Teaching Method in Shadow Education: the Impact of Implementing a Task Cycle into Supplementary Lessons in Hong Kong

Shadow education has been a popular topic among students in Hong Kong, since a lot of them have extra classes after school. Research has shown that shadow education is subordinated to mainstream schools, and it can provide a more supportive role to students who are in-need. In these days, scholars focused on discussing the impact that shadow education had on students, and students, teachers and parents' point of views. However, there is hardly any research about the teaching methods inside shadow education. This is a very important topic, since teaching methods will affect the effectiveness of student's learning. As a result, for this research, the main focus is on shadow education teaching method. The use of task cycle is also being used in this research, since studies showed that it can improve the student's learning abilities. By using an organized teaching method in shadow education, this may improve the quality of shadow education. Moreover, this can open an area for more research to investigate the teaching methods in shadow education.

Keywords: *language learning, shadow education, task cycle, teaching and learning*

Introduction

In the past decades, private tutoring has become a trend in many countries around the world, and many families are willing to spend money on this type of education. According to Lee (2013), in Korea, there were 86.8 % of primary school students and 72.2 % of secondary school students had private tutoring classes in 2010, and the tutoring sector contained approximately 3 % of Gross Domestic Product (GDP). This is also the case in Hong Kong, since parents in Hong Kong are willing to spend money in supplementary tutorial classes to provide extra help for their children (Kwo & Bray, 2011). It is a sense of

competitiveness among parents in Hong Kong, since they do not want their children to be left behind. As a result, there are a growing number of private tutorial classes in Hong Kong.

Private supplementary classes or lessons are regards as shadow education by scholars (e.g. Aslam and Atherton 2012; Bray 1999; Lee et al. 2009). The reason for this metaphor has been further explained by Bray (1999), and there were several explanations behind this idea. First, mainstream schools and shadow education co-exist, since they serve as a supplement to mainstream education. Second, private tutoring changes according to the mainstream schools. Finally, people pay more attention to the mainstream schools than the "shadow". Although the attention is more focused on mainstream schooling, shadow education can also be useful. It can reduce the workload of mainstream school teachers, and it can also help students to keep up with their peers (Bray, 1999).

In this paper, the focus of shadow education is on teaching method. Shadow education has been widely discussed, and most of the research focused on the impact of shadow education (e.g. Mori & Baker, 2010; Unal et al., 2010). With reference to research in this field, there are not a lot of studies related to the effective teaching methods in shadow education. Therefore, this research tried to discuss whether a systemic way of teaching in shadow education can create some impacts on students' academic results.

Shadow education in Hong Kong

Private tutoring has been a common practice for students in Hong Kong, and recently kindergarten students are also needed to attend extra lessons after mainstream schooling. The reason for Hong Kong students to take more classes is due to several education reforms in Hong Kong education system after the handover (Yung & Bray, 2017). According to Bray and his colleagues' survey in 2011/2012, 53.8% of Secondary Three and 71.8% of Secondary Six students indicated that they have extra lessons after school in last 12 months (Bray et al., 2014). As a result, most of the students in Hong Kong have experiences in shadow education. Compared to other East Asian countries, such as Japan, Korea, Hong Kong has more students who received private tutorial classes than those countries (Bray & Lykins, 2012). Bray (2013) further pointed out that

students in Hong Kong spend a substantial amount of time in private tutoring. Bray's research showed that Hong Kong students used an average of 2.19 hours per week on English private tutorial class, 2.19 hr on mathematics, and 1.88 hours on Chinese during normal school semester and those numbers has increased during the examination seasons (Bray, 2013).

Shadow education in Hong Kong is more than supplementary lesson or remedial class for students in Hong Kong. There are different types of private tutoring forms, such as one-to-one, small-group, live lectures, video recorded lectures, and online (Zhan et al., 2013). Students not only receive extra lessons, but in some occasion, they also provide babysitting services for parents (Yung, 2019). Parents in Hong Kong often encourage their children to stay in the tutorial centre, since they believe the quantity of lessons co-related to their children's academic achievements (Cheng, 2021). Therefore, the function of shadow education in Hong Kong is more than just remedial purpose.

