Political Dialogues*; “so monstrously Inconsistent with each other, tho’ upon the same Subject, and from Natives of the same Land, that without much Study and Labour, ’twill be impossible to form any just Idea, of the true Intention of my Correspondents.”

Act, and ended Fielding’s career as a playwright. Fielding then never forgave Smollett.

Also attributed to Smollett is, To the Author of Pasquin, in A Collection of Miscellany Poems, c.1736 (Fielding 26), as are three later Marforio/Pasquin works, all with spurious imprints: two published by W. Webb and one by J. Bromage: An Historical View of the Principles, Characters, Persons, &c ... by Marforio 1740; Pasquin and Marforio on the Peace [1748]; and Pasquin Pasquinaded 1749 (Figures 15, 16, 18). In An Historical View Smollett writes as Marforio, and includes an attack on Fielding over the Golden Rump. The latter works include subtle dialogues on the relationship between Fielding and Smollett; implicitly with Pasquin and Marforio on the Peace, alluding to a truce in their satiric war, after publication of Tom Jones and Roderick Random.

Figure 15. On the Peace

---

35. D. Shelton, Smollett and The Golden Rump


37. D. Shelton, Smollett and W. Webb, Spurious Imprints ; Smollett and Spurious Imprints A to E
However, prospect of peace lapsed after Smollett mocked Fielding in a *Dissertation on Mr Hogarth’s Six Prints*, 1751 (Figure 17); “And was one to traverse the Halls of their Chief Magistrate, what scenes of Gluttony, Drunkenness, and Excesses of all Kinds should we see rampant everywhere?”. Fielding retaliated by ridiculing Smollett in *Covent Garden Journal*, and as the unknown Author in *Amelia*.


39. D. Shelton, *A Satire not a Sermon, Four Stages of Cruelty* ... (ATINER, 2020, doi.org/10.30958/ajhis.6-3-3)
Figure 17. A Dissertation

A DISSERTATION
ON
Mr. Hogarth’s Six Prints
Lately publish’d, viz.
Gin-Lane, Beer-Street, and the
Four Stages of Cruelty.

CONTAINING
I. A Genuine Narrative of the horrible Deeds perpetrated by
that fiery Dragon, Gin; the wretched and deplorable
Condition of its Admires and Votaries; the dreadful
Havock and Devastation it has made among the Human
Species; its pernicious Effects on the Soldiers, Seamen and
Mechanicks of this Kingdom; and its poisonous and
pernicious Qualities in destroying the Health, and cor-
rupting the Morals of the People.

II. Useful Observations on wanton and inhuman Cruelty,
severely satirizing the Practice of the Common People in
sporting with the Lives of Animals.

Being a proper Key for the right Appreciation of the Author’s
Meaning in those Delights.

Humbly inferib’d to the
Right Honourable Francis Cokayne, Esq.
Lord Mayor of the City of London, and the Worshippful Court of Alderman.
Who have so worthily distinguished themselves in the Measures they have
taken to suppress the excessive Use of Spirituous Liquors.

LONDON,
Printed for B. Dickinson, on Ludgate-Hill, 1751.
Price One Shilling.
Smollett is also believed author of, *Pasquin and Marforio, a Dialogue*, in *Scots Magazine*, 1761, a revival after Fielding’s death, as a convenient way to comment on war in Germany.40 Smollett made unkind allusion to Fielding as Pasquin in 1767, even after his 1754 death, in *Travels Through France and Italy*;

[F]ronting the entrance, is a handsome fountain with the statue of a river god reclining on his urn. This is no other than the famous Marforio, so called from its having been found in Martis Foro. It is remarkable only as being the conveyance of the answers to the satires which are found pasted upon Pasquin, another mutilated statue standing at the corner of a street. 41

*The Daily Gazetteer*, 7 May, 1737 (Fielding 29); *The Daily Gazetteer*, 4 June, 1737 (Fielding 31) has letters signed, An Adventurer in Politicks. Sometimes credited to Lord Hervey, but now attributed to Smollett; who wrote for *The Daily Gazetteer*, later authoring satirical pieces there signed The Fool.42

An observation by Vincent Liesenfeld aids Smollett attributions, via

40. *The Scots Magazine - Volume 23 - Page 9* also p. 525
42. D. Shelton, *Smollett and The Daily Gazetteer*
mention of *Auri sacra fames* by the “Adventurer”, and in *The Vision*; “The Adventurer attributes the composition of *Eurydice Hissed* to Fielding’s greed, the *Auri sacra fames*. By using the same Virgilian phrase (Aeneid III.57) that was embroidered in gold characters on the cassock worn by the Chief Magician in *The Vision of the Golden Rump*, the Adventurer attributes to Fielding the very characteristic that had distinguished the figure of Walpole, his main target, in the satire in *Common Sense* seven weeks earlier”.