What is task cycle?

As task cycle is the main method that used in this research, there is a necessity to understand the meaning of task cycle. The meaning of "task" is referred to "goal-oriented activity" which learners use the target language to deal with the reality (Willis, 1996). Task cycle framework is suggested by Willis, and the goal for this is to facilitate a better language learning environment for students. Willis (1996) suggested that the framework should start with a pre-task before any activities introduced to students.

Table 1. Willis's task cycle framework (1996)

1) Pre-task	2) Performing the task	3) Planning	4) Report
Teacher introduces the topic and related materials to the class.	Students are given chances to use the language. The focus here	Within a small group, students share their ideas and outcome of the task, and they should prepare to	Students need to report to the class. In this stage, it can be any kinds of ways that can demonstrate

	should be on spontaneous, exploratory talk and confidence-building.	finalize their ideas. This part should focus on the language clarity, accuracy and appropriateness.	student's abilities after three stages, such as presentation or written form.

During the task performing stage, planning is essential. Foster (2009) mentioned that planning can help students to prepare their ideas, and it can help them to produce a better quality of work in the final stage. By using this way of teaching, students will have a better understanding to the task, and also the have the opportunity to practice their language in class (Willis, 1996; Skehan et al., 1996).

Mixed-method approach for shadow education research

Scholars have different approaches to conduct shadow education research. There was a study by Yung in 2020 which focused on students' perception on shadow education, but the approach is quite different from Nam and Chan's research in 2019. The approach that Dr Yung used in his research was an exploratory sequential mixed-methods design, and there were student interviews, classroom observation and questionnaire included in data collection methods (Yung, 2020). There were 58 students participated in the study, and they were all in grade 12. Classroom observations were conducted during the private tutoring classes, and researcher paid attention to the classroom atmosphere and students' performance during the lesson (Yung, 2020). Moreover, Cantonese semi-structured interviews were carried out for six students, and they can express their opinion about their impression towards private tutoring (Yung, 2020). Towards the end of the research, questionnaires were distributed to all students in this research, so that the data could be expanded to a wider population (Yung, 2020). As for the questionnaire, it was in both Chinese and English, so that students can fully understand the questions.

Another study from Dr Zhang Wei also used the mixed-method to the impression of shadow education from students' perspectives. The data collection methods included questionnaires, interviews and case study (Zhang, 2014). The researcher provided a justification for using mixed-method, which it refers to the data can be both board and in-depth to explain the phenomenon (Johnson, Onwuegbuzie, & Turner, 2007, p. 123). For this research, questionnaires were distributed to both 9th grade students and parents, whereas interviews and case studies were used to supplement the results from questionnaires (Zhang, 2014). The writer used purposive sampling (Creswell, 2012) with some components of random selection. The sample sizes were big, since the researcher aimed at collecting data according to participants' living background, such as "the city proper, a rural-urban continuum, an ordinary rural county and an ethnic autonomous county (Zhang, 2014)". As a result, the total number of participants in this research was 985 Grade 9 students and their parents. There were 860 students and 773 parents returned their questionnaires to the researcher. As for the interviews and case studies, researcher used different interview methods in this study, such as semi-structured interviews, informal interviews, and ethnographic interviews (Bernard & Ryan, 2010). It appeared that the researcher changed the interview methods according to the research situation (Zhang, 2014).

Research Questions

As mentioned in pervious section, shadow education research often focused on the impact of students' academic performance and the intention of having private tutoring in the society (Nam & Chan, 2019). However, there is a lack of research in discussing the effective way of teaching in shadow education. Therefore, there are three research questions for this research which the main purpose is to fill in the gap of shadow education. Adapting from Bray's experience (2014), research questions in shadow education need to consider the complexity level, since the reality is complex. Bray (2014) further pointed out that questions, such as ''Does private supplementary tutoring work?'' is too general for any shadow education studies. As a result, the questions in this paper are more specific.

1) Which method of teaching in private tutoring is suitable for secondary school students in Hong Kong?
2) What impacts does task cycle have on students in shadow education?
3) What areas do educators need to be aware when they are planning their lessons in shadow education?