But Liesenfeld errs in opining Walpole as target of *The Vision of the Golden Rump*. When read carefully, *The Vision* is a satire focused on the Stuart Pretender, his elaborate Court in Exile, and his efforts to obtain support. It demonstrates a characteristic of Smollett satire; strongly advancing a point of view, but with an ironic twist to reveal his true message. A reader of *The Vision* is lulled into a belief the fable targets King George and Walpole, but a Smollett twist mocks the Jacobites as Papists, a threat to be feared far more;

If they [Papists] had sufficient Power, they would instantly melt down the Body of our Pagod [King George] for the Use of the Poor, and crucify the Chief Magistrate [Walpole] for a Terror to all of his Profession [politicians]. In the Place of the former they would set up the Statue of the Blue-eyed Virago [Bonnie Prince Charlie], Pallas Athene [in the Palace]; and supply the Room [Rome] of our Gaster Argos [Papism], by recalling an old Maid, one Astraea, [Virgin Mary], who for her Impertinence was banished the Earth [the Reformation] above four thousand Years [above 200 years] ago.

*Figure 19. Vision of the Golden Rump*

To reinforce his ant-Jacobite message in *The Vision*, Smollett, admonishes readers who may charge him as anti-Hanover, "to open their Eyes and

---

45. D. Shelton, *Smollett and The Golden Rump*
purchase Two pennyworth of Common Sense”; a pun advertising the magazine The Vision appeared in. Liesenfeld was also misled by Smollett when opining; 

On Saturday the Daily Gazetteer printed another essay by “An Adventurer in Politicks” that rebutted the arguments put by “Pasquin” in Common Sense three weeks earlier (21 May). The Adventurer using a method that was quickly to become standard in the newspaper war, bases his attack on historical parallels. ... Exactly the same method is adopted by R.F. (almost certainly “R. Freeman,” Ralph Courteville’s pseudonym) in the Daily Gazetteer of 10 June, which consists of an extended history of the stage and its regulation in Greece and Rome.47

Using multiple identities, Smollett was initiator of that use of historical parallels. R.F. did stand for Ralph Freeman, but as a Smollett pseudonym. The reason for scholars linking R.F. to Courteville, was a red-herring in a Smollett work signed Marforio, and bearing a spurious W. Webb imprint, which states; “Another Writer in this Paper [Gazetteer] is one M___y, whose political name is Algernon Sidney, as that of C____le is R. Freeman.”48 Scholars have never questioned Marforio’s motive for that claim but, with Smollett revealed as Marforio, it demands scrutiny and reveals Smollett’s mischief. He had written as both Algernon Sidney and Ralph Freeman but, to conceal his identity, laid false trails to Charles M[ollo]y and C[ourtevill].

An Apology for the Life of Mr Colley Cibber, 1740. (Fielding 35) is usually attributed to Colley Cibber, but was ghost-written for him by Smollett; with a quid pro quo that Cibber would stage Smollett’s The Regicide.49 As the Licensing Act ended Fielding’s career as a playwright, Smollett opted to use An Apology to mock Fielding, referring to “a broken wit”, as a pun on the destruction of Fielding’s career.50,51 Smollett repeated the insult in his biography of Theophilus Cibber, An Apology for the Life of T... C...;

These tolerated Companies gave Encouragement to a broken Wit to collect a fourth Company, who for sometime acted Plays in the Hay-Market, which House the united Drury-Lane Comedians had quited. This enterprising Person, I say,

51. T. Smollett, An Apology for the Life of Mr Colley Cibber ... (London: John Watts, 1740), 164.
Fielding was incensed by this so, in 1741, he published Shamela to ridicule Smollett; via rhyming slang of Tobias/Toby to characterise Smollett as Mr Toby/Booby. On returning to London, Smollett immediately countered with, To the Author of Shamela, The London Magazine, June 1741. (Fielding 37). Hogarth later sided with Fielding, in depicting Smollett as “a broken blade” in Plate 2 of Marriage A-la-Mode. The Appendix lists multiple works referring to Tom Jones, most believed attributable to Smollett, although space precludes discussion in this paper. In The Critical Heritage, the Tom Jones pieces include;

The London Magazine, February 1748-9. (Fielding 57)
From The Fan: A Heroi-Comical Poem, in Three Cantos 1749. (Fielding, 58)
Preface to The History of Tom Jones, the Foundling, in his Married State, 1750. (Fielding 80)
Orblius, from An Examen of the History of Tom Jones, a Foundling … (Fielding 82)
The Monthly Review, December, 1749 (Fielding 83)
From The History of Charlotte Summers, the Fortunate Parish Girl, 1750. (Fielding 87)
The Gentleman’s Magazine, March, 1750 (Fielding 90)
Old England, 7 April, 1750 (Fielding 93)
The Gentleman’s Magazine, May 1750 (Fielding 94)
To the Worshipful Justice Fielding, An Apology of the Life of Mr Bampfylde … (Fielding 98)
The Gentleman’s Magazine for March, 1751 (Fielding 99)
The Magazine of Magazines, April, 1751 (Fielding 100)
On the incomparable History of Tom Jones, The Ladies Magazine, 20 April 1751 (Fielding 101)

Tom Jones represents a peak in the Smollett v. Fielding wars, as discussed in separate notes. Key is a critique showing the opening essays in each chapter of Tom Jones, were written by Fielding as criticisms of Smollett. Those notes also attribute to Smollett, Charlotte Summers, and Tom Jones … in his Married State. Separate notes attribute Bampfylde Moore-Carew to Smollett.

54. D. Shelton, Smollett and Tom Jones - 1749
56. D. Shelton, Lost in the Scotch Mist - New Attributions to Tobias Smollett, (ATINER: under peer review), Smollett and Jonathan Wild 1743-50

Old England, 21 December, 1751 (Fielding 106)
The London Magazine, December, 1751 (Fielding 108)
The London Evening Post, 16-18 January, 1752 (Fielding 112)
The Adventures of a Valet, 1752. (Fielding 124)

**Figure 20. A Dialogue**

---

57. D. Shelton, *Smollett and Jacob Robinson Imprints*.
58. D. Shelton, *A Satire not a Sermon, Four Stages of Cruelty ...* (ATINER, 2020, doi.org/10.30958/ajhis.6-3-3)
Figure 21. The Parallel

Omitted from Critical Heritage, but focused on the Smollett/Fielding battles is Fielding’s 1745 pamphlet, A Dialogue between the Devil, the Pope, and the Pretender (Figure 20). Said to refer to John Henley, but a better fit to Smollett; who penned The Fool column in the Daily Gazetteer. Fielding conveys anger and frustration about Smollett’s tactics and carping criticisms. Concealed in a simple Sermon on the Jacobite rebellion, is a cryptic Satire, wherein impish “Devil” Fielding, has regal “Pope” (Alexander Pope) fulminate on Smollett, as “Pretender” to Pope’s literary throne, but who is,  

59. H. Fielding, A Dialogue between the Devil, the Pope, and the Pretender, (London: M Cooper, 1745); The Fool: Being a Collection of Essays and Epistles: Moral, ... ; Smollett and Porcupinus Pelagius
“one single impudent Buffoon”:

And to show their Profligacy in the highest Light, one single impudent Buffoon, hath for many Years has gone on with Impunity, in Defiance not only of Law but of common Decency, to vilify and ridicule every thing solemn, great and good amongst them: and, with a Mixture of Nonsense, Scurrility, Treason, and Blasphemy, once a Week, in the public Papers, and once in a Public Assembly (if any be so infamous to frequent it) to traduce the Persons and Characters of Nobles, Bishops, and even of the King himself.  

Smollett retaliated to Fielding’s insults with a pointedly similar title, A Serious Dialogue between the Devil the Pope and Pretender, At a conference held at the Pope’s palace; relating to the affairs in Scotland, 1745.  

Hogarth also mocked Smollett, as a young pretender to Pope’s literary throne, in The Gate of Calais.  

As with Alexander Pope, Smollett criticisms of Fielding ceased on the latter’s death: the cut and thrust of jousting was gone, so Smollett “dropped” Fielding, just as he “dropped” Pope. Soon after Fielding’s death, in 1755 Smollett emerged from the shadows, filling his need for criticism, via The Critical Review.