Methodology

The focus of this study is about the teaching method in shadow education, and it is an exploratory sequential mixed-method design (Creswell & Plano Clark, 2018). The main data collection methods were a comparison of control group and experimental group exam results and individual interviews. Students' performance was further compared and analyzed through independent *t-test* and paired *t-test*. Therefore, the research design combined of both qualitative and quantitative.

Participants & settings

There were 100 secondary five (grade 11) students participated in this research, and they are all come from Hong Kong. The school that participated in this research is a band 2 school, which considers by many parents as a middle ranking school in Hong Kong, and the students' academic abilities are intermediate in Hong Kong. Since their academic abilities are intermediate, it is easier for researcher to find any significant improvement after the research. The purpose of using secondary 5 students as the subject of this research is due to their private tutoring experiences, and also they can be classified as "high stakes" students (Harlen & Deakin Crick, 2003). "High stakes" students tend to have a strong and complex feelings towards high or low grades, so they would a higher intention to take supplementary lessons to improve their grades (Leonard & Davey, 2001). Furthermore, they need to prepare for the Hong Kong Diploma of Secondary Education Examination (HKDSE) next year, and compared to the other students, they have more likelihood to take supplementary lessons.

The sampling method was purposive sampling, since there are some requirements for the subjects in this research (Creswell, 2012). For example,

they should be all studying in secondary five and their academic abilities should be similar. All the students study in the same school which I am also their English teacher and they all asked their parents to sign the ethical consent form before participating in this research. The research took place at a secondary school and Zoom from January to June, 2021, since the social distancing guidelines in Hong Kong only allow one-third of students and teachers staying at school. The participants were divided into two separate group, which served as control group and experimental group. The focus of this research was on secondary students' English writing abilities, so students' mid-term English writing exam results and final English writing exam results were used to compare whether there are any differences for both groups.

For the interviews section, 3 students from each group were asked to attend an individual interview session with me for 30 minutes. The interviews were conducted through Zoom and face-to-face, and they were semi-structured. The selected participants were according to their final exam results at school, so they were one for each level (high, intermediate and low). During the interview, students expressed their thoughts towards their shadow education lessons in these 6 months.

Data Collection

In order to avoid any abilities differences between students, an IELTS writing test was used to test students' English abilities beforehand. The selected 100 participants had similar scores in the writing which were between 6 and 6.5. Afterwards, they were being divided into two groups, which were the control group and experimental group in this research. The main research process started the week after the grouping arrangement. At end of this research, there was no participant dropped out.

For the lesson observation, each group was asked to attend one supplementary tutoring lesson with me each week, and it was conducted after the mainstream school time. For each student, they have English lessons every day for approximately one hour at their mainstream school. The supplementary tutoring lesson lasted for one hour, which based on the things that they have learnt in mainstream school. Since I am their mainstream school teacher and private tutor at the same time, I can make sure that every class was synchronized. As 50 students would be too many for one tutorial class, I

divided each class into a maximum of 25 students. This allowed me to have more time to pay attention to each student. Below is a lesson schedule for this research.

Table 2. Supplementary lesson schedule for each group

Control group		Experimental group	
Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday
25 students	25 students	25 students	25 students

The difference between control group and experimental group was the teaching method. For control group, exercises and HKDSE past papers were used as the main instruments for the lessons, since this is a typical private tutoring teaching methods in Hong Kong (Yung, 2015). Teacher only provided exercises and exam techniques to students during the lessons. As for the experimental group, Willis's task cycle framework was implemented into the lesson.

After the final exam (26 June, 2021), 3 students from each group were asked to attend an individual interview. The medium of the interviews were Cantonese, since their native language is Cantonese. The interview lasted for 30 minutes, and they expressed their thoughts towards their supplementary lessons in this research. Recorder was used during those interviews, and prior notice had been given to students beforehand.