Tobias Smollett - The Critical Heritage

Tobias Smollett - The Critical Heritage, edited by Lionel Kelly, lists criticisms of Smollett. Selected items listed in the Appendix for potential attribution to Smollett include;

An Oxford Scholar, from The Parallel, 1748 (Smollett 5), is an extract from The Parallel; or, Pilkington and Phillips Compared ... by an Oxford Scholar, 1748, which bears J Stanton as a spurious imprint (Figure 21). Ongoing research is indicating Smollett was involved in editing, Pilkington’s Memoirs and Phillips’s Apology. He then published The Parallel, in order to “kill three birds with one stone”; i.e. to puff all three, Memoirs, Apology, and Roderick Random in a single pamphlet.

An Essay on the New Species of Writing, 1751 (Smollett 11) is usually attributed to Francis Coventry, but is more likely by Smollett, with a clue that the Preface slyly puffs three Smollett novels; “Should the following Sheets be of Force enough to hinder the weak sickly Birth of a Joe Thompson, Charlotte Summers, or Peregrine Pickle, in Embrio; the Town would undoubtedly be glad to exchange the heavy

60. D. Shelton, Smollett and Jonathan Wild 1743-50; Smollett and Porcupinus Pelagius  
Work of a voluminous Scribler for the more easy Burden of a loose Pamphlet.”

The Monthly Review, February, 1751. (Smollett 12) is Smollett seeking to defend, against Sir John Hill, his account of Lady Vane in Roderick Random.

The Monthly Review, March, 1751. (Smollett 13) is normally attributed to John Cleland, but is perhaps by Smollett. In early years of The Monthly Review, Smollett did contribute reviews, but after Ralph Griffiths came to view Smollett as a competitor, The Monthly Review became increasingly scathing of Smollett works; leading him to counter by establishing the Critical Review in 1756.

The Battle of the Reviews, 1760 (Smollett 55) was published by R. Marriner, a Smollett spurious publisher, and inspired by Swift's The Battle of the Books. In comparing the Monthly Review and Critical Review, Smollett implicitly puffs the latter. He was a master of polemic rhetoric, and believed the appearance of a bitter public rivalry between the two reviews would boost sales.

Samuel Johnson - The Critical Heritage

Samuel Johnson - The Critical Heritage, edited by James T. Bouton, lists criticisms of Johnson. Selected items listed in the Appendix for possible attribution to Smollett include;

Johnson seeking a Publisher for London, 1738 (Johnson 1). Although by Johnson, it is relevant that Johnson wrote to Edward Cave at The Gentleman's Magazine. In 1738 Smollett was the literary editor at The Gentleman's Magazine, having replaced Jacob Ilive. Hence Smollett likely received the letter, and crafted a reply to Johnson, suggesting he should instead approach Robert Dodsley. It seems significant the poem did not appear in The Gentleman's Magazine, due to Smollett seeking to discourage a poet who displayed more natural skill than Smollett himself.

A Criticism on Mahomet and Irene, 1749. (Johnson 4) and An Essay on Tragedy, 1749. (Johnson 5), are attributed to Smollett who wrote many literary reviews; he often published multiple titles on a single theme. An essay on tragedy, with a critical examen of Mahomet and Irene, London, R. Griffiths, 1749 is sometimes attributed to John Hippisley, but more likely by Smollett who, c.1747-50, did publish several works with Griffiths. Smollett wrote many reviews; these both likely by him.

Two early tributes, 1750 (Johnson 6). The first is from the Remembrancer of 21 April, 1750, and signed by Smollett, as Dennis Ductile; “If a new writer, blessed with a vigorous imagination, under the restraint of a classical judgement, a master of all the charms and graces of expression, had not lately made his appearance to the public under the stile and title of The Rambler, I would myself have assumed that character, as the most suitable to my own.” Here Smollett indulges in self-puffing; he did write contributions for the Remembrancer c.1750

64. T. Smollett, An Essay on Tragedy, with a critical examen of Mahomet and Irene, (London: Griffiths, 1749)
and the tone here is believed his.\footnote{65}

**Laurence Sterne - The Critical Heritage**

*Laurence Sterne - The Critical Heritage*, edited by Alan. B. Howes, lists criticisms of Sterne. Selected items listed in the Appendix for possible attribution to Smollett include;

*Critical Review*, January, 1760. (Sterne 6a); *London Magazine*, February, 1760. (Sterne 6b); *Royal Female Magazine*, February, 1760. (Sterne 6c); all likely by Smollett.

*Letter*, April, 1760. (Sterne 9b). This letter was written on 15 April 1760, but only published in 1788. It discusses the design of *Tristram Shandy*, and the tone is that of Smollett. The opening reads as an answer to a question; a common Smollett ploy. Smollett seeks to convey he was friendly with Sterne; he discusses the work as a fellow author, and as a man aware of clerical sensitivities; arising from Smollett’s divinity training. The timing of their June meeting seems camouflaged, but note the use of ‘Nay’, also scatology references to “the Dirtiness of Swift” and “the Looseness of Rabelais”;

"In Answer to your Enquiries, I have sate down to write a longer Letter than usual, to tell you all I know about him and the Design of his Book. I think it was some Time in June last [*1759] that he showed me his Papers, more than would make four such Volumes as those two he has published, and we sate up a whole Night together reading them. ... That it was no difficult Matter to avoid the Dirtiness of Swift on the one Hand, and the Looseness of Rabelais on the other - and that if he steered in that middle Course, he might make it not only a very entertaining, but a very instructive and useful Book; and on that Plan I said all I could to encourage him to come out with a Volume or two in the Winter … At this Time he was haunted with Doubts and Fears of its not taking. He did not, however, think fit to follow my Advice, yet when the two Volumes came out, I wrote a Paper or two by Way of recommending them**."\footnote{66}

*The reference to June is a deliberate red-herring. In 1759 Sterne was mostly at York: on 2 June 1759, Smollett was in London for his trial for libel and, sometime between June and October 1759, he traveled to the Continent. ** The above reviews, 6a and 6b, in *Critical Review* and *London Magazine*.\footnote{65} D. Shelton, *Smollett, Vol. 20, 1750, The Gentleman’s Magazine*.

Conclusion

The year 2021 is a suitable occasion to reassess Smollett’s career as author, being the tercentenary of his birth. This paper has tabled for discussion, examples of Smollett’s anonymous critiques and criticisms, many as contributions to papers and others as separately published works, often with spurious imprints. The discussion is supported by extensive open access research notes. Scholars are invited to reconsider Smollett’s role, corpus, and career in the light of evidence showing he contributed to many London periodicals from 1731. The evidence of Smollett’s contributions and his many published works have wide implications for a revision of the history of English literature. Affecting to greater or lesser degrees, previous histories of Pope, Swift, Fielding, Johnson, and Sterne, as well as William Hogarth, Colley Cibber, and Theophilus Cibber. And better illuminating, contemporary commentaries on the theatre, the Jacobite Rebellion, and British politics.

Bibliography

Fielding, H. A Dialogue between the Devil, the Pope, and the Pretender, London: M Cooper, 1745.
Shelton, D. Author Attributions in English Literature – 1730-70. ATINER – under peer review.
Shelton, D. A Satire not a Sermon, Four Stages of Cruelty ... ATINER, 2020, doi.org/10.30958/ajhis.6-3-3.
Shelton, D. A Satire not a Sermon, Marriage A-la-Mode and Shamela, ATINER: under peer review.
Shelton, D. Lost in the Scotch Mist - New Attributions to Tobias Smollett, ATINER: under peer review.

Ackers, 1735.

1 Smollett, T. *An Apology for the Life of Mr Colley Cibber ... London: John Watts, 1740*
2 3 Smollett, T. *An Apology for the Life of T... C... London: J. Mechell, 1740,
3 Smollett, T. *A Serious Dialogue between the Devil the Pope and Pretender ... London: Stanton, 1745.*
4 Smollett, T. *Pasquin and Marforio on the Peace ... London: Webb [1748].*
5 Smollett, T. *Pasquin Pasquinaded ... London: Bromage, 1749.*
Smollett, T. *A Dissertation on Mr Hogarth’s Six Prints ... London: Dickinson, 1751.*
Smollett, T. *An Essay on the New Species of Writing ... London: W. Owen, 1751.*
6 Symmons, C. *Poems by Caroline Symmons and Charles Symmons ... London: Johnson, 1812.*
Appendix of Anonymous Critiques from The Critical Heritage

As a convenience, and as an invitation for academic researchers, this Appendix of anonymous critiques is extracted from selected volumes of The Critical Heritage; showing the volume and contents numbering, in chronological order:


Most contain Smollett DNA, and many are discussed in the online research notes, but as a fraction of his pieces in 1730-70. Hence many others absent from The Critical Heritage. Also omitted are covert references; e.g., Fielding refers to Smollett as Mr Wilson in Joseph Andrews, as Tom Smirk in Jonathan Wild, and the anonymous Author in Amelia.