Data Analysis

SPSS was used to organize students' exam results, and independent *t-test* and paired *t-test* were used to observe whether the data is significant. Both groups' mid-term and final exam results were analyzed, and the critical value was considered at $p<0.05$. The reason for conducting a t-test to see students' academic performance is to mainly answer the second research question about the impact that task cycle had on students. Furthermore, it is also an indicator for educators to understand whether teaching methods have a significant impact on student's performance, which this related to the third research question in this study.

As for the interview data, they were codified and transcribed. The

responses from participants were used to answer the first research question, which is about whether the method is suitable. Since students is one of the main users in shadow education, it is important to understand their feelings. Moreover, the interview data can help to triangulate the results in students' academic performance. Some of the transcribed data were checked and discussed with another English teacher at the secondary school, so that the interpreted data can be more objective and avoid any misinterpretation (Bell, 2011). During this process, participants' identity did not expose to the second reviewer, since this can protect participant's privacy.

Ethnical Consideration

In order to ensure the research quality, it is important to be ethically critical. There were some ethnical guidelines provided to participants and other stakeholders in this research. To begin with, all the data in this research was being codified and participants' name did not fully expose in this research. Only the participant's first name can be seen in this study. All the participants have been asked to sign a consent form which indicated whether they would like to participate in this research and the risk that they may have in this research. Since the participants in this study are not at the legal age of adult, consent forms were also disturbed to their parents. As for the school, the principal was fully aware of this research, and permitted me to conduct the research from 1st January, 2021 to 30th June, 2021. All the participants were given a choice of opt out from the research if they felt uncomfortable. Before any research procedures, such as interviews, lessons and pre-test, the background of the research and intention were provided to participants, and they can also choose to exit from the research whenever they felt uncomfortable. This is to ensure the data collected in this research is purely for academic purpose and all the participants were fully aware of what they were doing (Punch & Oancea, 2014).

Findings

This section contains both quantitative and qualitative findings for this research. As table 3 showed that the mean score for control group is 74.28/100, whereas the experimental group (task cycle) is 78.42/100. The significant value for the results is .031, which this indicates the results can reject the null hypotheses and it is significant. The mid-term result can serve as a benchmark to compare the results in the final exam.

Table 3. Mid-term exam results for both groups (independent t-test)

	Control group mean	Experimental group mean	Sig. (2-tailed)
Mid-term exam	74.28	78.42	.031

As for table 4, it indicated the final exam results for both groups. The mean score for control group is 77.48/100, whereas the experimental group (task cycle) is 80.81/100. The significant value for the results is .047, which this indicates the results can reject the null hypotheses and it is significant. Compared to table 3, both groups has slightly increased in their exam results, but the experimental group still has a better score than control group

Table 4. Final exam results for both groups (independent t-test)

	Control group mean	Experimental group mean	Sig. (2-tailed)
Final exam	77.48	80.81	.047

As for table 5, it indicates the difference between mid-term exam and final exam for both groups. The correlation between those two exams is positive, which means student performed better in mid-term exam tends to do better in final exam. As the mean for final exam is higher than mid-term exam, this further supported the positive correlation result.

Table 5. Relationship between both exams (Paired t-test)

	Mid-term exam	Final exam
Mean	76.35	79.14
Correlation	.68	
Sig. (2-tailed)	.000	.000

As for the interview findings, six interviewees expressed that shadow education can help them with their studies. During the 30-minute interview session, interviewee expressed their thoughts about the class arrangement. Students from the control group expressed the supplementary classes were similar to those tutorial schools in Hong Kong, which the private tutor only focused on training their exam skills. As for those who were in experimental group, they expressed more or less the same opinion as the tutorial schools, but they mentioned that the introduction section (pre-task) and the report section in every supplementary class helped them to revise the things that they learnt in that class. One of the students in experimental group even mentioned:

> *"The supplementary lessons before the exams are very helpful, and the report section helped me to do it practically. This can improve my understanding and practice all the stuff that I have learnt before" (An extract from Matthew in experimental group)*

For the control group students, they mentioned that the supplementary lesson were helpful, since they had extra time to learn the materials again. However, one of the students mentioned that the lesson arrangement can be more than just training exam skills.

> *"Although the lessons were helpful, those exam exercises can be done at home. Teacher, you do not need to use an hour to conduct that lesson. It is better for us to do self-studying at home. We have a lot of homework you know." (An extract from Elaine in control group)*

The student was indicating if the lesson does not have any extra materials or organization, it will be a bit "useless" for them.

All six interviewees talked about the class size issue, and they all mentioned that it would be better if the class had fewer students.

"There are too many people in one class. We cannot ask questions, and teacher cannot cater all of us" (An extract from Rocky in control group).

"It would be better if we had fewer students. I can then ask questions and also discuss with my peers about the things that I don't know" (An extract from Mary in experimental group).

It can be seen that class size is a concern for educators, since students expressed that too many students in the supplementary class would affect their learning.

Discussions

With reference to the findings in this study, a more structured supplementary teaching method is important for students. Shadow education can be in different forms, as Bray (1999) suggested that private tutoring can be in a large group or in a small group. The quality of those lessons may vary, since they can be affected by social, economic and cultural factors (Bray, 1999; Rohlen & LeTendre, 1996; Kwan-Terry, 1991). The findings in this study indicated task cycle group has a better mean score than control group without any teaching method (See table 3 & 4). This further implied that a more organized private tutoring classroom can help students in their learning. This can also be a lesson for educators, especially private tutoring class teachers. Rather than focusing one-way lecture, they can consider to provide a lot more information to their students about the task. By doing so, it can increase student's understanding about the things that they are going to do in the reality.

Teaching methods in shadow education

In respond to the first research question, students tend to perform better in task cycle class. The mean score showed that in both mid-term exam and final exam, experimental group has a better score than control group. The reason

was also explained by interviewees, and it is related to pre-task and report section during the lesson. This has somewhat contradicted to some of the researchers' findings, since other scholars suggested that students were satisfied with passive learning in shadow education (Yung, 2015). In Yung's study, students mentioned that when tutors fed them with a lot of information, they felt their money has been well-spent in this lesson. However, Yung (2015) concluded that students' language proficiency did not improve, instead their exam skills had improved after taking supplementary lessons. This implied that without any structure of teaching during the class, students may not have significant improvement in their knowledge. The statistics between control group and experimental group in this research supported the findings of Yung's research.

As for private tutoring teachers, they need to consider about the methods of teaching in their lessons. They should not only train student's examination skills, but also maintain a balance between knowledge-oriented and exam-oriented. Although this can be difficult in Hong Kong situation, tutors should be well-prepared and organized their lesson. A "Hybrid" model can be useful in Hong Kong situation, which tutors can allow at least 5 minutes to introduce the topic and at least 10 minutes for students to report their materials or ask students some questions to recap the concept that they had learnt during the lesson. This has a recast function on students, which it allows students to recall their memory and deepen their understanding (Nicholas et al., 2001). By doing this, teachers can also check their students' understanding and may adjust their lesson plan for future.

As for students, the data showed that they preferred a more organized lesson rather than just merely providing materials and past papers to them. As one of the students from control group mentioned during the interview, it would be better if the lesson can be more fruitful rather than only doing past papers. For most of private tutorial centres in Hong Kong, they used 80% of the time in doing exam-related exercises, and 20% of the time would be one-way lecture from tutor (Yung, 2015; Bray, 2013). As a result, student's exam skills improved rather than academic knowledge (Yung, 2015). Elaine's opinion in the interview indicated that lesson planning may affect their learning motivation. If teachers only focus on doing exam papers all the time, they can just provide them with answers. It is because the exam structure and question style are similar. However, this cannot help students academically. This can

only help students to familiarize with the exam structured. Therefore, a well-organized private tutorial class should be able to increase both student's knowledge and examination skills.