- The Grub-street Journal, 18 November, 1731. (Fielding 3)
- The Grub-street Journal, 15 June, 1732. (Fielding 4)
- The Grub-street Journal, 8 June 1732. (Fielding 6)
- The Grub-street Journal, 30 March, 1732. (Fielding 7)
- The Grub-street Journal, 29 June, 1732. (Fielding 8)
- The Grub-street Journal, 13 July, 1732. (Fielding 9)
- The Grub-street Journal, 20 July, 1732. (Fielding 10)
- The Grub-street Journal, 24 August, 1732. (Fielding 13)
- The Auditor, 23 March, 1732-3. (Fielding 15)
- The Satirist: in Imitation of the Fourth Satire of Horace, June, 1733. (Pope 64)
- An Epistle to the Little Satyrst of Twickenham, March 1733. (Pope 78)
- The Gentleman’s Magazine, April, 1733. (Fielding 16)
- The Universal Spectator, 6 July, 1734. (Fielding 20)
- The Gentleman’s Magazine, page 96, February, 1734. (Pope 80c)
- The Gentleman’s Magazine, page 97, February, 1734. (Pope 80d)
- An Epistle to Mr Pope, November, 1734 (Pope 80e)
- The Poet Finish’d in Prose, June, 1735. (Pope 65)
- The Prompter, November, 1735. (Pope 66)
- A Letter to Mr Pope, March 1735 (Pope 87)
- Anonymous criticisms of Houyhnhnmeland, 1735 (Swift 18)
The Old Whig, 8 April, 1736. (Fielding 23)
The Grub-street Journal Nos. 330 and 332, 22 April and 6 May, 1736 (Fielding 25)
To the Author of Pasquin, in A Collection of Miscellany Poems, 1737 (Fielding 26)
The Daily Gazetteer, 7 May, 1737 (Fielding 29)
Common Sense; or, the Englishman’s Journal, 21 May, 1737 (Fielding 30)
The Daily Gazetteer, 4 June, 1737 (Fielding 31)
An Epistle … from South Carolina, 1737. (Pope 67)
Johnson seeking a Publisher for London, 1738 (Johnson 1)
Common Sense; or, the Englishman’s Journal, 28 October, 1738. (Fielding 33)
Observations on the Present Taste for Poetry, 1739. (Fielding 34)
An Apology for the Life of Mr Colley Cibber, 1740. (Fielding 35)
To the Author of Shamela, The London Magazine, June 1741. (Fielding 37)
A Letter from Mr Cibber, 1742. (Pope 88c)
A Letter from Mr Cibber, 1742. (Pope 91)
A Letter to Mr C__b_r, August, 1742. (Pope 71)
A Letter to Mr C__b_r, August, 1742. (Pope 85)
Sawney and Colley, 1742. (Pope 72)
The Craftsman, 1 January, 1742-43. (Fielding 46)
Why How now, Gossip Pope, 1743. (Pope 94)
An Elegy on Mr Pope, June 1744. (Pope 96)
Memoirs of the Life and Writings of Alexander Pope, Esq., 1745. (Pope 97)
From Trott Plaid Excused, The London Evening Post 28-30 July 1748. (Fielding 53)
An Oxford Scholar, from The Parallel, 1748 (Smollett 5)
The Gentleman’s Magazine, March 1749 (Smollett 6)
Old England, 20 Nov, 1748, reprinted in Gentleman’s Magazine Dec, 1748. (Fielding 54)
The London Magazine, February 1748-9. (Fielding 57)
From The Fan: A Heroi-Comical Poem, in Three Cantos 1749. (Fielding, 58)
A Criticism on Mahomet and Irene, 1749. (Johnson 4)
An Essay on Tragedy, 1749. (Johnson 5)
The Gentleman’s Magazine, March, 1749 (Fielding 61)
Old England, 27 May, 1749 (Fielding 66)
The Gentleman’s Magazine, June 1749 (Fielding 75)
The Gentleman’s Magazine, August, 1749 (Fielding 76)
Preface to The History of Tom Jones, the Foundling, in his Married
State, 1750. (Fielding 80)
Orbilius, from An Examen of the History of Tom Jones, a Foundling ... (Fielding 82)
The Monthly Review, December, 1749 (Fielding 83)