Task cycle as an alternative method in shadow education

For both mid-term and final exam, the data showed that experimental group had a higher mean score than control group (please see table 3 & 4), and this further indicated that a well-structured lesson has a bigger impact on student's academic performance. Some students further elaborated during the interview sessions, and their responses towards task cycle approach were positive. Since they understood the intention of the class, they can have a general impression before the real lesson stage. At the end of each lesson, they had been given a chance to express the materials that they had learnt in that lesson. Therefore, they can deepen their understanding after taken the supplementary lesson. As for the control group, they only focused on doing exercises. This approach is a typical shadow education in Hong Kong, since tutors should only focus on exam skills (Yung, 2015). Students tend to lose interests in studying when the lessons proceed. That is why one of the control group students expressed in the interview session by saying teacher can provide answers to them, and they can do it at home. They would actually feel "useless" for attending the supplementary lessons, since they just came here to do exercises. The learning motivation in control group deteriorated over time, although they are also "high stakes" learners.

Task cycle teaching method is just one of the methods that can be used in shadow education, but more importantly, this study suggested that a well-organized lesson can enhance student's academic achievements. The expectation for shadow education may only focus on examination skill, since exam success is a very important issue in Hong Kong (Bray, 2013). However, as Yung (2015) suggested that private tutorial lessons may not provide any significant improvement in knowledge, the teaching methods in shadow education should be reconsidered by educators. As education should not merely focus on exam achievements, it should also help students to understand the world (Sewell & Newman, 2014). Although shadow education works under mainstream schooling, it is also a type of education. As for educators, the goal should be helping students to understand the knowledge rather than only

improving their exam skills. As a result, private tutoring classes should also include a "pre-task" stage or something that is similar, so that the intention, the expectations or the procedures of the lesson can be introduced to students. By doing this, it can provide a proper direction for students to continue in this class, and help them to stay on track (Marzano & Marzano, 2003). As the lesson comes to an end, it is better to leave 5 to 10 minutes for teacher to sum up or ask questions to refresh student's memory. This can help students to recap the things that they had gone through in this class, and through question and answers interaction at the end of the lesson, teachers would know students' understanding. Recasts would appear at the end, and help teachers to correct students or to reorganize their approach for the next lesson. Hence, in this research, the results showed that a more structured classroom can help students to improve their grades. As for educators, the teaching methods in shadow education should be reconsidered and planned for the sake of students' understanding.

Things to be careful in organizing a supplementary class

When organizing supplementary classes, teachers need to be careful in classroom management, student's motivation and topics of the lessons. Those are the areas that can be relatively important in a shadow classroom, since they affect student's learning quality and behavior.

Classroom management is the first thing that shadow educators need to be careful. In previous paragraphs showed that the experimental group has a better mean score than the control group, and students in experimental group expressed they have better understanding towards the task in their class. As this suggested that educators need to be well prepared for the lesson, this can help students to improve. The expectation for shadow education is more than just focusing on exams, since students would easily lose focus during an unplanned lesson. Marzano & Marzano (2003) have mentioned that a well-structured lesson can help students to maintain the right direction in learning. The meaning of well-structured lesson consists of an introductory phrase to establish learning goals, and providing feedback to students for them to improve after the lesson (Marzano & Marzano, 2003). Moreover, educators could also implement some rules in supplementary class. This can help students to stay alert, and not to underestimate supplementary class. The sense

of setting up rules can help to build an effective relationship between teacher and students (Glasser, 1990), and this is especially important in shadow education. The reason is because supplementary classes or private tutorial classes may only have a limit of time to cover the materials.

Student's motivation is another thing that educators need to be careful in shadow education. Surprisingly, in this study, some of the students in control group expressed the lessons were a bit waste of time, since they can do those exercises and check answers at home. It can be seen that they lost some motivation in learning, since the extra lessons were similar to mainstream school's curriculum. A very similar idea has been introduced in Cheng's study. Some of the students were doing fine at school, but they still needed to attend tutorial classes after school. Parents in that study mentioned they think this can help their children to stay competitive, but students indicated that they were quite frustrated and tired of taking too many classes after school (Cheng, 2021). In this study, students expressed similar feelings. They may already do fine in mainstream school, and then they may ask the reasons that they joined the supplementary classes. This would discourage them, and they may start to lose interest and direction in supplementary classes. As for educators in private tutorial schools, this may be something that needs to be aware. Student's motivation will affect their learning and academic achievement (Harlen & Deakin Crick, 2003), and educators need to remind them again about the purpose of these lessons.

Finally, the topics of the supplementary lessons should be synchronized with mainstream school curriculum. As Bray (1999) described shadow education, it is an education exists because of mainstream school exists. Shadow education serves as a supportive role under mainstream schooling. It is difficult to create a new curriculum in shadow education without following mainstream school curriculum, since this would reject the purpose of shadow education. As a result, the materials in tutorial classes should be similar to the things that students need to do in their mainstream schools. This would increase the motivation for students to study in supplementary classes, especially when students need to attend public examination (Yung, 2015). For educators in private tutoring field, they should not improvise a lot in curriculum, but they should pay attention to the teaching methods which used during private tutorial lessons. A lot of private tutorial learning centres in Hong Kong do not have a very structured lesson for students, and this turns out to be

somewhat like caretaker institutions (Bray et al, 2014; Cheng, 2021).

Conclusion

Teaching methods can make a difference in students' academic achievement, and this is the main purpose of this paper. The data showed that students' performances are affected by the way of teaching in shadow education. Students in experimental group expressed that the pre-task and report sections in the lesson can help them to understand the concept, strengthen their knowledge and recap the ideas that they had learnt. In Hong Kong, there are only a few tutorial centres that may provide a well-structured lessons for students, since the focus of those tutorial classes should be on exam skills. As Yung (2015) mentioned that students expected training exam materials during those extra lessons, this kind of concept has molded the centres in Hong Kong. Educators in Hong Kong should reconsider the ways that shadow education has been carried out to students, since implementing a proper teaching method in supplementary classes would have some benefits for students in learning. Although it is unlikely to change the curriculum in shadow education, the teaching methods can be modified. This will be the ultimate goal in this research and for any future researchers in this field.

For future research, other kinds of teaching methods can be used to discuss the effectiveness in shadow education. It would be very interesting to see how private tutoring class combines with online software can help students to learn at home. Since Covid-19 appears, many schools around the world use online software to support their teaching. Some educators even mentioned the pandemic has transformed the ways of education around the world (Dhawan, 2020). It would be fascinating to investigate the impact of using online software in shadow education, and online learning will be the future in education sector. Moreover, the class sizes of shadow education may also influence student's learning. It was not very obvious in this research, but some students mentioned about the classes were too big in this study. Whether class size will affect the motivation of student's learning can also be another research in shadow education, and will there be a "decent" student quantity for a private tutorial. This will be an area that can be further investigated.

Reference

Aslam, M., & Atherton, P. (2012). *The 'shadow' education sector in India and Pakistan: the determinants, benefits and equity effects of private tutoring.* ESP Working Paper 38, Budapest: Education Support Programme, Open Society Foundations.

Bernard, H. R., & Ryan, G. W. (2010). *Analyzing qualitative data: systematic approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Bell, J. S. (2011). Reporting and publishing narrative inquiry in TESOL: challenges and rewards. *TESOL Quarterly, 45*, 575–584.

Bray, M. (1999). *The shadow education system: private tutoring and its implications for planners.* Paris: UNESCO International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP).

Bray, M., & Lykins, C. (2012). *Shadow education: private supplementary tutoring and its implications for policy makers in Asia*. Hong Kong: Comparative Education Research Centre, The University of Hong Kong, and Asian Development Bank.

Bray, M. (2013). Benefits and tensions of shadow education: comparative perspectives on the roles and impact of private supplementary tutoring in the lives of Hong Kong students. *Journal of International and Comparative Education, 2*, 18–30.

Bray, M. (2014). The impact of shadow education on student academic achievement: Why the research is inconclusive and what can be done about it. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, *15*(3), 381-389.

Bray, M., Zhan, S., Lykins, C., Wang, D., & Kwo, O. (2014). Differentiated demand for private supplementary tutoring: Patterns and implications in Hong Kong secondary education. *Economics of Education Review, 38*, 24–37.

Cheng, C, H. (2021). A need or a force? Shadow Education in Hong Kong from secondary school parent's perspective. *Curriculum and Teaching, 36* (1), pp. 37-48.

Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research* (4th ed.). Boston, MA: Pearson.