From The History of Charlotte Summers, the Fortunate Parish Girl, 1750. (Fielding 87)
The Gentleman’s Magazine, March, 1750 (Fielding 90)
Old England, 7 April, 1750 (Fielding 93)
The Gentleman’s Magazine, May 1750 (Fielding 94)
The Monthly Review, January, 1750-51 (Fielding 96)
To the Worshipful Justice Fielding, An Apology of the Life of Mr Bampfylde ... (Fielding 98)
An Essay on the New Species of Writing, 1751 (Smollett 11)
The Monthly Review, February, 1751. (Smollett 12)
The Monthly Review, March, 1751. (Smollett 13)
The Royal Magazine, Jan, Feb, Mar, 1751. (Smollett 14)
A Parallel, March 1751 (Smollett 16)
The London Magazine, March, 1751 (Smollett 17)
The Gentleman’s Magazine for March, 1751 (Fielding 99)
The Magazine of Magazines, April, 1751 (Fielding 100)
On the incomparable History of Tom Jones, The Ladies Magazine, 20 April 1751 (Fielding 101)
The Ladies’ Magazine, June, 1751 (Smollett 22)
Old England, 21 December, 1751 (Fielding 106)
The London Magazine, December, 1751 (Fielding 108)
Habbakkuk Hilding, 15 January, 1752 (Smollett 25)
Fun: A Parodi-tragi-comical Satire, 1752 (Smollett 28)
Dedication to Ferdinand Count Fathom, 1753 (Smollett 32)
The London Evening Post, 16-18 January, 1752 (Fielding 112)
The Adventures of a Valet, 1752. (Fielding 124)
Some Remarks on the Life and Writings of Dr [John] H[ill], 1751/52 (Fielding 130)
The Gentleman’s Magazine, March, 1752 (Fielding 131)
Critical Remarks on Sir Charles Grandison, Clarissa, and Pamela, 1754. (Fielding 143)
Admonitions from the Dead in Epistles to the Living, 1754. (Fielding, 150)
The London Magazine, February, 1755. (Fielding 151)
The Gentleman’s Magazine, March, 1755. (Fielding 152)
The Monthly Review, March 1755. (Fielding 153)
A Letter from a Gentleman, in Roderick Random, 1755 (Smollett 42)
Critical Review, February, 1752 (Smollett 43)
Ode to Dr Smollett, 20-22 February 1760 (Smollett 54)
The Battle of the Reviews, 1760 (Smollett 55)
Critical Review, January, 1760. (Sterne 6a)
London Magazine, February, 1760. (Sterne 6b)
Royal Female Magazine, February, 1760. (Sterne 6c)
Letter, April, 1760. (Sterne 9b)
Critical Review, April, 1760. (Sterne 10b)
The Universal Magazine of Knowledge and Pleasure, April, 1760. (Sterne 10c)
Grand Magazine, April, 1760. (Sterne 11a)
Explanatory Remarks on ... Tristram Shandy by Jeremiah Kunastrokius, April, 1760. (Sterne 11b)
The Clockmakers Outcry Against the Author of ... Tristram Shandy, May, 1760. (Sterne 11c)
Tristram Shandy’s Bon Mots, Repartees, odd Adventures, and Humorous Stories ... and a New Dialogue of the Dead, between Dean Swift, and Henry Fielding, Esq; June, 1760. (Sterne11d)
Critical Review, May, 1760. (Sterne 13b)
Monthly Review, May, 1760. (Sterne 13c)
Royal Female Magazine, May, 1760. (Sterne 13d)
Sterne as Juvenilian satirist, June, 1760. (Sterne 15)
Sterne and the Monthly Reviewers, June 1760. (Sterne 20)
Attack on Sterne and the Methodists, July 1760. (Sterne 21)
Tristram Shandy as satire, 1760. (Sterne 24)
British Magazine, February, 1761. (Sterne 28b)
Critical Review, April, 1761. (Sterne 28c)
A mock funeral discourse, October 1761. (Sterne 31)

With later critiques, from 1761 and attributable to Smollett; listed in Smollett CH and Sterne CH.