Creswell, J. W., & Plano Clark, V. L. (2018). *Designing and conducting mixed methods research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.

Dhawan, S. (2020). Online learning: A panacea in the time of COVID-19 crisis. *Journal of Educational Technology Systems*, *49*(1), 5-22.

Foster, P. (2009). Task-based language learning research: expecting too much or too little? *International Journal of Applied Linguistics*, *19*(3), 247-263.

Glasser, W. (1990). *The quality school: Managing students without coercion*. New York: Harper and Row Publishers, Inc.

Harlen, W., & Deakin Crick, R. (2003). Testing and motivation for learning. *Assessment in Education: principles, policy & practice*, *10*(2), 169-207.

Johnson, R. B., Onwuegbuzie, A. J., & Turner, L. A. (2007). Toward a definition of mixed methods research. *Journal of Mixed Methods Research, 1*, 112– 133.

Kwan-Terry, A. (1991). The Economics of Language in Singapore: Students' Use of Extracurricular Language Lessons. *Journal of Asian Pacific Communication*, *2*(1), 69-89.

Kwo, O. W. Y., & Bray, T. M. (2011). Facing the shadow education system in Hong Kong. *IIAS Newsletter*.

Lee, C. J., Park, H. J., & Lee, H. (2009). Shadow education system. In G. Sykes, B. Schneider, & D. N. Plank (Eds.), *Handbook of education policy research (pp. 901–919).* New York: Routledge for the American Educational Research Association.

Lee, J. Y. (2013). *Private tutoring and its impact on students' academic achievement, formal schooling and educational inequality in Korea*. PhD dissertation, Columbia University.

Leonard, M. & Davey, C. (2001). *Thoughts on the 11 Plus.* Belfast: Save the Children Fund.

Marzano, R. J., & Marzano, J. S. (2003). The key to classroom management. *Educational leadership*, *61*(1), 6-13.

Mori, I., & Baker, D. (2010). The origin of universal shadow education: What the supplemental education phenomenon tells us about the postmodern institution of education. *Asia Pacific Education Review, 11*(1), 36–48.

Nam, Y., & Chan, K. (2019). The roles of mainstream schooling and shadow education in English language teaching: A case study in Hong Kong. *Education Journal*, *8*(1), 16-26.

Nicholas, H., Lightbown, P. M., & Spada, N. (2001). Recasts as feedback to language learners. *Language learning*, *51*(4), 719-758.

Punch, K. F., & Oancea, A. (2014). *Introduction to research methods in education* (2nd eds). London: SAGE.

Rohlen, T. P., & LeTendre, G. K. (1998). *Teaching and learning in Japan*. Cambridge University Press.

Sewell, K., & Newman, S. (2014). What is education. *Education Studies: An Issue Based Approach*.

Skehan, P., Willis, E. J., & Willis, D. (1996). Second language acquisition research and task-based instruction. *Readings in Methodology*, *13*.

Unal, H., Ozkan, M., Milton, S., Price, K., & Curva, F. (2010). The effect of private tutoring on performance in mathematics in Turkey: a comparison across occupational types. *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *2*(2), 5512–5517

Willis, J. (1996). A flexible framework for task-based learning. *Challenge and change in language teaching*, 52-62.

Yung, K. W. H., & Bray, M. (2017). Shadow education: features, expansion and implications. In T. K. C. Tse & M. Lee (Eds.), *Making sense of education in post-handover Hong Kong: Achievements and challenges* (pp. 95–111). London: Routledge.

Yung, K. W. H. (2015). Learning English in the shadows: understanding Chinese learners' experiences of private tutoring. *Tesol Quarterly*, *49*(4), 707-732.

Yung, K. W. H. (2019). Learning, teaching, and researching in shadow education in Hong Kong: an autobiographical narrative inquiry. *ECNU Review of Education*, *2*(1), 64-76.

Yung, K. W. H. (2020). Problematising students' preference for video-recorded classes in shadow education. *Educational Studies*, 1-8.

Zhang, W. (2014). The demand for shadow education in China: mainstream teachers and power relations. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, *34*(4), 436-454.